
CITY COUNCIL REPORT

GENERAL INFORMATION

TO: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

PACKET DATE: April 3, 2014

FROM: Mario Paniagua
Budget and Research Director

SUBJECT: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the first three community budget hearings. These hearing were held on Tuesday, April 1, 2014 at Helen Drake Senior Center, Phoenix College and Cesar Chavez High School.

At phoenix.gov/budget residents can access:

- The 2014-15 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Proposed 2014-15 Budget for Community Review tabloid in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the electronic and voice mail comments included through March 21, 2014 are included.

The community budget hearings will be held through April 22. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from the first three community budget hearings and electronic comments are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 1 & 5
HELEN DRAKE SENIOR CENTER
APRIL 1, 2014**

Councilwoman Thelda Williams opened the community budget hearing at 6:09 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. She introduced Deputy City Manager Deanna Jonovich and Budget & Research Director Mario Paniagua.

Ms. Jonovich thanked those in attendance and presented the overview video describing the proposed budget. Following the presentation, Councilwoman Williams opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Linda Anderson asked what fund paid for City Council and City management salaries. Councilwoman Williams responded the salaries were paid out of the General Fund. Ms. Anderson recommended all employees, including police and fire, take a 3% pay cut to balance the budget.
2. Jennifer Langdon spoke in opposition to reducing services that impact those with disabilities specifically the closing of Pioneer Pool and the elimination of closed captioning services.
3. Coni Cabot proposed increasing revenue to help the budget deficit instead of eliminating services.
4. Frank Steinmetz expressed support for reinstating the sales tax on food.

Councilman Daniel Valenzuela joined the meeting at 6:34 p.m.

5. Joyce Steinmetz submitted a card recommending a new fee for all mountain rescues and expressing support for reinstating the sales tax on food.
6. Hope Gavin spoke in support of funding senior centers and invited City leaders to visit senior centers to see how beneficial they are to the community.
7. Geoffrey Gonsler thanked Councilwoman Williams for supporting arts programs and spoke of restoring arts programs.
8. Rivko Knox spoke in favor of a sales tax on services in order to avoid budget reductions.
9. Joe Williams in support of funding senior centers.
10. Sherry Dudek spoke in favor of hiring more police officers, reinstating the sales tax on food and proposed new revenue sources. She spoke against the reductions to neighborhood inspectors and Police Central Booking.
11. Sharon Parks suggested ideas to increase revenue such as increasing community center membership fees and a sales tax on services.

12. Barb Heller spoke in favor of reductions to the Public Information Office and increasing revenue through taxes, fines and fees.
13. Paul Schildgen spoke in support of maintaining services at senior centers.
14. Nancy Burnett submitted a card to maintain services at community centers.
15. Mario Horabuena expressed concern about the closure of senior centers and described how beneficial they are to the members that visit the centers on a daily basis.
16. Diana Cameron in support of maintaining funding for community centers. She asked the City Councilmembers what they felt was the best thing about senior centers. Councilwoman Williams and Councilman Valenzuela responded to Ms. Cameron's question.
17. Sylvia Mejia spoke in support of maintaining funding for senior centers, recommended a fee for using hiking trails and proposed a salary reduction for middle managers and executives.
18. Ben Kuglar spoke in favor of eliminating the surveillance aircraft from the Police department; increasing reward incentives to employees for cost saving ideas; and suggested the City review the volunteer process to make it easier for people to volunteer.
19. Gene Blue spoke in favor of summer youth programs and reinstating the sales tax on food. He suggested a private-public partnership for parks sponsorships.
20. Sabrina Taylor spoke against the elimination of the Police Department Central Booking and spoke in favor of increasing current revenue sources and finding new revenue sources.
21. Diane Harris spoke in favor of a sales tax on services and employee restorations.
22. Jose Paredes expressed safety concerns at the intersection of 35th and Dunlap Avenues. He spoke in favor of supporting youth programs and against reductions to street maintenance programs.
23. Jason Whitaker expressed concern of the safety at the intersection of 35th and Dunlap Avenues.
24. Edith Schnauffer submitted a card requesting the Helen Drake Senior Center not be cut.
25. Elizabeth Benning spoke in favor of reinstating the sales tax on food to help the budget deficit.
26. Regina Nixon spoke in support of maintaining funding to art education programs.
27. Phil Hourican submitted a card in favor of increasing public transportation services and keeping senior centers open.
28. Liz Hourican submitted a card in favor of increasing public transportation services and keeping senior centers open.

29. Peggy Odendahl spoke in favor of increasing fees at senior centers in order to keep the classes.
30. Ben Konik spoke in favor of increasing revenue.
31. Judi Rae Kell suggested increasing revenue by fining for false fire calls, charging a fee for mountain rescues and increasing the fee to other cities for Fire Dispatch Services. She spoke against the Central Booking reductions.
32. Mary Obrachta spoke in support of maintaining funding for senior centers, pool safety programs, code enforcement and the Fire Prevention Center. She spoke in favor of eliminating Chanel 11 and reinstating the sales tax on food. She asked how dog parks were funded. Councilwoman Williams responded the dog parks are funded by dedicated funds voted on by residents.
33. Barbara Gonzales spoke against funding of the Reimagine Phoenix program and stated she supported restoring Central Booking. She spoke in favor of reinstating the sales tax on food.
34. John Ioannon spoke in favor of keeping senior centers open and creating more bike lanes.
35. Juanita Vandever spoke in favor of keeping the Helen Drake Senior Center open.
36. Ron Ostrom spoke in favor of increasing revenue sources. He spoke against the closure of senior centers stating that many veterans are members and benefit from them.
37. Suzanne Day spoke in favor of bicycling infrastructure and asked the City Council to continue funding for additional infrastructure.
38. Suzanne Thraen spoke against reductions to the Police department, community center and neighborhood inspectors.
39. Melyna Fang spoke in favor of public safety efforts and revenue building.
40. Laurel Speer Petersen submitted a card to restore services at community centers as they support service to those who cannot afford other venues of entertainment.
41. Robin Mofford spoke in favor of increasing revenue and suggested a sales tax on online purchases. Councilwoman Williams responded a company must have a presence in the state of Arizona in order for taxes to be collectable.
42. Sean Mattson submitted a card with revenue generating ideas including a tax on grocery bags and a fee for using hiking trails.
43. Laurrie Fitzhugh recommended the budget tabloid be revised in order to make it more understandable.
44. Jak Keyser spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and reinstating the sales tax on food.
45. Mary Travis submitted a card opposed to community center closures and in favor of a sales tax on services.

Councilman Valenzuela thanked everyone for their comments and suggestions. Councilwoman Williams thanked everyone for attending and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 9:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayra Z. Baquera
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4
PHOENIX COLLEGE
APRIL 1, 2014**

Councilwoman Laura Pastor opened the community budget hearing at 6:06 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance. She commented on the salary proposed for our current City Manager and that she will support his raise at the Formal Council Meeting on April 2, 2014. Adding, she also supports his new contract that eliminates pension spiking.

She introduced Deputy City Manager Rick Naimark who also thanked everyone for coming. He briefly explained the budget process and emphasized the importance the citizens' comments have on the final adopted budget. He then introduced Deputy Budget and Research Director Jeff Barton, Acting Assistant City Manager Danny Murphy and city staff in attendance. Mr. Naimark introduced the presentation which described the budget process in more detail.

Following the presentation, Councilwoman Pastor commented several Councilmembers wanted to look at innovative ways to bundle services to save money as well as thinking of new ways to generate revenue. She then opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Nicole Rodriguez asked to restore funding for code enforcement in Fire. She suggested other cost saving items such as eliminating the employee bus pass program; charging fees at South Mountain Park and Camelback Mountain; charging rental fees for using park ramadas; and turning off lights after hours in the parks.
2. Brenden Burnham suggested employees take a month furlough to solve the deficit. He also commented the public transportation system is too slow, adding there are too many bus stops on the routes.
3. Haley Ritter spoke in support of maintaining the summer swimming and diving programs. She also spoke in favor of improving the bicycle/pedestrian infrastructure.
4. Rosemary Holusha spoke in support of swimming lessons and swim and dive competitions to keep kids safe and prevent obesity. She also supported funding community and senior centers. She stated she also supports changing the retirement formula to 65 years and removing car allowances.
5. Lisa Parks spoke in support of bicycle infrastructure and believes bicycling is better for the economy because cyclists will stop at more businesses.
6. Jeremy Stapleton spoke in support of complete streets and bicycle infrastructure.
7. Libby Coyner thanked the City Council for the \$1.5 million for bicycle infrastructure last year and would like to continue the funding in the future.
8. John Walker also thanked the City Council for the bicycle infrastructure funding and supports continued funding.
9. John Romero also spoke in support of bicycle infrastructure funding.
10. Martin Vogel asked to consider revenue from activity cards, similar to what Encanto Park used to use, at Encanto as well as other city parks. He spoke in favor of 5 day work

weeks for Police staff. He also would like Police statistics to be posted online. Mr. Naimark responded staff would look into the online statistics item.

11. Lauren Henschen spoke in favor of selling postcard books that the City currently distributes for free as revenue to help offset Phoenix Arts and Culture Office reductions.
12. GG George stated she supports reinstating the sales tax on food or increasing sales tax to keep the parks, pools and libraries open. She asked what the loss of revenue to the city was this year when we dropped it 1%. Mr. Naimark and Mr. Barton responded the revenue loss was \$12.1 million for this fiscal year and \$21.3 million through March 30, 2015.
13. Kelly Larabee Morlan spoke in favor of keeping the swim teams and sports complex staff at Encanto Park. She added she supports reinstating the sales tax on food. She suggested setting fees for non-residents at the park.
14. Susan Dale spoke against cutting any services in the Parks and Recreation Department, especially Encanto Park.
15. Annie Eldon spoke in support of bicycle infrastructure and thanked the City Council for last year's funding. She would like to see funding for this continue.
16. Richard Rea spoke in favor of increasing taxes to meet the city's obligations. He stated he believes the City managers are underpaid, not overpaid. He added he supports bringing back the sales tax on food.
17. Gary Egan spoke in support of the Arts and Culture program.
18. Margie Gin spoke in support of maintaining services at the senior centers and community centers.
19. Ted Wiseman spoke in support of the swim and dive teams and swim lessons.
20. Connie Zilversmith spoke in support of the community centers and senior centers. She added she supports raising taxes to keep them open.

Afterward, Councilwoman Pastor thanked residents, city staff and her staff Monica Sandschafer and Megan Schmitz for attending this meeting. She said there are multigenerational cuts across the board. She added she believes cutting the community centers and senior centers is not acceptable.

Councilwoman Pastor closed the hearing at 7:52 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary Scrivens
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 7 & 8
CESAR CHAVEZ HIGH SCHOOL
APRIL 1, 2014**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:16 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He introduced Councilman Michael Nowakowski and Councilwoman Kate Gallego.

Mr. Zuercher gave a brief summary of the proposed 2014-15 budget and asked staff to present the overview video describing the process in more detail. Following the presentation, Councilwoman Gallego recognized community members and staff in attendance. She stated she has asked the City Manager to look at revenue options.

Councilman Nowakowski stated he welcomed comments on residents' needs and wants. He opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Michael Espinoza spoke in favor of retaining funding for Central Booking.
2. Elton Carey spoke in favor of keeping funding for graffiti and blight control programs and recreation centers.
3. David Bridge spoke in favor of maintaining service levels for the Police Department, human services, neighborhood services, trash pickup and street maintenance.
4. Patra Carroll spoke in favor of keeping funding for graffiti and blight control, code enforcement, community centers, and parks. She suggested finding alternative sources to fund the Super Bowl security and financing capital expenses instead of pay-as-you-go. She spoke in favor of balancing the budget without impacting services to South Phoenix.
5. Mercy Gomez spoke in favor of keeping funding for human services and parks and recreation programs for seniors and people with disabilities.
6. Tony Berastegui spoke in favor of increasing services, especially police and neighborhood services, to Laveen. He also asked for park maintenance for soccer fields and development of Laveen. He expressed support for retaining the city manager's compensation.
7. Jennifer Nelson spoke in favor of city pension reform, performance-based compensation for city employees, and economic development, recreation, swimming pools, and additional resources for the Laveen and South Phoenix areas.
8. Yolanda Moreno spoke in favor of keeping senior centers open, especially the South Mountain Senior Center.
9. Peggy Morales spoke in favor of keeping funding for swimming pools and police services. She suggested the following potential cost saving ideas: establishing fees for non-essential services; merging city departments; and hiring more retirees, veterans and interns. She advocated balancing the budget without impact to city employees.
10. Neal Haddad spoke in favor of adopting recommendations from citizensforphoenix.org;

increased efficiencies; and keeping funding for senior and community centers and Central Booking. He expressed support for adopting \$4 million in proposed cuts, and establishing increased, predictable revenues such as the food tax.

11. Erika Kennan spoke in favor of restoring the food tax, and for more development, greenbelts, transportation and bike studies, sidewalks, improved bus shelters, community centers, dog parks, senior and youth programs, and parks maintenance in Laveen. She also asked for replacement of 18 picnic tables at Cesar Chavez Park.
12. Claudine Reifschneider spoke in favor of restoring the food tax, and for more development, greenbelts, transportation and bike studies, sidewalks, improved bus shelters, community centers, dog parks, senior and youth programs, and parks maintenance in Laveen.
13. Andrew Brown spoke in favor of more youth programs in Laveen.
14. Hunter Franklin spoke in favor of more youth programs, a recreation center, pools with slides, basketball courts, and more resources for Laveen.
5. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of keeping funding and restoring funding for programs for homeless people.
6. David Tapley spoke in favor of funding for more bike infrastructure.
17. Paul Loomans spoke in favor of funding for more bike safety and infrastructure. He asked the city to follow-up on the recommendations of the bike master plan.
18. Amy Hale spoke in favor of keeping all swimming pools open.
19. Job Salinas Hernandez spoke in favor of keeping swimming pools, Harmon Park and all senior centers open, especially Marcos de Niza Senior Center.
20. Grace Arroyo Salinas spoke in favor of keeping open Harmon Park, Coleman Recreation Center and Marcos de Niza Senior Center. She expressed support for pool funding at Harmon Park and Coleman Center.
21. Muriel Smith spoke in favor of keeping current funding for parks, senior centers, neighborhood services and pools.
22. Mary Alvarez spoke in favor of keeping open parks and all senior centers, especially Marcos de Niza Senior Center.
23. Mary Hayes spoke in favor of keeping the South Mountain Senior Center open.
24. Debbie Zapatka spoke in favor of funding for covered bus shelters, bike lanes, community centers, extra police services, and youth programs for Laveen.
25. Calisto Rosales Herrera spoke in favor of keeping open senior centers, especially Marcos de Niza Senior Center.
26. Maria Morales spoke in favor of keeping open senior centers, especially Marcos de Niza Senior Center.
27. Maria Lopez spoke in favor of keeping open senior centers, especially Marcos de Niza

Senior Center.

28. Reverend Reginald Walton spoke in favor of keeping funding for recreation and senior centers and Central Booking.
29. Maria Maciel spoke in favor of keeping open parks, libraries and senior centers.
30. Maria del Rio spoke in favor of keeping open parks, libraries and senior centers.
31. Bobbie McLeod spoke in favor of keeping open senior centers, especially Seniors Opportunities West (S.O.W.) Senior Center.
32. Officer Joe Clure spoke in favor finding additional revenue and the recommendations of Citizens for Phoenix.
33. Maria Gonzales spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
34. Wendy Flood spoke in favor funding for pools, parks maintenance, benches for bus stops, school resource officers, additional soccer fields, and increased investment in Laveen. Ms. Flood suggested keeping current projects instead of starting new projects and studies, and deferring potential Hance Park funds to Laveen. She expressed support for keeping the current number of and compensation to city employees, Council outreach and Graffiti Busters. She expressed support for a modest increase in swimming lesson fees and increasing taxes on alcohol and adult-oriented businesses.
35. Robert Anselmo spoke in favor of keeping open senior centers, especially Seniors Opportunities West (S.O.W.) Senior Center and funding for youth programs, pools, and swim lessons.
36. John Mockus submitted a card in favor of city pension reform, performance-based compensation for city employees, and economic development, recreation, swimming pools, and additional resources for the Laveen and South Phoenix areas.
37. Michelle Fierro submitted a card in favor of a new dog park, safer and cleaner parks, more local entertainment options, and less animal abandonment in the Laveen area.
38. George Young submitted a card in favor of restoring services.
39. Walt Gray submitted a card in favor of a two percent sales tax increase to retain and increase city services.
40. Donna Henderson submitted a card in favor of a bus turnaround for local bus route 52 – Roeser.
41. Ruben Henderson III submitted a card in favor of a bus turnaround for local bus route 52 – Roeser.
42. Elizabeth Ross submitted a card in favor of keeping senior centers open.
43. Chris and Janeen Newhouse submitted a card in favor of youth programs and public safety, specifically increased funding for neighborhood services and parks and recreation programs.
44. Naveed Ahmed submitted a card in favor of keeping funding for police and

neighborhood services, and increasing funding for parks and community centers for the Laveen area.

45. Julio Sesmas submitted a card in favor of funding for streets and sidewalks.
46. Rocky Alvarado submitted a card in favor of reduced crime and violence, neighborhood development, neighborhood code enforcement and healthy food grocery stores, such as Sprouts, in Laveen.
47. Elda Narvais submitted a card in favor of park safety, street crossings along 35th Avenue, reduced crime and violence, proper zoning, code enforcement and graffiti removal in Laveen.
48. Lindsay Bateman submitted a card in favor of a park at Alta Vista and 47th Avenue, economic development, and increased police presence in Laveen.
49. Margaret Kilman submitted a card in favor of increased funding for police, outreach to people who are homeless, and trash services.
50. Susan Sitar spoke in favor of increased economic development, recreation, swimming pools, and additional resources for the Laveen and South Phoenix areas.
51. Lisa Doromal submitted a card in favor of restoring the food tax, and for more development, greenbelts, transportation and bike studies, sidewalks, improved bus shelters, community centers, dog parks, senior and youth programs, and parks maintenance in Laveen.
52. Paula Fleck submitted a card in favor of keeping and increasing funding for police and air support. Ms. Fleck also expressed support for increased graffiti removal and neighborhood preservation funding for Laveen.
53. Stephanie Hurd submitted a card in favor of restoring the food tax, and for more development, greenbelts, transportation and bike studies, sidewalks, improved bus shelters, community centers, dog parks, senior and youth programs, and parks maintenance in Laveen.
54. Randy Jones submitted a card in favor of economic development, recreation, swimming pools, and additional resources for the Laveen and South Phoenix areas.
55. Cindy Stark submitted a card in favor of keeping funding for community centers and swim and dive teams. She also expressed support for development, greenbelts, transportation and bike studies, sidewalks, improved bus shelters, community centers, dog parks, senior and youth programs, and parks maintenance in Laveen.
56. Becky McBride submitted a card in favor of more funding youth recreation programs, a community pool and a new recreation center for the Laveen/South Mountain area.
57. Kristina Washington submitted a card in favor of development, greenbelts, transportation and bike studies, sidewalks, improved bus shelters, community centers, dog parks, senior and youth programs, and parks maintenance in Laveen.

Councilman Nowakowski summarized the comments received. He thanked everyone for attending and sharing their stories.

Councilwoman Gallego thanked everyone for sharing their time and asked residents to subscribe to the District 7 and 8 email lists. She closed the hearing at 8:37 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Genevieve Siri
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Through March 21, 2014**

1. Cherene Cunningham sent an email stating her family uses services at the Beuf Community Center and asked that services be maintained.
2. Ann Warner submitted an email requesting swimming lessons not be cut.
3. Shelley Wright submitted an email requesting pools and community centers not be cut.
4. Dana Hoffman asked that alternative reductions be considered to balance the budget.
5. Chris Richert sent an email to not cut recreation programs including pools and community centers.
6. Ella Dawson sent an email inquiring about the jail excise tax included on the municipal services bill. Staff responded with information about the tax.
7. Joann Philbin sent an email requesting restoration of summer youth recreation. She asked that the City reduce library hours or delay closing centers until August.
8. Nancy Peabody sent an email in support of maintaining summer recreation and swim and dive team activities especially at Sunnyslope Pool. She suggested increasing participant fees.
9. melodee@q.com sent an email concerned about proposed reduction of senior centers.
10. Heather Barton sent an email requesting clarification of the proposed pool and swim reductions, whether it included recreational swim programs. Parks Department staff responded that for the pools that remain open, there were no proposed reductions to recreational swimming.
11. Kim Pestka sent an email in support of community centers and swim programs and asked that the reductions be reconsidered.
12. B. Brian Hopkins sent an email requesting the city not cut community centers to ensure kids have recreation activities.
13. Anne Sullivan sent an email in support of maintaining programming for children programs, summer activities and senior centers.
14. Rebecca Keck sent an email supporting maintaining of summer recreation activities at community centers.
15. John and Stephanie Corder sent an email supporting maintaining Paradise Valley Community Center and Road Runner Pool.
16. Elida Hemphill asked that the city not cut summer recreation program for kids.
17. Melanee Mareno asked that the city not cut summer programs for children at the community centers.

18. Ana sent an email asking that services impacting children and the disenfranchised not be cut.
19. Scott Sharples asked that the sales tax on food be restored to address the budget shortfall.
20. Taffery Lowry sent an email requesting to not implement proposed reductions to the Parks and Recreation Department.
21. Chao-Sha Huang sent an email in support of maintaining funding for summer and after school programs for youth.
22. Karen Stout sent an email requesting to maintain City of Phoenix swim programs.
23. Henry Ma sent an email in support of maintaining funding for Parks and Recreation programs.
24. Irfan Emrah Kanat sent an email opposed to reductions to the Parks and Recreation Department.
25. Jennifer sent an email in support of maintaining funding for community centers. She suggested the City apply for grants or request donation to fund these programs.
26. Jessica Lewis sent an email in support for funding for City pools.
27. Lisa Christiansen asked that services to children and low income residents not be cut.
28. Anna Macro sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers.
29. Karen Peterson asked to continue funding for swimming at City pools.
30. Randy Moe sent an email to support services at the community centers.
31. Tonya Buchanan sent an email in support of services at the community centers.
32. Cheryl Stradling sent an email to maintain funding for Parks and Recreation Department community centers and pools.
33. Helen Cernich sent an email in support of maintaining community services and pools.
34. Erin McGever asked Council to maintain the Parks and Recreation Department services at community centers and pools.
35. Shari Tucker-Gasser sent an email in support of funding Parks and Recreation Department services.
36. Melissa Landon sent an email supporting funding for Parks and Recreation Department community center and pool services.
37. Ann Myers Jones sent an email in support of funding community centers and pools.

38. Diane Reese sent an email in support of funding pools as a necessary means for children to learn to swim safely.
39. Beverly Graves sent an email to maintain services at community centers.
40. connolly89@cox.net expressed frustration with proposed reductions to community centers.
41. Denise Cossey sent an email commenting that reducing community centers was unacceptable and suggested exploring alternative options.
42. Mike Reese sent an email expressing frustration at the propose elimination of swimming and diving programs.
43. Jeanne Ugarte sent an email commenting that by reducing summer youth programs, families will have to pay for private programs or daycare during the summer.
44. Jeannette Nord sent an email in support of maintaining swimming and diving programs and recreation/senior centers.
45. Tracy Darr sent an email in support of funding summer youth programs at Beuf Community Center, as it is an affordable alternative for youth during the summer.
46. Kari Andonov sent an email questioning the decision to close community centers.
47. Stephanie Bolena sent an email to support maintaining funding for park and recreation services at Pecos Community Center.
48. Sara sent an email to support funding park and recreation services.
49. M Reddy sent an email in support of funding swim and dive programs.
50. April Hedrick sent an email expressing her sadness over the decision to eliminate swim and dive programs.
51. Nicole Gonzalez sent an email in support of funding summer youth programs at the Paradise Valley Community Center.
52. Anna Shebell sent an email to maintain services at pools.
53. Elijah Grant, a participant of youth programming at Sunnyslope Community Center, sent an email in support of maintaining programming at community centers.
54. Jessica Sissel suggested doubling or tripling fees for recreation and swim programs to keep them open.
55. Karen Johnson sent an email in support of maintaining services at Desert West Community Center.
56. Muriel Smith sent an email in support of parks and recreation funding to support community efforts such as her neighborhood has to clean up Lindo Park.
57. Karla Domokos sent an email in support of maintaining funding for parks and recreation services.

58. Libby sent an email stating it would be a travesty to close community centers.
59. Pamela Hennard sent an email in support of maintaining park and recreation services.
60. Kerrie Walker sent an email commenting that closing community centers will hurt our youth.
61. Julie Thibodeaux sent an email in support of funding services at Beuf Community Center.
62. Sharon Bernier sent an email in support of raising recreation fees, meals and door to door cab services to allow services at the Deer valley Community Center to remain open.
63. Belinda Ray sent an email in support of park and recreation services.
64. Tina Ashburn sent an email in support of funding park and recreation services.
65. Darcy Manfredi sent an email to request the City keep the pools and community centers open this summer.
66. Lisa Montour sent an email supporting youth summer recreation programs.
67. Michelle Roth-Tamulewicz sent an email suggesting programs reduce funding for trophies, jerseys, and end of season parties. She also suggested securing more sponsors. She commented that ending the unnecessary perks may allow them to keep having a rec center in her neighborhood. She added the kids just want to play ball, and if the parents want more, they can spring for the extras.
68. Bridgette Smith sent an email in support of maintaining summer recreation programs.
69. Jen Matthews sent an email to maintain services at the Pecos Community Center. She recommended raising fees and establishing a volunteer program to support services.
70. Eric Chan called to support maintaining services at the Washington Community Center, stating it is used by the young and the old.

Respectfully Submitted

Julie Flaskerud
Management Assistant

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

GENERAL INFORMATION

TO: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

PACKET DATE: April 10, 2014

FROM: Mario Paniagua
Budget and Research Director

SUBJECT: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from community budget hearings held between Wednesday, April 2 and Monday, April 7, 2014.

At phoenix.gov/budget residents can access:

- The 2014-15 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Proposed 2014-15 Budget for Community Review tabloid in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the electronic and voice mail comments received through April 2, 2014 are included.

The community budget hearings will be held through April 22. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from the four additional community budget hearings and electronic comments are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 6
PECOS COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 2, 2014**

Deputy City Manager Rick Naimark opened the community budget hearing at 6:10 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance, briefly describing the budget process, encouraging participants to comment on the City's proposed budget and introducing Budget and Research Director Mario Paniagua. Councilman Sal DiCiccio joined the meeting at 6:15 p.m.

Following presentation of the overview video describing the proposed budget, the hearing was opened to public comments.

1. James Domschke spoke in favor keeping senior centers open.
2. Don Southard submitted a card in favor of maintaining city services.
3. Bill Cadaret spoke in favor of keeping community centers, particularly senior centers open.
4. Jason Kirkland spoke in favor of maintaining the current central booking process.
5. Preston Jarrell spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and investing in infrastructure. He suggests use fees be increased for non-residents.
6. Nancy Norwood spoke in favor keeping senior centers open.
7. Peggy Cadaret submitted a card in favor of keeping community centers open.
8. Dian Kinsman submitted a card in favor of keeping community centers open.
9. Sheri Guthrie spoke in favor of keeping community centers open.
10. Scott Ryan spoke in favor of investing in Ahwatukee.
11. Virginia Morton spoke in favor of keeping community centers and senior centers open.
12. Robin Salthouse spoke in favor of restoring park ranger staffing to 2007 levels, providing dedicated parks staffing to manage volunteer activities and fund desperately needed trail maintenance in North Mountain and South Mountain Preserves.
13. Susan Shaffer Nahmias, submitted a card opposing the proposed cuts to the arts and culture staff.
14. Constance Holcomb spoke in favor of keeping the Pecos Community Center open and suggested raising fees to keep the facility open.
15. Leslie Zschokke spoke in support of homeless services and keeping shelters open.
16. Paul Barnes spoke in opposition to the proposed position and service reductions. Mr. Barnes suggests looking to predictable revenue sources such as increasing sales tax.

17. Kamryn Hodson spoke in favor of maintaining community center summer programs.
18. Steve Manolis spoke in favor of keeping community centers open.
19. Jerry Vlach spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and maintaining community resources.
20. Theresa Walters spoke in favor of maintaining programs for seniors and summer programs at community centers.
21. Judy McBee submitted a card in favor of keeping community centers open.
22. Rich Coplan spoke in favor of maintaining senior programs.
23. Cora Kelley submitted a card in favor of keeping community centers and senior centers open.
24. Penni Montgomery submitted a card in favor of maintaining senior services at community centers.
25. Joanne Outzen submitted a card in favor of keeping the senior program at Pecos Community Center open.
26. Jim Basilone submitted a card without identifying specific issues.
27. Greta Rogers concurred with Paul Barnes comments. Ms. Rogers opposes cuts to services as well as police and fire. Ms. Rogers suggests an increase to revenue sources (e.g., city sales tax, increase property tax rate and update outdated fee structure.)
28. Paul Loomans spoke in favor of the city's continuing investment in bike infrastructure.
29. Connie Lozano submitted a card in favor of keeping senior centers open.
30. Oliveira Vaz submitted a card in favor of keeping senior centers open.
31. Giovanni Arico spoke in favor of the city's continuing investment in bike infrastructure.
32. Donna Chapman submitted a card in favor of keeping senior centers open.
33. Kathie Kelly spoke in favor of keeping senior centers open.
34. Nathan Jordan requested no cuts to police and spoke in favor of maintaining the current central booking process.
35. Vanessa Ryan spoke in favor of keeping Pecos Community Center open. PLAN PHX committee members identified the center as a place for teens to go and longer hours were suggested. Ms. Ryan questioned whether the recommendations were read.
36. Bobbie McLeod spoke in favor of keeping senior centers open.
37. Mary Mesa submitted a card in favor of keeping senior centers open.
38. Keith Kaminski submitted a card in favor of not reducing community services or

compensation of city employees.

39. Tere Garcia spoke in favor of keeping community centers open.
40. Jessica Vega submitted a card in favor of keeping community centers open.
41. John Romero spoke in favor of the city's continuing investment in bike infrastructure.
42. Jacqueline Jones spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and continuing summer children programs and pools.
43. Chris McCrossan spoke in favor of not implementing proposed cuts to arts grant funding.
44. Holly Ophardt submitted a card in favor of keeping Pecos pool open and requested that the city continue with dive teams and swim lesson programs.
45. Sherrill Kinnaman submitted a card in favor of keeping senior centers open.
46. Melissa Landon spoke in favor of keeping Pecos Community Center open and suggested raising fees to keep the facility open.
47. Allison Skonsen submitted a card in favor of keeping community centers open and suggested raising fees to keep the facility open.
48. Noreen Kumar submitted a card in favor of keeping Pecos Community Center open.
49. Ninette Vaz submitted a card in favor of keeping Pecos Community Center open.
50. Judy Boeseners submitted a card suggesting mayor and council's pay should be cut and frozen before services are cut to the community.
51. Luis Acosta spoke in support of employees performing job functions as opposed to contractual awards.
52. Patricia Cox submitted a card in favor of keeping community centers and parks open.
53. John Edmondson submitted a card suggesting budget be kept flat.
54. Annette Gong submitted a card in favor of keeping pools open and requested that the city continue with dive teams and swim lesson programs.

Councilman DiCiccio thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 8:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mari Tunder Kruger
Acting Fiscal Manager

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 2 AND 3
PARADISE VALLEY COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 2, 2014**

Deputy Budget and Research Director Tracy Reber opened the meeting by welcoming those in attendance, thanking them for coming to the community budget hearing and presented the video overview of the proposed budget. Vice Mayor Jim Waring and Councilman Bill Gates arrived shortly after and opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Roger Peck spoke in support of programs provided by the Parks and Recreation Department. Mr. Peck stated he was the Chairman of the Parks and Recreation Board.
2. Veronica Hope spoke in favor of keeping the Paradise Valley Community Center open and supports programs for seniors.
3. Mark Townsend spoke in support of keeping the sales tax on food to fund graffiti removal programs, centralized booking, Street Transportation's slurry seal program, and freeway landscape maintenance.
4. Jennifer Longton spoke in support of funding services and programs for the disabled community such as Telephone Pioneer pool and closed captioning.
5. Doris Freeman spoke against funding for Police security at the Super Bowl and the transfer to tax dollar to businesses as incentives.
6. Mary Travis spoke in favor of funding senior and community centers and recommended raising city fees. Ms. Travis stated that fees are too low for all the services provided. Ms. Travis also mentioned that a list of community centers and locations are not easy to find on the City's website and the A-Z menu feature on the webpage did not work.
7. Suzanne Day spoke in support of keeping the sales tax on food and also reinstating the 1%. Ms. Day spoke in support of bicycle infrastructure and public transportation.
8. Penny Matteson spoke in favor of keeping all community and senior centers open. Ms. Matteson voiced her concerns about optimistic revenue projections in the future.
9. Geoffrey Wolfe spoke in favor of keeping community center open and increasing taxes if other solutions can't be found.
10. Richard Thacker spoke in favor of needing to invest in our roadway infrastructure. He spoke against raises for upper management.
11. E. Pal Peru spoke against the City Manager's pay and supported keeping the community centers open.
12. Jessica Davis spoke in favor of keeping Paradise Valley Community Center open.
13. Joanne D'Angelo spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and was concerned with providing former City Manager David Cavazos and upper management a raise then three months later proposing budget cuts.

14. Kathy Halsey spoke in favor of keeping the sales tax on food to fund community centers, educational programs for children, and libraries.
15. Jackie Buchanan spoke in favor of keeping the Paradise Valley Community Center open and supports swim and dive teams.
16. Tori Buchanan spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and supports the basketball leagues.
17. Dave Grimm spoke in favor of keeping all the community centers open.
18. Judy Guilds spoke in favor of supporting the Phoenix Office of Arts and Culture budget.
19. Randy Moe spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and to find ways to increase revenues to keep all the services funded.
20. Seth and Jack Camp spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and support youth sports.
21. Franklin Marino stated he was a police officer and spoke in support of funding for public safety. Mr. Marino also spoke in favor of keeping the sales tax on food to fund community centers. He also spoke against reducing city employee's pay.
22. Kim Ross spoke in favor of keeping community centers open and funding the swim/dive teams.
23. Lisa Parks spoke in support of keeping the sales tax on food and for funding of bicycle infrastructure.
24. Libby Coyner spoke in favor of funding for bicycle infrastructure and community centers.
25. Catlin McCartney spoke in support of keeping the Paradise Valley Community Center open.
26. Bill McComas spoke in favor of funding for bicycle infrastructure and community centers.
27. Debra Rosonberg spoke in favor of funding Parks and Recreation programs and senior centers.
28. Marsha Butler spoke in favor of the City Manager's pay and the need to raise taxes. Ms. Butler spoke in support of city employees and their pensions.
29. Jeff Gunter spoke in support of the pension reform that was implemented and voiced his concerns regarding the budget cuts and the impact on residents.
30. Roseanne Shavviak spoke in favor of keeping the senior and community centers open.
31. Tommy Aluey spoke in support of keeping the community centers open and spoke in favor of youth programs.
32. Odette Calvin spoke in support of funding for community and senior centers.
33. Suzette Parson spoke in support of keeping senior centers open.

34. Christina Flaaen spoke in support of funding for PHX11 and for funding the programming of shows about city services.
35. Jill Diedrich spoke in favor of keeping community centers open.
36. Canyou Schuster spoke in supports of keeping the Paradise Valley Community Center open and the funding of youth sports.
37. Craig Tribken spoke in support for funding of homeless shelters and services.
38. Sara Curry spoke in favor of keeping community center open and funding for graffiti programs.
39. Theresa Mayville spoke in favor of keeping community centers open.
40. Annie Houser spoke in favor of increasing parking fees for hiking areas or other fees to provide funding for community and senior centers.
41. Richard Rea spoke in favor of raise revenue instead of cutting city pay or programs.
42. Neal Haddad spoke in favor of keeping the sales tax on food.
43. Richard Kelleher spoke against government funding for non-profit organizations. He felt it was unfair to agencies that do not receive government funding.
44. Milena Sideris spoke in support of funding all services for children and adolescents and keeping the community centers open.
45. Barb Heller spoke in support of the sales tax on food to fund Police and community centers.
46. Rose Ponczak spoke in support of keeping the community centers open and eliminating any employee expense accounts.
47. Robert Kamaz spoke in support of keeping the sales tax on food to fund street infrastructure and police services.
48. Travis Verse spoke in support keeping the Paradise Valley Community Center open.
49. Ted Hinerman spoke in support of funding street infrastructure and additional maintenance, and to reward city employees that save the city money.
50. Bill Cusimano spoke in support of keeping the community centers open and supports city employees.
51. Leo Nenortos did not speak but submitted a card in support of community centers.
52. Linda Besse did not speak but submitted a card in support of community centers and libraries. Ms. Besse was concerned why they let the problem get so big.
53. Kris McLaughlin did not speak but submitted a card in support of basketball, seniors, kids, and programs.

54. Steve Spancrud did not speak but submitted a card in support of having summer programs and athletic programs continued for community center children.
55. Nanette Merrit did not speak but submitted a card in support of keeping all the community centers open.
56. Lisa Loplut did not speak but submitted a card in support of keeping the community centers open.
57. Roy Wise did not speak but submitted a card in support of eliminating pension spiking and is not in support of the City Manager's salary.
58. Richard Miller did not speak but submitted a card in support of all activities provided for the elderly.
59. Charles Post did not speak but submitted a card concerning cutbacks in essential service like fire, police, and employee compensation.
60. Laura Cooper did not speak but submitted a card in support of keeping the community centers open, funding code enforcement, and said she has had good working support from the Council office.
61. Patricia Brooks did not speak but submitted a card in support of keeping the Paradise Valley Community Center open.
62. Melissa Frey did not speak but submitted a card in support of funding for code enforcement to protect neighborhoods.
63. Jim Nace did not speak but submitted a card concerning the waste in government.
64. Robert Halsey did not speak but submitted a card in support of funding for community centers.
65. Harold Michelson did not speak but submitted a card to thank Council for supporting the libraries.
66. Gloria Padaline did not speak but submitted a card to thank Council for supporting libraries.
67. Judy Bernstein did not speak but submitted a card concerned about the City Manager's raise, street improvements, community center closures especially in north Phoenix and Cave Creek Rd.
68. W. Jazmine Ryan did not speak but submitted a card in support of keeping the community centers open.
69. Spencer Warren did not speak but submitted a card opposing the cuts to police support, the City Manager's raise, funding to non-profits, and golf courses.
70. Beth Alcayde did not speak but submitted a card in support of keeping the community centers open.
71. Alicia Magera did not speak but submitted a card supporting fair contracts for employees and does not support a pay raise and then expecting employees to take cuts.

72. Travis Stewart did not speak but submitted a card in support of keeping the Paradise Valley Community center open as it's a safe place for seniors and a good place to have civic events.
73. Shirley Prouty did not speak but submitted a card in support of senior centers and libraries.
74. Judith Carr did not speak but submitted a card in support of funding recreation centers and summer programs. Ms. Carr stated that the golf courses should be changed over to AstroTurf to save water costs.
75. Tyisha Terrell did not speak but submitted a card in support of keeping the community center open.
76. Brent Carr did not speak but submitted a card in support of setting pricing for community center membership based on supply and demand even though it may have a financial impact on other specific centers. Mr. Carr also supported keeping the Paradise Valley Community Center open as programs are popular and registration fill up quickly. He supports increasing the cost of youth basketball and summer school programs.
77. Henry Glaydel did not speak but submitted a card concerning cuts that always seem to be from the bottom up (senior centers, police fire, and services) and administration levels do not seem to be cut.

Additionally, a petition with 490 signatures in support of keeping the Paradise Valley Community Center open was submitted to Vice Mayor Jim Waring.

Afterward, Vice Mayor Jim Waring and Councilman Bill Gates thanked everyone for attending, and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 8:46 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 6 & 8
DEVONSHIRE SENIOR CENTER
APRIL 3, 2014**

Councilmembers Kate Gallego and Sal DiCiccio opened the community budget hearing at 10:10 a.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. Councilwoman Gallego introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher and Budget and Research Director Mario Paniagua.

Mr. Zuercher gave a brief summary of the proposed 2014-15 budget and asked staff to present the overview video describing the process in more detail.

Following the presentation, Councilman DiCiccio summarized his opposition to the proposed budget. Councilwoman Gallego expressed her disagreement with the proposed budget reductions and requested resident input for creative solutions to the budget issue.

Councilmembers Gallego and DiCiccio opened the hearing to public comments.

1. John Eichenauer expressed his disagreement with the City Manager's salary and spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
2. Stacey Kinkel expressed disagreement with current employee compensation.
3. Greta Rogers spoke in favor of funding community centers and pools. She spoke against cutting funding for Graffiti Busters and stated Graffiti Busters helps to reduce crime. Ms. Rogers spoke against reducing employee compensation, and she stated employees have taken several cuts over the past years that have not yet been restored.
4. Herlinda Cubas spoke in favor of funding for senior and community centers. She asked which centers could be affected by budget cuts. Mr. Zuercher responded to her question.
5. Cheryl Glenn spoke in favor of funding for senior centers and for special education. She expressed disagreement with funding for dog parks.
6. Barbara Gralnek spoke in favor of funding for senior centers and children's' programs.
7. Myron Lieberman spoke in favor of funding for senior and community centers. He spoke against funding for dog parks.

Mr. Zuercher responded to Mr. Lieberman's funding questions about dog parks.

8. Bill Sheppard spoke in favor of funding for arts grants. He stated the arts drive tourism in Phoenix and are an economic generator.
9. Maria Maciel spoke in favor of funding for Marcos de Niza senior center and surrounding parks.
10. Suzanne Amari submitted a card in favor of funding for senior centers and children's after school programs.

11. Francine Masterson spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
12. Joseph Benesh spoke in favor of funding for arts grants. He stated arts programs for children reduce crime, including graffiti and tagging. Mr. Benesh expressed support for a plastic bag tax.
13. Ella Mae Clark spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
14. Suzanne Smith spoke in favor of funding for senior and community centers, parks, and after school programs for children.
15. Lorrie Elvendahl spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
16. Frank Perazelli spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
17. Jasper Hawkins spoke in favor of funding for fire prevention and code enforcement services.
18. Lisa Parks spoke in favor of funding for senior centers, and additional bicycle infrastructure. She stated cities that have invested in bicycle infrastructure have attracted more technology companies to invest in the cities' economies.
19. Paul Loomans expressed his support for additional funding for bicycle infrastructure.
20. Libby Coyner expressed support for additional funding for bicycle infrastructure and stated bicycle infrastructure helps attract younger workers to the city.
21. Wayne Bowers spoke in favor of funding for senior centers. Mr. Bowers also spoke in favor of legalizing marijuana as a way to raise revenue for the city.
22. Anna Warble expressed support for additional bicycle infrastructure funding. She spoke in favor of funding for senior and community centers, and stated her support for a plastic bag tax. Ms. Warble spoke in favor of having teenagers clean up graffiti if they are caught defacing property.
23. Richard Rea stated the lack of growth in the city has contributed to the current deficit, and he expressed support for raising revenue in order to provide the public services people request. Mr. Rea stated police and fire constitute 70% of Phoenix's budget, and if people want to continue funding police and fire at this level, then revenue should increase proportionally.
24. Ann Monrad spoke against legalizing marijuana as a way to raise revenue for the city.
25. John Rusinek spoke in favor of funding for senior centers and expressed disagreement with additional funding for Hance Park.
26. Neal Haddad stated his support for \$4 million of the city's proposed cuts and increasing efficiencies to save money. Mr. Haddad spoke in favor of restoring the food tax completely as a way to raise revenue for the city.
27. Walt Gray expressed disagreement with the proposed budget cuts and stated city employees have already accepted enough cuts. He spoke against restoring the food tax, and spoke in favor of additional revenue for workforce development and libraries.

28. Don Peterson spoke in favor of funding for senior and community centers, pools, and parks.
29. Eva Feld spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
30. Richard Avellone spoke against the proposed budget cuts, especially those affecting crime. He spoke in favor of funding for community centers and code enforcement/blight removal. Mr. Avellone spoke in favor of additional funding in infrastructure, particularly in modernizing infrastructure and economic development projects.
31. Ginnie Ann Sumner spoke against the proposed budget cuts and suggested ideas for cross-training employees. She stated she supports funding for police officers, but she favors the 'broken window' policy more of code enforcement and blight prevention. Ms. Sumner spoke in favor of additional funding for programs that address blight.
32. Calistro Rosales spoke in favor of funding for Marcos de Niza senior center.
33. Abraham James spoke in favor of funding for arts programs.
34. Former Councilman Craig Tribken stated his support for Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) and spoke in favor of restoring funding for CASS.
35. Ruth Smith spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
36. Roseann Redwine spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.
37. Mary Alvarez spoke in favor of funding for Marcos de Niza senior center as well as community centers.
38. Pat Kellar asked a question about senior center programming at Devonshire and was provided assistance by the Devonshire Senior Center staff.
39. Terry Lee Halleman spoke in favor of funding for Devonshire and Adam Diaz senior centers.
40. Andrea Hurlbut spoke in favor of funding for senior centers.

The following people submitted cards but did not wish to speak:

41. Jean Wright expressed support for funding for senior centers.
42. LeRoy Donnally expressed support for funding Sunnyslope Community Center.
43. Beth Medrano expressed support for funding Devonshire Senior Center.
44. Lori Gonzalez requested advance notice if senior centers will be closed. She expressed support for restoring the food tax if it would keep senior centers open.
45. Pat Caldwell expressed support for funding for senior centers.
46. Elizabeth Kiesell expressed support for funding for senior centers.
47. Vic Grace expressed support for funding community pools, senior centers, and graffiti removal.

48. Deborah Grijalva expressed support for funding community pools, summer programs for children, and senior centers.
49. Thomas Topero expressed support for funding bicycle infrastructure, parks, and library services.
50. Sara Farina expressed support for funding for senior centers.
51. Grace Arroyo Salinas expressed support for funding for senior centers and parks.
52. Brenda Sperduti expressed support for funding for arts, senior centers, and pools. She expressed her support for restoring the food tax if it would eliminate the proposed budget cuts to city services.
53. Karen Beckvar expressed support for funding for senior centers, parks, pools, police and fire. She expressed her support for increasing revenue in order to avoid cuts to city services.
54. Barbara Herber-Baumann expressed support for funding for senior and community centers, and pools.
55. Rachel Lieberman stated her disagreement with the proposed budget.
56. Dave Kaufman stated employee pay should be frozen for two years to address the current budget deficit.
57. Catherine Foley expressed support for funding for arts programs.
58. Nancy Kimm expressed support for funding for senior centers.
59. Cathie Regan expressed support for funding for senior and community centers.
60. Suzanne Campbell expressed support for funding for senior centers.
61. Roger McClanahan expressed support for funding for Devonshire Senior Center.
62. Charlotte McClanahan expressed support for funding for Devonshire Senior Center.
63. Janice Forwood expressed support for funding for parks, community centers, pools, and children's programs.
64. Liz Giron expressed support for funding for senior and community centers.
65. Kris Kowalewski expressed support for funding for senior centers and for restoring the food tax if it would eliminate the proposed budget cuts to city services.
66. Marilyn Ong expressed support for funding for senior centers, police, and fire.
67. John Jarvis expressed general concerns with the proposed budget.
68. Mary Melemore expressed support for funding for senior centers.
69. Job Salinas Hernandez expressed support for funding for Marcos de Niza Senior

Center and Harmon Park.

70. Anne Kraidler expressed support for funding for senior centers, children's programs, and volunteer programs.
71. Lynn Ashby expressed disagreement with the proposed budget.
72. Patricia Sipes expressed support for funding for senior centers.
73. Carol Tassone expressed general concerns with the proposed budget.
74. Martha L. Freeman expressed concern about business incentives and their cost to the city.
75. Linda S. Robinson expressed support for funding for senior centers.
76. JB Robinson expressed support for funding for senior centers.
77. Marilyn Baker submitted a card but did not indicate her support for or against the proposed budget.
78. Mary Trujillo submitted a card but did not indicate her support for or against the proposed budget.

Councilmembers Gallego and DiCiccio thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 12:05 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Melissa G. Hoffman
Management Assistant I

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 7
SANTA MARIA MIDDLE SCHOOL
APRIL 7, 2014**

Mayor Greg Stanton opened the community budget hearing at 6:09 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He summarized the budget hearing process, and introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher.

Mr. Zuercher stated comment cards and the Budget Tabloids were available; the hearing was videotaped; and residents should share their priorities. He introduced Councilman Michael Nowakowski.

Councilman Nowakowski welcomed comments on residents' needs and wants. He thanked Mayor Stanton and staff for attending the meeting. Councilman Nowakowski asked staff to present the overview video describing the budget process in more detail.

Following the presentation, Councilman Nowakowski opened the hearing to public comments.

1. David Bridge from Central Arizona Shelter Services spoke in favor of maintaining and ensuring consistency of police coverage, funding for human services for homeless clients, and maintaining funding for homeless shelters.
2. Libby Coyner spoke in favor of more bike infrastructure that would promote safety and encourage bicycling. She expressed support for reinstating the sales tax on food and establishing a fee for plastic bags. She thanked the city for supporting bicycling.
3. Suzanne Day spoke in favor of funding bicycling infrastructure secondary to retaining funding for community centers. She expressed support for reinstating the sales tax on food and establishing new fees. She thanked the city for funding bike infrastructure last year and its positive community impact.
4. Paul Barnes expressed support for General Fund Proposed Departmental Efficiencies in Schedule A of the Trial Budget, reinstating the sales tax on food, and looking for predictable revenue sources. He also expressed support for maintaining current funding for the General Fund items proposed for reduction in Schedule B of the Trial Budget, and taking actions that do not negatively impact city employee compensation. He stated the budget situation sets important programs or services against others, and leads to residents advocating for competing needs.
5. Bill Sheppard spoke in favor of keeping current funding of arts grants and the economic benefits of arts and culture.
6. Robert Miley spoke in favor of keeping current funding of arts grants.
7. Suzanne Thraen expressed support for General Fund Proposed Departmental Efficiencies in Schedule A of the Trial Budget. She also supported keeping current funding for police, community prosecutors, central booking, community centers, pools, city employee compensation, bike infrastructure, senior centers, and restoring the sales tax on food. She suggested the Trial Budget exclude showing proposed staffing for the new dog park. She spoke in favor of items that would improve the quality of life in

south and west Phoenix and Sunnyslope.

Mr. Zuercher noted the dog park is not funded by the General Fund.

8. Walt Gray spoke in favor of keeping current services which are necessities for south and west Phoenix and Sunnyslope such as workforce development programs, pools, and Phoenix Afterschool Centers. Mr. Gray spoke in favor of proper compensation for city employees and allowing labor negotiations to conclude naturally. He also expressed support for additional funding for police patrols, economic development staffing and workforce development programs. He advocated for a general sales and construction contract tax increase of one-tenth of one percent instead of reinstating the sales tax on food.
9. Gene Holmerud spoke in favor of more education of bicyclists' safety and rights on the road, bike infrastructure and establishing fines.
10. Sherry Rampy spoke in favor of funding historic preservation, which generates positive economic impact.
11. Bobbie McLeod spoke in favor of keeping open senior centers, especially Seniors Opportunities West (S.O.W.) Senior Center. She also expressed support for keeping central booking, civilian support for Police and Fire, and reinstating the sales tax on food.
12. Luis Acosta spoke in favor of ensuring there is no operating waste, keeping funding for Graffiti Busters, reallocating graffiti staff from sign enforcement, thorough graffiti removal, right-sourcing city services, and ensuring the city does not over-pay contractors. He also expressed support for not contracting with nonprofit organizations.

Mr. Zuercher explained that city contracts with nonprofit partners in the community when the organizations are more effective at providing services or when it is more fiscally advantageous.

13. Beatrice Moore spoke in favor of keeping open parks and youth programs. She suggested the city find ways to incent business owners to remove graffiti more quickly and for residents to take ownership in improving their neighborhoods. Ms. Moore commended Graffiti Busters' response times, and encouraged the city to increase partnerships with shelters for homeless people.

Mayor Stanton thanked Ms. Moore for all she has done in the community and explained that swift graffiti removal is key.

Ms. Moore suggested increasing fines to business owners that do not swiftly remove graffiti on their property.

14. William Buividas spoke in favor of increasing revenues, keeping all programs and services proposed for reduction, and reinstating the sales tax on food.
15. Victoria Jaques spoke in favor of reinstating the sales tax on food and keeping current funding for neighborhood code enforcement, graffiti removal, parks and recreation programs for youth, pools and central booking.
16. Roy Lee Hunter submitted a card in favor of keeping open senior centers.

17. Mayra Lozano submitted a card in favor of retaining senior centers operations, funding shelters for homeless, and increases taxes that are not sales taxes on food.

Councilman Nowakowski summarized the comments received. He stated we will need a Team Phoenix approach, and recognized Village Planning committee members for attending. He thanked everyone for attending and sharing their stories.

The hearing was closed at 7:42 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Genevieve Siri
Management Assistant II

SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Through April 2, 2014

1. Jack Langmeier sent an email in support of maintaining community centers and senior centers. He added he would support restoring the sales tax on food. Lastly he asked the City to considered new revenue sources and implement pension reform.
2. rethahill@aim.com sent an email in support of maintaining summer recreation programs.
3. Christine Juby sent an email to support maintaining summer PAC programs.
4. R. Hernandez sent an email stating he applauded the City Manager for his proposed budget, adding stating he believes essential services water, police, fire and streets are most important to protect.
5. Christa Lawcock sent an email to support maintaining community center and pool programs. She also asked to eliminate street closures in the Encanto-Palmcroft neighborhood and instead ticket those committing parking violations.
6. Wendy Flood sent an email in support of maintaining recreation and pool programs. She recommended employee concessions to balance the budget.
7. Jeff Steinert sent an email in support of maintaining park and recreation services as people depend on them.
8. Shannon Malan sent an email to maintain funding for community centers and pools. She enjoys utilizing these services and believes they are important to the community.
9. Wen Guo sent an email in support of community centers and their impact on children.
10. Michael Voda sent an email stating he grew up utilizing the swimming programs and asked that they be maintained. He added he would pay additional taxes to allow continued services.
11. Allison D Georgoulis sent an email in support of maintaining summer recreation programs at community centers especially at Longview and Washington Adult Center.
12. Melissa Saunders sent an email about the importance of services at community centers to the community.
13. Katherine Fox sent an email describing her experience of the highly utilized Deer Valley Community Center, asking to reconsider the decision to close the centers.
14. Chris Finley sent an email requesting a refund of their recreation fee at Sunnyslope Community Center. He stated he supported maintaining summer recreation programs for children, suggesting purchasing different vehicles for police, and consider employee concessions.
15. Kristina Waters sent an email asking to reconsider the shutdown of full-time community center support and the great programs these community cornerstones enable.

16. Heidi Spann sent an email stating it would be a great travesty to have these community centers closed. She asked to please keep them open for the good of our community.
17. Allison Pela sent an email stating the proposed trial budget would have a significant detrimental effect on many families with young children, noting for many this is the only affordable summer program for our school aged children. She added she would rather pay slightly more than lose the program all together.
18. Shelly Reardon sent an email in support of maintaining swim programs.
19. Musette sent an email asking to please keep the community center and public swim at Pecos open.
20. Dr. James Laine sent an email to maintain services at Pecos Community Center noting many of the neighborhood seniors are dependent on the facility and the young people are also using the facilities.
21. Rajesh Das sent an email stating that teaching swimming to our children saves their lives. He asked the City consider raising fees or open for a certain period of time instead completely shutting down for the season.
22. Josh Alloway sent an email in support for maintaining summer programs for the youth.
23. Linda Curry sent an email asking to please consider alternative closures or explore fund raisers to keep the Paradise Valley Community Center and pool open.
24. Michelle Geiger sent an email stating the community centers are providing a healthy outlet in our community and help make our neighborhoods great!
25. Jessica Dalsing-Hernandez sent an email to please reconsider closing of community centers and pools.
26. Jim McManus sent an email stating before children program are reduced, all support for arts venues should be eliminated.
27. Gabriella Westfall sent an email in support of maintaining the Police Department, Central Booking.
28. Ashley Toliver sent an email to consider keeping City parks and recreation services open and available to the community.
29. Denise Von Linsowe sent an email to relay her unhappiness in regards to the budget proposal that would close Phoenix recreation centers this summer as well as swim programs at the city pools. She added there has to be a better way to balance the budget than closing these very important facilities that many families utilize during the important summer months when children are out of school.
30. Christine Grumeretz sent an email urging the City to not close community centers.
31. Becky Warren sent an email in support of maintaining swim and dive team programs.
32. Gerald Seegers sent an email in support of services at Mountain View and Paradise Valley Community Centers.

33. Jill Diedrich sent an email in favor of maintaining community centers.
34. Ronda Hollander sent an email to request to not close Pierce pool or cut the swim teams. She suggested raising the fees, get more sponsors, or find grant monies and build partnerships with organizations to help offset operating costs.
35. Judy Wilder sent an email to comment that it is a huge mistake to cut the City's recreation classes and programs and/or close recreation centers for the year 2014/2015.
36. Layla Saikley called to ask the City to please not cut the swim programs, her children have been involved in them for the past twelve years.
37. Lynne called to question paying taxes and yet programs are being cut. She added the City is doing a bad job if they are closing programs down that help keep kids out of trouble.
38. Lori Arsenic sent an email to please find another solution other than cutting park and recreation programs. She added she would even be willing to pay a little more to keep these opportunities for her children.
39. Sara LeSturgeon sent an email requesting to please reconsider budget cuts that would eliminate popular children's programs at community centers and pools.
40. Ben Santerre sent an email saying he believes it is a terrible idea to cut all of the youth building facilities out of the budget.
41. Susan Levy sent an email acknowledging that budget balancing is very difficult but hopes the City can find another way other than to close the Sunnyslope Community Center.
42. Randy Moe sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers.
43. Nancy Major sent an email to not close Mountain View Community Center. She suggested a fee increase for annual membership.
44. Lori Whitlock sent an email requesting the City keep the Beuf Community Center as well as all the other community centers open.
45. Julia Drake sent an email in support of maintaining community center services.
46. Lonna Henderson sent an email to support maintain services at Pecos Community Center.
47. Justine Adair sent an email to not close the Pecos Pool.
48. Jessica Beresford sent an email requesting the city maintain park and pool programs.
49. Diane Cullum sent an email in support of maintaining swim and dive team programs.
50. Shawna Christofis sent an email in support for funding the Pecos Pool and the swim and dive team programs.
51. Sara Malan-McDonald sent an email to express her disappointment over the proposed reductions to community centers and pools especially Pecos Community Center.

52. Vera Martinez, Program Director for the Arizona Recreation Center for the Handicapped (ARCH), sent an email to urge the City to not close the Community Centers for the sake of the disabled and non-disabled individuals they serve.
53. Kip Murray, Executive Director, Arizona Recreation Center for the Handicapped (ARCH) sent an email to urge the City to not close the Community Centers for the sake of the disabled and non-disabled individuals they serve.
54. Janice McCarthy sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers.
55. Bill Gadzia sent an email asking to keep the Parks and Recreation Department budget intact.
56. Joseph Eul called requesting the City not close the community centers. He added these centers help these kids stay out of trouble and keep them busy.
57. Donna Morey sent an email asking to allow the Parks and Recreation Department's summer programs to continue.
58. Lisa Richmeier, Boardmember for Arizona Recreation Center for the Handicapped (ARCH), sent an email to please consider how the decision to close these facilities would affect these families and the negative repercussions this would have on the children involved.
59. Jamie Korn sent an email in support of maintaining affordable summer programming for children.
60. Joanne M. Deck sent an email in support of maintaining community centers and pools. She suggested the City divert funds away from Sherriff Joe and his needlessly crowded jail and keep the money in the community centers, so we'll have less need for jails to begin with.
61. Keri Bohlken sent an email in support of funding community centers and pools.
62. Lisa Olsen sent an email to support maintaining parks and recreation programming and if not all year, at least during the summer months.
63. Umar Sharif sent an email in support of maintaining Pecos Community Center and pool.
64. William E Myones sent an email to urge the City to not close the community centers for the sake of the disabled and non-disabled individuals they serve.
65. Carla Rutherford sent an email in support of maintaining services at City pools. She added she was willing to have reduced hours, or an increase in cost if it meant the difference between having these programs or nothing at all.
66. Jennifer Pershing Swanson sent an email asking the City to please reconsider and maintain the funding to the Parks and Recreation Department summer programs and services.
67. Thomas and Kathy Weichel sent an email opposed to the proposal to close Mountain View community center. They said they understood that there is a proposal to spend

millions on a downtown area park, adding they recommend tabling the proposed downtown area parks in order to maintain community centers.

68. Susan Walker sent an email in support of maintaining the Pecos Community Center pool and swim and dive teams.
69. Shad and Jennifer Kelly sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center. They added they would support increased fees if it would help keep these services.
70. Holena Lebron sent an email requesting the City reconsider the cuts to the parks and recreation programs.
71. Sherri Sessler sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers. She suggested raising fees 10-30 percent to avoid closing.
72. Nicole Bishop sent an email in support of maintaining the Paradise Valley Pool.
73. Raquel Centeno-Fequiere sent an email in support of maintain park and recreation summer programming. She added she would prefer to increase fees rather than cut services.
74. Beth Carter sent an email in support of summer recreation program at Pecos Community Center.
75. G. Ward sent an email in support of raising fees for summer recreation and swim programs.
76. Heidi Granatelli sent an email to maintain City pools.
77. Ang Forsyth sent an email to support maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
78. Aleida Howard sent an email to maintain all services at Devonshire Community Center.
79. Jennifer Mawyer sent an email in support of maintaining the supervised summer recreation programs.
80. Candice Beck sent an email in support of maintaining the swim and dive teams.
81. Bonny Cassutt sent an email in support of services at Pecos Community Center. She suggested increasing fees or raising property taxes to pay for community centers.
82. S. M. Parks provided the following suggestions to increase revenue to maintain services community centers
 - Implement a "Silver Sneakers" program where many insurance companies pay a community center for attendance similar to Glendale and Peoria.
 - Study fees of surrounding cities and increase fees to be competitive with those programs. Resident believes Glendale and Peoria both charge higher fees.
 - Rent out facilities for events.
 - Charge a fee for reserving tennis courts.

In addition, they recommended increasing revenue and is discouraged by the lack of revenue options provided. They also recommended the following options to address the overall deficit

- Implement a "Luxury" Tax.
- Decrease salaries where there is a high candidate pool for those positions.
- Eliminate or reduce pensions.

83. Gloria Ice sent an email in support of summer recreation services at Deer Valley Community Center.
84. Stefanie Pohlman sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Beuf Community Center.
85. Connie Padian sent an email in support of maintaining services for the elderly, youth and the poor.
86. Yissel McCardie sent an email to say closing all the community centers, pools, recreation centers, and diving program would be a great disservice to our community.
87. Carrie Brandt sent an email to support services at Pecos Community Center and pool.
88. Holly McKinzie Beene sent an email to support Phoenix Community Centers and youth programs.
89. Dave Grimm sent an email to maintain services at community centers.
90. Susan Lopez sent an email in support of parks, libraries and dog parks.
91. Debbie sent an email suggesting renovation at Hance Park be delayed and maintain services at community centers instead.
92. The Evans Family sent an email in support of maintaining services at Beuf Community Center.
93. Melissa Lawrence sent an email to ask to please not close the youth summer recreation programs at the community centers.
94. Jennifer Salome sent an email to maintain services at Pecos Community Center.
95. Debbie Barker sent an email in support of services at community centers and pools. She suggested raising fees for these programs.
96. Donnie Straus sent an email stating that reductions to swim programs is irresponsible.
97. Suzanne Hegarty sent an email in support of funding park and recreation programs.
98. Ken Greene sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers.
99. Lori Nitzsche sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers and pools.

100. Leo Arthur sent an email in support of programs at the Paradise Valley Community Center.
101. LG Stinson sent an email to raise taxes rather than close community centers and parks.
102. Nicole Koester sent an email in support for restoring services at community centers especially Pecos Community Center.
103. Karen Ryden sent an email to maintain summer youth programs.
104. Sam Levy sent an email in support of maintaining community centers.
105. Melanie Kaniewski sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
106. Lori Takeuchi sent an email to support parks and recreation services.
107. Cheryl Oliver sent an email to maintain services at recreation centers.
108. Brenda Young sent an email to reconsider closing community centers and pools.
109. Michelle Duncan sent an email to maintain services at Beuf Community Center.
110. Ms. S. Griffin sent an email to not close community centers.
111. Dana Noone sent an email to maintain services at Pecos Community Center.
112. Kurt A. Goering sent an email in support of funding park and recreation services.
113. DeAnn Fedyski sent an email to maintain services at Pecos Community Center and Pool.
114. Eva Willis sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center and pool.
115. Theresa j Mayville sent an email about the benefits the community centers offer residents.
116. Elizabeth Dagoberg sent an email to ask to maintain services at Pecos Community Center.
117. Pleinbridge1 sent an email to suggest a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
118. Brenda Smiley sent an email to maintain services at the Mountain View Community Center.
119. Katie Schott sent an email to maintain services at the Pecos Community Center.
120. Carole Hudson sent an email about the benefits of the services at community centers.
121. Michelle McLaws sent an email to support maintaining services at the Pecos Community Center.

122. Mike Osvold sent an email to suggest raising revenue and share the deficit between employee concessions and new revenue.
123. Heather Meng sent an email to maintain employees at current pay and implement alternate revenue sources to address the budget deficit.
124. Billy Hardy sent an email questioning if the deficit was caused by increasing salaries and why parks are operating rather than paying off the debt.
125. Joel Anderson sent a suggestion to transport emergency patients to a City operated Urgent Care.
126. Michelle Holly sent an email to maintain community centers as recreation centers/swim programs are valuable for our community and future generations.
127. Judy McBee sent an email asking the City to reconsider severe cuts including closing all community centers.
128. Kaelene Harrison sent an email in support of funding community centers and pools.
129. James Rakers sent an email requesting the City maintain full service recreational services.
130. Michelle Lyte sent an email in support of maintaining community centers as the facilities bring a community together and promote positive socialization.
131. Ria Hermann sent an email in support of maintaining services at Devonshire Community Center.
132. Brian sent an email in support of services at community centers.
133. Kerry Fitzmaurice sent an email in support of swim programs at City pools.
134. Bonnie Brown sent an email in support of funding programs at community centers.
135. Maria Navarro sent an email to maintain services at community centers.
136. Barbara Burley sent an email to maintain park and recreation services.
137. Steve Milo sent an email in support of services at Beuf Community Center.
138. Deanna Conti sent an email stating her grandchildren use the Mountain View Community Center. She noted children were more important than empty buildings.
139. Jason & Amy Beck sent an email in support of maintaining services at the deer Valley and Beuf Community Centers.
140. Shawna Townsend sent an email stating that closing community centers and pools is not the answer to solving the budget deficit.
141. Sharon Bernier sent an email stating the budget is not a true zero based budget, that there have been salary increases since the last negotiation ie longevity or merit increases, and to support funding senior services.

Respectfully Submitted

Julie Flaskerud
Management Assistant

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

GENERAL INFORMATION

TO: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

PACKET DATE: April 17, 2014

FROM: Mario Paniagua
Budget and Research Director

SUBJECT: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from nine community budget hearings held between Wednesday, April 8 and Tuesday, April 15, 2014.

At phoenix.gov/Budget residents can access:

- The 2014-15 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Proposed 2014-15 Budget for Community Review tabloid in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the electronic and voice mail comments are included through April 7, 2014.

The community budget hearings will be held through April 22. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from the nine additional community budget hearings and electronic comments are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICT 2
TRAMANTO FIRE STATION
APRIL 8, 2014**

Deputy City Manager, Lisa Takata, opened the meeting at 6:01 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to the community budget hearing and introduced Vice Mayor Jim Waring. Vice Mayor Waring also thanked those in attendance for participating.

Vice Mayor Waring gave a brief summary of the proposed 2014-15 budget and presented the overview, describing the process in more detail. Following the presentation, he opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Ron Christensen spoke against the City Manager's salary. Mr. Christensen was concerned about over optimistic projected revenue and also stated that Police and Fire could maybe take cuts as it would not be fair to regular employees.
2. Melyna Fang spoke and submitted a comment card against stopping band-aid cuts. She supports renewing the sales tax on food or possible a luxury tax to hire more police officers. She also supported corporate sponsorships for Police Department needs.
3. Kelly Pignato did not wish to speak but submitted a card supporting reinstating the sales tax on food as Phoenix is one of two cities that does not have this tax. Ms. Pignato stated better revenue projections are needed. She also recommended raising community center fees.

Afterward, Vice Mayor Waring thanked everyone for attending and closed the budget hearing at 6:51 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
CITYWIDE ENGLISH/SPANISH
MARYVALE COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 8, 2014**

Councilman Daniel Valenzuela opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:12 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He introduced Councilman Michael Nowakowski and Councilwoman Laura Pastor.

Councilman Nowakowski commented he welcomed comments on residents' needs and wants.

Councilwoman Pastor commented several Councilmembers wanted to look at innovative ways to bundle services and new ways to generate revenue.

City Manager Ed Zuercher gave a brief summary of the proposed 2014-15 budget and asked staff to present the overview video describing the process in more detail.

Following the presentation, Mr. Zuercher introduced Mayor Greg Stanton who welcomed residents to the hearing and stated that important changes occurred in the proposed budget every year based on the input received by residents.

Mr. Zuercher then opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Dwight Amery asked that no cuts be made to police and that residents need the services provided at the youth and senior centers.
2. Ramon Aquino spoke in favor of funding for youth programs to help low income families.
3. Doc Dawkins spoke to maintain community centers which provided important services to residents.
4. Esther Aguila Dawkins spoke to maintain community centers because they provide services for the youth in the community.
5. Frank Brandenburg stated the street infrastructure around the neighborhood was in desperate need of repair. He provided pictures of the street conditions at 49th Avenue and Indian School and Garfield/McKinley at 35th Avenue.
6. Barb Heller stated she did not support any cuts to public safety or the Graffiti Busters program. She also asked the City to look into ways to increase user fees and taxes.
7. Al DePascal asked the city maintain community centers and to put a freeze on merit raises of employees.

8. Joe Garcia spoke to maintain community centers, pools, senior centers, because these are the types of services expected when residents pay taxes.
9. Marge Neiman from the Desert West Center asked the city to keep the center open because of the services it provides to the community.
10. Ruby Hill from the Desert West Center asked the city to keep the center open because of the services it provides to the community.
11. Juan Juarez spoke in favor of funding for Phoenix Channel 11 because it reaches out to the community with quality programs.
12. Miguel Angel Lopez spoke in favor of funding for the Maryvale Community Center because of the important youth services it provides.
13. Liz Ricario spoke in support for public safety programs in the community and funding for the community centers which keep kids out of trouble.
14. Maria Myers spoke in favor of bike program funding and asked the City to keep senior centers open.
15. Tyler Olsen recommended that the City provide a more participatory budgeting process for citizens that other cities around the country are starting.
16. Luis Schmidt stated that the city and residents should work together to find creative solutions to the budget deficit, including increasing revenues and keeping important services.
17. Barbara Keene spoke in support of maintaining community centers and asked the city to keep funding for the Graffiti Busters program.
18. Linda Alonzo from the Desert West Center asked the city to keep the center open because of the services it provides to the community.
19. Carol Hobbs asked to maintain community centers and asked the city to look into increasing revenues rather than eliminating services.
20. Dorothy Gentry spoke in support of keeping senior centers open because volunteers provide important services to seniors.
21. Shirley Adair submitted a card questioned the need for more taxes were needed for ongoing expenditures.
22. Silvana Salcido spoke in favor of continued funding for the Arts Programs and the Graffiti Buster program.

23. Rex Gulbranson stated he appreciated the funding for the Arts and Culture programs because they provide important events for tourists and brings in additional revenue to the City.
24. Dion Abril spoke to support maintaining the Fire Prevention program because of the important building codes that save lives.
25. Victoria Jaquez spoke against any reductions to public safety, Graffiti Busters program, and community services. She also asked the city to implement new methods of generating revenue.
26. Andrea McCoy spoke in favor of increasing revenue to restore services to the community. She also asked the city to not cut public safety.
27. Norma Ramirez spoke against any reduced funding for public safety programs because those are the services needed most in the community.
28. Marshall Pimentel spoke in favor of generating more revenue through user fee for the Light Rail and asked the City to not reduce funding for the Graffiti Busters program.
29. Brenden Robert spoke to maintain community centers because kids need libraries for reading/education. He also asked the City to increase the biking program funding.
30. Adriana Garcia spoke against any cuts to public safety and any reduction in hours at community centers.
31. Rosario Guzman spoke against closing the Desert West Center because of the services provided to the elderly residents in the area. She also spoke against any cuts to public safety programs.
32. Liz Hourican asked the city to find creative ways to increase revenues and not eliminate services.
33. Phil Hourican submitted a card that asked the city to find new revenue sources instead of eliminating services.

34. David Solano spoke against closing community centers because of the youth programs they provide. He also spoke against the level of the City Manager's pay.
35. Jessica Rubio stated that dog parks should close before any of the community centers.
36. Rosa Pastrana asked the city to not close community centers and, in fact, more centers are needed for the Maryvale area. She also asked the city to increase revenue rather than eliminating services.
37. Adelaida Garcia spoke in favor of keeping funding for community centers, pools, and youth services.
38. Aldo Gonzalez spoke against closing any of the community centers and asked the City to find additional revenue sources to provide these important services.
39. Bill Scheel from the Historic Preservation Commission spoke in favor of continued funding for historic preservation programs, including a study for the Maryvale area.

Afterward, Councilman Nowakowski summarized the comments received and clarified that the City Manager received a pay increase as a result of being promoted from the Assistant City Manager position. He thanked everyone for attending and sharing their stories.

Councilwoman Pastor thanked residents and city staff for attending this meeting. She said there are multigenerational cuts across the board. She added she believes cutting the community centers and senior centers is not acceptable. She has asked staff for additional information related to community center usage and which centers are planned to be affected.

Councilman Valenzuela thanked everyone for their comments and reiterated the hard work put into the transparency of this trial budget and that everyone's comments will be incorporated into the final version of the budget.

Mayor Stanton thanked everyone for attending and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 8:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

David R. Mays
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 5
VILLA DE LA PAZ ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
APRIL 10, 2014**

Councilman Daniel Valenzuela opened the community budget hearing at 6:07 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the proposed budget. He remarked on last year's budget compared to this year and stated it is now time to determine where the money will be coming from and the need to prioritize. Mr. Valenzuela handed the platform over to Deputy City Manager Rick Naimark.

Mr. Naimark explained the importance of budget hearings and mentioned that this is the first stage in adopting a budget. He also acknowledged city staff by raise of hands and stated they are here to help answer questions. He presented the overview video that spoke of the current budget in depth.

1. Walt Gray spoke in favor of supporting city programs and employee compensations and that pay agreements should only go through management and the unions. He supports a sales tax increase by raising it by an increment of 0.15% to cover the deficit.
2. Jesus Rodriguez supports street repairs and also feels it assists public safety by ensuring they reach their destination safely. He is against any cuts to Streets employees.
3. Thomas Jones spoke in favor of Historic Preservation. He stated that adaptive reuse of public buildings will save the city money.
4. Suzanne Thraen spoke in favor of Fire Crisis Response teams. She also is against any cuts that will affect the protection of children, seniors, and quality of life. She also favors an increase to the sales tax by an increment of 0.15% and also suggested holding raffles.
5. Victoria Jaquez asked to maintain Central Booking and against the proposed cuts to NSD. She is in favor of other revenue sources.
6. Paul Loomans spoke in favor of cycling and increased bike infrastructure. He also stated that cyclists tend to spend money in local shops more so than car riders.
7. Annie Eldon spoke in favor of bike infrastructure and transit. She noted a Baltimore, MD study that showed more jobs were created from bike infrastructure than car infrastructure. She supports continued funding for cyclists.

8. Jimmy Arbizu spoke against cuts to employees and programs for children and seniors. He also does not support contracting out services and believes it uses more money in the long run.
9. Martha Dieckman commented on the City Manager's salary. She is in favor of making cuts to top executive pay but not to remaining employees. She is in favor of reinstating the sales tax on food.

Councilman Valenzuela clarified some points made and gave his closing comments. He thanked everyone for attending and concluded the hearing at 7:29.

Respectfully submitted,

Susannah Pietrzykowsky
Budget Analyst II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 8
BROADWAY HERITAGE CENTER
APRIL 9, 2014**

Councilwoman Kate Gallego opened the community budget hearing at 6:10 p.m. by thanking everyone for attending the meeting, and inviting them to share their thoughts regarding the Trial Budget. Councilwoman Gallego acknowledged City staff and community leaders in attendance, and introduced Ed Zuercher, City Manager.

Mr. Zuercher thanked everyone for their participation, and provided a brief overview of the budget video. Councilwoman Gallego opened the hearing to public comment after the video presentation.

1. Jennifer Longdon spoke to maintain of Pioneer Pool because it was the only public barrier-free pool in the City that served disabled persons. Ms. Longdon also opposed eliminating closed-captioning for Channel 11 programs.
2. Albert Blanco asked to maintain the Fire Prevention Inspectors because they protected the public safety officers. Mr. Blanco spoke in favor of the reinstating the sales tax on food, or implementing a plastic bag tax.
3. Greta Rogers asked to maintain recreational and senior centers, and reducing employees' wages. Ms. Rogers spoke in support of raising revenue through the implementation of taxes and fees, and reducing proposed expenses in next year's budget.
4. Carmen Arias asked to maintain recreation centers. Ms. Arias spoke in favor of constructing a community center at Lindo Park.
5. Gene Holmerud spoke in favor of developing programs to teach cyclists and motorists how to share the road to promote public safety.
6. Anthony Musa asked to maintain senior and recreational facilities and reducing the number of positions in Fire Prevention and Central Booking.
7. Shanna Dumas asked if operational efficiencies could be identified in programs and facilities that benefit the youth. Ms. Dumas suggested the City charge a fee when staff removes graffiti from private property.
8. Michael Johnson asked to maintain recreational centers and reducing civilian positions in Central Booking because they placed more responsibility on Police Officers. Mr. Johnson spoke in favor or reinstating the sales tax on food,

developing a summer jobs program, and utilizing resources in the Contingency Fund.

9. Muriel Smith asked to maintain recreation centers because it might lead to increased gang activity. Ms. Smith spoke in support of raising the cost of program fees provide more revenue for community centers.
10. Paul Barnes spoke in opposition to proposed budget cuts regarding service or wage reductions. Mr. Barnes spoke in favor of increasing revenue.
11. Darlene Anaya submitted a comment card in support of keeping the community center in Lindo Park open.
12. Carole Henry asked to maintain recreation and senior centers. Ms. Henry stated residents in some neighborhoods had not recovered from the reductions in service that occurred in 2008. Ms. Henry suggested rotating programs through different facilities throughout the City instead of eliminating them altogether.
13. Jerry Clore stated all of the stakeholders in the community should face the City's budget problems together.
14. Major Lucious submitted a comment card that opposed reducing services that were critical to the residents' welfare.
15. Roy Hamilton submitted a comment card that opposed closing senior centers.
16. Anna Richardson submitted a comment card that opposed the closing of senior centers.
17. Mr. Haddad spoke in support of increasing revenue through reinstating the sales tax on food.
18. Nora Hamilton submitted a comment card asking to maintain senior centers.
19. Emilie Vazquez spoke in support of creating more dog parks and instituting a plastic bag tax.
20. Henry Barnwell submitted a comment card to maintain services that benefitted the youth, seniors, and other vulnerable populations throughout the City.
21. Michael Pops spoke in support of establishing partnerships with organizations in the private sector to develop infrastructure and programs that promote public safety. Mr. Pops suggested building a grocery store in South Phoenix.

22. Wannetta Davis stated the negative effects of the trial budget would have a larger impact on the residents of South Phoenix.
23. Libby Comer spoke in support of making larger investments in bicycle infrastructure.
24. Lisa Parks stated greater investments in bicycle infrastructure would activate streets, increase revenue, and make the streets safer for cyclists.
25. Vince Nicholes asked if Phoenix was the type of City that turned its back on its most vulnerable populations when it confronted a crisis.
26. Nellie Daniels submitted a comment card to maintain senior and recreational centers, and reducing aid to food assistance programs.
27. Michael Kelly encouraged all stakeholders in the City to participate in the budget process.
28. Mary Lou Mesa asked to maintain senior centers.
29. Jesus Rivera submitted a comment card in support of dog parks.
30. Frankie McMurry spoke in opposition to closing parks, pools, and recreation and senior centers for the youth and the elderly.
31. Bobbie McLeod spoke in support of keeping the Senior Opportunity West Senior Center open because it provided nutrition, social interaction, health and fitness education, and case management for its members.
32. Crystal Houston asked to maintain funding for the Arts. Ms. Houston stated minimizing the budget would drastically limit programs and restrict access to opportunities to enjoy or participate in the arts.
33. John Romero spoke in support of investing in bicycle infrastructure.
34. Gary Brauer spoke in support of developing ideas to increase revenue. Mr. Brauer spoke to maintain services at community centers, and reducing assistance to local food banks.
35. Jessica Beresford spoke in support of implementing methods to improve the quality of management of community centers. Ms. Beresford spoke in favor of establishing partnerships with the private and non-profit sectors to increase the caliber and number of programs available at recreational centers, and raising the cost of user fees.

36. Louis Acosta spoke in support of creating more efficient operational and reporting processes for the Graffiti Busters program. Mr. Acosta spoke in favor of aggressively exploring right-sourcing opportunities.
37. Kurt Mangum spoke in support of researching what other cities across the country were doing to increase revenue. Mr. Mangum stated it was difficult to attract new residents and businesses to an area if children were not safe or had nothing to do. Mr. Mangum spoke in favor of reducing expenses through pension reform.
38. Amaris Plascencia submitted a comment card in favor of establishing more dog parks in the City.
39. Mario Leyva submitted a comment card in support of dog parks.
40. Gilona Galeno submitted a comment card in support of dog parks.
41. Betty Ware spoke in favor of reinstating the sales tax on food to raise revenue. Ms. Ware stated the proposed budget cuts would have the negatively impact the lives of the youth and seniors.
42. Felix Trejo asked to maintain services at senior centers.

Mr. Zuercher thanked everyone in attendance. Councilwoman Gallego thanked the residents of District 8 for their dedication and passion, and for sharing their ideas and budget priorities. Councilwoman Gallego closed the budget hearing at 8:15 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Thaddis Jackson
Management Intern

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
CENTRAL CITY SOUTH
EMMETT McLOUGHLIN COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 10, 2014**

Deputy City Manager Deanna Jonovich opened the meeting at 5:39 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance, thanking them for coming to the community budget hearing and presented the video overview of the proposed budget.

Following the presentation, Ms. Jonovich stated that the Mayor and City Council look forward to hearing from residents and opened the meeting to public comments.

1. Mary Rose Wilcox spoke in favor of continuing funding for the senior centers in the community because of the resources they provide low income families.
2. Shannon Dubasik asked to maintain University Park because of the important services it provides to the community.
3. Mary Alvarez asked to maintain services at Marcos de Niza Senior Center and Harmon Park because of the important services they provide to low income families.
4. Job Salinas Hernandez spoke in support of services at Marcos de Niza Senior Center and Harmon Park because of the important services they provide to low income families.
5. Calistro Rosales spoke in support of services at Marcos de Niza Senior Center and Harmon Park because of the important services they provide to low income families.
6. Grace Arroyo Salinas asked the city to use new taxes to help fund youth services at community centers.
7. Raul Daniels spoke in favor of funding for youth services to keep kids off the street and out of trouble.
8. Ginger Baron asked to continue services at Marcos de Niza senior center, pools, and any year round recreation activities. She also stated that dog parks should close before any community center.
9. Arthur Murillo asked that the youth services provided by the city get its fair share of financial support and that more input from low income families was need as part of the budget process since they rely on these services so much.

10. David Galavis expressed concern over reductions in youth programs that help children stay out of trouble and asked the city to not fund any part of the costs to host next year's Super Bowl.
11. Eva O. Olivas spoke about how the community and the city should work together to resolve the budget deficit and stated that the current budget is unacceptable and hoped the city could develop a budget that did not affect so many community services.
12. Selena Salazar asked to maintain services at community centers because they keep the communities safer. The youth programs help kids with activities that keep them off the street. She asked the city to keep services equal throughout the city and do not concentrate on low income areas.
13. Peter Martin spoke about how important community togetherness was and that the city needed to work with its partners to resolve the budget deficit and keep the important services that are identified as possible cuts.
14. Maria Herren stated opposition to the closing of any parks, libraries, or pools during the summer because these locations are safe for kids to visit.
15. Stanley Johns asked the city to keep the parks open.
16. Gloria Gonzalez asked to maintain services at community or youth centers especially in low income areas where the services are needed the most. She asked that the city be equitable in reducing services in all communities.
17. Michael Stevens asked to maintain services at senior or youth centers.
18. Mary Chou-Thompson submitted a card asking that the city not eliminate any youth programs because they are important to the city.

Afterward, Ms. Jonovich thanked everyone for attending and providing their important input into the city's budget process and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 6:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

David R. Mays
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 1
GOELET A. BEUF COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 10, 2014**

Councilwoman Williams opened the community budget hearing at 6:06 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. She introduced Deputy City Manager Rick Naimark and indicated the presentation would provide valuable information about the proposed budget.

Mr. Naimark gave a brief summary of the proposed 2014-15 budget and asked staff to present the overview video describing the process in more detail. Following the presentation, Councilwoman Williams opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Karen Young spoke in support to maintain services at community centers and stated both seniors and children would be negatively impacted if the center was closed. She stated it would also increase the crime rate if the centers were closed.
2. Jack Davis spoke in favor of leaving the Beuf Community Center open and bike safety. He supported reinstating the sales tax on food to help resolve the budget deficit.
3. Ronald Vaught spoke against the proposed spending cuts and stated he thought more revenue ideas would help resolve the budget problem.
4. Geri Bowers asked that services be maintained at community centers for seniors.
5. Betty VerMeer spoke in favor of keeping the Deer Valley Community Center opened.
6. Linda Fleur requested services continue at community centers.
7. Rosalie Hurd spoke in support of services at community centers and stated how important the fitness programs are for the children.
8. Rosa Pecaro stated seniors have contributed to the community and closing the Deer Valley Community Center would be a hardship for seniors and children.
9. Charles Bube spoke in support of maintaining community centers and supported finding better ways to spend city resources. He stated he is against the dog parks.

10. Alvin McCarty spoke in support of maintaining services at Beuf Community Center and stated persons with disabilities benefit from the centers. He asked if the City Council offices are also cutting their budgets and stated many children and seniors eat at the centers.
11. Miranda Cain from the Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce supported the proposed spending cuts and is opposed to any tax increases. She supported efforts to expand the business community.
12. Dawn Titles stated he had concerns about the budget and wanted to know how the city went from being structurally balanced to now showing a deficit.
13. Barb Heller spoke against the proposed budget and suggested increasing fees to help keep community centers opened.
14. Al Lauwers asked to maintain services at senior centers and stated he does not support the dog parks.
15. Judi Haenel spoke in support of increasing revenues to help solve the budget deficit. She stated she supports reinstating the sales tax on food and charging businesses fees. Additionally, Ms. Haenel stated she did not agree with raising the City Manager's salary.
16. Charles Fortner spoke in favor of reducing the number of managers.
17. Richard Eon spoke against the proposed budget cuts and stated spending is too high.
18. Barbara Eon spoke in favor of maintaining community centers and purchasing golf courses. She also spoke against the dog parks and proposed enhancements to Margaret T. Hance Park.
19. James Main spoke against spending by the City Council offices and the proposed budget cuts.
20. Ralph Battaglin asked to maintain services at the Beuf Community Center and the proposed budget.
21. Becky White spoke in favor of increasing revenues to keep senior centers open. She also spoke in favor of police officers and is against closing central booking.
22. Carol Blundall spoke in favor of keeping the senior centers open and reserve a ride. Mr. Naimark stated he would have staff follow up with Ms. Blundall regarding transportation.
23. Kent Snider spoke in favor or restoring the sales tax on food and other revenue increases to help resolve the budget shortfall.

24. Carol Trevilian spoke in favor of maintaining the Beuf Community Center.
25. Art True spoke in support of the community and senior centers.
26. Jay Caruthers spoke in support of the community centers and stated the center provides valuable services to seniors and children. He stated he is concerned about property values declining if the centers are closed.
27. Barbara Gonzales spoke in support of the community centers and fee increases but supports reinstating the sales tax on food. She also spoke against closing central booking and reductions to fire prevention services.
28. Robert Suich spoke in support of the community centers and suggested reducing salaries of top managers to help resolve the budget deficit.
29. Ron (no last name provided) spoke against taxes and in favor of keeping the community centers opened for seniors.
30. Rupesh Ratkaran spoke in favor of Beuf Community Center and the children and fitness programs offered at the center.
31. Friar Henry Wasielweski spoke in favor of keeping the Deer Valley Community Center open. He spoke against the proposed cuts and supports reinstating the sales tax on food.
32. Suzanne Day spoke in favor of bike infrastructure and public transit services. She stated she supports reinstating the sales tax on food and is also against closing community centers.
33. Mike Ornosky stated he is a City employee and provided several ideas to help resolve the budget deficit including a possible tariff or fees to contractors doing business with the city. He recommended advertising opportunities as another way to generate revenue.
34. Walt Gray spoke in favor of increasing the retail sales tax rate to help resolve the budget deficit and supported restoring previous budget cuts. He spoke against reinstating the sales tax on food. He also spoke in support of workforce development to create jobs.
35. Lisa Parks spoke in favor of bike infrastructure.
36. Libby Coyner spoke in favor of bike infrastructure, community centers and reinstating the sales tax on food.
37. Regina Nixon spoke in favor of the arts and music programs offered at the community centers. She also spoke in favor of police and fire services, keeping the pools opened and reinstating the sales tax on food.

38. Roxanne Allen, a retired City of Phoenix employee, spoke in favor of the sales tax on food and evaluating Council budgets for possible reductions. She supports community centers, summer programs, diving teams and the pools.
39. Logan and Bethany Sterne spoke in favor of keeping the Beuf community center opened and the children's programs, specifically the swim teams.
40. Steve Gesler spoke in favor of the Beuf Community Center, homeless programs and reinstating the sales tax on food. He also supports other revenue ideas including a potential tax on spring training facilities and optimizing the website.
41. Luis Acosta, a retired City of Phoenix employee, spoke against over spending by the city. He spoke in favor of more transparency with the budget and recommended increasing fines for graffiti offenders.
42. Jeanne Bowling asked to maintain city pools and supports the swimming teams.
43. Lou Snow thanked Councilwoman Williams for her work in the community, specifically revitalization efforts.
44. Vicky Phetteplace spoke in support of the community centers, mainly Beuf and Deer Valley, and closure of public pools. She also supports reinstating the sales tax on food.
45. Julia Kerytkowski submitted a card wanting to know how much money was used in other areas that could be allotted to parks and recreation. She indicated she is in favor of keeping pools opened and the community centers opened.
46. Cindy Jones submitted a card supporting increasing fees to keep the community centers opened and reinstating the sales tax on food. She indicated keeping the centers opened will keep kids off the streets and will help to prevent crime.
47. Laverne McArthur submitted a card supporting increasing fees to keep community centers opened, reinstating the sales tax on food and slot machines at the race track.
48. Tom and Rita Kleykamp submitted a card in support of the Deer Valley Community Center.
49. Khue Do submitted a card opposing reductions to human services volunteer programs such as the COMFORT program and crisis intervention programs that help domestic violence victims.
50. Cheryl Colin submitted a card spoke in support of the community centers and indicated it would be detrimental to the children's summer programs.

51. Stacey Arvanaghi submitted a card in favor of charging fees for classes to help keep the Beuf Community Center opened. She indicated it would be a disaster to the community if the center was closed.
52. Travis Andrews submitted a card in favor of the recreation center for children.
53. Travis Brown submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center.
54. Charles Hoover submitted a card in support of community center services.
55. Stefanie Taylor submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center, specifically the sports programs and fitness classes.
56. Christina Taylor submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center, specifically the sports and exercise programs.
57. Yuntao Zhu submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center.
58. Jason Stokes submitted a card opposing the proposed budget cuts and supporting reinstating the sales tax on food and seeking other potential revenue sources.
59. Brenda Morgan submitted a card supporting reinstating the sales tax on food to help keep the following programs and services: police central booking, neighborhood inspector positions, graffiti busters, community prosecutors, funding for street repairs and senior centers.
60. Mary E. Kitchen submitted a card to maintain services to the police department, activities at Rose Mofford Park, street repairs, senior centers, graffiti busters and blight inspectors. She supports reinstating the sales tax on food.
61. Bernard Columby submitted a card supporting increased funding to help seniors.
62. Don Schilling submitted a card in support of the senior centers.
63. Thomas Marshall Olsen submitted a card supporting the continuation of the senior lunch program and ballroom dancing classes.
64. Jacob DuMers submitted a card in support of the gym at the Beuf Community Center.
65. Lorik Muslin submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated he and his friends frequent the center often to play basketball.
66. Nick Wafford submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated it is the only place where he can play basketball.

67. Cheryl Norman submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center. She indicated the center provides classes to children which keep them active and if the center is closed crime would increase.
68. Andrew Cordoza submitted a card in favor of charging residents a \$50 annual fee for residents and a \$70 annual fee for non-residents to help keep the Beuf Community Center open.
69. J.A. Hill submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated it would negatively impact seniors and children specifically during school breaks.
70. Dauntel Dukes submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center.
71. Patti Kramer submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated it would cause a serious hardship to seniors and community members.
72. Darryl Fulmer submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated the center helps to keep kids out of trouble and gives seniors companionship.
73. Rosa Violeta Wegrón submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated the center helps seniors and children.
74. Mark Lawrence Harris submitted a card in support of parks and recreation and senior centers.
75. Reace Lambert submitted a card to maintain recreation centers and indicated the centers help to keep kids out of trouble.

Councilwoman Williams thanked everyone for attending the meeting and providing feedback about the proposed budget. She closed the meeting at 8:56 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Amber Williamson
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 4 & 8
PHOENIX CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL
April 10, 2014**

Councilwoman Laura Pastor opened the community budget hearing at 6:05 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget.

Acting Assistant City Manager Danny Murphy introduced city staff. He gave a brief overview of the budget and then presented the video describing the proposed budget in detail.

Afterward, Councilwoman Kate Gallego expressed that she does not support this trial budget. She added she promotes bike safety and infrastructure as well as personal ID cards. She opened the hearing to public comment.

1. Seneca Boulanger spoke to maintain services at her local park on 67th and Encanto. She and her family utilize the park to play sports and spend time.
2. Paul Barnes spoke against the proposed service cuts and does not support balancing the budget by reducing employee wages, which he feels would decrease morale. He proposes to increase revenue and advocates for the food tax.
3. John Walker spoke in favor of increased bike infrastructure and safer cycling. He would like bicycle funding to continue. Mr. Walker noted a study showing that bicyclists bring in local revenue by remaining in the area to eat and shop.
4. G.G. George spoke against the proposed budget but supports increased revenue options such as reinstating the sales tax on food. She also supports parks programs and its amenities stating it is a vital component to the City.
5. Mary Moore does not support closing her local pool and advocates for the Neighborhood Services attorneys in order to preserve local neighborhoods. She also supports bringing back the sales tax on food and finding other revenue streams.
6. Derek Horn supports Historic Preservation as he feels it retains stability in neighborhoods.
7. Richard Siever submitted a card in favor of continuing or increasing park services.

8. Luis Schmidt spoke against the proposed services cuts explaining that many residents rely on those services. He spoke in favor of the community centers and Ironwood pool. He is against making cuts to employee wages.
9. Joseph Benesh spoke in favor of the Arts programs as it is vital to investing in the children. He also supports a bag tax and bringing back the food tax.
10. Sandra L. Lilley submitted a card for her support of the community centers. She explained they are essential to keeping the youth occupied and off the streets. In addition, she is against any cuts to fire and police and is requesting more.
11. Lori Gonzalez spoke in favor of restoring the 1% on sales tax on food and extending it past its sunset date. She expressed concerns regarding the closure of senior centers, particularly in District 8.
12. Emelie Vazquez spoke of her support of a plastic bag tax as well as her support of a dog park in the district.
13. Gustavo Vasquez spoke of his support for a dog park in the area.
14. Clarissa Felix spoke in favor of a plastic bag tax and a dog park in the area.
15. Charlene Tarver spoke in favor parks and recreation programs as well as Arts. She favors additional revenue resources in order retain services for children's health, safety, and welfare.
16. Abraham James supports the arts programs, library, transit, senior and youth centers, neighborhood services, public works, fire, and police. They are essential in order to retain the status as a world-class city.
17. Julie Witenstein and her daughter spoke in favor of the arts, especially for the Teen Art Guild explaining it provides youth an outlet to keep busy and increase their confidence.
18. Joe Murphy supports a plastic bag tax and does not support employee cuts.
19. Bill Cusimano supports charging for parking at popular parks and reinstate charging for metered parking after hours and weekends. He does not support cutting essential employee positions, Fire Response teams and maintenance workers. He supports additional revenue sources.
20. Anthony Leach supports cutting executive salaries in order to retain recreation centers and other services for his children. He also spoke in favor of increasing funding for police.
21. Giona Galeno spoke in favor of recreation centers, a dog park, and promoting a plastic bag tax. She stated recreation centers allow people to bond and

relieve stress.

22. Juana Mendoza submitted a card wishing to support dog parks and a tax on plastic bags.
23. Dan Carroll spoke in favor of alternative revenue such as the sales tax on food, a cellular public safety fee, mountain parks parking fee, a tax on graffiti supplies, and a plastic bag fee. He is not in favor of the proposed budget and does not favor balancing budget on the rank and file men and women.
24. Jennifer Boucek spoke in favor of personnel that support historic preservation as well as other employees. She supports reinstating the 1% on sales tax on food and extending it. She also expressed her hope in ensuring the budget is secure for the future instead of just temporarily.
25. AJ Marsden spoke in favor of the sales tax on food. She also expressed her concern with user fees as a revenue source since it could potentially hurt the ones that can't afford them. She opposes the elimination of Central Booking.
26. Tanya Callaway expressed her disappointment that Phoenix is not committed to a live/work/play mentality. She explained her perspective while searching possible relocation areas for herself and her small business.
27. Monique Lange spoke against closing the Long View Recreation Center or any other recreation center with an after-school program. She supports increasing fees up to \$150/semester if they could remain open. She also requested more activities be offered. She also supports a dog park.

Councilwoman Pastor thanked everyone for participating in the hearing and expressed her support for senior centers, fire, police, and historic preservation in her closing comments.

Councilwoman Gallego thanked everyone for their suggestions and she concluded the hearing at 7:27.

Respectfully submitted,

Susannah Pietrzykowsky
Budget Analyst II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 6
MADISON SCHOOL DISTRICT, DISTRICT OFFICE
April 10, 2014**

Councilman Sal DiCiccio opened the meeting by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City budget.

Councilman Stanton introduced City Manager Mr. Ed Zuercher who explained that the City was looking for input from residents on the budget. A video of the budget was presented. Following the presentation, Mr. DiCiccio opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Scott Sefranka spoke to maintain services at senior centers, pools, Central Booking, and the Police Air Support Unit. Mr. Sefranka suggested increasing revenue by selling vacant properties.
2. Ginnie Ann Sumner spoke in support of cross training staff to complete right-of-way and sign enforcement inspections.
3. Nathan Mabley spoke in support of reducing the Police Air Support Unit due to noise nuisances he routinely experiences at his home.
4. Robert Topolosek, Fire Inspector, spoke against reductions to the fire inspection program.
5. Charles Wilfong spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food. Mr. Wilfong asked to maintain services at pools and funding for the Melrose Archway and Margaret T. Hance Park restoration projects.
6. Richard Rea spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food and partnering together to fix the budget. Mr. Rea noted the City Manager was promoted which was the reason for the salary increase.
7. Sarah Kriehn, Phoenix Arts Commission, spoke in of funding for the Office of Arts and Culture budget. Ms. Kriehn spoke against the \$123,000 reduction to arts grants funding.
8. Per Klype spoke in favor of raising prices to ride public transit, moving city employees to the Affordable Care Act insurance in lieu of city provided insurance, and privatizing city services. Mr. Klype spoke against pension spiking.
9. Gladys Butt spoke in support of the City Manager and senior centers.

10. Nicole Rodriguez spoke in favor of fire prevention services, field officers for Neighborhood Services Department, zero tolerance for hostility in the work place, and increasing health care costs to employees to offset the increase in employee insurance coverage rates. Ms. Rodriguez questioned the Safer Grant to fund fire fighters and the closure of recreational centers.
11. Janet Traylor spoke in favor of funding for the Office of Arts and Culture budget.
12. Neal Haddad, Citizens for Phoenix, spoke in favor of restoring the sales tax on food to fiscal year 2012 funding levels.
13. Eddie Jones spoke in favor of funding for the Office of Arts and Culture budget.
14. Matt Marcus did not speak but asked about the process for obtaining funding for capital improvement projects.
15. Amina Krick spoke in support of facilities supporting the disabled. Ms. Krick spoke against the closure of Pioneer Park as there is no close substitute to this facility for the disabled who are not capable of driving to another location for the same uses. Ms. Krick asked about the feasibility study for the ABIL Center in Phoenix.
16. Susan Loga spoke in favor of increasing the fees for parks and recreation and senior programming to achieve cost recovery.
17. Nick Ramirez spoke in favor of restoring the sales tax on food, funding for the Office of Arts and Culture, emergency responders, and street repairs.
18. Gary Brewer spoke against all the budget cuts. Mr. Brewer spoke in favor of restoring the sales tax on food.
19. Ed Blunden provided information about the City's pension system.
20. Jane Conway did not speak but submitted a card in favor of reducing the cost of building lower income apartments and reducing pension costs to taxpayers. Ms. Conway stated she did not support the City Manager's pay or water-rate raises.

Afterward, Councilman DiCiccio thanked everyone for attending, and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 7:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Laura A. Madson Brown
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3 and 5
SUNNYSLOPE COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 15, 2014**

Councilman Bill Gates opened the Community Budget Hearing at 7:32 a.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking staff and residents for attending. He informed everyone that Councilman Daniel Valenzuela would be there shortly. He then introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher who introduced a budget overview video which described the budget process in more detail.

Following the presentation, Councilman Gates introduced Mayor Greg Stanton and thanked him for attending the hearing. Mayor Stanton thanked everyone for coming and emphasized the importance the citizens' comments have on the final adopted budget due to our hyper-public budget process. Councilman Gates then opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Winifred Green spoke about her confusion of why we now need cuts after being the top run city only 5 years ago.

Mayor Stanton thanked her for all she's done for Sunnyslope. He said that although we aren't the same as we were five years ago, Councilman Gates has helped us find efficiencies in our city over the past five years. Despite the cuts over the years, we received the highest customer service ratings from the public.

2. Auria and Herlinda Cerbas spoke in support of keeping the senior centers and community centers open. They suggested the increase in the City Manager's salary could have been used to support cuts.
3. Tee Lambert asked how the budget cuts are determined by the City. She supports and encourages creative revenue ideas.
4. Judy Guilds spoke in support of new revenue and does not want to see budget cuts in the arts programs.
5. Patsy Bauer spoke in support of keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center.
6. Craig Tribken supports more funding for the homeless shelters and services.
7. Harold Brazer spoke in support of keeping the community centers and senior centers open.
8. Linda Smith spoke in support of our libraries and was happy to find out library funding is earmarked from property taxes.
9. Sherry Rampy spoke in support of the Historic Preservation Commission.
10. June Gibson asked to maintain services at senior centers.

11. Elizabeth Hourican offered a suggestion of the City putting PV solar panels on every building in Phoenix to generate revenue and reduce costs.

Councilman Gates responded that both he and the Mayor support solar programs.

12. Carol Norris spoke in support of the senior and community centers. She suggested leasing vehicles instead of buying them, comparing salaries to other neighboring organizations and capping them, and contracting for more services to save on personal services costs.
13. Robert Andrews spoke in support of the community centers.
14. Mark Greenberg spoke in support of senior and community centers. He suggested a 1% tax on food in restaurants and bars and earmark this revenue for the community centers.

At 8:25 a.m., Councilman Valenzuela joined the meeting.

15. Paul Loomans spoke in support of more bicycle infrastructure for both safety and to promote economic development.
16. Michelle Goings spoke in support of arts and culture to attract more people into Phoenix which would lead to increased tax revenue.
17. Roger Peck spoke in support of keeping the senior and community centers, swimming centers and parks open. He would like to see more of the park rangers restored from the prior year cuts.

Councilman Gates responded that although we have not restored all of the previously cut park rangers, we did restore some of them last budget year.
18. Gene Derie believes we have cut too much over the years and we must keep the centers open. He supports increasing taxes.
19. Walt Gray is opposed to the proposed cuts. He supports employee raises and suggests adding an increment of 0.15% to the general sales tax, but not the sales tax on food.
20. David Bickford spoke in support of senior centers and community centers as well as more funding for bicycle infrastructure. He would also like to see improvements on the frequency of the bus and light rail transportation system.
21. Michael Spano supports keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center and senior centers open.
22. Betsy Durkin spoke in support of keeping the community centers open.

23. Leslie Spencer-Snyder spoke to oppose any more cuts to our parks. She supports keeping the sales tax on food and finding new revenue sources.
24. Bob Boelke spoke in support of keeping the senior centers and libraries open.
25. Janet Valder and Claudia Cardenos spoke in support of keeping the after school programs, community centers, swimming pool hours and children programs.
26. James Natziger spoke in support of the Sunnyslope Senior Center as well as the youth and outdoor recreation programs.
27. Lillian Barker spoke in support of homeless centers, youth services and senior centers because they keep people healthy which in turn saves us money. She does not support lowering employee's wages and would support increased fees and taxes other than the sales tax on food.
28. S. Elaine spoke in support of keeping the senior centers open. She stated the economically depressed areas are harder hit by the loss of services.
29. Laura Gonzales spoke in support of all the community centers.
30. Barbara Shaw Snyder spoke in support of ensuring the cuts are not disproportionately affecting specific individuals or specific districts. She also supports funding for street infrastructure.
31. Greta Rogers spoke in support of raising sales tax by an increment of 0.1% and reinstating the sales tax on food permanently. She opposes cuts to the senior centers, parks and the police civil services.

Councilman Gates clarified that the need for cuts was not entirely due to cutting the sales tax on food. The sales tax on food cut amounted to \$14 million while the total deficit was \$38 million.

32. Jack Charters spoke in support of the Sunnyslope Community Center.
33. Colby Jeffers spoke in favor of keeping the community centers open for our youth and teens.

At 9:15 a.m., Councilman Gates thanked everyone for attending and left the meeting.

34. Suzanne Day spoke in support of keeping the community centers open. She supports keeping the sales tax on food as well as creating a plastic bag and bottle tax. She also supports bicycle infrastructure and public transportation improvements.
35. Mike Stewart spoke in support of keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center open.

36. Carey Mavin spoke in support of keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center open.
37. Benjamin Spano spoke in favor of keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center open.

The following individuals did not speak, but attended the meeting and submitted comments:

38. Craig Dean suggested reducing bulk trash pickups to twice a year instead of four times per year.
39. Hal Mokbiz is in support of keeping the community centers open.
40. Ellen Judd is in support of children and seniors – quality of life is so important.
41. Gerda Sullivan is concerned that the budget cuts always affect the most vulnerable people in society.
42. Kay Schnizlein is in support of keeping all community centers and senior centers open. She also supports adding solar to all public buildings and is in favor of a plastic bag tax.
43. Pam Fitzgerald is in favor of increasing revenues, cutting the City Manager's salary, eliminating pension spiking and no police cuts.

Mayor Stanton went over the budget calendar and reminded the audience that council will make budget decisions in mid-May. He then introduced Councilman Valenzuela.

Councilman Valenzuela spoke about how wonderful and diverse Sunnyslope is and thanked all the senior citizens who attended today and reminded them that their comments really will make a difference.

The community budget hearing closed at 9:26 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary Scrivens
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Through April 6, 2014**

1. DeeAnn Chan sent an email in support of maintaining community centers and pools.
2. Karen Recker sent an email to maintain funding for community centers.
3. Lily Henson sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Beuf Community Center.
4. Kristel Jonkosky sent an email to maintain community pools.
5. Kristina Troost sent an email in support of maintaining summer recreational swim and dive teams.
6. Nilesh Joshi sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Beuf Community Center.
7. Julie Elefante sent an email in support of funding parks and recreation services.
8. Choi Lee sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Mountain View Community Center including their senior ping pong program.
9. Jennifer Fryer sent an email to please reconsider the closure of city pools and recreation centers for the summer.
10. Ron and Ruth Brown sent an email stating a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow the City to solve the deficit problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
11. Debi and Dan wall sent an email in support of maintaining services at Mountain View Community Center. They suggested staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues to balance the budget.
12. Collen Connolly sent an email to maintain parks and recreation programs.
13. Rosemary Holusha sent an email to maintain City pools and swim and dive teams. She also questioned hiring an Assist City Manager.
14. MoniQue Simpson sent an email to maintain funding for Pecos Community Center.
15. Brent Grove sent an email suggesting the City needs a new City Manager. He commented he supported reducing the City Manager's salary.

16. Debi Huss sent an email to requesting to not cut recreation centers.
17. Micheal Espinoza sent an email recommending the Municipal Court create a night court to sentence criminals, thus avoiding pay the jail fee for those released until their court date.
18. Brandi Flores sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Mountain View Community Center.
19. Hua Mo sent an email to maintain services at the Pecos Community Center.
20. Teresa Lueken sent an email to maintain services at community centers and pools.
21. Jennifer Mawyer sent an email in support of summer recreation programs, community centers and City pools.
22. Timna Guerchon sent an email stating many parents rely on programs at the community services. She asked the City to please reconsider these cuts.
23. Roy Miller sent an email about the importance of maintenance at Encanto Park.
24. An anonymous person called to ask that community center programs and hours be maintained.
25. Meghan Masterson sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
26. Leah Harris sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
27. Jamie Trammell sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
28. Kristen Johnson sent an email to maintain programs and City pools.
29. Janelle Rastad sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
30. LaDonna Harvey sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Deer Valley Community Center. She asked the City to clean up their finances and find waste to support reducing the budget deficit.
31. Leah Derewicz sent an email in support of services at Pecos Community Center and pool.
32. Staci Lesueur sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.

33. Lisa Warren sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
34. Mary Jo Santistevan sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
35. Brian Stash sent an email in support of funding community centers.
36. Kimberly Micheau sent an email to keep City pools open in the community.
37. Emily Sandhu sent an email in support of swim and dive programs.
38. Katie Libby sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Beuf Community Center.
39. Jordyn DeFriez sent an email in support of maintaining parks and recreation funding.
40. Breck Labrecque sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Sunnyslope Community Center.
41. Tamii Kujawa sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Pool.
42. Diane Russo sent an email in support of services at community centers and pools.
43. Shar Zapp sent an email in support of maintaining swim and dive programs.
44. Ronda S. Reed sent an email to maintain services at Paradise Valley Community Center.
45. Jean Pratt sent an email in support of services at community centers.
46. Tory Kirkpatrick sent an email to maintain services at the Paradise Valley Community Center.
47. Ralph & Carolyn Chilleli sent an email stating a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
48. John Norris also sent an email to propose a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
49. George Young sent an email to reconsider closing any recreation centers, pools, or adult centers

50. Kathryn Halsey sent an email to say revenues, not cuts, will move us forward. She added she feel it was short-sighted to drop the sales tax on food and feel Arizona needs to learn how to tax itself responsibly.
51. Loretta Frawley sent an email in support of maintaining services at Mountain View Community Center.
52. Robert Kostewa sent an email stating a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
53. Ruth Brown sent an email stating a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
54. Richard Sparber sent an email to retain programs for seniors, arts and low income participants.
55. Loretta Frawley sent an email in support of maintaining services at Mountain View Community Center.
56. Carol Kropf sent an email to maintain services at Beuf Community Center.
57. Christine Grumeretz sent an email about the importance of the Paradise Valley Community Center to her family.
58. Susan Crookston sent an email in support of maintaining programs at the Paradise Valley Community Center.
59. Heidi Combs sent an email in support of maintaining community centers.
60. Judy Bernstein sent an email to maintain services at community centers. She recommended increasing recreation fees to offset costs.
61. Daranna L. Johnson sent an email to maintain services at community centers. She recommended increasing recreation fees to offset costs.
62. April Pak sent an email to reconsider maintaining swim programs.
63. Candace Jones-Pehlic sent an email to support services at community centers. She suggested charging organizations for use of meeting rooms.
64. Brenna Schear sent an email to maintain services at Beuf Community Center.
65. Mayra Lerdahl called to ask to please reconsider closing community centers and pools.
66. Arnold Jurn sent an email supporting the City cutting the Neighborhood Services Department.

67. Janis and Daniel Myers sent an email to maintain swim and dive programs.
68. Thomas Reeder sent an email to maintain services at the Deer Valley Community Center and suggested employee concessions to address the budget.
69. West Side Town Hall Steering Committee sent an email supporting an added increment of 0.15% to the general sales tax for workforce development (\$500,000), full restoration of library hours, full restoration of PAC programs, more police, and more Community & Economic Development staff for the city's new economic development plan.
70. Mary called to say that the dog parks are unnecessary and funding should be used for swim programs instead.
71. Victoria Jaquez sent an email in support of maintaining community centers and programs.
72. Megan Wahl sent an email to maintain swim and dive programs.
73. Kara Barron sent an email to maintain services at the Deer Valley Community Center.
74. Lachell Merrell sent an email to maintain community centers.
75. Cynthia Grunert sent an email to support services at the Beuf Community Center.
76. Jim Fox sent an email in support of maintaining programs at community centers.
77. George Holusha sent an email requesting to balance the budget through employee concessions and not reduce any services. He added he supported eliminating bonuses, reducing middle manager and executive pay and eliminating vacation and sick leave buy outs.
78. Heather Paulk sent an email to maintain swimming programs and pools.
79. Kitty and Brandon sent an email in support of preserving programs at community centers.
80. Gilbert Gonzales asked to consider freezing pay increases rather than having employee furlough days.
81. Joel Anderson sent an email asking to at a minimum maintain current pay levels for employees. He also suggested paying employees for benefits and let them manage them instead.
82. Kathleen Hoffman sent an email suggesting bus pass perk be eliminated.
83. Nancy K. Williams sent an email to maintain services at the community centers.

84. Erin Rodriguez sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
85. Peggy Espinoza sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
86. Kelly Figliola sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
87. Jackie Y. sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
88. Casey Smith sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
89. Marion Upper sent an email to request maintaining services at community centers.
90. Nylin Lightford sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.

Respectfully Submitted

Julie Flaskerud
Management Assistant

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

GENERAL INFORMATION

TO: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

PACKET DATE: April 24, 2014

FROM: Mario Paniagua
Budget and Research Director

SUBJECT: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes of the final community budget hearings held between Wednesday, April 16 and Tuesday, April 22, 2014.

At phoenix.gov/budget residents can access:

- The 2014-15 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Proposed 2014-15 Budget for Community Review tabloid in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the electronic and voice mail comments are included through April 23, 2014.

The minutes from the final community budget hearings and electronic comments are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
CITYWIDE
VALLEY LEADERSHIP COMMUNITY DIALOGUE SERIES
APRIL 16, 2014**

Valley Leadership Executive Director Christy Moore opened the Community Budget Hearing at 7:55 a.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. Ms. Moore introduced guest Rick DeGraw, Executive Vice President of CopperPoint Mutual Insurance Company, and she thanked CopperPoint for hosting the community budget hearing.

Ms. Moore introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher. He gave a Powerpoint presentation of the proposed 2014-15 budget. Mr. Zuercher also stated, due to feedback from previous budget hearings, the City Council would be discussing upcoming revenues sources at a future city council meeting.

Mr. Zuercher opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Dennis Mitchem expressed support for paying more in taxes in order to save senior and community centers. He expressed his concern for release time for union employees as well as pension spiking.
2. Bill Wiess expressed support for the city's budget and asked about Mr. Zuercher's vision for the future of Phoenix.

Mr. Zuercher stated his vision for Phoenix is to increase tourism, attract more entrepreneurs to the city, and maintain services for the community so that more people want to live in Phoenix.

3. Randy Gurtis asked about the city's procurement process and encouraged the city to choose local businesses over out-of-state companies.

Mr. Zuercher provided information regarding improvements to the city's procurement process.

4. Allison O'Toole expressed support for maintaining parks, pools and libraries. She asked if corporate sponsorship of city parks would be an option to keeping them opened and fully staffed.

Mr. Zuercher discussed the Cool Kids Program partnership with Cigna as well as the new donation from Grand Canyon University to help preserve the city's drowning prevention program and Graffiti Busters program.

5. Sarah Porter expressed support for parks, libraries, and after school programs for children. She stated Parks Department staffing is already too low, and cutting funding to the Parks Department would exacerbate the problem. She expressed disagreement with corporate sponsorship of parks and stated parks funding is a city responsibility.
6. Jeff Sherman stated his support for demand-based parking meters. He asked a question on various water fees, and he stated his support for economic development staff.

7. Erika Keenan thanked staff for hosting the community budget hearings, and she thanked Ruben Alonzo, Karen Williams, Eddie Villa, Mark Thorton, and Ray Dovalina in particular for their help in answering her questions. She expressed her support for funding dog parks, and she asked about bringing back the food tax in its entirety to continue maintaining services.
8. Sean Sweat expressed support for a water fee. He advocated for smarter street infrastructure, and he encouraged the city to reduce urban sprawl.
9. Jill Maruca encouraged city staff to review the polls and questions asked by AZWeWant.org, and she expressed support for the city to work with community organizations.

Mr. Zuercher stated the Mayor's Office has been working with such organizations.

10. Tamika Davis did not wish to speak, but submitted a card in favor of maintaining parks, pools, and senior centers.

City Manager Ed Zuercher thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 8:55 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Melissa G. Hoffman
Management Assistant I

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4 and 7
PHOENIX ART MUSUEM, SINGER HALL
April 16, 2014**

Deputy City Manager Mr. Rick Naimark opened the meeting by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City budget.

Mr. Naimark explained the City was looking for input from residents on the budget. A video of the budget was shown. Following the presentation, Mr. Naimark opened the hearing to public comments. Mayor Stanton, Councilmembers Ms. Laura Pastor and Mr. Michael Nowakowski and City Manager Ed Zuercher joined the meeting in progress.

1. Ashley Bridwell spoke against reductions to Pioneer pool, Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS), Local Alcohol Rehabilitation Center (LARC), closed captioning services, and case management.
2. John Walker spoke in support of bike lanes and increased support for services for the bicycling public.
3. AJ Marsden spoke against closing Central Booking. Mr. Marsden spoke in support of restoring the food tax; partnering with private sector for partnerships to clean up graffiti; removing phone, car, and bus allowances from employee compensation packages; and fines for repeat offenders such as speeding and loud parties.
4. Mary Rose Holusha spoke in favor of community centers and saving Phoenix pools. Ms. Holusha asked that the City not to close three pools.
5. Will Novak spoke against sprawl. Mr. Novak spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food and Historic Preservation.
6. Tim O'Malley spoke in favor of maintaining neighborhoods around homeless shelters. Mr. O'Malley suggested that the City sell unused land for revenue.
7. Al DePascal commented on the City Manager's salary. Mr. DePascal spoke against spiking of pensions, longevity raises, and closing of senior center and pools.
8. David Lambright spoke against the Crisis Response Team elimination.
9. Susan Monje, Longview West Neighborhood Association, spoke in favor of increased enforcement of light rail and bus fares and upper

City management foregoing a pay raise.

10. Sandra Lilly, Longview West Neighborhood Association, spoke against the community center closings. Ms. Lilley said the City should not cut salaries, community centers, or homeless shelters. Ms. Lilley spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food and instituting a bag tax and hiking trails fees.
11. Susanne Rothwell, Phoenix Mountain Preservation Council, spoke in support of restoring funding for vacant park ranger positions for the Phoenix Parks and Preserves.
12. Tim Sprague spoke in favor of the new Margaret T. Hance Park master plan, recreational centers, after school programs, and City pools.
13. Esther Aguila-Dawkins spoke against closing community centers, specifically, Desert West and funding for dog parks.
14. Michael Moreno spoke in support of community centers, specifically, Desert West.
15. Layla Amaya spoke in support of community centers, specifically, Desert West.
16. Josiah Rios spoke in support of community centers, specifically, Desert West.
17. Apollo Dawkins spoke in support of community centers, specifically, Desert West.
18. Esteban Jimenez spoke in support of community centers, specifically, Desert West.
19. Barbara Wallace spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food.
20. Lisa Parks spoke in favor spoke in support of bike lanes and increased support for services for the bicycling public. Ms. Parks asked to reinstate the sales tax on food and create a bag tax with the proceeds of which should not be spent on cars.
21. Jessica Johnson spoke in support of after school programs and recreational centers.
22. Yvonne R. Clark spoke against reductions to internal controls and reduced inspections of businesses required to pay taxes to the City.
23. Richard Zuckerman spoke in support of protections for the environment and against fluoridation of City water.

24. Dennis M. Burke spoke in support of funding for homeless services.
25. Craig Tribken, Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS), spoke in support of homeless services, specifically CASS.
26. Thomas Tapero spoke in support of bike lanes and increased support for services for the bicycling public.
27. Edward Jensen, Phoenix Arts and Culture Commission, spoke in support of funding for the arts, police, and fire.
28. Donna Reiner, Phoenix Arts and Culture Commission, spoke in support of funding for the arts grants.
29. Sarah Schweiger spoke against closing recreational centers and City pools.
30. Nancy Smith, Great Arizona Puppet Theatre, spoke in favor of arts grants funding.
31. John Romero spoke in support of bike lanes and increased support for services for the bicycling public, a bag tax, and restoring the food tax.
32. Haley Ritter spoke in support of bike lanes and increased support for services for the bicycling public, City pools, and community centers.
33. Beatrice Moore spoke in favor of minor taxes to support a well-rounded City.
34. Dave Grimm spoke in support of self-sustaining centers and increasing the fees to use recreational centers.
35. Asato Grimm spoke in favor of community centers.
36. Deanna Castillo spoke in favor of community centers, specifically, Desert West.
37. Dee Gordon spoke against reductions to community and recreational centers, senior centers, and Central Booking.
38. Libby Coyner spoke in support of bike lanes and increased support for services for the bicycling public, a bag tax, and restoring the food tax.
39. Nicole Rodriguez spoke regarding procurement efficiency, SAFER Grants, and Brookings Institute report. Ms. Rodriguez spoke against privatizing community centers.

40. Nancy Kiflemarian spoke in favor of obtaining tax revenue from on-line sales and community centers.
41. Carolyn A. Harrison spoke in favor of senior center; parks; community centers, specifically, Desert West; freezing bonuses and raises; restoring the sales tax on food; and starting a bag tax.
42. Chris Brown spoke in support of the Margaret T. Hance Park restoration plans and raising revenues to balance the City's budget.
43. Daisy Hernandez Lospano spoke in support of community centers, specifically, Desert West.
44. Annie Eldon spoke in favor of community centers, recreational centers, and City pools.
45. Greta Rogers spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food and commended parents who brought children to speak in support of programs.
46. Tom Chapman, Phoenix Parks and Preserve Initiative, spoke in support of historic preservation, parks, and the City trail system.
47. Blanca Melgoza spoke against reductions to Central Booking and community centers. Ms. Melgoza spoke in favor of taxing large corporate stores that use a lot of City services and selling golf courses.
48. Lori Gonzalez spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food. Ms. Gonzales asked the City not to restore the Margaret T. Hance Park and spoke against benefit spiking by employees.
49. Patra Carroll spoke in favor of programs for seniors, children, and graffiti removal. Ms. Carroll stated that golf courses should be eliminated or have a fee increase.
50. Abraham James, Phoenix Arts and Culture Commission, spoke in support of funding for the arts, libraries, parks, pools, senior centers, and police and fire services.
51. Catalina Botiller spoke in favor of parks and community centers, specifically, Desert West.
52. Margaret Kilman, Madison Street Neighbor's Association, did not wish to speak and left a card in support of increased trash pickup and fire and police services to offset impact of homeless services in the area.

53. Anna Warble did not wish to speak and left a card in support of bike lanes and increased support for services for the bicycling public and a bag tax.
54. Mariana did not wish to speak and left a card in support of community centers.
55. Liz Kally did not wish to speak and left a card in support of preserving the quality of life and generating new revenue.
56. Joan Kelchner did not wish to speak and left a card in support of City pools and senior centers.
57. Mark Davis did not wish to speak and left a card in support of increasing police officer numbers and investing in the future of Phoenix by increasing fees that are not at the expense of the poor or marginalized society members.
58. Melanie Legendre did not wish to speak and left a card in support of City pools and community centers, specifically Sunnyslope.
59. Babette Mason did not wish to speak and left a card in support of services for youth and seniors.
60. Kelly Swanson did not wish to speak and left a card in support of restoring the food tax and starting a bag tax.
61. Nevenka Markac did not wish to speak and left a card in support of a plastic bag fee and against Market T. Hance Park renovation and dog parks.
62. David Bridge did not wish to speak and left a card in support of police services in shelter area and surrounding areas, human services funding for shelter and outreach services, and increased trash and cleaning services in area of shelter as a result of homelessness impact on the area of the Human Service Campus.
63. Aaron Legendre did not wish to speak and left a card in support of continued funding for Encanto Pool and Sunnyslope Community Center.

Afterward, Mayor Stanton, and Councilmembers Pastor and Nowakowski thanked everyone for attending, and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 8:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Laura A. Madson Brown
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
CITYWIDE ONLINE WITH MAYOR STATON
PHOENIX CITY HALL
APRIL 22, 2014**

Mayor Greg Stanton opened the community budget hearing at 6:05 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He described the format of the meeting which would include both live comments from those in attendance and comments submitted online through email, Twitter or Facebook. Mayor Stanton explained this was the last of more than 20 budget hearings held this year. He stated City Manager Ed Zuercher would propose a revised budget on which the City Council will vote on.

Mr. Zuercher provided a presentation which gave details on the city's budget process, fiscal year 2014-15 revenue & expenses and proposed reductions. He stated the City Manager's Proposed Budget will be presented on May 6th for City Council consideration and formal action two weeks later on May 20th.

Mayor Stanton asked why Mr. Zuercher is recommending an increase to the city's contingency fund in light of the budget situation. Mr. Zuercher responded the rating agencies which give the city a credit score expect to see 5% of operating funds in the contingency fund. He added that the city contingency fund is currently below 4% and the recommendation would be to continue to increase it until it reaches at least 5%. He explained that other valley cities have contingency funds above 5%.

Mayor Stanton opened the meeting to public comments.

1. Walt Gray commented he does not support reinstating the sales tax on food although he does support new revenue with taxes on non-necessities.
2. Wally Graham commented he would like to see the budget balanced by increasing revenue through development fees and without eliminating any city services.
3. Dennis Mareiro commented he does not want the budget to be balanced entirely through reductions to city employee wages and benefits.
4. Cecilia Marie commented through email she does not support a sales tax on food or an increase to city employee salaries and pensions.
5. Tom Henderson commented through email he supports the sales tax on food because it would help maintain city services like community centers.

6. Kenneth and Suzzane Jordan commented through email they do not support the sales tax on food or any new taxes.
7. Jesse Hardeman commented as an employee for the city he has not seen any raise to his salary and has seen an increase to medical expenses. He stated he would like to see a reduction to upper management compensation. Mr. Zuercher responded the City Manager's staffing has been reduced by 40% in the last five years. He stated middle managers and executives have only received an increase to their compensation once in the last five years. He concluded that any reduction to employee compensation will also apply to upper management positions.
8. Luis Schmidt stated he supports additional revenue options and considering the amount of out of state real estate investors, he would like to see an increase to property rental fees.
9. Doug Arnold commented on Facebook he would like to see new revenue sources instead of closing pools and senior centers.
10. Drew Gomez asked on Facebook where all the revenue from gaming casinos goes to. Mayor Stanton responded because of agreements with the surrounding tribal nations the city receives minimal gaming revenues and therefore it is not a viable solution to the city's budget deficit.
11. Phoenix Center for the Arts commented on Facebook any budget reduction to arts programs will have a negative impact for at-risk and underserved communities.
12. Richard Santos commented he supports fee increases to continue city operations and eliminate the need for reductions.
13. Abe Arvizu Jr. commented he would like to see an increase to revenue and recommends a junk food tax or a tax on items that are not a necessity.

Mayor Stanton asked Mr. Zuercher whether eliminated vacant positions would help balance the budget. Mr. Zuercher responded that due to budgeted vacancy savings, cutting vacant positions would reduce the budget somewhat while impacting services and still requiring further actions to eliminate the deficit.

14. PhxDowntowner commented through Twitter they would like to see a fee increase for pools and community centers with non-resident fees being higher than for residents.

15. Phxspokespeople commented through Twitter that bike lanes cost less and create more jobs than road only projects.
16. Esqaz commented through Twitter that parks and open space is key to maintaining quality of life in Phoenix.
17. Oparide requested through Twitter more public restroom facilities for downtown Phoenix.
18. Marshall Pimentel commented he would like to see new revenue including the food tax being reinstated and would like to see any cuts to employees also include Public Safety departments to make it fair across the board.
19. Steven Vollmer commented through email in support of funding for parks and no reductions to amenities which are already in place.
20. ReverandMaupin commented through Twitter against tax breaks for commercial developments.
21. Maureen Rooney commented through email in support of restoring public library hours.
22. Monica Pimentel commented in support of a food tax and pointed out that almost all surrounding cities have a food tax.
23. JenLongdon commented through Twitter in support of city employees and the food tax.
24. Patty McKinstry commented through email not in support of planned projects for 32nd Street in South Phoenix.
25. WestrnSkies commented through Twitter in support of bicycling as a form of transportation to work.
26. Joellyn Pollock commented through email against the proposed reductions to pools, parks and senior centers.
27. Janet Valder spoke in support of after school and summer programs for children.
28. Jessica Johnson spoke in support of children's programs and asked city leaders to consider all revenue sources to keep neighborhoods safe.

29. Tom Reade commented through Facebook that reductions to graffiti and code enforcement might cause crime to increase thereby increasing other costs.
30. Joyce McDunnough Barbano commented through Facebook whether city leaders have considered a facility tax at the airport and increasing water utility fees over a three to five year period. Mr. Zuercher responded any revenue generated at the airport can only be used for airport operations. He added there is a current proposal to add an excise tax of \$1.50 per month for most residents which would appear on customers' utility bill but is not based on water usage.
31. Scott Naughton spoke against balancing the budget through employee compensation concessions.
32. Blaine Johnson commented through email in support of increasing senior center membership fees in order to keep them from closing.
33. S. Elaine Sissler commented through email in support of youth programs in order to keep them off the streets.
34. SaraBockey commented through Twitter in support of bicycling as a means of transportation.
35. BigGayBrewery commented through Twitter against any reductions to city services.
36. Philip Patton spoke against balancing the budget through employee concessions.
37. Jchasewilliams commented through Twitter in support of new revenue rather than budget reductions.
38. OcotilloGlen commented through Facebook in favor of reinstating the sales tax on food.

After the public comments Mayor Stanton asked people to continue submitting comments and questions. He thanked everyone for their comments and suggestions. Mayor Stanton closed the meeting at 7:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayra Z. Baquera
Management Assistant II

SUMMARY MINUTES
ADDITIONAL SOCIAL MEDIA COMMENTS
FROM ONLINE BUDGET HEARING
Received by April 23, 2014

1. John Walker sent a tweet saying protected bike lanes will attract lots of reluctant cyclists! Please build them. He added bike infrastructure is critical to Phoenix's economic development.
2. Sara Bockey tweeted that bikes as transportation help improve air quality, reduce parking demands, improve health of citizens.
3. PHX Spokes People sent several tweets including
 - Memphis bike lanes on struggling strip = \$6 mil in private investment, 15 new businesses and 30 renovated properties.
 - Tucson is getting its first protected bike lane on May 1st
 - #Phoenix has highest bicyclist fatality rate per capita in US. Better infrastructure saves lives.
 - Cities have seen up to 49% revenue increase along protected bike lanes and bike lanes cost FAR less and create nearly TWICE as many jobs as road-only projects.
 - More and more cities and towns are realizing the need to invest in bike infrastructure.
 - "People... are feeling the pull of more vibrant urban places." - Will Bruder
 - Austin's bike plan update shows how bikes can be useful to everyone, especially in a congested city.
 - The 2014 Alliance Benchmarking Report has been released and has massive data for bicycling. Check out the #Phoenix stats
 - See what happens when you add green bike lanes to a great community? Lower Grand Avenue is the place to be!
4. Lisa Parks tweeted to please invest in bicycle infrastructure. It's vital for our safety and our economy.
5. Sean D. Sweat sent a tweet saying if we make it easier to live without cars, then the city will save money." Amen! He also tweeted each New Yorker has to pay to maintain just 4 ft of road. Each Phoenician has to pay for 17 ft. Sprawl is expensive and "Great cities provide great services." -- Craig Tribken (former councilman). He also tweeted Will Novak 13 points out if we let the state build the Loop202, we'll be on the hook for the roads & utilities its sprawl...
6. Mary Chou-Thompson tweeted Eva at @phxrevcorp speaking up for Central City South. We need to keep our youth programs & human services.
7. Dan Carroll sent a tweet commenting grim projections in City Mgr trial budget with Councilwomen Pastor & Gallego.

8. JT sent a tweet commenting dog parks instead of helping seniors and kids in phoenix??? You have to be kidding!! It's appalling.
9. BikeEastBay tweeted not everyone is 'fast & fearless' but rather up to 60% of people want to ride.
10. Gray Gal Images tweeted Pleases don't close Devonshire Senior Center!!!
11. Sheri Steinbach tweeted foreclosure rate is down, big business is booming but no \$ 4 kids and seniors???? Cut something else.
12. Rebecca Kossmann tweeted #phoenixbudget trying to save us from a nightmare!
13. Michael Espinoza sent a tweet commenting each of these 32 prisoner proper bags will be 32 officers off the street if Central booking is closed
14. Madison Street Neighbor's Association tweeted they were glad to see so many people here advocating for a budget that supports creating a livable community for ALL our neighbors!
15. Gary Brewer sent the following tweets: District 6 speaks out against outrageous budget cut proposals and asks the real question: where are the revenue increases? We can't cut our way to prosperity! and give future Phoenicians the chance to love our community as we have loved it. We can't cut our way to prosperity.
16. Todd Herrera-Ridenhour tweeted don't close Devonshire.
17. Bonnie Harkey commented please do not close Pecos Park Pool and Community Center. The budget can and should be restructured.
18. Rev Jarrett Maupin sent the following tweets.
 - #phx should examine all consultant fees to see if staff, boards, commissioners, volunteers have skills to avoid "expert
 - #phxbudget should focus on city services employees infrastructure if you grow the city you grow jobs remember: corporations need populations.
 - programs for our most vulnerable populations must be funded: #senior centers, #youthcenters, pools, and parks must be funded.
 - #phxbudget must be revenue focused. increase code enforcement and fees on urban residential/commercial slum lords, for example.
 - I spoke to #EdTheHotDogger yesterday, he wonders why #streetvendors can't get a break on "curb" fees while #CityScape tenants do?
19. Jennifer Longdon sent the following tweets
 - The hyperbole that vilifies our #PHX employees must stop. Our city employees are one of our best investments.
 - #peoplewithdisabilities #PWD face disproportionate hardship with proposed cuts in every area. WE MUST RAISE REVENUE!

- MayorStanton #phx universally rejects cuts 2 svcs. what's cost per capita to forego ANY more cuts & fully restore service?
20. Cat F tweet Mayor Stanton can't the City raise revenue by leasing unused space in City buildings?
 21. Amy B Wang tweeted Luis Schmidt: "Even the community in the lower socio-economic parts of Phoenix has said we'll pay for this (food tax).
 22. Chris Bockey sent a tweet commenting bicycling contributes to all of the core values of the General Plan Update. Please continue with funding levels from 2013 b... and to please continue to fund bicycle infrastructure to increase safe, accessible routes to connect with mass transit.
 23. Jo Hafford tweeted Mayor Stanton Good! Glad you're at the helm as we face these challenging decisions.
 24. Anthony E sent a tweet suggesting a Tax Soda! Pour the money
 25. Opa! tweeted public restroom facilities for #dtpmx.
 26. Joanne Moudy tweeted several comments including Mayor Stanton #phxbudget thx for RT folks Residents of Phx are about to get totally screwed by this moronic mayor. Friggi... and hey #phxbudget & corrupt Mayor Stanton WE R ANGRY & SAY NO 2 YOUR FOOD TAX! WE SAY NO 2 YOUR UNION WAGE INCREASES. U WILL...
 27. Dustin Gardiner tweeted the following comments:
 - MayorStanton asks Zuercher what would happen if city just eliminated all of its vacant positions. 560 vacant in general fund.
 - Zuercher explains why city trying to increase rainy-day fund from \$40M to \$46M. Says critical to keeping city's bond rating high.
 - Zuercher outlines increasing expenses, including \$18M for pensions. Says would have been much larger without 2013 reforms.
 - Ed Zuercher: "We're not like the federal government. We can't print money to solve our deficit." Must balance city budget.
 - MayorStanton starts hearing by reiterating his commitment to letting #foodtax sunset in 3/2015 and ending #pensionspiking
 - Because of 60-day posting requirement, that call likely had to be made last week. Nobody on council pushed for it.
 - Everyone on the council in Oct. 2013, including MayorStanton, voted to halve the #foodtax, except @lluvDistrict8
 - They had a chance to do that last week and decided not to include #foodtax in potential revenue increases.
 - the council and mayor already decided to not reintroduce/extend the #foodtax in next year's budget.
 - Council advances plan to raise taxes and fees: #Foodtax isn't part of the package.

28. CAS tweeted Mayor Stanton parks and open space funding is key to maintain quality of life in Phx. Too easy for it to be cut.

Respectfully Submitted

Julie Flaskerud
Management Assistant

SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Through April 23, 2014

1. Steve Hood sent an email in support of maintaining community centers.
2. Kerri & Dominik Scheffler sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers.
3. Dennis N. Schmidt sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers.
4. Elizabeth Lenhardt sent an email in support of continued programs at community centers.
5. Judy Moskop sent an email in support of restoring the sales tax on food.
6. A Petty sent an email in support of maintaining summer programs and City pools.
7. Helen Cernich sent an email questioning the decision for dog parks rather than reducing programs for youth and seniors.
8. Kristy Bryant sent an email in support of maintaining programs at the Beuf Community Center.
9. Sandra Armoto sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers.
10. Deby Valadez sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
11. Sharon Newman Matt sent an email to not support an increase in pay for the City Manager.
12. Melinda Villela sent an email requesting to not shut down Pioneer Park and pool it is the City of Phoenix's only barrier free park and pool.
13. Don Taylor sent an email stating he believes that a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
14. Wallace Graham sent an email suggesting the city of Phoenix should manage expenses and find ways to increase long term revenues.
15. Jeanne Bowling sent an email stating she believes that a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.

16. Kathy Clifton sent an email stating she believes that a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
17. Yanneth Montes sent an email in support of maintaining swim and dive team programs.
18. Bonnie Harkey sent a message on instagram asking to please do not close Pecos Park Pool and Community Center.
19. Nancy sent an email to maintain services at the Beuf Community Center.
20. Candise Holcombe sent an email questioning the City Manager's raise when employees are being cut and employees are making concessions.
21. Cindy Cloud sent an email to maintain park and recreation programs and services.
22. Pamela Franks sent an email in support of maintaining senior programs and community centers.
23. Martin Nordby sent an email to support reducing the City's sick leave policy and to move to a two year budget process.
24. Terri Becker sent an email to maintain park and recreation programs and services.
25. Deborah Kaufman sent email to maintain services at Pecos Community Center.
26. Ayae Katayama sent an email in support for maintaining at Pecos Community Center.
27. Silvia Roberts sent an email in support of maintaining services and programs at community centers.
28. Mary Lou Giaquint sent an email in support of maintaining park and recreation programs and services.
29. Candy Green sent an email in support of maintaining programs at community centers.
30. Grace Salinas commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.

31. Reinita Bradley commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
32. Mellie Trader commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
33. Rebecca Trevizo commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
34. Estrella Torres commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
35. Katherine Quintsna commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
36. Rachel Nizinski commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
37. Uriel Pelayo commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
38. Ali F commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
39. Sophoa Canez commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
40. Cheyenne Wroten commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers

would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.

41. Gabby sent an email to please keep Mountain View Community Center open.
42. Judy Lewis sent an email to please keep Mountain View Community Center open.
43. Pam Boland commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
44. Dawn Malinsky sent an email to please do not end the summer program for children.
45. Amanda Garcia sent an email to continue to provide swim programs.
46. Mary Chou-Thompson sent an email to support services at Harman Park Community Center and funding for CASS.
47. Maureen Taylor sent an email questioning the City Manager's salary, citing opposition to pensions and supporting funding for community centers.
48. Amber Hall sent an email asking to maintain Pecos Community Center and summer youth programs.
49. Melissa Wojtak sent an email asking the City to reconsider closing community centers.
50. Mary Bernard sent an email asking to please reconsider closing community centers and pools.
51. Linsay Reece-Evans sent an email in support of funding community centers.
52. Julie Amparano Garcia sent an email in support of funding park and recreation programs.
53. Lois Ferland sent an email in support of maintaining services at Beuf Community Center.
54. George Gerson sent an email suggested the City implement a Rescue Squad, staffed by volunteers, who operate ambulance services. Funding is paid by the town and from contributions from citizens. The volunteers are paid a small salary, but the incentive is that if a vacancy occurs in the police or fire departments they get first preference.

55. Joyce Sonnenschein sent an email in support of maintaining swim lessons, swim and dive programs and City pools.
56. Deborah Ampe sent an email to ask to maintain services at Mountain View Community Center.
57. W Jazmine Ryan sent an email suggested decreasing manager's pay and maintain services at community centers.
58. Ramsey sent an email questioning the impact of the reductions on those who need the services. He asked to reconsider the proposed reductions.
59. Kerry Fitzmaurice sent an email in support of maintaining swim programs.
60. Wendy Flood sent an email in support of the dog park at Chavez Park, developing the recreation center at the park and thanked the City for maintaining pools in the community.
61. Lindsay and Andy Bateman sent an email in support of a dog park in Laveen.
62. Linda Oliphant sent an email in support of maintaining programs at community centers. She suggested if had to reduce some, spread them throughout Phoenix so people can still utilize some services.
63. Melinda Bonifield sent an email in support of maintaining swim and dive programs. She added she would support increased fees to maintain services.
64. Freddie Villalon sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Desert West Community Center.
65. Jocelyn Medeiros sent an email in support of maintain services at community centers.
66. Marilyn Waite sent an email to support funding park and recreation centers.
67. Michela Bou Ghosn sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Desert West Community Center.
68. Bill Heintz sent an email in support of maintaining services at Desert West Community Center.
69. Sonya Graves sent an email to support programs at Beuf Community Center.
70. Patty Lee Haley sent an email in support of funding park and recreation services.
71. Madeline Ong Sakata sent an email in support of funding Phx11 services.

72. Brian Perkins sent an email recommending the City do more to attract volunteers.
73. Megan Neal sent an email suggesting insourcing landscape architects in the City.
74. Kelly George sent an email in support of maintaining services at Desert West Community Center.
75. Jose Valdez sent an email in support of maintaining services at Desert West Community Center.
76. Mary Kester sent an email to support continued funding of community centers.
77. Joey Manning sent an email stating closing the Desert West Park, let alone the major events that happen there, will have a negative effect on the community of Phoenix and its neighboring communities.
78. Philip Williams sent an email in support of maintaining services at Desert West Community Center.
79. Tiffany Ferguson sent an email asking the City to please reconsider reductions to community centers.
80. Valarie Olivas sent an email in support of funding Desert West Community Center.
81. M Quinn sent an email supporting the following items - Reduction to services: Budget & Research--keep #1, City Auditor--keep #1, Elections--keep one day of Saturday voting--e.g. at libraries and fire stations, or other scattered, already-open City buildings; voting day--coordinate with other governmental agencies for time and location to save money; continue voting at City Hall, Fire--keep #4, 5, & 7, Human Services--keep #4, IT Services--keep #5,6,9 Municipal Court--keep #1, Convention Center--reduce, don't eliminate, power wash, keep #2, Police--keep #1, 3 & 4, Street Transportation--keep #6, 7 & 10, General Fund Additions: Keep 0, Non-General Fund Additions--only for Water and Solid Waste.
82. Brian Kohlenberg sent an email asking to open all pools and splash pads in April.
83. Linda sent an email to continue services at Mountain View Community Center.
84. Laura Martin sent an email in support of maintaining services at Desert West Community Center.
85. Sheila Wood sent an email in support of maintaining services at Mountain View Community Center. She suggested raising fees instead of closing centers.
86. Kaoru Boynton sent an email in support of keeping the Mountain View Community Center and Tennis Courts open.

87. Richard Ward sent an email -

a. Suggested Reductions

1. Eliminate or reduce tuition reimbursements
2. Restructure Health Insurance pay less on single and more on family
3. Sworn Public Safety is above market, negotiate to bring salaries to market level
4. Retiree health re-structure (ACA offers a safety net)
5. Bring retirement down to the market level
 - 25 percentage points above market for Sworn Public Safety
 - 32 percentage points above market for General Employees
6. Cuts in community programs and reform pensions and spiking

B. Suggested Revenue increases:

1. Base on the positive response in favor of the food tax rather than reduce staff and programs, rethink this issue. We have gas taxes excise taxes etc. why not have Fat Taxes to promote general health of the populace and join the war on obesity.
2. Recreation Centers (RC):
 - a. Partner with businesses and corporations that have an interest in the activities such as sports and education (the Nike DV RC.)
 - b. For fee provide advertising space for schools, UA, ASU, MCCC and for profit universities even HS like Brophy etc. The selling of advertising is already done on light rail and busses.
 - c. Solicit grants and stipends from businesses and corporation who offer funds for community services. This revenue can offset cost for the RC and the funds saved can be directed to reduce staff layoffs.
 - d. Slight raise in user and application fees across the board.

C. Other items to consider:

1. All areas suffer staff cut including public safety, also the Mayors and Council staff too. Reduction in staff comes at terrible cost. It is costly to train new staff. The loss of staff intelligence takes a long time to replace. Staff cuts are a last resort.
2. Do not hire consultant of any type for any reason until there is a budget surplus.
3. Close Encanto 9 hole course, reduce other 9 hole courses to 4 days a week they would closed Tues, Wed. Thurs. Close 18 hole courses one day a week
4. Consider 1 day furloughs, libraries, and RCs and all pools closed one day week. Reduce hours in other services that need to be open daily.
5. Delay all projects that are not absolutely needed.
6. Move all sworn staff into the field and replace with less costly personnel. Possibility of transferring staff from reduced departments.
7. Hire no fire personnel outside the funds from the current grant.
8. Close temporally transit routes that are sparsely used.
9. Considering metering water (separate from garbage), the drought is to continue, water conservation needs to start now. You can meter at a

beginning rate that would reflect a slight increase to cover cost of conversion, and assist in deficit reduction. (Long term plan)

88. Pam Hintze sent an email in support of maintain services at Paradise Valley Community Center.
89. Anna Algiene commented on change.org to leave the 13 proposed recreation and senior centers open. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families. Why should children and families have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay.
90. Harley Jackson sent an email in support of the skate park at Desert West Community Center.
91. Max Trej sent an email in support of the skate park at Desert West Community Center.
92. Brian Daukulis sent an email in support of maintaining skate parks.
93. Karen Bedgood sent an email asking to reconsider closing Beuf Community Center.
94. Miko Price sent an email in support of funding community centers, especially Beuf Community Center.
95. Sally Peterson sent an email is support of funding senior centers.
96. Rod Lochmann sent an email in support of maintaining funding at community centers.
97. Ian Cassell sent an email in support of funding community centers especially Mountain View Community Center.
98. Francise Vern called asking to reconsider closing community centers.
99. Valerie Shaner called in support of funding community centers.
100. Angelica Brionces called to maintain the skate park at Desert West Community Center.
101. Ashley sent an email in support of funding desert West Community Center.
102. Gene Diehl sent an email in support of funding senior centers.
103. Ron Boltz sent an email in support of funding senior centers.
104. Marilyn Carson sent an email in support of funding senior centers.

105. Robert & Andrea Goldstein Sobczak sent an email in support of maintaining community centers and suggested increasing rates and reducing costs to reduce the budget issues.
106. Kathleen Dickson sent an email stating the economy seemed to be improving and suggested there may be alternative ways to address the budget shortfall other than service reductions.
107. Rachel de Masi sent an email to reconsider maintaining swim programs.
108. Helen Johnston sent an email in support of maintaining community centers.
109. Maureen smith sent an email to continue swimming lessons.
110. Lorie Eberly sent an email in support of services at Desert West Community Center.
111. Mary V Morrow sent an email in support of maintaining community centers.
112. Laura Alvarez sent an email in support of funding programs at the Maryvale Community Center and the Desert West Community Center.
113. Maria Luz Saldana sent an email in support of programs at Desert West Community Center.
114. Cheryl K. Brougham sent an email in support of funding programs for youth and seniors. She suggested eliminating salaries, perks and other waste.
115. F sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
116. Jack Roberts sent an email suggesting
 - The general fund would borrow money from the water department and pay it back with a small interest rate, writing the terms for 7 years and slowly pay back the money they borrowed. We could do that here by borrowing money from departments that have a surplus and pay it back over time. Aviation, PDD, Water, check each department and see if they have a surplus. They can put a cap on how much they want to keep in reserve and loan out the rest.
 - Hance Park renovation is a long time in coming, but an estimated 100 million dollars for a park renovation seems a bit high even if some of the dollars come from investors. That project could be set on the back burner for a few more years.
 - Look at middle managers positions in the city of phoenix. There are some managers that supervise 3 or 4 other supervisors. Cut out the middle man and have everybody report to next level up.
 - Bring back the food tax is a good way to balance the budget and the least impact on everyone since it is spread across the board.

Other comments - You have to remember what makes this city strong to begin with. Remember the core values, our ethics, how we treat people, etc. The current situation affects productivity, work relationships, and the overall morale of the entire department that they work in. Is there some things in the pension that need to be reformed? yes, but have it affect new hires not ones that already made the decision to work here years ago.

117. Michael Sotomayor sent an email suggesting a partial buyout program to for pension benefits allowing people to retire earlier if they can't afford the full amount and thus reducing expenses as new hire is at a lower rate.
118. Deborah Gomez-Resendiz sent an email in support of services at community centers.
119. Dolores Charlesworth sent an email in support of funding community centers.
120. Laura Martin called to say she was opposed to closing Desert West Community Center.
121. Katie Stell sent an email in support of funding services at community centers.
122. Sandra Evans called to express concerns with closing community centers.
123. Cheryl Colin sent an email in support of community centers. She suggested delaying dog parks and use funds for existing parks and to increase fees.
124. Marcia Stumpf sent an email in support of funding park and recreation services.
125. Kim Bastante sent an email in supporting economic development and support for business community. She stated she opposed raising taxes and commented to only cut what you have to.
126. Lynn Clayton sent an email in support of funding the senior services at Paradise Valley Community Centers.
127. Kelly McKibbin sent an email in support of funding community centers.
128. Catrina sent an email in support of services at desert West Community Center.
129. Elliot Hibbs sent an email in support of funding for CASS.
130. Gail H. Chimel sent an email in support of maintaining community centers and senior programs.
131. Marcylyne D. Holler sent an email to request not closing the Mountain View Community Center.

132. Theresa Smith sent an email in support of maintaining swimming programs and pools. She also suggested not raising taxes as it is not the answer but rather stop giving our money away in pensions, raises, and bonuses. She added the city proposes spending lots of our money on redoing Hance Park when Encanto Park is just down the street. She also stated the city is anxious to spend money on the Super Bowl which will be held in Glendale. How many residents can afford to buy tickets? Why aren't golf courses mentioned for cutbacks?

Additional suggestions included –

- Make retirement 65 years old
 - Stop the retention bonuses.
 - Decrease vacation and sick days allowed
 - Eliminate parades that tie up the city and overtime use of police
 - Eliminate car allowances
 - Communications Fee
 - Cut back on the paid holidays
133. Ron Gawlitta sent an email stating the City is proposing to cut low hanging fruit instead other options. He suggested eliminating car and communication allowances and fee bus/light rail passes.
134. Jose M. Romero sent an email stating he supports restoring the sales tax on food.
135. Markus Neustaedter sent an email to support keeping Desert West Skate Park open.
136. Lea Rogers sent an email requesting to maintain community center programs.
137. Benjamin Meyer suggested the taxation of the legal sale of marijuana as an revenue alternative.
138. Sandy Jane Wong sent an email to please don't support the budget. She stated the budget could be resolved by denying raises and through cutting vacant positions.
139. Jean Bye sent an email in support of maintaining CERT.
140. J. David Smith sent an email stating suggesting the city needs to find a way to manage within it's means and where there's waste - cut the fat. He added don't raise taxes or start taxing in new areas. He also commented opposing the City Manager's salary.
141. Bobby Kelley sent an email in support of maintaining community centers.
142. Barry Brooks sent an email to maintain funding for CASS.

143. Mike Goers sent an email for clarification on how merit and productivity enhancements build from one year to the next. Budget and Research staff responded to his email.
144. Monica Goings sent an email in support of increasing revenue including the sales tax on food.
145. Lynne Johnson submitted a petition with 46 signatures in support of maintaining services at senior centers and Telephone Pioneer Park Pool.
146. Jenny Stahl sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers and pools.
147. Charles Kaplan sent an email in support of maintaining services at Desert West Community center.
148. Gary Jordan sent an email in support of maintaining CERT.
149. Christine Blunt sent an email concerned over the financial picture change since the beginning of the year. She added vehicle replacements are not more important than parks and recreation programs.
150. Supporters of Phoenix Public libraries submitted 124 emails to thank the City for the hard work on the 2014-2015 budget. Further, they appreciate the tough decisions that the City will face in the coming months and they trust that the City shares their esteem for the library. Indeed, the future of our city depends on an educated and literate population. In a city the size of Phoenix, a vibrant library system is essential to that future.
151. Lauren Henschen sent an email in support of maintaining art funding. She also suggested sell Phoenix-based arts & culture merchandise as a way to increase revenue.
152. Nancy Schneider sent an email stating the pension funding has been an issue for some time. She asked if anyone addressed two other possibilities of the problem being mismanaged in some way or consider a "flexible" pension payout—one which is based on the funds available.
153. Christi Grimwood sent an email in support of maintaining services at community centers.
154. Gilbert Carreto sent an email in support of the Desert West Skate Park.
155. Carole Joyce sent an email suggesting –
 - No Tax Increases
 - Please suspend all funding support for "Arts & Cultural Centers" as these centers are NOT a necessity for living.
 - No salary increases or overtime pay.

- Implement a hiring freeze until the budget can be balanced and we can justify hiring of more employees per dept.
 - Have each dept. perform a time-management study for a week to see actual data on where we can make some cuts.
156. Pam Fitzgerald sent an email stating she is fine with restoring the sales tax on food, increasing activity fees or charging a field lighting fee. Additionally, she asked to maintain funding for graffiti busters and neighborhood services. She stated she did not support financing Phx11, the City Manager's salary or Hance Park renovations. She suggested getting sponsorships for parks, stop pension spiking, salary reductions for Mayor, Council and their staff. Finally she added she supports all public safety expenses.
157. Anna Sepic sent an email in support of maintaining funding in the Prosecutor's Office and all levels of public safety including education and outreach.
158. doug4034 sent an email regarding city improving management of its resources.
159. Melissa Crook sent an email asking that the City not make employees take pay cuts.
160. Kathy Sroka Richmond posted on Facebook her support for swim and dive programs and Pecos Community Center.
161. Craig Bowen sent an email suggesting all the City has to do is cut city spending. He also suggested no more illegal pension spiking, freeze city employee pay raises, down-size city government and contract out non-essential services. He commented against the City Manager's salary. He added the City should be a little more concerned about representing the taxpayer. He asked the City ensure full transparency with new labor agreements and implement no tax or fee increases.
162. Bill Wilson sent an email commenting on the City Manager's salary, the management of the City, and employee pay increases. He stated he did not support the budget.

Respectfully Submitted

Julie Flaskerud
Management Assistant

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

GENERAL INFORMATION

TO: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

PACKET DATE: May 1, 2014

FROM: Mario Paniagua
Budget and Research Director

SUBJECT: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits additional budget comments from the Online with the Mayor budget hearing on April 22, 2014 and those received by email through the Budget and Research Department.

At phoenix.gov/budget residents can access:

- The 2014-15 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Proposed 2014-15 Budget for Community Review tabloid in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The additional comments are provided below.

Additional Comments
Mayor's Online Budget Hearing
April 22, 2014

1. Christopher sent an email suggesting the City raise revenues. He added the City should increase fees at community centers and bicycle registration fees however not the food tax.
2. Ann Bogart sent an email suggesting street striping and traffic signals be privatized, and to privatize other departments and/or eliminate others. Additionally she commented no one should be allowed a full pension without 30 years of service and the city should not allow employees to collect until they are 65 years old. Lastly, she suggested a 50-50 employer-employee split.
3. Ashely Dechter sent an email to maintain funding for homeless programs noting a reduction is contradictory in assisting the City's goal to end homelessness.
4. James Emge sent an email in support of maintaining fire prevention and crisis response programs noting the importance of being prepared as Phoenix continues to grow.
5. Kristina Pham sent an email in support of maintaining services at the community centers, especially the Sunnyslope Community Center.
6. Jack Ranby sent an email suggesting the City raise property taxes enough to balance the budget.
7. Mary Pat sent an email noting closing community centers would be devastating.
8. Bruce Mckinstry sent an email to not fund downtown parks at the expense of basic services such as police and fire protection.
9. Pat Mckinstry sent an email asking the Mayor to lead a majority vote against the proposed budget. She asked the City to reprioritize the budget.
10. Mary Lynne Herr sent an email stating she was against reducing city services. She asked to reinstate the sales tax on food.
11. Traci Benstine sent an email suggesting stiffer penalties for garbage in yards, outreach programs can receive help with xeriscaping yards and

clean up. She also suggested using the canal clean up as community service and stronger police presence.

12. Karla Roberts sent an email asking Mayor Stanton to not balance the budget on the backs of employees but to find another way. She added the City is too top heavy and the budget staff that mismanaged funds should be fired.
13. Janessa Gonzales sent an email asking to not reduce City services and to stop attacking employees and their pay.
14. Alice sent an email stating look at the wealth being funneled everywhere and asked why the city does not have its share to keep in the community where it is being spent. Additionally she questioned reinstating the sales tax on food.
15. Gene Wikle sent an email to maintain support for Central Arizona Shelter Services. He questioned how the City justifies such a reduction of services to the citizens who need it the most vulnerable.
16. Neal Haddad sent an email stating that the City Manager did not suggest the sales tax on food as a revenue option. He added the entire budget process is a travesty as it effectively marginalizes citizen involvement in finding a solution. He also stated the planned spending was too aggressive based on an exuberant forecast in revenue. He asked to reinstate the sales tax on food.
17. Tim O'Malley sent an email saying the City made a commitment to serve the homeless and to keep safe the neighboring areas around the shelter.
18. Breaktofix sent an email noting the City was balancing the deficit on employees' backs, yet noting the City Manager's salary. He stated he hopes that people think about what they are doing and how many people will be affected by the choices.
19. Evert Andersen sent an email with the following suggestions
 - Cut all city officers and employees wages by 5% as many of those who work outside of government received a cut in hours and a 10% cut.
 - Zero in on traffic violations such as driving on out of state plates and living here.
 - Fines for load radios.
 - Fines for non-muffled vehicles.
 - More radar and higher fines for speeders.
 - Cut down on the bulk trash pick up to once every six months.
 - Cut back on the purchase of vehicles by driving the vehicles an extra two years.

- Simplify the water bills to a simple post card cutting stationary costs.
 - Eliminate street lights where there are frontage roads with lights.
 - At 35th Ave and Cactus area, there are many duplications of street lights.
20. Jodie Snyder sent an email in support maintaining tennis classes at Encanto Park.
 21. Richard Rea sent an email stating he strongly believes that the current budget (and those for several years to come) should be increased to cover those projects that have been delayed, cancelled or just under-funded. He added it is neither the current Council nor the workers for the city of Phoenix causing the current problem. He commented without a significant source of future funding, it will be almost impossible. Lastly, he stated we all have to roll up our sleeves, pitch in, pay more and pay for the services that our citizens need and deserve.
 22. Trish McCarty sent an email to consider any programs having to do with youth engagement, especially military working with the kids to learn on-the-job-training. She added we could accomplish job training and perform needed city work by enlisting our kids.
 23. Bill Cusimano sent an email asking the Council to ask employees for their input on the budget and suggested changes. He added the City may be surprised at the sacrifices that employees may be willing to make, however he suggested that there needs something that is fair to all.
 24. Dave Drake sent an email suggesting the following reductions
 - An 10% reduction in government salaries for any amount over \$100,000; Frank Fairbanks was never paid this and the City was better run.
 - A 10% tax on all government salaries over \$100,000.
 - Outsource items like changing oil and routine maintenance on government vehicles to save money.
 - Reduce redundancies in overlapping regulations and work processes within the government
 25. Katie McClure sent an email stating she was disappointed about the cut to the sales tax on food and the potential impact of closing senior centers and pools. She asked that the City do something to rectify the situation.
 26. Ryan McClure sent an email stating cutting the sales tax on food was not in the City's favor. He added balancing the budget by cutting the community and employees does not fix the problem of bad decision-making.

27. Bert Aldieiri sent an email suggesting identifying City services that offer low value to residents or offer services that can be served by the private sector and remove them from the budget. He added we also need to provide incentives to business growth in our city.
28. Susan Rajchel sent an email strongly opposed to the sales tax of food.
29. Caroline Condit sent an email strongly opposed to the sales tax on food.
30. Sam Oliver sent an email saying it is not right to balance your budget on the tax payers and your City employees. He asked to fix the budget in a different way as it is the City's management of funds that have caused this budget problem in the first place.
31. Joseph Caiola sent an email asking the City to say no to the sales tax on food, union workers and city employee salary and pension increases.
32. Steve Vollmer sent an email asking the Council to vote yes to maintain funding for Encanto Park.
33. Tom Cox sent an email to maintain funding to ensure elderly & under privileged are not short changed.
34. Helen Burland sent an email to raise alarm fees to \$15 annually and increase dog license fees.
35. Susan Dale sent an email concerned about the proposed reductions to the Phoenix Parks and Recreation Department's facilities, programs and services throughout the city including all 13 full-service community centers, resulting in the elimination of full-day supervised summer recreation programs, the elimination of recreational swim and dive team programs at all city pools, the elimination of supervised activities at Rose Mofford and Encanto Sports Complexes. She added of particular concern for my neighborhood are those reductions that would have a significant impact on our beloved, beautifully renovated Encanto Park. Lastly she stated she would like to see the city food tax restored.
36. Robert Fiore sent an email commenting
 - NO to big spenders, live within our means.
 - NO to the FOOD TAX
 - NO to Union Workers and City Employees salary & pension increases while pools, libraries, and senior centers are CLOSED down due to lack of funds.
37. Lynn Remelski sent an email stating she wants the city to live within its means.

38. Suzanne Jordan sent an email stating no on the sales tax on food. She added Phoenix needs to live within its means.
39. James Shoat sent an email commenting against employee pay reductions.
40. Dennis Mareiro sent an email to remind people that employees have kept the City running the past few years. He added employees have families to take care of.
41. S. Pierce sent an email asking to not increase staff salaries.
42. Bdpcole sent an email questioning the acceptability of continuing to balance the budget on the backs of employees. The email also noted it was shortsighted to end the sales tax on food early instead of keeping promises to employees. Lastly, is stated the more employees are cut, the less they have to spend on taxable items in Phoenix.
43. Marcia Viedmark sent an email to maintain funding to retain Neighborhood Services Department staff.
44. Alison Richardson sent an email stating the pension system is breaking the City. She asked to get the pension system under control and to reinstate the sales tax on food.
45. Frank Maglietta sent an email suggesting increase of taxes on cigarettes, hard liquor, hotels and motels.
46. Glen Ocotillo Neighborhood sent an email stating the City should raise revenue and not cut any critical services.
47. Kathleen Jayne sent an email to disagree with the City Manager's salary. She added the City should live within its means.
48. Martin Jiminez sent an email to look at revenue alternatives, noting employee pay should not be sacrificed.
49. Dan Suchoff sent an email saying it was too easy to just raise taxes and fees. He challenges the City to eliminate marginal programs, gain efficiencies and cut fat rather than raising taxes.
50. Gordon sent an email stated when it was voted to stop the sales tax on food; people were told it would not impact services and employees. He suggested following through on the promise.
51. Tom Ziegmann tweeted, "I had really high hopes for Mayor Stanton, but he's proven he's just another Democrat in it for himself and bigger

government, such a shame. He added Seriously Mayor Stanton - You have the nerve to propose raising taxes on residents?! How about living within your means like the rest of us”

52. Jim Thomas tweeted, “Mayor Stanton Why are the streets and roads in such bad shape but you have given all of you big raises, undeserved.”
53. Theresa Womack sent a tweet, “Mayor Stanton, Thomas road between 35th ave and 43rd ave needs to be repaved. Can we budget that in?”
54. Greg Knauss tweeted, “Mayor Stanton why are police and fire taking concession again? Will it be 4 years before they get a chance to get back the 11% they gave up?”
55. AFSCME 2384 tweeted, “Mayor Stanton Has city looked at increasing fees for rental properties. Thousands of out of state property owners who have rental properties. They added this budget will mean 6 years of concession contracts. We need to find viable solutions rather than to blame public servants.”
56. Derek Montilla tweeted, “Mayor Stanton to save the community centers and programs.”
57. David Leibowitz tweeted he did not believe that a promotion that comes along with a \$56K pay increase a "raise".
58. Byron Baldwin posted on Facebook to maintain funding for the Beuf Community Center.
59. Doug Arnold posted on Facebook a suggestion to find revenue resources instead of closing down swimming pools and senior centers.
60. Anna Maria Thornton posted comments against employee pay raises. She added the City is now asking residents to pay more to make up for bad budgeting decisions. She added be assured we will buy all our products in other cities if you decide to raise the taxes. If you decide to charge a bag tax, we will bring our own bags, if you raise water rates we will haul in our own water. Stop with bad budgeting decisions.
61. Tom Reade posted commented if the City cuts homeless shelter funding, graffiti and code enforcement, won't crime go up, thus increasing other costs.
62. Joyce McDonough Barbano commented, “Mayor Stanton, has any consideration been made to look at adding a facility tax/tarmac tax/terminal tax for Sky Harbor Airport for each ticket issued to bring added revenue to help reduce the deficit? Also, with the costs of water/sewer operating costs continually increasing to the city, any

thoughts to increasing water bills on sliding scale to water users over a 3-5 year plan to offset the costs?"

63. Cristina Fitch posted a comment in support of the sales tax on food.
64. Buffalo Rick Galeener posted to support cutting salaries and pensions.

Respectfully Submitted

Julie Flaskerud
Management Assistant

SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Through April 30, 2014

1. A petition with 147 signatures was submitted in support of maintaining services at all senior centers.
2. Desert Mission sent a letter concerned about the proposed reduction of funding to local food banks.
3. Melissa Crook sent an email in support of maintaining employee pay.
4. Kathy Sroke Richmond posted comments on her concerns of possible reductions to swim and dive team programs.
5. Craig Bowen sent an email suggesting the City cut City spending, end pension spiking, freeze employee pay increases, down size government by contracting non-essential services, and maintain the City Manager's salary. He added he did not support tax or fee increases.
6. Job Hernandez commented at change.org to leave the 13 proposed Recreation and Senior Centers open. The City of Phoenix has already cut multiple School activities in addition to the after school programs created for our youth of today. The closure of these recreation centers would impact thousands of families throughout the metropolitan area, not to mention the children directly. Why should they have to pay the cost to increase City officials pay, when ultimately they are losing more than a place to learn and expand their minds and talents.
7. David Martinez sent an email about the impact St. Mary's Food Bank has on the community. It stated in 2013, St. Mary's Food Bank distributed, with the assistance of more than 275 active agencies and food distribution partners in Phoenix, nearly 66 million pounds of food to Phoenicians in need. That includes serving more than 500 children daily meals at City of Phoenix community and recreation centers proposed for closure, as well as providing more than 1,500 seniors and families food boxes and fresh produce monthly in City of Phoenix seniors centers proposed for closure.
8. Cyndy Beckham sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Beuf Community Center.
9. Daniel Baugh sent an email in support of maintaining community centers.
10. Jenny Boone sent an email to support recreational swim programs.

11. Carrie Kaput sent an email asking to maintain services at community centers and pools.
12. Teryl Sands sent an email to support of maintaining swim and dive team programs. Additionally, she stated she would like to see it fully restored to pre-recession levels.
13. Laurie Devine, as an avid pickleball player, sent an email in support of maintaining programs and services at community centers
14. Emily Crapo sent an email in support of maintaining summer youth activities.
15. Mary Reid sent an email in support of keeping the Paradise Valley Senior Center open.
16. Jane Sanderson sent an email about the positive impact Devonshire Center has on seniors and the community.
17. Dave Cameron sent an email in support of maintaining services at the community centers.
18. Cathy Humphrey sent an email in support of maintaining Telephone Pioneer Park, the only pool in Phoenix that is uniquely designed for special needs participants.
19. Wendy Flood sent an email with the following suggestions:

General Fund proposed Dept. efficiencies:

- Extend the life of city vehicles and ensure proper maintenance before purchasing new vehicles.
- Do not eliminate any administrative staff, as they are a necessary component to a high functioning work group.

Agreed with all proposed reductions except the following:

City Council –

Do not reduce the funds to do community outreach and constituent service and instead of an overall reduction to City Council budget and let each councilperson decide what should be cut or reduce; They know there offices best.

City Manager's office –

Do not eliminate as volunteers are needed more than ever and save the City money.

Equal Opportunity -
One support staff reduction is enough.

Finance -
Do not cut staff involved with paying vendors - credit rating is important and that would affect it and the quality of future vendors who would want to work for the City.

Fire -
Do not cut pool safety programs and reduce fewer civilians.

Human Resources -
Do not cut Human Resources staff as training and fraud prevention save the City money.

Human Service -
Do not cut senior programs or senior centers. Do not cut volunteer coordinator. Do not cut homeless shelter funding as it will hurt the City's image and those in need.

Law - City Prosecutor
Do not cut community prosecution or there will be blight in the community.

Mayor -
Do not cut constituent and outreach services, let the Mayor decide what to cut.

Municipal Court –
Do not cut as many positions or those that impact revenue collection.

Neighborhood Services -
Do not cut Graffiti and support less reduction to code enforcement program.

Parks and Recreation –
Do not cut so deeply into parks and recreation programs.

Police -
Keep central booking open and consider adding fewer civilians to save costs.

Public Information Office -
Do not fully cut Channel 11 programming.

Public Works -
Do not cut so deeply into Public Works.

Street Transportation -

Supports cutting elimination of the 15 mph signs in and opposed to adding operation of new facilities funds for street landscape maintenance.

Planning and Development –

Add fewer positions in Planning and Development Department.

Solid Waste –

Opposed to added funding for recycling programs.

Opposed to food tax. Look at other revenue sources, such as alcohol sales tax and all aspect of adult entertainment, cigarettes and taxing soda.

Supports adding more fees to permits and anything that the city reviews or approves. Increase the library fines by .25\$ or .50\$, increase the pool admission by \$1, swim lesson by \$10, other city classes a few \$\$ here and there.

Supports adding needed services to the South Mountain area and Laveen such as a community, streets and weeds that need attention, vacant lots, bus stops with no shade, a conveyance channel that has the potential to be as lush and glorious as Scottsdale greenbelt or the 48th street channel.

Respectfully Submitted

Julie Flaskerud
Management Assistant