



## City of Phoenix

**To:** Ed Zuercher  
City Manager

**Date:** April 5, 2017

**From:** Jeff Barton  
Budget and Research Department Director

**Subject:** COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the first five community budget hearings. These hearings were held Tuesday, April 4, 2017 at [Helen Drake Senior Center, Pecos Community Center, Steele Indian School Park, Pendergast Community Center and Devonshire Community Center](#). The Budget and Research Department also maintains an [e-mail address](#) and a [voice mailbox for residents](#) to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the electronic and voice mail comments are also included.

At [phoenix.gov/Budget](http://phoenix.gov/Budget) residents can access:

- The 2017-18 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2017-18 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The community budget hearings will be held through April 20. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from the first five community budget hearings and initial electronic comments responded to are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 1 & 5  
HELEN DRAKE SENIOR CENTER  
April 4, 2017**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the community budget hearing at 8:30 a.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He mentioned comments would be recorded and provided to all the City Council members. Mr. Zuercher explained the budget hearing process and mentioned they would be videotaped and made available on PHX11 TV. He mentioned the detailed Trial Budget documents were available on the City's website.

Mr. Zuercher gave a brief summary of the proposed 2017-18 budget and presented a video describing the process in more detail.

Councilwoman Williams welcomed those in attendance and asked for feedback on the proposed Trial Budget.

Mr. Zuercher opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Mr. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of the increased funding for homeless services and Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) program. Mr. Tribken commented the caseworker load was extremely high at 50-1, noting how vital caseworkers were to assisting people through the program. Councilwoman Williams expressed her concern for the complex issue of homelessness and commented on how vital the CASS program is to the community.
2. Mr. Keith Preston spoke in support of funding for arts and culture programs. He expressed the need for an increase in arts maintenance funds. Councilwoman Williams thanked Mr. Preston for serving on the Arizona Commission on the Arts and agreed with the importance of maintenance.
3. Ms. Sue Soto expressed her support for the library programs. She commented on the need to increase library branch hours of operations. Councilwoman Williams thanked Ms. Soto for all her work with the Friends of the Library program. She agreed how important the library was to the community and for providing afterschool youth programs.
4. Ms. Coni Cabot expressed her support for efficiency within departments. She commented on a minor accident that happened in front of her house and how long the police had investigated the incident. Mr. Zuercher discussed how the proposed budget included adding funding for 16 civilian Police Assistants to respond to non-emergency calls for service, noting it would free up police officers for more critical calls.

Ms. Cabot expressed her support for enforcement of traffic laws to increase revenue. She also asked for clarification on employee pension eligibility. Mr. Zuercher discussed the city's pension eligibility.

5. Ms. Tamera Cline commented on the need for better infrastructure and landscape maintenance. Councilwoman Williams commented on how the Transportation 2050 program would improve infrastructure and street maintenance.

6. Mr. Darrell Kriplean submitted a card expressing his concern for the Police Department staffing crisis.

City Manager Ed Zuercher and Councilwoman Williams thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 9:16 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jesse Benavidez  
Management Assistant II  
Budget & Research Department

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 6  
PECOS COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 4, 2017**

Councilman Sal DiCiccio opened the community budget hearing at 8:30 a.m. welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua also thanked everyone for attending. Mr. Paniagua provided an overview of how public input is used in the City of Phoenix budgeting process. Jeff Barton, Budget and Research Director, Councilman Sal DiCiccio and Seth Scott, Mayor's Chief of Staff were introduced.

An overview video was presented, describing the Trial Budget components in more detail. Following the video presentation, the hearing was opened to public comments.

1. Don Heckhaus submitted a card requesting information about the actions for resolving the city's unfunded pension liability. Mr. Barton responded to the question by highlighting pension reform savings that will have a significant impact over a number of years (e.g., higher pension contribution rate for new employees.)
2. Bill Sheppard spoke in favor of the arts noting his organization's Friends of Phoenix Arts work to raise funds supporting arts maintenance and requesting City of Phoenix's support to match funds raised to support arts maintenance.
3. Nancy Rink spoke in favor of the arts requesting continued investment in the program.
4. Kathryn Sheppard submitted a card noting support of more funding to preserve public art and art grants.
5. Greta Rogers spoke in favor of increased public safety and street repair funding and requested additional park rangers identified for flatland parks be reallocated to preserves.
6. Mary Conant spoke in favor of an increased public safety presence in the community.
7. Robin Salthouse spoke in favor of funding additional park rangers and trail maintenance for improved safety at mountain preserves. Councilman Sal DiCiccio pointed out contributions Ms. Salthouse has made to open space/preserves in the past and noted the improvements that are planned for trails in the trial budget.
8. Derrick Johnson spoke in favor of supporting funding for homelessness/CASS.

Councilman DiCiccio thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 9:15 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mari Tunder  
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4  
STEELE INDIAN SCHOOL PARK  
APRIL 4, 2017**

Paul Blue, Deputy City Manager, opened the community budget hearing at 6:00 p.m. welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He introduced David Longoria, the District 4 Chief of Staff. Mr. Blue gave a brief summary of the proposed 2017-18 budget and presented a video describing the process in more detail.

Following the video presentation, the hearing was opened to public comments.

1. Bill Sheppard spoke in favor of the arts, noting his organization's Friends of Phoenix Arts works to raise funds supporting the arts and requested additional support for the arts this year which would give back to the City in the future.
2. Justin Johnson thanked the City for the outreach funding it provides to the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS). He stated he was requesting an additional \$400,000 to provide direct casework services which would be leveraged with private donations.
3. John Walker spoke in favor of an improved bicycle infrastructure. He commented dedicated bike lines would improve bicyclists safety.
4. Frank Marino spoke in support of additional resources to hire additional police officers. He noted they were requesting to increase positions to be properly staffed at 2.5 officers per 1,000 residents.
5. Aimee Williamson spoke in favor of additional funding for trees and parks. She noted green space and trees reduce the heat affect and provide shade. She recommended an additional \$10 per capita for trees and parks.
6. Laura Stone submitted a card in support of art and culture programs.
7. Kathryn Sheppard submitted a card noting support of more funding to preserve public art and art grants.
8. Range Shaw submitted a card noting support of more funding to preserve public art and art grants.

David Longoria, District 4 Chief of Staff thanked everyone for attending. He explained that unfortunately Councilwoman Pastor was attending a funeral. He expressed Councilwoman Pastor's belief in the importance of citizen participation in the City's budget.

Mr. Blue thanked everyone for their comments and closed the hearing at 6:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 5  
PENDERGAST COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 4, 2017**

Councilwoman Thelda Williams opened the community budget hearing at 6:08 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. She stated she was filling in for Councilman Valenzuela who was not able to attend the hearing due to a death in his family. She expressed the importance of resident input on the budget process. Councilwoman Williams introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher.

Mr. Zuercher explained the presentation summarizes the 2017-18 Trial Budget before the Council adopts the budget later this year. He added the Budget Summary is available, and details are available on-line at [www.phoenix.gov/budget](http://www.phoenix.gov/budget). Mr. Zuercher introduced the Trial Budget video.

Following the presentation, Councilwoman Williams opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Steven Feldman commended the proposed additional funding for Police Assistants. He stated he supports funding for more officers and spoke in favor of a culture change for Police to instill greater public trust. Mr. Feldman suggested for proposals that add resources with no additional cost, the Trial Budget document should include information about funding that will be eliminated to offset the additional cost.
2. Craig Tribken stated Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) is facing a \$200,000 deficit and needs more beds and caseworkers on the CASS campus to help people who are homeless. He spoke in favor of increased funding for CASS. He commended the City's homeless outreach program and stated the program should direct people who are homeless to the CASS campus to receive assistance.

Councilwoman Williams stated that sometimes we need to incentivize people, and there is a difference between people who are homeless and people who are transients.

3. Suzanne Thraen expressed appreciation for the work of CASS. She expressed concern for homeless issues and rising crime in District 5. She added the community helps people who are homeless.

Deputy Human Services Director Riann Balch spoke about the extensive homeless outreach and engagement services provided by the Human Services Department.

Councilwoman Williams thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 6:44 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Genevieve K. Siri  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 6  
DEVONSHIRE SENIOR CENTER  
April 4, 2017**

Councilman Sal DiCiccio called the meeting to order at 6:01 p.m. and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting, specifically his office and Mayor's office staff. Councilman DiCiccio explained there would be a brief budget presentation and introduced Deputy City Manager Karen Peters.

Ms. Peters welcomed everyone to the meeting. Additionally, Ms. Peters acknowledged City staff who were available to address residents' questions. Ms. Peters introduced the FY2017-18 City Manager's Trial Budget video presentation.

Following the presentation, Councilman DiCiccio opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Diane Wiesenthal spoke in support of expanding library hours and keeping libraries open seven days a week, noting there are currently only two libraries open seven days a week.
2. Jamie Johnson spoke in support of hiring 16 civilian police assistants and the reduction in Human Services Department staff to provide funding for homeless outreach services.
3. Karen Beckvar asked how the City is addressing the structural deficit due to the public safety retirement payouts and for more information about the deficit. Ms. Peters explained the City completes a five-year forecast and the forecast was recently presented to Phoenix City Council. Ms. Peters stated the forecast projects a \$43-65M deficit for FY2018-19. Ms. Peters explained the City pays the invoiced amount from Public Safety Personnel Retirement System of the State of Arizona (PSPRS) representing the actuarially determined City's share of the unfunded liabilities each year.

Councilman DiCiccio responded there is a structural deficit at the City with PSPRS. He added other cities across the Valley are paying down their known unfunded liabilities, referencing the City of Chandler debt repayment plan. Councilman DiCiccio stated the City could address its structural deficit by completing a strategic plan and evaluating each City service and whether the City should provide the service.

4. Neil Haddad asked if the budget process is effectively communicated to the public to encourage people to participate in the process. Mr. Haddad spoke in support of restoring police pay, and increasing the number of officers to 2.5 officers per 1,000 citizens.

Additionally, Mr. Haddad asked about the metrics for the homeless outreach service contract and expressed concern for the impact of the staff elimination on the Misdemeanor Repeat Offender Program (MROP). Mr. Moises Gallegos, Human Services Department Director, stated the request for proposal for the homeless outreach services is available on the City's website. Mr. Gallegos explained the City is looking for the contractor to consistently visit the known homeless hotspots to engage the homeless and bring the individuals into services. Mr. Gallegos explained two City staff would be

dedicated to the MROP and there will not be any impact to the MROP as a result of staffing changes to accommodate the homeless outreach services contract.

Mr. Haddad asked if 3,125 officers are sufficient for the City and if the hiring number included attrition. Councilman DiCiccio replied he did not think 3,125 officers are sufficient. Ms. Peters explained the hiring figures included replacing known retirements and stated the City will hire for those retirements that occur above known attrition.

5. An anonymous meeting participant asked how volunteer police fit into the overall police staffing model. A representative from the Police Department explained that police reserve members work alongside the officers and complete all the same types of work.

Councilman DiCiccio thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 6:53 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Laura A. Madson Brown  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES**  
**VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS**  
**Responded to through April 5, 2017**

1. Celeste Gornick sent an email about her concerns with lack of police and police resources in the Cactus Park Precinct.
2. Jim Welter sent an email in support of additional funding for homeless outreach and engagement services.
3. Janet Grove sent an email complimenting the City's decision to increase park rangers in parks and preserve areas.
4. Sean Hitch sent an email recommending Phoenix utilize alternative urban development where the focus is on quality and innovative development of venues, additional tram access, large park like landscape to draw people to the area.
5. Elsinore Blockwatch sent an email in support of additional police and neighborhood resources to address concerns in their neighborhood near the downtown area.
6. Arianna Peralta sent an email requesting additional police resources, revitalization efforts and neighborhood services to improve her neighborhood South Elsinore near downtown.
7. Delfina Peralta sent an email requesting additional police resources, revitalization efforts and neighborhood services to improve her neighborhood South Elsinore near downtown.
8. Lucinda Gross emailed the City in support of services to the elderly, disabled and homeless in the community.
9. Eric Bassingthwaigte sent an email in support of additional funding to hire additional police officers.
10. Bob Altizer sent an email asking the City to continue to fulfill MusicaNova Orchestra's mission through supporting the Office of Arts and Culture in the 2017-18 budget.

Respectfully submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant



## City of Phoenix

**To:** Ed Zuercher  
City Manager

**Date:** April 12, 2017

**From:** Jeff Barton  
Budget and Research Department Director

**Subject:** COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from six community budget hearings. These hearings were held at [Phoenix Children's Hospital](#), [Shadow Mountain Senior Center](#), [Senior Opportunities West Senior Center](#), [Beuf Community Center](#), [First Institutional Baptist Church](#) and [Encanto Park Clubhouse](#).

The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the [electronic and voice mail comments are also included](#). At [phoenix.gov/budget](http://phoenix.gov/budget), residents can access:

- [The 2017-18 City Manager's Trial Budget](#)
- [Community Budget Hearing Schedule](#)
- [The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2017-18 Budget in English and Spanish](#)
- [The Budget Hearing presentation video](#)
- [Videos of all completed budget hearings](#)
- [Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs](#)

The community budget hearings will be held through April 20. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from these six community budget hearings and additional electronic comments responded to are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4/DISTRICT 8  
PHOENIX CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL  
APRIL 5, 2017**

Assistant City Manager Milton Dohoney opened the meeting at 6:00 pm welcoming those in attendance. He introduced Councilwoman Kate Gallego, Councilwoman Laura Pastor and Budget and Research Director Jeff Barton. Subsequently the 2017-18 Trial Budget video was shown. Councilwoman Pastor cautioned the City will likely be facing a deficit in 2018-19 and she is concerned about how the City will cover the deficit.

Following the video presentation, the hearing was opened to public comments.

1. Craig Tribken spoke in support of additional funding for Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS). He noted the program was operating at a deficit due to increases in costs and requested funding to hire additional casework staff.
2. Donna Reiner spoke in support in preservation of the arts. She commented if there were a surplus, it would be beneficial for public arts to receive \$25,000 for maintenance.
3. John Walker spoke in support of better bike infrastructure. He believed it was important to have separated bike lanes. He added bikes will encourage people to be healthier as well as reduce pollution.
4. Frank Marino stated Phoenix is understaffed within the Police Department. He added this harmed both police and citizens since police are not able to respond in a timely matter. He requested a staffing model of 2.5 police officers per 1,000 citizens.
5. Abraham James submitted a card supporting the arts and culture, libraries, parks, and community centers.
6. Randy McDonald thanked the City for supporting arts programs. He spoke about the Arizona Opera Company and indicated support was needed continuously within the arts.
7. Ben Henderson stated he believed budgets were policy documents. He added economic growth should focus on education as well as quality of life.
8. Neal Haddad spoke in support of increasing police officers, adding police had sacrificed the most for the City when there were budget freezes and now should be able to recoup their staffing levels.
9. Ginnie Ann Summer spoke in support of hiring more police officers, better street maintenance and was re-thinking the direction of the homeless programs.

Afterward, Assistant City Manager Milton Dohoney, Councilwoman Kate Gallego as well as Councilwoman Laura Pastor thanked everyone for attending. Mr. Dohoney closed the hearing at 6:52 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann-Marie Branicz  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3  
SHADOW MOUNTAIN SENIOR CENTER  
APRIL 6, 2017**

Deputy City Manager Paul Blue opened at 8:05 a.m. the meeting by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to the Community Budget hearing. Mr. Blue introduced Councilwoman Debra Stark who welcomed and thanked those in attendance for participating in the hearing.

Mr. Blue presented the video overview of the proposed budget. Following the presentation, he opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Keith Preston thanked the City for supporting arts and culture programs. Mr. Preston spoke in support of school art programs and continued support for the art in Phoenix.
2. Frank Marino spoke in support of hiring additional police officers. He stated he was encouraged to see the proposed increase in Police Aides but felt it was not enough staff to cover all seven precincts and handle the City's growth. Mr. Marino indicated the staffing shortage puts police officers in danger.
3. Craig Tribken spoke in support of funding for homeless services and funding for Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS). Mr. Tribken noted there was a deficit in the CASS budget and supports additional funding for shelter services and additional caseworkers.
4. Danielle Foushee spoke in support of additional funding for the arts and art education programs. Ms. Foushee thanked the city for supporting the arts in the past and stated the benefits of funding art programs outweighed the cost.
5. Linda Smith spoke in support of additional libraries and extended hours. Ms. Smith stated she had lived here her whole life and had seen the population growth and the needs for library services increase.
6. Chris Vaughan asked if Roadrunner pool would be open this summer. A Parks and Recreation Department representative stated Roadrunner pool would in fact be open to the public this summer.
7. Michelle Goings spoke in favor of funding for public art. Ms. Goings thanked the City for the funding in the prior years but additional funds were needed for maintenance of art projects. Ms. Goings stated the largest funding need is for the Dreamy Draw Pedestrian Bridge.

Councilwoman Stark thanked all the resident for coming and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 8:36 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 8  
SENIOR OPPORTUNITIES WEST SENIOR CENTER  
APRIL 6, 2017**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the community budget hearing at 8:30 a.m. welcoming those in attendance and thanking staff for attending and answering questions that may come up during the meeting. Councilwoman Kate Gallego made a few opening comments and noted the Mayor's Senior Policy Advisor was in the audience. Councilwoman Gallego announced the overview video would begin describing the Trial Budget components in more detail.

Following the video presentation, the hearing was opened to public comments.

1. Ryan Harper spoke in favor of supporting funding for homelessness and Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS). The organization was requesting additional support to resolve an immediate funding crisis related to an operating deficit and a need to hire additional caseworkers.
2. Darrell Kriplean spoke in favor of providing additional police staffing to address the police staffing crisis and improve police response averages. Mr. Zuercher added comments summarizing hiring plans and referenced the Police Assistant Program that assists sworn officers of administrative tasks.
3. Betty (last name was not given) spoke in favor of improved public safety.
4. H. Bobbie McLeod, spoke in favor of opening a senior center in Laveen and improving the space at Senior Opportunities West Senior Center. Councilwoman Gallego commented how the city was partnering with AARP to review senior services across the city.
5. Helen Yanez submitted a card supporting H. Bobbie McLeod to speak in favor of improving senior centers.
6. Aurelia Peers spoke in favor of improving safety at the senior center. Ms. Peers provided examples of unsafe experiences at the center. Mr. Zuercher called on Mr. Moises Gallegos, Human Services Director to review how the city contends with homelessness.
7. Pauline Tafoye submitted a card requesting a new, larger senior center as the current facility was too small.
8. Frances Esheuerria submitted a speaker card supporting a new senior center.
9. Iris Roger spoke of the need to improve the quality of food served at the senior center. Mr. Zuercher requested that Mr. Moises Gallegos, Human Services Director discuss the issue with Ms. Rogers after the meeting.

10. Sharon Pitrat spoke in support of replacing the floor at the senior center.

Mr. Zuercher made closing comments and thanked all for attending. He closed the hearing at 9:15 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mari Tunder  
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 1/DISTRICT 2  
GOELET A.C. BEUF COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 6, 2017**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the meeting by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to the community budget hearing. Mr. Zuercher introduced Councilwoman Thelda Williams and Councilman Jim Waring, both who welcomed and thanked those in attendance for participating in the hearing.

Mr. Zuercher presented the video overview of the proposed budget and following the presentation, he opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Craig Tribken spoke in support of funding for homeless services. Mr. Tribken stated Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) had a \$200,000 budget deficit next year. Mr. Tribken thanked the city for support in the past and hoped some additional funding could be found to hire additional caseworkers.
2. Rick Naimark spoke in support of funding for public art maintenance. Mr. Naimark stated \$100,000 was needed to bring some older public art back to its original look. Mr. Naimark thanked the city for the \$25,000 in public art funds for this year but would like the city to consider an additional \$25,000 in funds for next year.
3. Lauren Kisicki spoke in support of funding for the arts. Students from the Youth Arts and Culture Council demonstrated their passion by playing various instruments and singing. They stated arts programs produced positive changes and increased self-esteem and creative expression. They noted their support for continued funding for the arts.
4. Darrell Kriplean spoke in support of public safety. He stated staffing levels were not sufficient.
5. Regina Nixon spoke in support of funding for arts. Ms. Nixon thanked the City for its previous support and for purchasing Pioneer Village. Requesting additional funding to maintain and expand the growth.
6. Jane Tisdel spoke in support of public safety and noted concerns with street maintenance. Ms. Tisdel stated the current conditions of the streets, sidewalks, and curbs were dangerous for seniors to walk in their neighborhoods, adding there were numerous pot holes and cracks that were in need of repair. Mr. Zuercher asked the Street Transportation Department to work with Ms. Tisdel to get more information regarding her concerns.
7. Laura Wilde spoke in support of funding public art. Ms. Wilde stated art had a positive impact on youth and increased self-esteem.

8. Neal Haddad spoke in support of public safety. Mr. Haddad stated Phoenix residents and businesses needed greater police staffing in their neighborhoods. Mr. Haddad stated that response time needed to decrease and the average squad size of 6.9 officers per squad needed to increase.
9. Virgel Cain spoke in support of funding for libraries. Mr. Cain stated that libraries were a hub in the surrounding community and both hours and programs needed to be extended.

Both Councilwoman Williams and Councilman Waring thanked residents for coming and closed the hearing at 6:48 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4/DISTRICT 7  
ENCANTO PARK CLUBHOUSE**  
**April 11, 2017**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua opened the community budget hearing at 6:04 p.m. welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. Mr. Paniagua gave a summary of the proposed 2017-18 budget and presented a video describing the process in more detail. Councilman Nowakowski and Vice Mayor Pastor thanked those in attendance for their participation in the city budget process.

An overview video was presented, describing the Trial Budget components in more detail. Following the video presentation, the hearing was opened to public comments.

1. Tom Simplot submitted a card requesting to maintain and increase funding for the arts.
2. Frank Marino spoke in support of hiring additional police officers. He noted they were requesting to increase positions to be properly staffed at 2.5 officers per 1,000 residents.
3. Rosemary Holusha spoke in favor of increasing funding to improve streets and also policing in the neighborhoods. She also recommended increasing the minimum age a city employee can retire in order to help the pension funds.
4. Ginnie Ann Sumner recommended staff address the fiscal year 2018-19 budget deficit now instead of later, increase the number of police officers and also requested to increase the number of case managers assigned to helping the homeless population.
5. Craig Tribken stated Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) was facing a deficit. He spoke in favor of increased funding for CASS.
6. Jack Schuimmer advocated for the benefits of the Office of Arts & Culture and recommended increased funding for the arts.
7. Jim McPherson requested the implementation of the city's tree and shade master plan and recommended shade to be a factor in all city projects.
8. Michael Oleskow spoke in favor of funding for the arts stating having a strong arts program attracted people to move to Phoenix.
9. Tim Sprague spoke in favor of increasing funding for parks to increase the number of park rangers and enhance security.

10. Barbara Lewkowitz advocated for homeless programs in particular those that serve the senior population.
11. Andrew Knochel spoke in favor of increasing parks funding especially in high density neighborhoods.
12. Neal Haddad spoke in support of restoring police pay and increasing the number of officers to 2.5 officers per 1,000 citizens.
13. Martin Vogel recommended eliminating the employee four/ten shift schedules to save approximately \$100 million.
14. Ray Cabrera spoke in favor of increasing parks funding for maintenance and adding shade to increase walkability.
15. Michael Mendoza submitted a card in favor of increasing funding for the arts and parks.
16. Richard de Uriarte submitted a card recommending changes to the property tax rate, renting parking spaces at the 32nd Street and Lincoln Drive trailhead, and thanking the City for improvements at Highland Estates.

Mr. Paniagua thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 7:17 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayra Z. Baquera  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
CITYWIDE  
FIRST INSTITUTIONAL BAPTIST CHURCH  
APRIL 11, 2017**

Pastor Stewart opened the meeting at 6:08 pm and welcomed everyone to the church. Mayor Greg Stanton welcomed those in attendance and thanked everyone for attending the Community Budget Hearing. He explained the City budget process. He introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher and Budget and Research Director Jeff Barton.

City Manager Ed Zuercher welcomed everyone for attending and explained the Budget Hearing process. He added information can also be found online. Subsequently the 2017-18 Trial Budget video was shown.

Mayor Greg Stanton opened the floor to the public.

1. John Walker spoke in favor of separated bike lanes. He added bicycling encouraged people to be healthier and reduce pollution.
2. Ryan Harper spoke in support of Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS), noting the shelter was facing an operating deficit of \$200,000. He added they also needed more caseworkers in order to approach the national average. In summary, he was grateful for the support of the City and was asking for \$240,000 to assist them with the deficit as well as the need for caseworkers.
3. Tommie Taylor submitted a card in support of additional computers at libraries and senior centers. In addition, they requested to bring back same day service to Dial-A-Ride.
4. Donna Reiner spoke in support of preservation of the arts. She asked, if there were a surplus, to provide public arts with \$25,000 additional funding for maintenance.
5. Carole Coles Henry addressed three areas of need including jobs for youth, street maintenance and a flooding action plan. She requested additional lighting to make the community safer. Lastly, she indicated the body cameras discussion should be elevated to the community in order to determine when the implementation would take place.
6. Jenny Strickland submitted a card thanking the City for the \$60,000 increase to the Office of Arts & Culture last year. She indicated any additional funding would help fund more grants to up and coming arts organizations.
7. Sean Sweat stated he was in support of more parks and open space. He suggested the City more strategically located parks and requested the City spend \$10 more per person for 2 to 3 small parks within the downtown area where green space is currently lacking.

8. Ken Crane spoke about the need for increased police staffing. He stated he believed there needed to be a ratio of 2.5 police officers to 1,000 citizens.
9. Teniquia Broughton spoke in support of arts & culture programs. She requested additional funding to support grassroots organizations.
10. Michael Johnson spoke in support of summer employment for youth, increased street lighting and supplemental revenue to support decreased federal funding. He commented, based on the uncertainty, it was important to plan into the future.
11. M. Ali Nervis inquired about crime prevention. Mayor Stanton responded, and explained various diversion programs.
12. Abraham James submitted a card in support of the Office of Arts and Culture, libraries, neighborhoods, parks, community centers, streets and transportation as well as Police and Fire. He stated he hoped additional funds within the City's Budget would go toward aiding the homeless, substance abuse programs, and providing additional affordable housing within downtown and central Phoenix.
13. Calvin C. Goode stated that he would like to see more affordable housing and not just high-rises within the downtown area. In addition, he believed youth and summer programs for youth are vital.
14. Redeem Robinson spoke in support of additional services to address the homeless issue, suggesting building more shelters. He also commented sex trafficking was another area that needed to be addressed.
15. Richelle Glenn spoke on support of additional homelessness services and education resources.
16. Jesse J. Ary believes the First Institutional Baptist Church is a central part of the community. He is worried about the City receiving reduced Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funding adding the City would need to find additional resources to support the programs.
17. Michael Neal spoke in support of youth programs and the Phoenix Police Department. He stated a hiring program focusing on inner city was a must for the community.
18. Pastor Stewart expressed concerned as he heard some churches were closing due to crime in their areas. He wanted to ensure the City could do to address this issue.

Mayor Greg Stanton thanked everyone once again for attending and closed the hearing at 7:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann-Marie Branicz  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES**  
**VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS**  
**Responded to through April 12, 2017**

1. Geniee Smith sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
2. Paul Smith sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
3. Melissa Brandebourg sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
4. Ruth Roman sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
5. Taben Hale sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
6. Willian Truett sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
7. Jackie Hall sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
8. Maureen Rooney sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
9. Penny Kariznowi sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
10. Rebecca Custer sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
11. Judy Reid sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
12. Nora Ulloa sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
13. Mary Lynn Thompson sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
14. Lynda Stone sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
15. Wendy Walther sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.

16. Cynthia Gens sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
17. Susan Schwartz sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
18. Mary Curry sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
19. Karen LaPolice sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
20. Wendy Franz sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
21. Manya Paul sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
22. Christopher Klauschie sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
23. Joseph Bock sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
24. Virginia Ginter sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
25. Lisa Broughton sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
26. Bryan Riggins sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
27. Laurie Munn sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
28. Alysa Edwards sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
29. Miriam Arostegui Johnson sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
30. Terri Carr sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
31. Janet Gould sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.

32. Angie Mayfield sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
33. Jason Barraza sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
34. Heather Calandro sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
35. Christopher Winters sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
36. Ruth Silon sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
37. Kimberly Powers sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
38. Kas Winters sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
39. Bonita Cassutt sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
40. Trisha Lau sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
41. Althia Hardt sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
42. Ann Lindner sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
43. Mary Beth Scanlon sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
44. Pamela Tames sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
45. Corina Goodwin sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
46. Margaret Morse sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
47. Angela Jaramillo sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.

48. Wilma Lund sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
49. Karen Kruse sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
50. Marilyn Seese sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
51. Marilyn Moschecki sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
52. Kathie Price sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
53. Lois Kotin sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
54. Virgel Cain sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
55. Stacy Huguez sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
56. Valentina Zeff sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.
57. Jim McPherson sent an email in support of funding the City's Tree and Shade Master Plan and suggested code enforcement requiring property owners to replace trees and landscaping.

Respectfully Submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant



## City of Phoenix

**To:** Ed Zuercher  
City Manager

**Date:** April 19, 2017

**From:** Jeff Barton  
Budget and Research Department Director

**Subject:** COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from two community budget hearings. These hearings were held at [North Mountain Visitor Center](#) and [Cesar Chavez High School](#) last week. The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A [summary of the electronic and voice mail comments](#) are also included.

At [phoenix.gov/Budget](http://phoenix.gov/Budget) residents can access:

- The 2017-18 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2017-18 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The community budget hearings will be held through April 20. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from these two community budget hearings and additional electronic comments responded to are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3  
NORTH MOUNTAIN VISITOR CENTER  
APRIL 12, 2017**

Councilwoman Debra Stark opened the community budget hearing at 6:02 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the proposed budget. The overview video was then presented and Councilwoman Stark introduced Milton Dohoney.

Councilwoman Stark opened the hearing for public comment:

1. Helena Haber and team spoke in support of funding for youth access to the arts.
2. Louis Howley stated he supports Phoenix libraries and favors restoration of Sunday and Monday hours at the Acacia branch.
3. Judy Guilds thanked the City for the \$25,000 increase to the arts budget last year and requested an additional \$25,000 for the Office of Arts & Culture this year.
4. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) and requested an additional \$200,000 in funding to increase their caseworker ratio and cover their shortfall next year.
5. Sarah Laurent submitted a card in favor of library funding, noting the tangible and intangible benefits exceed the costs. Ms. Laurent stated libraries save the City and State money and produce future tax paying citizens.
6. Jeff Sherman spoke in support of parks and advocated to meet the 25% citywide tree shade coverage by 2030.
7. Franklin Marino spoke in favor of increasing Police department staffing ratios.
8. Lin Ling Lee spoke in favor of arts and culture and would like additional funding of \$60,000 for additional grants.
9. Ken Crane spoke in favor of increasing Police staffing ratios department wide.
10. Anita Herrick spoke in support of mountain preserves and trails. She commented that trails are in need repair and maintenance. She thanked the city for adding 22 Park Rangers last year and would like funding continued for this year.

Councilwoman Stark thanked everyone for attending and concluded the hearing at 6:41 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susannah Pietrzykowsky  
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 7 & 8  
CESAR CHAVEZ HIGH SCHOOL  
APRIL 12, 2017**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the community budget hearing at 6:12 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. Mr. Zuercher explained the presentation summarized the 2017-18 Trial Budget before the Council adopts the budget later this year.

Councilman Michael Nowakowski provided an update on the new Loop 202 South Mountain Freeway. Councilwoman Kate Gallego and Councilman Nowakowski presented updates on the following services and projects including new employment, new pedestrian bridge, street improvement and maintenance, flood mitigation, and parks improvements.

Mr. Zuercher introduced the Trial Budget video and following the presentation, he opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Jennifer Rouse spoke in favor of developing a new multi-generational community center and increased funding for Police, youth and library programs in Laveen. Ms. Rouse recommended expanding the sites for the Mobile Youth Recreation vehicles to more neighborhoods and schools. She expressed support for increasing taxes for public safety
2. Isaac Serna spoke in favor of funding for more youth and teen recreational activities in Laveen and South Phoenix.
3. Linda Cannon spoke in favor of adding more days of service in the library system especially at Cesar Chavez Public Library.
4. Tony Berastegui spoke in support of increasing maintenance of Cesar Chavez Park, addressing juvenile crime in Laveen, controlling weeds along Baseline Road, and increasing Police protection in Laveen. He stated there are holes in the soccer field at Cesar Chavez Park. Mr. Zuercher stated staff will look into the soccer field issue at Cesar Chavez Park.
5. Laura Wilde spoke in favor of increased funding for arts and cultural programs, especially public art maintenance and community support grants for festivals.
6. Christa Severns spoke in favor of increased funding for the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) for more caseworkers. She shared that the summer heat poses a danger for people who are homeless.
7. Michael Dicken spoke in favor of funding a visual art venue in Laveen. He expressed support for incorporating the venue in the new community center for art classes and to display art.
8. Dr. Carol Poore spoke in favor of increase funding for public art maintenance through increasing funding by \$25,000 to preserve the community's assets.

9. Carole Coles Henry spoke in favor of increased funding for youth and senior programs; municipal internships and employment for youth; street improvements, paving, lighting and drainage in South Phoenix; and body cameras for Police Officers.
10. Lisa Salinas spoke in support of increased park maintenance at Cesar Chavez Park and Blight Busters. She explained that the park is vandalized and sturdy soap dispensers are needed at the park. Mr. Zuercher asked Neighborhood Services and Parks and Recreation staff to meet with Ms. Salinas after the meeting to discuss her specific concerns.
11. Rachel Johnson spoke in support for increased funding for public art, community arts grants, neighborhood arts programs, and cultural facilities maintenance.
12. Wendy Johnson submitted a card in favor of a new Laveen community center and additional safe bike and horse paths along Dobbins Road.
13. Millie Strauss submitted a card in favor of additional library hours.
14. Christine Dicken submitted a card in favor of additional library hours every day at every branch.
17. Stephanie Hurd submitted a card in support of walking, horse, and bike paths along Dobbins Road through Laveen and South Mountain, public art along Dobbins Road, a new multi-generational community center in Laveen, and quality development at the new Loop 202 South Mountain Freeway and Dobbins Road.

Councilwoman Gallego thanked everyone for attending. Councilman Nowakowski stated the community's participation at these hearings assists with facilitating change. He closed the hearing at 7:33 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Genevieve K. Siri  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES**  
**VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS**  
**Responded to through April 19, 2017**

1. Mary Helen Ruelas sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
2. Kim Contreas sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
3. Marco Castellanos sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
4. Linda Linderman sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
5. Kevin Hedfepeth sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
6. Carol Joanie Cloninger sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
7. Jill Scherer sent an email supporting additional resources at Hance Dog Park including new trees, lighting, more benches, and new plastic panels could be secured.
8. Candy Meisenburg sent an email requesting increased water pressure at the water fountain and better drainage at the Steele Indian School Dog Park.
9. Todd Wills sent an email requesting increased lighting and better drainage at the Dog Park at Hance Park.
10. Natalie Amato sent an email supporting additional resources at Steele Indian School Dog Park including a better water fountain, increased lighting and additional landscaping efforts.
11. Jennifer Romine sent an email requesting increased lighting and better drainage at the Hance Dog Park.
12. Lydia Milliken sent an email in support of additional lighting resources at Hance and Steele Indian School Dog Parks and increased funding for homeless and domestic violence services
13. Pierre Kaluzny sent an email in support of bicycle protected lanes downtown and in central Phoenix and more shade trees.
14. Avie Kalker sent an email suggesting to create a Dog Park Superintendent to perform day to day management of dog parks as she believes requirements are different from regular parks. She also requested planning procurement and adjusting rules at dog parks to allow purchases from wholesalers and other vendors including those that sell used recycled products that may charge less and warranty their products.
15. Melissa Morrison sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day

16. Michael Patterson sent an email requesting increased lighting and better drainage at the Hance Dog Park.
17. Ervin McGrath sent an email recommending school resource officers drive personal vehicles to their assigned school and their patrol car be assigned for patrol or other operational duty.
18. Chelsey Lutteke sent an email in support of additional lighting resources at Hance and Steele Indian School Dog Parks.
19. Gail and Richard Flickinger sent an email in support of street repair and additional funding for services in their neighborhood. They state grass is growing through cracks in asphalt and the access streets have potholes.
20. Judy Ullrich sent an email requesting increased trees and green space in the downtown area and support for more retail and small businesses options.
21. Kimberely Clah sent an email in requesting more low lighting, benches, and dog bags at Hance Dog Park. She also asked the City to address homeless issues in park restrooms.
22. Krystle Miller sent an email in support of additional lighting resources at Hance Dog Park.
23. Monica Goddard sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all libraries are open every day.

Respectfully Submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant



## City of Phoenix

**To:** Ed Zuercher  
City Manager

**Date:** April 26, 2017

**From:** Jeff Barton  
Budget and Research Department Director

**Subject:** COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the final four community budget hearings. These hearings were held at [Maryvale Community Center](#), [Paradise Valley Community Center](#), [Metro Tech High School](#) and [Sunnyslope Community Center](#) last week. The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the [electronic and voice mail comments](#) is also included.

At [phoenix.gov/Budget](http://phoenix.gov/Budget) residents can access:

- [The 2017-18 City Manager's Trial Budget](#)
- [Community Budget Hearing Schedule](#)
- [The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2017-18 Budget in English and Spanish](#)
- [The Budget Hearing presentation video](#)
- [Videos of all completed budget hearings](#)
- [Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs](#)

The community budget hearings were held through April 20. Staff transmitted minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from these four community budget hearings and additional electronic comments responded to are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 5  
MARYVALE COMMUNITY CENTER  
April 18, 2017**

Councilman Daniel Valenzuela opened the community budget hearing at 6:04 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He introduced Vice Mayor Laura Pastor, Councilman Michael Nowakowski, Deputy City Manager Deanna Jonovich, and Budget and Research Director Jeff Barton. Councilman Valenzuela informed attendees the comments would be recorded and provided to all the City Council members.

Councilman Michael Nowakowski thanked attendees for coming and noted he was eager to listen to their comments.

Councilman Valenzuela presented an informational video on the proposed budget in both Spanish and English. Following the video, he opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Jesus Galaviz Ameguin and members of the Youth Arts and Culture Council presented a musical and theatrical performance to express support for arts and arts access for youth. Vice Mayor Pastor thanked the youth for bringing the arts to life with their presentation.
2. Barb Heller requested the City hire more officers at a rate of 2.5 full time officers per 1,000 residents. She said calls for service had gone down because people have stopped calling the police when emergencies occur.
3. Harold Hurtt spoke in favor of hiring more police officers. He encouraged the City to take advantage of new technologies to increase service levels and cost-neutral or revenue-generating practices that have proven successful in other cities.
4. Ginnie Ann Sumner stated the City should be seeking additional funding sources in advance of next year's projected budget deficit. She also requested for the public to be more involved in budget process and from the beginning when the budget is being formulated.
5. Craig Tribken advocated for support for the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS), and spoke to its operating budget deficit and need for more caseworkers. Vice Mayor Pastor asked if CASS works with City caseworkers. Mr. Tribken said CASS has an ongoing relationship with City Housing Department staff.

6. Joseph Benesh expressed his support for the arts as a method of improving economic development and public safety outcomes. He said the Office of Arts and Culture is managing its funds well.
7. Rosa Pastrana requested support for a space to allow Lucha Libre Mexican wrestling athletes to practice. She said wrestlers must stay anonymous as part of the sport, and they currently have no appropriate closed facility to train. She added it is an important youth activity that celebrates Mexican culture.

Councilman Nowakowski and Vice Mayor Pastor thanked citizens for their input, noting their desire to improve the community.

Councilman Valenzuela thanked everyone for attending. He said he would advocate for keeping people safe, moving the economy forward, and strengthening neighborhoods. He described the next steps in the budget process. Councilman Valenzuela closed the hearing at 7:03 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Carmen Ronan  
Management Intern

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 2 & 3  
PARADISE VALLEY COMMUNITY CENTER  
April 19, 2017**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the community budget hearing at 6:09 p.m., welcoming those in attendance and thanking staff for attending and answering questions that may come up during the meeting. An overview video of the proposed 2017-18 budget was presented. Councilmembers Debra Stark and Jim Waring thanked those in attendance for their participation in the city budget process.

Mr. Zuercher opened the meeting to public comments.

1. Guy Mikkelsen thanked the city for having an open budget process; praised the Human Services department for the high level of service provided; and asked the Council to continue funding the homeless outreach program.
2. Louis Howley spoke in support of longer library hours at all locations but particularly at the Acacia branch.
3. Tom Cummins advocated for restoration of library hours stating libraries benefit children and people that don't have access to computers at home.
4. Ken Crane spoke about the need for increased police staffing. He stated he believed there needed to be a ratio of 2.5 police officers to 1,000 citizens.
5. Barbara Welsh submitted a comment in support of adding lights at the dog parks so they can be used at night during the summer after it cools down.
6. Franklin Marino spoke in support of increased public safety staffing levels to decrease response times.
7. Mark Robert Gordon requested the Council increase the funding for public art maintenance by \$25,000 which would bring the annual budget to \$100,000.
8. David Jernigan inquired what percent of the total cost of added Public Transit staff was for wages. Mr. Zuercher replied staff could provide details but on average it is about \$50,000 per position. Mr. Jernigan stated he felt that was very high and he would rather see additional funding to improve city streets and increase public safety staffing.

Mr. Zuercher responded additional funding has been added for street maintenance in the current budget and in upcoming fiscal years.

9. Joseph Benesh spoke in favor of funding for the arts stating programs have many benefits including being effective at keeping students engaged in school and providing activities for residents at senior centers.

Mr. Zuercher thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 6:54 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayra Z. Baquera  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
CITYWIDE YOUTH MEETING  
METRO TECH HIGH SCHOOL  
April 19, 2017**

Deanna Jonovich, Deputy City Manager, opened the community budget hearing at 6:10 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. She mentioned the comments would be recorded and provided to all the City Council members. Ms. Jonovich explained the budget hearing process and how important community input was.

Councilwoman Pastor and Councilman Valenzuela welcomed those in attendance and asked for feedback on the proposed Trial Budget.

Ms. Jonovich gave a brief summary of the proposed 2017-18 budget and asked staff to present the overview video describing the process in more detail.

Councilman Valenzuela opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Jennifer Falcon spoke in favor of the arts programs.
2. Ryan Tempest spoke in favor of public art. He asked for an increase of \$25,000 for the Friends of Phx Public Art program to support the ongoing maintenance of public art.
3. Tenneille Choi spoke in support of investing in arts and culture supplemental school funding initiatives.
4. Jenny Strickland spoke in favor of adding additional funding for arts programs.
5. Christian Hoyt spoke in support of adding funding for arts, education and bicycle infrastructure programs.
6. Faye Gray spoke in support of the Phx-Teens program. She discussed the impact the program had on her life and expressed gratitude for the funding the City of Phoenix provides.
7. Aleah Willis spoke in support of the Phx-Teens program. She discussed the impact the program had on her life and expressed gratitude for the funding the City of Phoenix provides.
8. Lidia (last name unknown) spoke in support of the Phx-Teens program. She discussed the impact the program had on her life and expressed gratitude for the funding the City of Phoenix provides.

9. Nicole Underwood submitted a comment in support of funding for arts programs and for creating an affordable environment for artists to live in.

Ms. Jonovich, Councilwoman Pastor and Councilman Valenzuela thanked everyone for attending and closed the budget hearing at 6:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jesse Benavidez  
Management Assistant II  
Budget & Research Department

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3  
SUNNYSLOPE SENIOR CENTER**  
**April 20, 2017**

Councilwoman Debra Stark called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m. and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting. Councilwoman Stark mentioned the City takes the public's comments to heart and introduced Deputy City Manager Karen Peters. Ms. Peters welcomed everyone to the meeting and explained the budget process. She introduced the FY2017-18 City Manager's Trial Budget video presentation.

Following the presentation, Councilwoman Stark opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Gene Blue spoke in support of public transit and public safety services and urged the City Manager to provide extra funding for youth services.
2. Louis Howley discussed the positive impact of the library system on the community and spoke in support of additional funding to provide seven days-a-week service at all the branches.
3. Gail Helm submitted a card in support of improving the Sunnyslope area and requested addressing issues trash and used needles.
4. Leticia Clark submitted a card in support of improving the Sunnyslope area by addressing the issues arising from homelessness in the area.
5. Mark Jacobsen thanked city staff for the meeting and spoke in support of funding to remove drugs from the area and asked the City to help the residents make a difference in the Sunnyslope neighborhood.
6. Judy Guilds submitted a written statement in support of funding for the maintenance of public art. Councilwoman Stark stated Ms. Guilds had discussed the Grasshopper Bridge.
7. Justin Johnson spoke in support of increased funding for the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) program. Mr. Johnson stated CASS is the largest shelter in the region and would use the additional funding for caseworkers to help connect clients with the services they need.
8. Gloria Padalino submitted a card in support of having each library open seven days-a-week and thanking the City Council for their continued support of the libraries.

9. Harold Michelson submitted a card in support of having each library open seven days-a-week and thanking the City Council for their continued support of the libraries.
10. Sarah Laurent spoke in support of additional library funding for seven days-a-week operations for the whole library system.
11. Jim Welter spoke in support of additional funding for those experiencing homelessness. Mr. Welter discussed a Sunnyslope area collaborative with the faith community to address homelessness. Mr. Welter stated he is in favor of increasing homeless outreach teams.
12. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of increased funding for homeless services and the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) program. Mr. Tribken explained additional caseworkers would help people get services and decrease the recidivism rate.
13. Franklin Marino spoke in support of additional resources to hire additional police officers. Mr. Marino asked for staffing at a rate of 2.5 officers per 1,000 residents.
14. Dan Carroll spoke in support of hiring additional police officers. Mr. Carroll suggested the City use funding from selling excess City properties to fund the staffing at the level of 2.5 officers per 1,000 residents.
15. Martin Vogel noted the Berkshire Advisors, Inc. Innovation and Efficiency study of the Phoenix Police Department report might provide insight into finding funds for additional police hires. He commented the City should implement the report's recommendations.
16. Jenny Strickland spoke in support of additional funding for the arts.
17. Aimee Williamson spoke in favor of additional funding for trees and parks. Ms. Williamson noted green space and trees reduce the heat affect and provide shade. Ms. Williamson recommended an additional \$10 per capita for trees and parks and suggested the City should focus on maintenance as well as tree planting.
18. Sean Sweat spoke in favor of additional funding for downtown. Mr. Sweat explained people living in downtown Phoenix did not have yards and currently must walk a long distance to a park. Mr. Sweat commented Phoenix under spends per capita as compared to Austin, Las Vegas and Atlanta and suggested that park funding be increased \$10 per capita to create small, green spaces to offset the growth in downtown.
19. Sharina Nash spoke in support of increased funding for youth programs and street maintenance to improve road conditions in South Phoenix.

20. Harold Prazek spoke in support of additional funding to remove homeless from the parks in Sunnyslope. Mr. Prazek stated the City should consider hiring homeless people to pick up the trash in City parks.
21. Barbara Brown spoke in support of the adding a circulator stop at the disability center on Washington Street, additional funding for a Sunnyslope park such as a dog park and park information kiosks, and allowing people to travel safely to whichever senior center has their specific programs. Ms. Brown stated she opposed a 29-story residential building along Roosevelt and explained parking is already crowded along Roosevelt Street.

Ms. Peters noted the City Manager's Budget would go to Council on May 19.

Councilwoman Stark thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 7:13 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Laura A. Madson Brown  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES**  
**VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS**  
**Responded to through April 25, 2017**

1. Lauren Whitehurst sent an email in support of extending dog park hours to help address issues of walking dogs in the heat.
2. Jill Bernstein sent an email in support of park improvements including benches, trees, multigenerational playgrounds and more community garden space.
3. Isabel Fierros sent an email questioning the need of having an ambulance as part of the Emergency Operations Center at the airport. Amber Williamson, Deputy Budget and Research Director responded to her questions.
4. Margaret Shalley sent an email requesting traffic signals at 67th Avenue/Vineyard Avenue and 43rd Avenue/Broadway Road, increase maintenance of medians along Baseline Road, setting aside funds for a community center west of 51st Avenue, extending the 67 and 51 bus routes to Baseline Road and installing shade at Laveen bus stops.
5. Robin Angeley sent an email supporting library services and requesting all branches be open every day.
6. Nick Horstman sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
7. Comfort Keller sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
8. Renate Daniele sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
9. Wendy Franz sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
10. Catherine Amend sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
11. Mary Lee Smith sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
12. Christina Ramirez sent an email supporting funding improvements at Hance Dog Park including additional trees, more park benches and increased maintenance and upkeep.

13. Ginnie Ann Sumner sent an email suggesting the City address financial issues including pension costs with the public safety unions by reviewing projected needs of each department now and involving the public earlier in the budget process.
14. Ray Cabrera sent an email supporting increased funding to fully implement the Tree and Shade Master Plan.
15. Erin Cochran sent an email in support of improvements at dog parks including better lighting, additional trees, more park benches and improved dog water fountains.
16. Jennifer Boucek sent an email requesting resources to fully implement the Tree and Shade Master Plan.
17. Steven Young sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
18. Nathan Fidel sent an email requesting the City plant more trees and create small parks in the downtown area, develop designated bike lanes and harvest rainwater.
19. Heather Charlton sent an email supporting more lighting at Hance Dog Park.
20. Sally Chaney sent an email in support of public library services and of restoring library hours so all 17 public libraries are open every day.
21. Brian Gillman sent an email requesting more trash bins along Roosevelt Street and modernizing the bus stop at Central and Roosevelt.
22. The Phoenix Downtown Neighborhood Alliance sent a letter to support increasing the number of shade trees and small parks in the downtown area.

Respectfully submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant