



City of Phoenix

General Information Packet

City Council Report

Agenda Date: 4/11/2019, Item No. 4

Community Budget Hearing Minutes

Summary

Attachment A transmits the minutes of the Community Budget Hearings held from April 2-8, 2019 and electronic, voicemail and written comments received from February 23-April 9, 2019 for review. Minutes are not a verbatim transcript of comments. A video record of each budget hearing is available on-line at www.phoenix.gov/budget.

Responsible Department

This item is submitted by City Manager Ed Zuercher and the Budget and Research Department.

ATTACHMENT A



City of Phoenix

To: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

Date: April 10, 2019

From: Jeff Barton
Budget and Research Department Director

Subject: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the community budget hearings held between Tuesday, April 2 – 8, 2019 at [Pecos Community Center](#), [Devonshire Community Center](#), [Steele Indian School Park](#), [Sunnyslope Community Center](#), [South Mountain Community Center](#), [Burton Barr Central Library](#), [Country Place Leadership Academy](#), [North Mountain Visitor Center](#) and [Pendergast Community Center](#). The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. [A summary of the electronic and voice mail comments is also included.](#)

At phoenix.gov/Budget residents can access:

- The 2019-20 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2019-20 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The minutes and summary of emails and phone calls are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 6
PECOS COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 2, 2019**

Councilman Sal DiCiccio opened the community budget hearing at 8:00 a.m., provided opening comments, welcomed those in attendance and recognized attending city staff. Councilman DiCiccio requested that speaker cards be completed for those that wish to speak.

Deputy City Manager, Mario Paniagua then made a few opening comments and generally described the city's budget process timeline. A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented.

Councilman DiCiccio then opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Christine Helsell spoke in support of investing in community infrastructure. Affordable housing, job training, homelessness, mental health program enhancements, park improvements and expanded hours were recommended.
2. Frank Helsell spoke to support programs to enhance infrastructure for affordable housing, youth programs and services for mental health and homelessness.
3. Laurie Munn, spoke in support of restoring library hours and discussed the correlation between available library hours and passing test scores for children.
4. Benjamin Clark spoke in support of neighborhood and community development programs.
5. Carolina Coronel spoke in support of funding being allocated to necessary street paving in a specific area of the Garfield neighborhood that experiences unacceptable levels of flooding after heavy rainfall.
6. Kevin Heaphy spoke in support of additional funding for libraries ensuring that every library is open every day.
7. Steve Schumacher spoke in support of public/private investment in historic preservation. Councilman DiCiccio commented favorably to the idea.
8. Candice Hutt chose not to speak and no comments were indicated on the speaker card.

Councilman DiCiccio closed the hearing at 8:40 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mari Tunder
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 6
DEVONSHIRE COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 2, 2019**

Councilman Sal DiCiccio opened the community budget hearing at 10:32 a.m., provided opening comments and welcomed those in attendance. Councilman DiCiccio requested that speaker cards be completed for those that wish to speak.

City Manager Ed Zuercher made a few opening comments, introduced the interpreter and thanked the city staff in attendance. A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented.

Councilman DiCiccio then opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Donna Reiner spoke in support of maintaining public art and increasing funding by \$25,000.
2. Craig Tribken spoke in support of increasing homeless services funding.
3. Gloria Gonzalez spoke in support of funding being allocated for necessary street repairs for drainage, sidewalks and curbs specifically to the 13th street and Roosevelt.
4. Jody Moman spoke in support of funding for relocation of Cholla trail due to safety, traffic and litter concerns. If no funding is available, would support additional police and park rangers.
5. Rebecca Hawkins spoke in support of funding for relocation of Cholla trail.
6. Laurie Munn, spoke in support of restoring library hours to every library and open every day.
7. Sandra Lines Laurie spoke in support of funding for relocation of Cholla trail.
8. Adrianna Baum chose not to speak after card was submitted.
9. Scott Grigg spoke in support of funding for relocation of Cholla trail.
10. Franklin Marino gave statistical information regarding the Police department. He also spoke in support for increased funding for public safety budget, salaries and recruitment efforts.

11. Luke Black spoke in favor of using the General Fund to increase spending in the areas of affordable housing, domestic violence services, homeless services, mental health services, parks and park amenities and trails.
12. Karen Kruse spoke in support of restoring library hours to every library and open every day.
13. Abraham James III thanked city leaders and staff for support of arts/culture, library services, historic preservation, neighborhoods, parks, youth, senior centers, transportation, police and fire. He spoke in favor of increasing funding for libraries, homeless services, substance abuse services and affordable housing downtown.
14. Richard de Uriarte left comments thanking city leadership for work on budget priorities, historic preservation and street improvements in Highland estates. He supports expansion of planned 2020 bond issue beyond public safety.
15. Ben Loughlin left comments in support of increased funding for affordable housing, homeless services, park rangers and park beautification and keeping parks open during daytime hours.

Councilman DiCiccio closed the hearing at 11:30 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Khala Stanfield
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4
STEELE INDIAN SCHOOL PARK
APRIL 2, 2019**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the meeting at 6:03 p.m. and welcomed those in attendance. He explained that Councilwoman Laura Pastor was on her way and wishes for the meeting to start on time. He explained how the City Budget process takes place. He also welcomed the Spanish Translator, Gloria San Miguel. He reminded everyone to take a tabloid and mentioned that information could also be found online. He explained that the meeting will be taped and encouraged citizens to fill out speaker cards if they wish to speak. The 2019-20 Trial Budget video was shown.

After the video, Councilwoman Laura Pastor arrived at the meeting and thanked everyone for attending. She opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Donna Reiner spoke in favor of additional funding for the arts and maintenance. She thanked the City Council for providing what they have for the arts but she would like \$25,000 additional added to what they have received in the past.
2. Mario Romero spoke in favor of additional funding for the arts. He thanked the City Council for providing what they have for the arts but she would like \$25,000 additional added to what they have received in the past.
3. Chris Palmer spoke in favor of street maintenance and safety for the children walking on the streets. He pointed out 13th street from Van Buren to Moreland.
4. Iva Peters-Badoni spoke expressing interest in how citizen's taxes are being spent. Councilwoman Laura Pastor explained the process of participatory budgeting and how it brings the community together. City Manager Ed Zuercher also explained the process as well.
5. Ray Peters-Badoni did not wish to speak but supported Iva Peters-Badoni's inquiry regarding taxes.
6. Steve Schumacher spoke in favor of funding for historic preservation, history and awareness. He discussed how one of the markers had been destroyed in 2003 and replacement is crucial since it is part of Phoenix history.

7. Dan Klocke spoke in favor of historic preservation. He also requested funding for family reunification.
8. Ann Bommersback left a comment card requesting additional funding for homeless and police funding.
9. Craig Tribken spoke on behalf of Central Arizona Shelter Services and requested additional funding for homeless services. He requested that the City provide around \$258,000 and they will raise the rest.
10. Ruth Ann Marstor spoke in favor of increasing funding for arts and historic preservation.
11. Athia Hardt thanked the City for additional funds for libraries and potential funding that will open libraries on Sundays. She is hoping that arts and culture is looked at when looking at the bond program so that it is not primarily focused on Police and Fire.
12. Yazmin Meza spoke in favor of arts and culture. She believes money should be allocated across other areas and not just Police and Fire.
13. Sarah Munoz Perez spoke in favor for more funding for arts and culture.
14. Mirabel Lopez spoke in opposition of the large amount of General Fund being allocated to the Police department.
15. Lisa Helm thanked the City for the many improvements but is concerned with dangerous traffic due to the increase in development.
16. Patrick Scither spoke questioning whether policemen will have the proper de-escalation training before dealing with the homeless population and those with mental illness. He also expressed citizens should be reimbursed for what they have been taxed on since those that voted for the light rail extension never received what they had asked for.
17. Eduardo Pym spoke in support of arts and culture, crisis intervention, funding for affordable housing and mental health services.
18. Harry Keidan did not wish to speak.
19. Richard de Uriarte spoke in support of historic preservation and believes that City Council needs to expand the 2020 bond issues beyond public safety.
20. Claire Nelson spoke in favor of preserving the environment, reduced emissions, increase in sustainability, increase in public transportation, expanded recycling and historic buildings preservation.

21. Abraham James spoke in favor of funding for affordable housing, substance abuse programs as well as an increase in library hours. He wanted to thank the City for everything they have done during the cyclical times.
22. AJ Marsden wanted an update in regards to PHX C.A.R.E.S. and spoke in favor of funding more homeless services.

Councilwoman Laura Pastor thanked everyone for attending and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 7:41 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann-Marie Branicz
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 3 and 5
SUNNYSLOPE COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 2, 2019**

Acting Deputy City Manager Toni Maccarone opened the community budget hearing at 6:01 p.m. She welcomed attendees and recognized city staff. She introduced Councilwoman Debra Stark and Councilwoman Vania Guevara.

Councilwoman Stark welcomed everyone and thanked those in attendance. Councilwoman Guevara thanked those in attendance and pointed out that translation service was available.

A video of the City of Phoenix's budget was presented. Councilwoman Stark opened the hearing to public comments:

1. Gloria Gonzalez spoke in favor of addressing monsoon-related drainage and flooding issues on 13th Street between Van Buren and Moreland Streets. She stated Garfield Elementary School is also affected.
2. Lisa Glow spoke in favor of additional \$258,000 in funding for homeless services.
3. Pat Briggs thanked the city for additional Library Department funding. She spoke in favor of increased funding for services for people who are homeless and recommended researching other cities' innovative ideas.
4. Maria Sanchez spoke in favor of funding for homeless services, youth programs, municipal identification, and traumatic incident intervention resources.
5. Isabel Garcia spoke in favor of funding for homeless and mental health services, affordable housing, and street maintenance.
6. Cleo Lewis spoke in favor of funding for homeless services, affordable housing, and veteran services.
7. Bill Scheel spoke in favor of funding historic preservation programs which will allow for surveys to be conducted on new historic properties.
8. Gloria Padalino submitted a card in favor of increasing library hours.
9. Harold Michelson submitted a card in favor of increasing library hours.

Councilwoman Stark closed the hearing at 6:44 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayra Z. Baquera
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 7 and 8
SOUTH MOUNTAIN COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 4, 2019**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the hearing at 8:10 a.m. He introduced Councilwoman Felicita Mendoza and recognized the interpreter. Mr. Zuercher provided a budget overview, welcomed attendees, and recognized city staff in attendance.

A summary video of the city's trial budget was presented. After the presentation, Mr. Zuercher provided budget highlights that would impact Council districts 7 and 8. Councilwoman Mendoza added to the budget highlights. The hearing was opened to public comments.

1. Julian Sodari spoke in support of investing in Grant Park outdoor exercise equipment and revitalizing the 100-year old Duppa House near Central and Grant.
2. Gloria Gonzalez requested funding for 13th Street (from Moreland to Van Buren) infrastructure including curbs, gutters, sidewalks, and drainage because the neighborhood experiences high levels of flooding and excessive residual dust and debris after rainfall. She added the situation affects the students of Garfield Elementary School and Garfield residents. Mr. Zuercher stated he will follow up with the Street Transportation Department.
3. Dan Penton spoke in support of increased Police patrols in Laveen, funding for a Police precinct, funding for the new community center programming and a new indoor pool, and historic preservation of historically-significant properties south of the freeway. He thanked Councilwoman Mendoza and the city for the full time ambulance. Mr. Zuercher commented the budget includes funding for Police and parks. He added he will follow-up with Historic Preservation staff.
4. Mary Rose Wilcox spoke in support of parks and requested parks be considered a top priority. Mr. Zuercher commented the proposed budget includes funding for central area parks maintenance.

Councilwoman Mendoza closed the hearing at 8:45 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mari Tunder
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 7
BURTON BARR CENTRAL LIBRARY
APRIL 4, 2019**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the community budget hearing at 6:15 p.m. by welcoming and thanking those in attendance. Mr. Zuercher gave a summary of the 2019-20 Trial Budget. He introduced Councilman Michael Nowakowski.

Councilman Nowakowski thanked residents and City staff for attending the hearing and welcomed District 7 interns. He asked staff to present the video which describes the 2019-20 Trial Budget and the budget process. Following the presentation, Councilman Nowakowski opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Gabriella Saavedra requested funding for 13th Street (from Moreland to Van Buren) infrastructure including curbs, gutters, sidewalks, and drainage because the neighborhood experiences high levels of flooding and excessive residual dust, debris, and mold after rainfall. She added the situation affects the students of Garfield Elementary School and Garfield Historic neighborhood residents. Mr Zuercher stated that the City Engineer is preparing a report on this matter.
2. Drew Maxwell spoke in favor of increased funding for arts, additional park rangers, human services, additional forms of emergency shelters for those experiencing homelessness, and the light rail extension to the Laveen area.
3. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of increased funding for the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) and requested \$258,000 in funding to cover half of the operating deficit caused by decreased funding from other sources. He also spoke in favor of providing CASS with relief from a specific cost reimbursement model.
4. Fred Ullrich spoke in favor of funding arts grants, public art maintenance, and the incorporation of arts and culture into the City's priorities.
5. Jana Bommersbach spoke in favor of increased funding for Sunday library hours and for library hours to be restored to seven days a week in libraries across the City.
6. Jim McPherson spoke in favor of a bond program to fund all areas of City services.
7. Darrell Kriplean spoke in favor of a pay increase for public safety employees. Mr. Zuercher stated the City is actively recruiting public safety officers in order to meet hiring goals.

8. Sebastian Dimond spoke in favor of increased funding for Sunday library hours and libraries to be open seven days a week across the City.
9. Dan Klocke spoke in favor of funding for historic preservation and \$500,000 in funding for emergency housing and transportation for vulnerable populations to connect individuals experiencing homelessness with services and safe transportation to family and friends.
10. Ryan Tempest spoke in favor of funding public art and public art maintenance.
11. Jessica Bristou spoke in favor of additional funding for education, storm water management to recharge aquifers, heat readiness initiatives, public transit, shade trees, and green spaces.
12. Ginnie Ann Sumner spoke in favor of increased transparency and public participation outside of the budget cycle, hiring additional park rangers, additional funding for repeat offender programs, and hiring additional public safety officers.
13. Hilda Hernandez spoke in favor of funding \$180,000 for the rental rehabilitation program. She expressed concerns about the problems she was having with her property related to qualifying for the rehabilitation program, including a lien placed on her property. Mr. Zuercher stated Neighborhood Services Director Spencer Self will follow up with Ms. Hernandez after the meeting.
14. Ryan Boyd spoke in favor of funding \$500,000 for a family reunification program, a bond program to fund general services, and participatory budgeting.
15. Kathy Cale spoke in favor of additional funding for library hours for libraries to be open seven days a week across the City.
16. Edward Jensen submitted a card in favor of urban quality-of-life issues and funding for arts and culture programs.
17. Andrew Raub submitted a card in favor of funding for 13th Street (from Moreland to Van Buren) infrastructure including curbs, gutters, sidewalks, and drainage.
18. Mark Ybarra submitted a card in favor of funding for 13th Street (from Moreland to Van Buren) infrastructure including curbs, gutters, sidewalks, and drainage.

Councilman Nowakowski thanked everyone for attending and summarized the comments received. He closed the hearing at 7:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alexa Martin
Management Intern

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 7
COUNTRY PLACE LEADERSHIP ACADEMY
APRIL 8, 2019**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua opened the hearing at 6:00 p.m. Councilman Michael Nowakowski provided opening comments and welcomed those in attendance. He introduced the interpreter.

A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented. Councilman Nowakowski opened the hearing to public comments:

1. Lisa Glow spoke in favor of providing \$258,000 in funding to the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) to cover half of their funding shortfall.
2. Josh Strasburg spoke in favor of funding for homeless veteran services, the development of a planned community center, and youth and teen recreational programs in the 99th Avenue and Lower Buckeye Road area.
3. Jennifer Rouse spoke in favor of funding for a human services campus, programs to address increased homelessness in the Estrella and Laveen areas, seven days of library services, the development of a planned park near Country Place Academy, more parks maintenance, programming the mobile recreation van to visit the Estrella area, a Town Hall on special needs, programming for special needs at the Cesar Chavez Community Center, and increased public safety compensation.
4. Vickie Jaquez spoke in favor of funding for more speeding enforcement in Estrella neighborhoods, pedestrian safety at Estrella street crossings, driver education on school bus laws, increased hiring of Police Officers, and more street maintenance.
5. Charisse Walls spoke in favor of increased funding for the development of a planned park near Country Place Academy, the development of a planned recreation center and planned fire station at 99th Avenue and Lower Buckeye Road, more bus service to the area, increased traffic enforcement, and more Police Officers to cover the area.
6. Lisa Perez spoke in favor of increased funding to address homeless needs, a library for the Estrella area, increased library hours, Police compensation, the development of a planned regional park in the area, and the expansion of Light Rail along the I-10.
7. R. Miller submitted a card in favor of funding for more area parks and dog parks, the development of a fire and police station, residential street lights, animal spay and neuter programs, and more restaurants in the area.

8. Jerry Festa submitted a card in favor of more city services and programs for the growing Estrella area.

Councilman Nowakowski made closing summary remarks, introduced city staff, and adjourned the hearing at 6:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Genevieve Siri
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3
NORTH MOUNTAIN VISITOR CENTER
APRIL 8, 2019**

Councilwoman Debra Stark opened the community budget hearing at 6:01 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the proposed budget. She introduced Deputy City Manager Karen Peters and the overview video was then presented.

Councilwoman Stark opened the hearing to public comments:

1. Steve Schumacher spoke in support of Phoenix historic preservation efforts and proposes to add educational awareness for children and adults within the preservation efforts.
2. John Borowski submitted a speaker card but did not wish to speak.
3. Lin Ling Lee thanked the City for the ongoing \$25,000 to the Arts and Culture budget.
4. Patrick McMullen spoke in favor of the additional funding for Parks in the proposed budget.
5. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of CASS and requests additional dollars to cover increased expenses and mentioned that revenue sources are decreasing. He would also like to see more flexibility in contracting.
6. Robin Petrowski spoke in support of CASS objectives to address the homeless problem and the negative effects encampments leave behind. She also spoke in favor of increasing police officers. She would like the collected library fines to stay within the Library budget.
7. Rene Blain spoke recommending a bike lane added on 7th Street south of Thunderbird Road to Mountain View.
8. Dan Klocke spoke in support of added funding for CASS and would like family reunification efforts to be a part of the homeless solution.
9. Kathleen Ingley spoke in favor of restoring all library hours to be open every day. She also supports increasing trees within the city.
10. Wesley Harris spoke against the funding for employee labor contracts. He also stated that the budget does not include funding to address the current pension problem.

11. Sarah Smith would like a climate policy adopted by the city to prioritize a safe, clean, environmentally sound place to live and funding to make improvements. She also supports updating building codes and old infrastructure to decrease toxic materials and increase solar energy.
12. Kaitlyn Cook submitted a comment card but did not wish to speak. She would like increased usage of solar panels and updating building sustainability.

Councilwoman Stark thanked everyone for attending and concluded the hearing at 6:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susannah Pietrzykowsky
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 5
PENDERGAST COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 8, 2019**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the community budget hearing at 6:00 p.m., provided opening comments, welcomed those in attendance, including city staff and introduced the interpreter. He also requested that speaker cards be completed for those that wished to speak.

Councilwoman Vania Guevara made a few opening comments and thanked those in attendance. A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented.

Councilwoman Guevara then opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Maria Sanchez spoke in favor of allowing community input earlier in the budget process and more transparency, affordable housing, funding for homeless, victim and mental health services, municipal identification, and traumatic incident intervention resources. She was opposed to funding more park rangers and security guards at the libraries.
2. Andrew Loubert thanked the city for their assistance with homeless services and spoke in support of increasing homeless services funding by \$258,000.
3. Luke Black spoke in favor of using the General Fund to increase spending in the areas of trauma support fund, municipal identification, and park amenities and services. He was opposed to additional funding for cultural competency and de-escalation training in the police department and spending \$1.7 million on park ranger expenses.

City Manager Zuercher commented that the \$1.7 million consisted of multiple items being funded not just park rangers.

4. Ruby Barraza spoke in favor of funding for affordable housing, youth programs and mental health services. She opposed services that promote criminalization.
5. Eduardo Rym spoke in favor of allowing community input earlier in the budget process and more transparency and increasing funding for traumatic incident intervention resources.
6. Michael Ingram spoke in opposition of the increase in positions for booking. He commented that if we cite and release there will be less arrests and less people needed for booking.

7. Isabel Garcia spoke in favor of allowing community input earlier in the budget process and more transparency. She was opposed to funding more park rangers and security guards at the libraries and is against more policing and surveillance.
8. Jasmin Meza spoke in favor of funding for youth programs and arts and culture. She opposed services that promote criminalization.
9. Sarahi Munoz spoke in favor of funding for affordable housing, homeless services and youth and community programs. She opposed services aimed at attacking the homeless.
10. Cynthia Baiz thanked the city for their commitment to arts and culture and spoke in favor of increasing funding for arts and culture.
11. Viri Hernandez spoke in favor of allowing community input earlier in the budget process and more transparency, youth and arts programs, municipal identification, affordable housing, and municipal identification. She was opposed to funding more park rangers and security guards at the libraries and programs that criminalize homeless, poor and brown people.
12. Jennifer Hernandez spoke in favor of free youth programs and affordable housing. She was opposed to funding more park rangers and funding that criminalizes homeless.
13. Berta Rita spoke in favor of free youth programs and family services and municipal identification. She expressed that she doesn't feel safe and was opposed to funding more policing and surveillance.
14. Juana Rita asked if citizens must pay to use the trauma fund.

City Manager Zuercher responded that the service is free.

Councilwoman Guevara closed the hearing at 7:06 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Khala Stanfield
Management Assistant II

SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Responded to February 23, 2019 through April 9, 2019

1. Maria Sanchez sent an email regarding questions and feedback on the budget process.
2. Samuel Girgenti left a voicemail stating he supported increased funding for streets maintenance.
3. Mary Outt sent an email expressing support for improving street maintenance and closures; increased Police enforcement and patrols in District 7; and increased enforcement of neighborhood code compliance.
4. Jane Koval sent an email to express support for additional library hours.
5. The Downtown Voices Coalition sent an email to express support for creating a homeless family unification program and utility rate discount or reimbursement for homeless support organizations.
6. Mark Evans sent an email recommending a disc golf course being installed at Cesar Chavez Park.
7. Karen Voyer-Caravona sent an email to express support for more bike lanes, more signage and education about the safe movement of bicycles and vehicles, and light rail expansion.
8. Amy Miao sent an email to express support for building Laveen common park.
9. Julie Lilleberg sent an email to express support for building Laveen common park.
10. Aimee Janca sent an email to express support for building and maintain a city park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
11. Jerry Miziel left a voicemail related to Sunridge Park. He said near the horse trail part the sod/dirt is damaged from the horses walking on it and would like the area turned into a dog park, would like lights around the concrete walkway, would like to see some barriers put in near the sidewalks so that the cars can't drive in the park, and asked if some exercise work stations could be implemented on the walking perimeter.
12. Linda Abegg sent an email to express support for building Laveen common park and use of the \$125,000 from impact fees.

13. Will Hoffman sent an email to express support for building and maintain a city park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
14. Vanessa Ketron sent an email to express support for funding a park manager, eight parks rangers, and continue and convert funding for vehicles and two existing full-time temporary Solid Waste Equipment Operator positions to regular status for citywide cleanup of encampments.

Respectfully Submitted,

Khala Stanfield
Management Assistant II

Genevieve Siri
Management Assistant II



City of Phoenix

General Information Packet

City Council Report

Agenda Date: 4/18/2019, Item No. 2

Community Budget Hearing Minutes

Summary

[Attachment A_April 9-15](#) transmits the minutes of the Community Budget Hearings held between April 9-15, 2019 and a summary of emails, voicemail and social media received for review.

Responsible Department

This item is submitted by City Manager Ed Zuercher and the Budget and Research Department.

ATTACHMENT A _April 9-15



City of Phoenix

To: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

Date: April 17, 2019

From: Jeff Barton
Budget and Research Department Director

Subject: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the community budget hearings held between April 9 – 15, 2019 at [Helen Drake Senior Center](#), [Cesar Chavez High School](#), [Phoenix Children’s Hospital](#), [Maryvale Community Center](#), [Paradise Valley Community Center](#) and [Neighborhood Resource Center](#). The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. [A summary of emails, voice mail and social media is also included.](#)

At phoenix.gov/Budget residents can access:

- The 2019-20 City Manager’s Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2019-20 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The minutes and summary of emails, voice mail and social media are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 1 & 5
HELEN DRAKE SENIOR CENTER
APRIL 9, 2019**

Acting Deputy City Manager Toni Maccarone opened the Community Budget Hearing at 8:29 a.m. by welcoming those in attendance and turned the floor over to Councilwoman Vania Guevara who introduced herself and thanked those for coming to comment on the proposed budget. She then handed the platform over to Councilwoman Thelda Williams who also thanked everyone for coming and being an active part in the budget process.

A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented. The hearing was opened to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Pearl Childress spoke in favor of restoring library hours to be open every day. She requested additional funding for Helen Drake to extend chair yoga classes.
2. Donna Reiner spoke in favor of restoring library hours to be open every day. She would like an additional \$25,000 for public art maintenance.
3. Sue Soto spoke in favor of restoring library hours to be open every day.
4. Carolina Coronel spoke in favor of adding curbs and gutters between Moreland and Van Buren to end flooding issues that happen every monsoon season. She stated it creates parking problems for the residents who then get ticketed for parking in unsuitable areas. Ms. Coronel would like the city to complete a performance study of the area to see what will be needed.
5. Stanley Bates did not speak but submitted a speaker card requesting the City fund a study to review police staffing levels. He states that even the recent staffing increases only puts staffing at 2005 levels rather than increasing for 2019 needs.
6. Jeff Spellman spoke in favor of redevelopment, revitalization, and reunification for the areas between 19th Avenue and Dunlap to 35th Avenue and Indian School Road. He explained that homelessness and blight are problems in the area and spoke in favor of maintaining Streets and Public Works services in cleaning up encampments. Mr. Spellman spoke in favor of the additional park rangers in the proposed budget since they also combat undesirable activities from the homeless taking place in parks. Mr. Spellman also asked how he can find out what the current performance percentages are for Phoenix Cares since their budget increased.

Councilwoman Williams commented that the homeless problem is more of transients refusing services because it's a chosen lifestyle. She mentioned that Phoenix is doing better than most big cities because citizens stay involved. Councilwoman Williams also noted they are working with Courts to see if there's a way to force transients into beneficial programs.

Mr. Spellman followed up by agreeing with Councilwoman Williams and wants to see a more aggressive approach on applying needed services to transients.

7. Patrick Murphy spoke in support of the \$25,000 funding to Arts and Culture and explained that the city and its citizens experience other benefits that the arts bring to society.
8. Shirley Diekman did not turn in a speaker card but chose to comment. She supports the libraries and the additional library security guards. She also spoke in favor of the additional park rangers to decrease transients/homeless in the parks. She also spoke in support of the arts and culture.

Councilwoman Williams added closing comments and thanked everyone for participating. Councilwoman Guevara also thanked everyone for supporting the budget process and encouraged anyone to speak to them individually. As they were closing, a citizen in the audience stood up to speak.

9. Frank Steinman spoke in favor of adding 32 police officers who could specifically patrol the multi-housing units in his area. A comment card was not submitted.

Councilwoman Guevara thanked everyone and concluded the meeting at 9:18 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susannah Pietrzykowsky

Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 7 & 8
CESAR CHAVEZ HIGHSCHOOL
APRIL 9, 2019**

Councilman Michael Nowakowski opened the community meeting at 6:06 p.m. and welcomed those in attendance. He introduced Phoenix Mayor Kate Gallego for a special announcement.

Mayor Gallego welcomed the community to the meeting and introduced Dan Harkins from Harkins theaters who announced that a new mega movie theater would be built near the new South Mountain Freeway and Baseline Road in Laveen in 2020. Harkins staff distributed popcorn and cowbells prior to the budget meeting starting. Mr. Harkins thanked the City Council and city staff.

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the official budget hearing at 6:20 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the city's proposed budget. Mr. Zuercher introduced the Spanish speaking interpreter and requested that speaker cards be completed for those that wished to speak. Mr. Zuercher provided a brief overview of the budget additions being proposed and introduced Councilman Michael Nowakowski and Councilwoman Felicita Mendoza.

A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented.

Councilman Nowakowski then opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Jennifer Rouse expressed support for the addition of the ambulance, park rangers and Harkins theaters. Ms. Rouse requested additional funding for the youth and people with special needs. She supported the light rail expansion and the need to increase library hours to 7 days per week.
2. Gabriela Sivala and Mark Ybarra expressed support for neighborhood revitalization. Ms. Sivala voiced her concern for the severe drainage issues at 13th Street. and Roosevelt Street by Garfield Elementary School. Ms. Sivala requested that the repair project, that was originally studied in 2008, be added to the next years Capital Improvements program. She also requested a left turn signal at Roosevelt and 7th Street to address safety concerns.
3. Kenny Preble expressed support for adding a disc golf course and additional community events to increase sources of revenue.
4. Alan Manka submitted a card in favor of adding a disc golf course to Laveen parks.
5. Franco Hernandez expressed support for more community programs.

6. Ross Patrick submitted a card in favor of adding a disc golf course to Laveen parks.
7. Michelle Campuzano expressed support for increasing services and accessibility at parks and community facilities for people with special needs.
8. Raul Daniels expressed support for increasing services and accessibility at parks and community facilities for people with special needs.
9. Linda Cannon expressed support for increasing library hours and programs.
10. Lisa Perez spoke in favor of funding for neighborhood services, increasing library hours and building out the park at 99th Avenue and Lower Buckeye Road. She also spoke in favor of increased public transportation services and the expansion of the light rail.
11. Kim Domovich submitted a card to express support for adding police, parks and community centers. She also requested better fire station infrastructure and road repairs before more housing is built.
12. Gabriella Saavedia submitted a card but did not specify any issues or concerns other than "13th St."
13. Robert Branscomb spoke in favor of increasing diversified housing options in Laveen. Mr. Branscomb commented on the new community center at the Cesar Chavez Park. He also commented on the new streetlight being added at 39th Avenue and Southern Avenue to address community safety concerns.
14. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of more support and funding for Phoenix homeless shelters and additional resources for the homeless community.

Councilman Nowakowski thanked Mr. Tribken for his high level of commitment to the community.
15. Jason Boyd spoke in favor of adding disc golf at Cesar Chavez Park and increasing activities at the community centers.
16. Jacob (no last name indicated) spoke in favor of adding disc golf at Cesar Chavez Park.
17. George Garcia expressed support for increasing services and accessibility at parks and community facilities for people with special needs.
18. Tony Berastegui spoke in favor of adding a police station in Laveen and the need to build parks in the open fields. He also expressed his concern for street racing.

19. Larry Martin requested an increase in funding for the Pueblo Grande Museum. He expressed his concern for needed repairs to the facility and increasing staffing levels.
20. Dan Panton spoke in favor of developing parks, increasing transportation services and adding funding for street repairs.
21. Tim Gammage expressed a concern for the growth in the community and being proactive in adding funding for public safety.
22. Lisa Salinas expressed her concern about illegal signs being posted and requested soap dispensers in the community park facilities.
23. Christine Dicken spoke in favor of increasing library services.
24. Card number was not used.
25. Isabel Garcia spoke in opposition of adding more funding for the Police Department. Ms. Garcia requested that funding be added to neighborhood service and transportation maintenance programs. She expressed the need to do better in communicating the budget meetings to the community.
26. Lauren Cerone expressed support in building undeveloped city parks in Laveen.
27. Fortino Gredio submitted a card to support an increase in neighborhood services and accessibility at parks and community facilities for people with special needs.
28. Blanca Abarca expressed a need for budget information to be shared with all people in the community.
29. Melissa Huapaya spoke in favor of increased funding for public art maintenance.
30. Valentina Suarez submitted a card to support accessibility at parks and funding community facilities for people with special needs.
31. Dan Krocke spoke in favor of an additional \$500,000 in funding for homeless programs in an effort to reunite families. He expressed his support for reunification which reunites homeless people in our community with families out of state.
- 32-
33. Sue Mockus submitted two cards in support of adding community action officers at the bus stop on 51st Avenue and Baseline Road to keep traffic moving. She also requested adding Cesar Chavez library hours on Friday and after 5 p.m. on Monday. Ms. Mockus mentioned that the library needs paint, updated bathrooms and landscaping.

34. Michael Ingram spoke in favor of increasing funding for youth and arts programs.
35. Stephen Baines spoke in favor of adding funding for non-profit companies to support the services they provide to the community.
36. Sarahi Muñoz Perez spoke in favor of increasing funding for arts and culture and budget transparency.
37. Jasmin Meza spoke in favor of adding funding for youth programs and resources for homeless people.
38. Daisy Cazares submitted a card to express her concern for the money spent on public safety rather than community resources. She requested adding funding to build and maintain the community parks.
39. Victoria Thompson spoke in favor of increasing services for the youth and people with special needs.
40. Stephanie Hurd discussed the need to utilize revenue from impact fees to secure more resources in the Laveen community. She expressed the need for a police substation and the issue of street racing. Ms. Hurd requested the Dobbins Scenic Route Study be reenacted. She requested enhancements for community centers, pools and street maintenance. Ms. Hurd requested funding to build and maintain undeveloped park land, add full-time ambulance staff and increase library services.

Mr. Zuercher recommended contacting the Village Planning Committee for a more detailed understanding of how the impact fees are utilized to fund service increases. Mr. Zuercher mentioned the new ambulance that was added to the budget was a result of the impact fees collected.

41. Angela Strong spoke in favor of funding for special needs programs.
42. Imogen Arate submitted three cards and requested funding for after school programs, better services for the community and more low income housing options to reduce the homeless population. Ms. Arate requested more accessible recycling and composting stations and incentives to retail vendors to utilize these services.
43. Onesimus Strachan expressed support for economic development opportunities and the growth of the high schools. Mr. Strachan commented about a new hospital that was planned to be built. He also commented on the need to increase transportation services to Rio Salado to support resident commuting. Mr. Strachan expressed his support for the employee compensation package identified in the proposed budget.

44. Patricia Gurule spoke in favor of funding for displaced barrios.
45. Wen Huang submitted a card to comment on a bulk trash dispute with public works.
46. Linday Bateman spoke in favor of adding parks to undeveloped lots, specifically at 47th Avenue and Alta Vista Road.
47. Jasmine Dominguez spoke in favor of funding for a special needs community center.
48. Phil Hertel demanded the city stop wasting money rather than adding more money. He expressed a need to address the landscaping along Broadway Road. He recommended removing the landscaping to save money.
49. Vickie Ward submitted a card to support the increase in funding for a new police substation in Laveen, extended library hours and developing the parks. Ms. Ward also requested keeping the multi-purpose trails open.
50. Wendy Sandman submitted a card to support the Dobbins Scenic Route project, adding a police substation and funding for parks.
51. Susan Sanborn spoke in favor of utilizing the funding that had been allocated to build the parks that have been planned and requested the city add funding to maintain the parks.
52. Wendy Ensminger submitted a card requesting funding for more police officers, fire fighters and ambulances. She requested that the planned parks be developed and expressed gratitude for the community center. Ms. Ensminger also asked about the flight paths and why planes fly so low in the area.
53. Millie Strauss submitted a card requesting all libraries be open seven days per week. She also requested that part-time employees be eligible for a raise to minimum wage.
54. Jessy Avalos submitted a card requesting funding for more law enforcement due to vehicle vandalism, graffiti and gun shots. Mr. Avalos commented on the need to repair streets and reduce speed limits.
55. Linda Cannon submitted a card supporting building the park at 55th Avenue that was promised 12-15 years ago.
56. Wendy Flood submitted a card supporting community services for teens and youth and building parks in vacant areas. Ms. Flood requested additional funding for Police and Fire departments.

57. Mary Ann submitted a card asking when there will be an open forum.
58. Bernadette Buehlmann submitted a card in support of pay raises for full-time employees and increased hours for libraries.
59. Maria Rodriguez submitted a card supporting increasing funding for special needs programs.
60. Jessy Avalos submitted a card requesting an increase in solar energy for new development, electric vehicles and recycling to reduce the footprint.

Councilman Nowakowski thanked everyone for attending and expressed his dedication in working with the community through the issues discussed at the meeting.

Councilwoman Felicita Mendoza also thanked the community for coming out to the meetings.

Mr. Zuercher closed the meeting at 8:23 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jesse Hinds
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4
PHOENIX CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL
APRIL 9, 2019**

Assistant City Manager Deanna Jonovich opened the meeting at 6:01 p.m. and welcomed those in attendance. She explained that Councilwoman Laura Pastor was on her way and wished for the meeting to start on time. She also welcomed the Spanish speaking interpreter, Carmen Cota.

Ms. Jonovich reminded everyone to take a tabloid since there was more detail in regards to the budget within the documentation. Lastly, she explained that this meeting would be taped and encouraged citizens to fill out speaker cards if they wished to speak.

A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented. Ms. Jonovich introduced Budget and Research Director, Jeff Barton. He explained to the citizens in attendance how the City Budget process takes place. Councilwoman Pastor then arrived to the meeting and thanked everyone for attending the Community Budget Hearing. Councilwoman Pastor opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Isis Gil thanked the City as well as Phoenix Children's Hospital for holding the budget hearing. She spoke in favor of divesting large-scale government systems and investing in community led work as well as services. She believes the funding should come from freezing any increase in funding for the Police Department since they hold a large chunk of the General Fund.
2. Eduardo Pym spoke in favor of filling the seats in the audience by greater community outreach and requests a quarterly financial report showing where and how the money is being spent in each District.
3. Ginnie Ann Sumner wanted to clarify that the words "homeless" and "transient" are not the same as they were synthesized into one word of "homelessness". She believes the issues and solutions for each one is different and this isn't fair to the homeless population or to help the transient issue. She wants to know how much is allowed in the budget for Community Bridges. She appreciates and participates in the libraries, arts and parks, but after doing internet searching for what makes a livable city she found two common threads and they were safe and secure. She would like to see these issues resolved before the next budget hearing. She says yes to park rangers, a repeat offenders program in Police Department and appropriate compensation for new and existing police officers.

4. Parris Wallace spoke in favor of affordable youth programs and park rangers especially at Falcon Park. She believes that funding should be turned away from public safety and instead be funneled into new and safe park equipment.
5. Ben Loughlin is concerned in how individuals from lower socioeconomic status are being criminalized by Police. He spoke in favor of more funding for affordable housing, library hours, additional water fountains, mental health, addiction services, and the municipal ID program. He believes that residents should have earlier say in the budget process.
6. Patricia Butler wishes for the City to be greener overall. She indicated there need to be more trees especially with all of the construction that is taking place.
7. Luke Black thanked Councilwoman Pastor for her leadership. He spoke in favor of freezing funding for Police, fully fund the trauma fund, funding for the Municipal ID program, decrease in funding for park rangers as well as taking \$390,000 from Street cleaning and allocating it to Central Arizona Shelter Services.
8. Viri Hernandez spoke in opposition of funding for law enforcement/criminalization. She spoke in favor of funding for youth programs, parks, streets, and expanded Library hours as well as mental health.
9. Dr. Robert Cannon thanked the City staff as well as the men and women in uniform. He spoke in favor of increasing funding for conservation of historic neighborhoods.
10. Lisa Glow spoke in favor of providing \$258,000 in funding to the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) to cover half of their funding shortfall.
11. Monica Goddard spoke in favor of funding an expansion in library hours since libraries contribute to the success as well as a more educated population.
12. Laura Stone spoke in support for the Office of Arts and Culture and the proposed supplement to the Community Investments and Engagement Program.
13. Gloria Gonzalez spoke in favor of increased funding for curbs, upgraded paving as well as an improved drainage system on 13th Street.
14. Manuel Salas spoke in favor of increased funding for curbs, upgraded paving as well as an improved drainage system on 13th Street.

15. Orien Nelson spoke in support of increase in funding for programs and services that enhance positive community experiences. She believes that the budget should be more preemptive and not reactive.
16. Mary Muesegades did not wish to speak but submitted a card. She asked for further support in funding for the Office of Arts and Culture.

Councilwoman Laura Pastor thanked everyone for attending and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 7:22 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann-Marie Branicz
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
CITYWIDE ENGLISH/SPANISH MEETING
MARYVALE COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 11, 2019**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:10 p.m. He introduced the councilmembers in attendance: Councilwoman Vania Guevara, Councilwoman Felicita Mendoza, and Councilman Michael Nowakowski thanked those in attendance and expressed the importance of the community budget hearings.

Videos in English and Spanish providing information on the City's budget process were presented.

After the presentation, the hearing was opened for public comments.

1. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of increasing case management funding to provide more support for the homeless population.
2. Carolina Coronel spoke in favor of addressing street and drainage issues on 13th Street in the Garfield neighborhood.
3. Victoria Thompson spoke in favor of more funding for special needs programs and a women's re-entry program.
4. Regina Nixon thanked the Council for the increase in arts and culture funding.
5. Jasmin Meza spoke in favor of a more transparent and accessible budget process.
6. Viridiana Hernandez spoke in favor of funding for parks renovation over funding for park rangers and library security.
7. Silverio Ontiveros spoke in favor of funding for the renovation and maintenance of parks.
8. Dagoberto Bailon spoke in favor of community safety over funding for Police.
9. Sarahi Munoz spoke in support of programs to help people who are homeless and a more transparent budget process.
10. Teodora Mejia spoke in favor of funding for gender-neutral public restrooms and more investment in the community over Police funding.
11. Maria Sanchez spoke in favor of funding for more affordable housing, homeless services, mental health services, and free or affordable youth programs over Police funding.

12. Lucya Zuniga Cortes spoke in support of a policy that will treat the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transsexual Queer (LGBTQ) community members with respect during an encounter with Police.
13. Julio Reyes spoke in support of a policy that will treat the Lesbian Gay Bisexual Transsexual Queer (LGBTQ) community members with respect during an encounter with Police.
14. Vickie Jaquez spoke in support of funding for public safety.
15. Jennifer Hernandez spoke in favor for more investment in the community and a more transparent budget process.
16. Berta Rita spoke in favor of funding youth programs, parks, and streets maintenance over Police funding.
17. Juana (no last name given) spoke in favor of funding for community services over Police funding.
18. Lorenza (no last name given) spoke in favor of funding for community services over Police funding.
19. Eduardo (no last name given) spoke in favor of a more transparent budget process and funding for more affordable housing and homeless services over funding for neighborhood cleanup.
20. Isabel Garcia spoke in favor of not funding park rangers, library security and neighborhood cleanup.
21. Taji White submitted a card in support of addressing homelessness in the community.
22. Daisy Cazares submitted a card requesting more information regarding the distribution of budget funds.
23. Rosario Galvan submitted a card requesting more information regarding the distribution of budget funds.
24. Eduardo Pym submitted a card requesting more information regarding the traumatic event fund.
25. Bailey Tulrer submitted a card requesting more information regarding mental health support.
26. Pita Juarez submitted a card requesting more information regarding street conditions.
27. Felipe Mendez submitted a card in favor of increasing the traumatic event

funding.

28. Jorge Luis Ramirez submitted a card requesting more information regarding homeless services.
29. Gabriela Vera submitted a card requesting more information regarding homeless funding and the halt of Police funding.
30. Esther Moncada submitted a card requesting more information regarding funding street maintenance and decreasing Police funding.
31. Elida Vera submitted a card requesting more information regarding an increase in community funding and a decrease in Police funding.
32. Omar Gonzalez submitted a card in favor of the improvement of roads within neighborhoods.
33. Karen Gonzalez submitted a card in favor of the improvement of roads and parks.
34. Carlos Valenzuela submitted a card in favor of improving alleys, parks, and street conditions.
35. Jannet Carlos submitted a card in favor of implementing street lights and park security.
36. Melinda Velazco submitted a card requesting more information regarding municipal ID and the improvement of streets.
37. Martha Felix submitted a card requesting more information regarding municipal ID and the improvement of parks.
38. Jose F. Ramos submitted a card in favor of rehabilitation centers, parks, and the improvement of streets.
39. Irene Vega Felix submitted a card in favor of implementing municipal ID and the improvement of parks.
40. Rosy Perez submitted a card in favor of the improvement of streets and parks.
41. Beatriz Gonzales submitted a card in favor of street improvements and expressed opposition to the current trial budget.
42. Maria King submitted a card requesting more information regarding street lighting.
43. Esther Moncader submitted a card in opposition to Police funding.

44. Mari Pas Mendez submitted a card in favor of community improvements.
45. Sandra Herrera submitted a card in favor of street improvements.
46. Nely Sejudo submitted a card in favor of increasing homeless services.
47. Jesus Gutierrez submitted a card in favor of the improvements of parks.
48. Josefina Torres submitted a card in favor of the improvement of parks and streets.
49. Gregory Vergonet submitted a card in opposition to Police funding.
50. Juan Herrera submitted a card in opposition to Police funding.
51. Alfredo Mendez submitted a card in opposition to Police funding and in favor of improving the community.
52. Concepcion Franco submitted a card requesting more information regarding community investment.
53. Angelina Maciel submitted a card in opposition to Police funding and in favor of community investment.
54. Francisco Franco submitted a card in favor of increasing school funding.
55. Ignacio Rita submitted a card in favor of homeless services and the improvement of streets.
56. Elvia (no last name given) submitted a card in favor of homeless services and the implementation of educational programs for the community.
57. Jancy Maldonado submitted a card in favor of the improvement of streets, municipal ID, and school crosswalks.
58. Maria Moya submitted a card in favor of the implementation of crosswalks, improvement of streets, and municipal ID.
59. Maria Gutierrez submitted a card in favor of the implementation of crosswalks, improvement of streets, and municipal ID.
60. Natividad Acuna submitted a card in favor of the improvement of streets.
61. Carolina Zamora submitted a card in favor of the improvement of streets.
62. Consuelo Rosales submitted a card in opposition to Police funding and in favor of community investment and municipal ID.

63. Juana Rita submitted a card in opposition of Police funding.
64. Oralía Martínez Flores in opposition to Police funding and in favor of municipal ID. and the improvement of parks.
65. Isabel Espinosa spoke in opposition to Police funding and in favor of municipal ID and the improvement of parks.
66. Verónica Zamora submitted a card in favor of the improvement of parks and streets.
67. Benigno submitted a card in favor of the improvement of streets and alleys.
68. Samanta Vrbian submitted a card in opposition to Police funding and in favor of municipal ID and the improvement of streets.
69. Erika Barragun submitted a card in opposition to Police funding and in favor of municipal ID and the improvement of parks.
70. Magda Félix submitted a card in favor of the improvement of parks and implementation of traumatic event centers.
71. Antonio Hernández submitted a card in favor of increasing homeless services and water fountains in local parks.
72. María Maldonado submitted a card in favor of community investment, municipal ID, and free youth programs.
73. Marco A. Hernández submitted a card in opposition to Police funding and in favor of community investment.
74. Angélica Aragón submitted a card in favor of the improvement of streets, municipal ID, and the implementation of water fountains in parks.
75. Daysi Ocampo submitted a card in favor of municipal ID, park improvements, and homeless services.
76. Jazmin Hernández submitted a card in favor of youth programs and in opposition to Police funding.
77. Teresa Sánchez submitted a card in favor of the implementation of youth programs and activities.
78. Elvia Serna submitted a card in opposition to Police and in favor of community improvements.
79. Beatriz García submitted a card in favor of community safety.

Councilman Nowakowski thanked everyone in attendance. He stated he was the Chair of the Public Safety and Veterans City Council Subcommittee and said some of the topics that were shared can be discussed in that Subcommittee to generate solutions.

Councilwoman Mendoza thanked those in attendance and expressed her support of the community.

Councilwoman Guevara thanked those in attendance and stated the councilmembers were available to speak regarding any other issues the community may have.

Mr. Paniagua closed the budget hearing at 8:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Rogelio Espinoza Huerta
Management Intern

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 2 AND 3
PARADISE VALLEY COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 11, 2019**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the meeting by welcoming those in attendance. Mr. Zuercher introduced Councilman Jim Waring who introduced Councilwoman Debra Stark. Councilman Waring and Councilwoman Stark thanked the public for attending and encouraged attendees to fill out a comment card.

Mr. Zuercher presented the video overview of the proposed budget. Following the presentation, Councilwoman Stark opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Gloria Gonzales spoke in favor of funding and resolving the drainage and infrastructure issues in the 13th Street and Garfield Street area due to flooding and health hazards of mold and dust after the water has subsided.
2. Sandra Weir spoke in support of funding for human services programs, libraries, parks, and community centers to increase civic participation.
3. Ben Loughlin spoke in support of funding for affordable housing, investing in social programs, and programs to help people who are homeless and mentally ill.
4. Armando Bras spoke in support of restoring Sunday library hours at all libraries, especially at the Acacia, Desert Broom, Agave, and Desert Sage branches.
5. Ian Moon spoke in support of funding for the PHX Teens program.
6. Jessica Sissel spoke in support of funding and expanding the PHX Teens program.
7. Michelle Dew spoke in support of funding for programs to assist people who are homeless and community services programs.
8. Rowdy Duncan spoke in support of funding for programs to assist people who are homeless.
9. Brian Mecinas spoke in favor of a climate action plan and environmental programs and funding for light rail, solar power at city facilities, and updating building codes with more “green” requirements.

10. Gervick McFadden spoke in support of funding for programs to assist people who are homeless.
11. Mya Moon spoke in favor of additional funding for the PHX Teens program.
12. Kristie Beaudion spoke in favor of funding for libraries, increasing library hours at existing branches, and expanding the library system.
13. Alana Vehaba spoke in support of funding for neighborhoods, services to help people who are homeless in parks, park maintenance, and park development.
14. Nancy Rink spoke in support of funding for arts and culture. Ms. Rink thanked the City for its continued support of arts programs and hopes to expand funding in the future.
15. Luke Black spoke in support of funding for park clean-up, park equipment repairs, drainage solutions for the 13th Street and Garfield Street area, expansion of library services, and crime prevention programs over funding for Police booking.
16. Kennedy Peters submitted a card in support of more youth programs.

Mr. Zuercher thanked everyone for attending and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 7:20 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Susan Robustelli
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICT 8
NEIGHBORHOOD RESOURCE CENTER
APRIL 15, 2019**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:07 p.m. and welcomed attendees. Mr. Zuercher introduced Councilwoman Felicita Mendoza. Councilwoman Mendoza thanked the public for attending and emphasized the importance of feedback on the 2019-20 Trial Budget.

Mr. Zuercher presented the video overview of the trial budget. Following the presentation, Councilwoman Mendoza opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of funding \$258,000 for the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) to assist people who are homeless.
2. Larry Martin spoke in favor of increasing funding by \$500,000 for the Pueblo Grande Museum to hire full-time staff.
3. Joseph Benesh thanked Councilwoman Mendoza and Mr. Zuercher for their work and for the proposed increase for arts and cultural programs in the trial budget. He spoke about the importance of art and cultural programs to the community.
4. Chris Palmer spoke in favor of increased funding for and attention to the drainage, dust control and parking citations, and infrastructure issues along 13th Street (from Moreland Street to Van Buren Street). He stated there is site plan and design work in progress and asked about funding.

Mr. Zuercher stated the first step is to finish design, and the funding for construction work would likely be in the next capital improvement program.

5. Steve Schumacher spoke in favor of adding funding to establish an educational curriculum on Phoenix's history. He thanked the city for funding historic preservation and for the Mayor's proclamation designating March as Phoenix Pioneer Month.
6. Frank Grinere spoke in favor of increasing funding to convert part-time positions at Pueblo Grande Museum to full-time positions to reduce turnover and retain dedicated staff.
7. Stephen Baines spoke in favor of funding the Fulfillment in Training (FIT) program at South Mountain High School that is a mentorship program that bridges public safety employees and youth in fitness settings.

8. Raul Daniels spoke in favor of increasing funding for special needs programs in Laveen and South Phoenix, including funding a full-time therapeutic Recreation Coordinator position and programming at the future Cesar Chavez Community Center.

Mr. Daniels asked for a contact with the Friends of the Phoenix Public Library. Mr. Zuercher asked Deputy Library Director Maria Dominguez to assist Mr. Daniels with request.

9. James Gizzard spoke in favor funding the Fulfillment in Training (FIT) program because its mission is to build relationships between law enforcement personnel and under-resourced youth.
10. Rachel Johnson spoke in favor of continuing to support arts and cultural programs.
11. Kari Carlisle submitted a card in favor expressing appreciation for and funding to build capacity and catch-up on deferred maintenance of Phoenix's historic properties.
12. Kelly Bushong submitted a card in favor of funding to keep every library open every day.
13. Kaveri Smith submitted a card in support of funding libraries.

Mr. Zuercher thanked everyone for attending and providing comments. He stated things evolve over time and encouraged residents to continue to be engaged. Councilwoman Mendoza thanked attendees for their feedback and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 6:52 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Genevieve Siri
Management Assistant II

SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Responded to April 10, 2019 through April 17, 2019

1. Kristi Bursaw sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
2. Veronica Baca sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
3. Todd Liolios sent an email to express support considering the needs for special education students and planning parks and recreation programming at the new Cesar Chavez Community Center to meet the needs of individuals with disabilities.
4. Andrea Orto sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
5. Daniel Orto sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
6. Cynthia Infante sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
7. Pastor Sarah Stadler sent an email to express support for funding a HAWK light at 3rd Street & Moreland Street and installing a couple of speed signs on 3rd Street between the I-10 on-ramp and Roosevelt Street.
8. Martha Sexton sent an email to express support for increasing the number of patrol officers in the community.
9. William Merritt sent an email to express support for increasing the number of patrol officers and vehicles for them as well as civilian techs and clerks.
10. Goldie Cohen sent an email to express support for increasing funding for more police officers.
11. Joann Cellers sent an email to express support for increasing funding for more police officers.
12. Amber Villalvazo sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.

13. Steve (no last name given) sent an email to express support for increasing funding to educate schools and citizens on Phoenix Historic Preservation.
14. Michelle Lantin sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.

Social media statistics from April 2, 2019 to April 15, 2019 are as follows:

20 Facebook Calendar posts

- Reach: 15,558
- Event views: 4,113
- Reaction (interested/going): 165

7 Tweets (so far)

- Impressions: 64,926
- Engagements: 133

14 YouTube videos (so far)

- Total views: 678

Respectfully Submitted,

Khala Stanfield
Management Assistant II

Genevieve Siri
Management Assistant II



City of Phoenix

General Information Packet

City Council Report

Agenda Date: 4/25/2019, Item No.3

Community Budget Hearing Minutes

Summary

[Attachment A_April 16-18](#) transmits the minutes of the Community Budget Hearings held between Tuesday, April 16 - Thursday, April 18, 2019 and a summary of emails, voicemail and social media received for review. The budget hearings are concluded and this will be the final report.

Responsible Department

This item is submitted by City Manager Ed Zuercher and the Budget and Research Department.

ATTACHMENT A_April 16-18



City of Phoenix

To: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

Date: April 24, 2019

From: Jeff Barton
Budget and Research Department Director

Subject: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the community budget hearings held between Tuesday, April 16 – Thursday, April 18, 2019 at [Goelet A.C. Beuf Community Center](#), [Metro Tech High School](#), [Shadow Mountain Senior Center](#), [Encanto Park Clubhouse](#) and [Matthew Henson HOPE VI](#). The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. [A summary of emails, voicemail and social media is also included.](#)

At phoenix.gov/Budget residents can access:

- The 2019-20 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2019-20 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The minutes and summary of emails, voice mail and social media are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 1 AND 2
GOELET A.C. BEUF COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 16, 2019**

Vice Mayor Jim Waring opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:03 p.m. and welcomed those in attendance. Mr. Waring introduced Councilwoman Thelda Williams. A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented.

Following the presentation, Mr. Waring introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher, who also thanked the public for attending. Mr. Waring opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Craig Tribken spoke in support of additional funding for Central Arizona Shelter Services to provide more case management and placement services for homeless individuals and families.
2. Joseph Benesh thanked Vice Mayor Waring and Councilwoman Thelda Williams for the current investments in arts and culture and spoke in support of additional funding for these activities. Mr. Benesh stated that investing in arts and culture has a significant positive economic impact on the community.
3. Connie Wood submitted a comment card in support of more funding for libraries and for every library to be open every day.
4. Carol Kropf submitted a comment card in support of funding for all libraries to be open on Sunday and more hours added to every day of the week.
5. Gloria Gonzalez spoke in support of funding to solve the drainage issues in the 13th Street and Garfield Street area. Ms. Gonzalez stated that flooding of homes and a nearby school occurs when it rains. She is concerned about the health hazards of mold and dust after the water has subsided and supports funding to resolve the drainage issue in this historical area.
6. Erin Hulverson submitted a blank comment card.

Councilwoman Williams and Vice Mayor Waring thanked all the residents for coming and concluded the meeting at 6:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli
Management Assistant II

**COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4
METRO TECH HIGH SCHOOL
APRIL 16, 2019**

Assistant City Manager Deanna Jonovich opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:02 p.m. and welcomed those in attendance. Ms. Jonovich gave a brief summary of the proposed 2019-20 budget and introduced Councilwoman Laura Pastor.

A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented. Ms. Jonovich introduced Budget Director Jeff Barton. Mr. Barton outlined the budget process and proposed budget in detail. Councilwoman Pastor thanked residents and City staff for coming to the hearing.

Councilwoman Pastor opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Carlos Mendoza spoke in favor of the PHX Teens program. He outlined PHX Teens programs and benefits to participants and their surrounding community.
2. Katherine Russell spoke in favor of the PHX Teens program. She detailed benefits of the program for community youth, and spoke about recent events hosted by the program.
3. Kennedy Peters spoke in favor of welcoming parks with hospitable restrooms, and spoke about walking to Falcon Park. She requested the bathrooms remain unlocked and the bathroom lights remain on.
4. Solomon (no last name given) spoke in favor of community-sensitive training designed to respectfully assist individuals affected by traumatic incidents such as sexual and domestic violence. He requested free programs for youth.
5. Manuel Angelo spoke in favor of youth programs, and urged the City to invest in people.
6. Jennifer Hernandez spoke in favor of additional funding for youth programs designed to provide job training, as well as mental health programs and affordable housing. She spoke in opposition of funding for park ranger and library security programs designed to criminalize individuals experiencing homelessness.
7. Sarahi Muñoz Perez spoke in favor of additional funding for youth programs and environmental programs. She felt all seats should be filled at budget hearings. She spoke in opposition of funding for park ranger and library

security programs designed to criminalize vulnerable populations and individuals experiencing homelessness, and requested decreased police spending.

8. Jasmin Meza spoke in favor of youth programs and homelessness initiatives. She requested budgetary transparency and all seats to be filled at budget hearings. She spoke in opposition of funding for park ranger and library security programs designed to criminalize vulnerable populations and individuals experiencing homelessness, and requested decreased police spending.
9. Isabel Garcia spoke in favor of affordable youth programs. She spoke in opposition of funding for park rangers, library security and neighborhood clean-up programs designed to criminalize vulnerable populations and individuals experiencing homelessness, and requested decreased police spending.
10. Mirabel Lopez spoke in favor of youth programs, mental health programs and homelessness initiatives. She spoke in opposition of funding for police funding, park ranger and library security programs designed to criminalize vulnerable populations and individuals experiencing homelessness, and requested decreased police spending.
11. Daisy Cazares requested funding for public transit.
12. Stephanie Villa-Lobos requested additional funding for youth programs.
13. Jessica Briston requested a definition of sustainable as it relates to the proposed budget.

Budget Director Jeff Barton defined sustainability as it relates to the availability of on-going funds, spending which can be sustained on an annual basis.

Ms. Briston requested urban green space and stated she did not support increased funding for police. She stated water should be conserved during storms. She stated she did not support park ranger and library security programs designed to criminalize individuals experiencing homelessness.

14. Jonathan Gutierrez spoke in favor of additional funding for youth programs. He requested even-distribution of funds in east and west Phoenix and spoke in favor of municipal ID programs.
15. Carol Poore spoke in favor of additional funding for the ongoing maintenance costs of indoor and outdoor public art.

16. Gizela Hernandez spoke in favor of additional funding for youth art programs. She spoke in opposition of police funding criminalizing vulnerable populations, and requested decreased police spending.
17. Noah Simmons spoke in favor of additional funding for affordable youth art programs. He spoke in favor of homeless services and investment in the arts and community, and requested decreased police spending.
18. Endymion Bragg spoke in favor of additional funding for youth programs.
19. Stephen Baines spoke in favor of additional funding for youth programs and homelessness initiatives, and spoke in favor of working holistically with both the community and public safety officers.
20. Adrianna Gonzales spoke in favor of additional funding for youth programs and mental health programs. She spoke in opposition of police funding designed to criminalize vulnerable populations, and requested decreased police spending.
21. Ellen Bilbrey submitted a card in favor of increased funding for street transportation, landscape maintenance, and a bike path on 3rd Avenue between Camelback Avenue and Missouri Avenue.
22. Iliana (no last name given) submitted a card in favor of additional funding for street maintenance and street lights.
23. Elvira Vaquera submitted a card in favor of additional funding to decrease crowded neighborhood streets.
24. Elizabeth (no last name given) submitted a card in support of additional funding for street maintenance.
25. America Patricia Medina submitted a card stating the community budget hearings provided information on interesting topics, which could help if future problems arise.
26. Josi Castillo submitted a card in support of additional funding for street maintenance.
27. Marcela Sofia Martinez Medina submitted a card in support of additional funding for community programs to reduce incarceration and recidivism.
28. Reganne Mercado submitted a card in support of teacher training and more friendly security at schools.
29. Vennet Robles submitted a card in support of additional funding for youth programs and mental health, and decreased police spending.

30. Nora Espino submitted a card in support of additional funding for social services.
31. Dejaliza Hernandez submitted a card in support of 1 percent of the City's budget be given directly to the community.
32. Leanne Murphy submitted a card in support of additional funding for youth programs and recreational spaces.
33. Heriberto Bautista submitted a blank card.
34. Felicity Welch submitted a blank card.
35. Lindsay Ashworth submitted a card in support of free youth programs, homeless services, additional water fountains and park equipment repairs. She stated she did not support police funding, park ranger or library security programs designed to criminalize vulnerable populations and individuals experiencing homelessness, and requested decreased police spending.
36. Kamini Ramalenishna submitted a card requesting decreased police spending and stated she did not support library security and park ranger programs designed to criminalize vulnerable populations. She requested expanded library hours, homeless services.
37. Martha Gonzalez submitted a card in support of additional funding for neighborhood street lights.
38. Margarita Castillo submitted a card in support of additional funding for community services and programs.
39. Bailey Tuller submitted a card in support of additional funding for mental health programming.
40. Andrew Acuña submitted a card in support of additional funding for mental health programming.
41. Noe Rosales submitted a card requesting decreased funding for cops and additional funding for youth programs.
42. Humberto Morales submitted a card in support of additional funding for street maintenance.
43. Julio Santiago submitted a card in support of additional funding for community programming.
44. Rosa Gomez submitted a card in support of additional funding for street light and school safety.

45. Angelica Aragon submitted a card in support of additional funding for youth programs and decreased police funding.
46. Juana (no last name given) submitted a card in support of additional funding for traffic safety, clean parks, street maintenance, and public transit.
47. Ivan Nunez submitted a card in support of additional funding for street maintenance and public spaces.
48. Carolina Canedo submitted a card in support of additional funding for a municipal ID program.
49. Treianna Myles submitted a card in support of additional funding for free youth programs, participatory budgeting, victim advocacy and homeless services.
50. Rudy Velasco submitted a blank card.
51. Kevin Zuniga submitted a card in support of additional funding for south Phoenix projects and programming.
52. Michelle Ruiz submitted a card in support of additional funding for youth programs and decreased police funding.
53. Cynthia Diaz submitted a card in support of additional funding for social services and decreased police funding.
54. Maxima Guerrero submitted a card in support of additional funding for free arts and culture programs.
55. Milagros Renteria submitted a card in support of additional funding for social services.
56. Jose Eduardo Ramos submitted a card in support of additional funding for mental health programming.
57. Victoria Riechers submitted a card in support of additional funding for affordable housing, social services, victims advocacy, mental health programs, youth programs and a municipal ID program. She requested decreased police funding, park ranger and library security programs designed to criminalize vulnerable populations and individuals experiencing homelessness.
58. Melony Aguilar submitted a card in support of additional funding for youth programming.
59. Fatyma Yasut submitted a card in support of additional funding for youth programming.

60. Matthew Mejia submitted a card in support of additional funding for street and alley maintenance and recreational facilities.
61. Trinity Mejia submitted a card in support of additional funding for street and alley maintenance and recreational facilities.
62. Rosalie Celaya submitted a card in support of additional funding for street and alley maintenance and recreational facilities.
63. Genesis Mejia submitted a card in support of additional funding for street and alley maintenance and recreational facilities.
64. Diana Valenzuela submitted a card in support of additional funding for street and alley maintenance and recreational facilities.
65. Maria Mejia submitted a card in support of additional funding for street and alley maintenance and recreational facilities.
66. Sebron Parker submitted a blank card.
67. Celeste Leon submitted a blank card.
68. Michael Ingram submitted a card in support of additional funding for youth art programs, and decreased police funding, park ranger and library security programs designed to criminalize vulnerable populations and individuals experiencing homelessness.
69. Hillary Foose submitted a card in support of arts and culture.

Councilwoman Pastor thanked everyone for attending and stressed the importance of the youth involvement in the community budget hearing process. She concluded the hearing at 7:07 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Alexa Martin
Management Intern

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3
SHADOW MOUNTAIN SENIOR CENTER
APRIL 18, 2019**

Assistant City Manager Milton Dohoney, Jr. opened the Community Budget Hearing at 8:00 a.m. and welcomed those in attendance. Mr. Dohoney introduced the Spanish-speaking interpreter and requested that speaker cards be completed for those that wished to speak. Mr. Dohoney provided a brief overview of the budget process and introduced Councilwoman Debra Stark.

Councilwoman Stark expressed the importance of community input at the budget hearings.

A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented.

Mr. Dohoney opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Christopher Palmer spoke in favor of increasing funding for neighborhood improvements in the Garfield District along 13th Street from Van Buren Street to Maryland Street.
2. Caroline Lobo spoke in favor of adding funding for street improvements in the Hatcher corridor. She requested additional funding for homeless encampment cleanup, shading and art work in the community. Ms. Lobo requested that the temporary staff in solid waste for encampment cleanup be converted to full-time positions.
3. Nancy Rink spoke in favor of adding funding to maintain art in the community and increasing neighborhood improvement efforts.
4. Jimmy Alauria expressed his concern for public safety along Hatcher from 7th Avenue to 19th Avenue due to a lack of street lighting. He spoke in favor of adding street lighting to help illuminate the community making it safer for the police and citizens.
5. Nadine Alauria spoke in favor of adding neighborhood improvement funding to the Hatcher corridor to address street cleanup and lighting needs. She also commented on the need to implement a gated alleyway program.

Councilwoman Stark commented on the block watch bike squad group that was making an impact in the community.

6. Barbara Snyder spoke in favor of funding for art maintenance and neighborhood revitalization funding in the Hatcher corridor. She also commented on the need to increase funding for street lights in the area.

7. Mary Travis spoke in favor of increasing library hours and requested the city add an outdoor pickle ball court in the northeast area.
8. Rick Naimark spoke in favor of adding \$25,000 to increase the art maintenance budget. He also requested adding \$500,000 to \$1,000,000 for historic preservation efforts to save buildings in downtown phoenix that are in jeopardy of being torn down. Mr. Naimark requested funding for human services to address the mental health issues in the community.

Councilwoman Stark agreed with the need to address these issues.

9. Caiden Ouimet, a student visiting the council office, spoke to thank Councilwoman Stark for allowing him to shadow her and other staff.
10. Samantha Dezonias submitted a card in support of adding street lighting along Hatcher Road from 19th Avenue to 12th Street. She commented on the need for assistance with homeless encampment cleanups and neighborhood beautification.

Councilwoman Stark thanked everyone for attending and concluded the meeting at 8:40 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jesse Hinds
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 4 AND 7
ENCANTO PARK CLUBHOUSE
APRIL 18, 2019**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:04 p.m. and welcomed those in attendance. Mr. Zuercher introduced the Mayor's Office Community Outreach Director Cepand Alizadeh who was available to speak to residents after the meeting. A video describing the City of Phoenix's Budget was presented.

Mr. Zuercher introduced the Spanish-speaking interpreter, Carmen Cota, Councilwoman Laura Pastor, and Councilman Michael Nowakowski.

Councilwoman Pastor opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of more funding for the Central Arizona Shelter Services and additional resources for the homeless community.
2. John Walker spoke in favor of increasing funding to street infrastructure that promotes cycling safety.
3. Steve Martin spoke in favor of additional funding for the arts.
4. Gabriella Saavedra spoke in favor of funding for 13th Street in the Garfield neighborhood to improve street infrastructure because the neighborhood experiences high levels of flooding and excessive residual dust, debris, and mold after rainfall.
5. Jeff McAdams spoke in favor of increasing speed limit enforcement along Seventh Avenue.
6. Ginnie Ann Sumner wanted to clarify that the words "homeless" and "transient" are not the same as they were synthesized into one word of "homelessness". She believes the issues and solutions for each one is different and this is not fair to the homeless population or to help the transient issue. She feels Phoenix has a compassionate and realistic program for each population but we are not adequately supporting it. It is called the repeat offenders program. However, the name implies that only transient issues are being addressed. The homeless are being protected and helped as well as neighborhoods. She believes we call it public safety but the main issues each year are all about past agreements and not everyone counts the same. She requests that next year's budget hearings revolve around keeping the public safe and is in favor of park rangers.

7. Mike Oleskow spoke in favor of additional funding for the arts.
8. Katie McFadzen spoke in favor of a rental support program for arts organizations.
9. Bob Herman spoke about cars driving over the speed limit and recommended the use of traffic cameras to issue tickets for speeding.
10. Robert Cannon spoke in favor of finding solutions to traffic issues in the Willo neighborhood.
11. Brent Kleinman spoke in favor of public safety, sustainable energy, and opening public pools earlier in the year, and extending pool hours.
12. Gene Nance spoke in favor of reducing traffic and speeding in the Willo neighborhood and making the neighborhood safer for cyclists.
13. Opal Wagner spoke in favor of reducing traffic and speeding in the Willo neighborhood and increasing funding to the Historic Preservation Office.
14. Brad Brauer spoke in favor of increasing funding for traffic safety in the Willo neighborhood.
15. Nelson Ross spoke in favor of additional funding for the arts.
16. Lara Sands spoke in favor of reducing traffic and speeding in the Willo neighborhood and making the neighborhood safer for cyclists.
17. Zachary Holman spoke in favor of making the streets safer to ride a bike and requested the addition of bicycling facilities.
18. Reina Zamani spoke in favor of increased funding to clean up graffiti.
19. Richard de Uriarte submitted a card in support of historic preservation, traffic calming efforts, affordable housing, and light rail.
20. Zenya Weatherall submitted a card in favor of investing in people rather than incarcerating them.
21. Rose Mary Verdugo submitted a card to bring awareness to community development, public housing, emergency home repairs, community enrichment, and youth programs.
22. Daisy Danforth submitted a card to bring awareness to homeless services, youth programs, and affordable housing.
23. Mark Hayduke Grenard submitted a card to bring awareness to affordable housing, trauma funding, youth education, and foreclosure prevention.

24. Susan Morris submitted a card in support of increasing youth programs that increase community engagement and training.
25. Jaedyn Thomas submitted a card to bring awareness to immigration, family separations, racism, and police relations.
26. Krystal Renteria submitted a card in support of affordable housing and making neighborhoods better with regular maintenance and street lights.
27. Bill Rayner submitted a card to bring awareness to traffic on 3rd Avenue and 5th Avenue.
28. Adrianna Gonzales submitted a card in support of increasing resources to help people who need mental health services.
29. Diane Wiesenthal submitted a card in support of restoring Sunday hours at Acacia, Agave, Desert Broom, and Desert Sage libraries.
30. Andrew Raub submitted a card to bring awareness to the infrastructure issues on 13th Street in the Garfield neighborhood.
31. Bill Raynar submitted a card to bring awareness to traffic along 3rd Avenue and 5th Avenue in the Willo neighborhood.
32. Beth Plasencia submitted a card in favor of adding sidewalks and improving cycling and walking paths in the Willo neighborhood.

Councilwoman Pastor thanked the public for attending the budget hearing and spoke about the online participatory budgeting that will soon be available on the City's website for residents to use.

Councilman Nowakowski thanked everyone for attending and expressed his dedication to working with the community on the issues discussed at the meeting. He concluded the hearing at 7:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayra Z. Baquera
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICT 8
MATTHEW HENSON HOPE VI
APRIL 18, 2019**

Deputy City Manager Karen Peters opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:04 p.m. and welcomed those in attendance. Ms. Peters welcomed the Spanish interpreter, Sandra Heredia. Councilwoman Felicita Mendoza thanked everyone for attending the Community Budget Hearing. A video describing the City of Phoenix's budget was presented.

Councilwoman Mendoza opened the hearing to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Earl Wilcox spoke in opposition to Arizona Public Service Company's power plant relocation and expansion to the Grant Park area and spoke in favor of funding for a city study on the impact of these activities on historical neighborhoods.
2. Grace Salinas spoke in favor of continued funding for senior centers. She thanked the Police Department and park rangers' responses to homelessness in neighborhoods.
3. Eva O. Olivas spoke in favor of increasing funding for the Police Department, community strengthening programs, and reducing homelessness in parks.
4. Isaac Gaspar spoke in favor of funding the Fulfillment in Training (FIT) program at South Mountain High School, programs to bridge the gap between the Phoenix Police Department and the community, and community development.
5. Josue Parra spoke in favor of funding the Fulfillment in Training (FIT) program at South Mountain High School and programs to strengthen the community and help under-resourced individuals obtain access to employment and health services to alleviate poverty and enhance quality of life.
6. Rachel Johnson thanked the city for supporting arts and cultural programs. She spoke in favor of funding for arts grants and maintenance.
7. Mary Rose Wilcox submitted a card in favor of funding for parks.
8. Isaiah Dixson submitted a card in favor of funding the Fulfillment in Training (FIT) program at South Mountain High School.

9. Job Salinas submitted a blank comment card.

Councilwoman Mendoza thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 6:56 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann-Marie Branicz
Management Assistant II

SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Responded from April 16, 2019 through April 22, 2019

1. Andrea Erdbacher sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
2. Stacey Leybas sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
3. Jason Rottman sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
4. Jenell Kizziar sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
5. Mike Abegg sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
6. Jeremiah Beltran sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
7. Danny Phu sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
8. Adriann Shivers sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
9. Richard Rubio sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
10. Laura P. Arreguin Garcia sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
11. Virgel Cain sent an email to express support for expanding hours at Desert Broom Library and being open six days a week.

12. Rhonda Beckstead sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.
13. Mandy Jones sent an email to express support for building and maintaining Laveen Commons Park at South 55th Avenue and West Samantha Way in Laveen.

Social media statistics from April 2, 2019 to April 22, 2019 are as follows:

20 Facebook Calendar posts

- Reach: 15,933
- Event views: 4,297
- Reaction (interested/going): 172

7 Tweets (so far)

- Impressions: 97,038
- Engagements: 174

14 YouTube videos (so far)

- Meetings:
- Total views: 929 times
- Total Minutes Watches: 6,046
- Shared: 93 times

Respectfully Submitted,

Khala Stanfield
Management Assistant II

Genevieve Siri
Management Assistant II