



City of Phoenix

## General Information Packet

### City Council Report

---

Date: 4/5/2018, Item No. 1

---

#### Community Budget Hearing Minutes

##### Summary

**Attachment A** transmits the minutes of the first five Community Budget Hearings and initial electronic comments received for review.

##### Responsible Department

This item is submitted by City Manager Ed Zuercher and the Budget and Research Department.

---



## City of Phoenix

**To:** Ed Zuercher  
City Manager

**Date:** April 5, 2018

**From:** Jeff Barton  
Budget and Research Department Director

**Subject:** COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the first five community budget hearings. These hearings were held Monday, April 2, 2018, at [North Mountain Visitor Center](#) and Tuesday, April 3, 2018, at [Arizona School for the Arts](#), [Helen Drake Senior Center](#), [Paradise Valley Community Center](#), and [Pendergast Community Center](#). The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the [electronic and voice mail comments](#) are also included.

At [phoenix.gov/Budget](http://phoenix.gov/Budget) residents can access:

- The 2018-19 City Manager's Trial Budget Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2018-19 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The community budget hearings will be held through April 17. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from the first five community budget hearings and initial electronic comments responded to are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3  
NORTH MOUNTAIN VISITOR CENTER  
APRIL 2, 2018**

Councilwoman Debra Stark opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:00 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. She introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher. He acknowledged the City staff present and the interpreter, Maria Garcia.

Mr. Zuercher showed two videos: the overall budget process and the FY18-19 Trial Budget. Following the presentations, he opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Winifred Green spoke in favor of more assistance from PHX C.A.R.E.S. to address residents living in the washes.
2. Craig Tribken stated he would like to see additional homeless services including increased outreach programs, affordable housing, temporary shelters and case management services.
3. John Siefert expressed his appreciation for recent street improvements including asphalt repairs and street maintenance. He also spoke in favor of more LED streetlights.
4. Candice Fremouw spoke in support of increased funding for public safety.
5. Miranda Groux spoke in support of additional homeless services including funding for 24/7 restroom access.
6. Casey Whitehead spoke in support of expanded homeless services including funding for more temporary shelters and assistance from PHX C.A.R.E.S.
7. Lindsay Myers spoke in support of additional homeless services including funding for outreach, shelters and case management.
8. Erin Clapp expressed concern about homelessness and the closing of the overflow shelter. She stated she would like to see a zero-barrier shelter.
9. Ana Chavez spoke in support of additional homeless and mental health services including funding for outreach, shelters and case management.
10. Patrick Tiersch expressed concern about homelessness and the lack of assistance from PHX C.A.R.E.S. He stated he would like to see programmatic changes and additional resources to address homelessness. He also suggested LED light use as a cost reduction.
11. Nancy Kroening spoke in support of funding public safety, developing a Police Oversight Committee and services assisting people with mental illness.
12. Lin Ling Lee spoke in support of arts and culture funding. She also expressed support for investments to improve homelessness.

13. Judy Guilds spoke in favor of arts and culture programs and requested an additional \$16,000 for arts maintenance.
14. Marshall Zeable spoke in support of hiring additional fire staff and increasing funding for equipment to reduce response times.
15. Arick O'Hara spoke in support of hiring additional fire staff and increasing funding for equipment to reduce response times.
16. Rene Blain spoke in support of making road improvements to the North Mountain access road so that it is accessible for those with special needs.
17. Barbara Snyder spoke in favor of arts maintenance funding.
18. Steve Buerlein stated he would like to see the City's increased revenue be used to increase Fire Department funding.
19. Patrick McMullen expressed support of funding desert preserves.
20. Massimo Sommacampagna stated he would like the Acacia library open every day.
21. Charles Weber asked questions pertaining to the City's reappropriation process and use of unused funds.
22. John Dean spoke in support of hiring additional public safety staff and increasing funding for equipment to reduce response times.

Councilwoman Stark thanked everyone for attending, noting their comments matter. She closed the hearing at 7:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Khala Stanfield  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 1 AND 5  
HELEN DRAKE SENIOR CENTER  
APRIL 3, 2018**

Mayor Greg Stanton opened the Community Budget Hearing at 8:30 a.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He introduced Vice Mayor Thelda Williams, Councilman Daniel Valenzuela and City Manager Ed Zuercher.

Mr. Zuercher presented two videos: the overall budget process and the proposed FY18-19 Trial Budget. Following the presentations, he opened the hearing to public comment.

1. Steven Musto spoke in support of implementing merit based funding at the City of Phoenix. He noted it would make departments more accountable and reward departments that are successful.
2. Aaron Erusberger spoke in support of additional funding for the Fire Department.
3. Terry Mullarkey spoke in support of additional police services in North Phoenix and additional parks in the area given the rapid development.
4. Craig Tribken spoke in support of increased funding for homeless services through increased outreach programs, more affordable housing, and in depth case management.
5. Sue Soto spoke in support of increased library funding. She stated she would like to see every library open every day.
6. Frank Steinmetz stated he would like to see results of homeless initiatives before supporting programs with additional funding. He questioned supporting social services in lieu of public safety with proven results.
7. Donna Reiner spoke in support of increased funding for public art maintenance.
8. Casey Whitehead spoke in support of expanding services for homeless that are sustainable longer term and based on the person's capability.
9. Ana Chavez spoke in support of additional homeless services including increase case management.
10. Edith Schnauffer spoke in support of having input on senior center funding and the meal service and activities.
11. Eva Olivas stated she would rather have additional funding be provided to the Police, Fire, Parks and Recreation, Public Works and Neighborhood Services departments who are directly providing services related to homelessness and to neighborhoods. She added more affordable housing is needed throughout the City for low income residents and veterans.

12. Jeff Spellman spoke in support of items in the proposed budget to assist neighborhoods, sober living group home licensing and increased park rangers. He stated safety and homeless issues need to be addressed ensuring accountability by all involved. He added additional funding is needed for the Public Works Department who is responsible for homeless related clean up.
13. Pam Fitzgerald stated she also supported items supporting neighborhoods, licensing sober living homes and addressing homeless issues.
14. Jason Wright spoke in support of additional funding to increase Fire Department staffing and equipment.
15. Ima Jean Dolan spoke in support of police services, noting the impact of homeless support has on response times. She spoke in support of adding additional officers. She added she supports increased funding for licensing sober living homes.
16. Dorothy Ward spoke in support of increased funding to add additional trees.
17. Jessica Bueno submitted a card in support of homeless funding to be used to support services addressing homeless in the Public Works, Neighborhood Services and Parks and Recreation departments instead of expanding homeless outreach teams.
18. J. J. Hover submitted a card in support to increasing fire staffing with 138 new fire fighters.

Mayor Stanton, Vice Mayor Williams and Councilman Valenzuela thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 9:50 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 2 AND 3  
PARADISE VALLEY COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 3, 2018**

Councilman Jim Waring opened the meeting by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to the Community Budget Hearing. Councilman Jim Waring then introduced Councilwoman Debra Stark and City Manager Ed Zuercher. City Manager Ed Zuercher also thanked community members and city staff for attending.

City Manager Ed Zuercher presented the video overview of the proposed budget. Following the presentation, Councilwoman Stark opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Wesley Harris asked questions about the public safety pension and adding staff for the proposed Crime Gun Intelligence Center. Mr. Zuercher and staff from the Police Department responded to his questions. Mr. Harris questioned adding 47.4 new staff in 2018-19, noting he supports small government. Mr. Harris stated he felt the proposed Park Ranger positions should be dedicated to patrolling parks.
2. David Gore spoke in support of increased funding for the Fire Department.
3. Bryan Willingham spoke in support of increased funding for the Fire Department.
4. Larisa Balderama spoke in support of licensed and regulated sober living residences.
5. Ginnie Sumner spoke in support of the PHX C.A.R.E.S. program and the Police Department. Ms. Sumner stated she is concerned Park Rangers do not have enough authority and asked the City to build more relationships with non-profits and to be a leader in the solving of homelessness.
6. Nita Muhlenfeld spoke in support of funding for libraries and extended hours, adding every library branch should be open every day.
7. Ron Peer submitted a comment card in support of funding for library services.
8. John Siefert submitted a comment card in support of more funding for City streets.
9. Cynthia Kerr submitted a comment card in support of sober living licensing, homeless intervention services and additional funding for Police and Fire. Ms. Kerr also commented funding for light rail should be reallocated to City streets and noted the cost of the trees for the streetscape management program are too expensive.

City Manager Ed Zuercher thanked everyone for attending and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 7:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 5  
PENDERGAST COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 3, 2018**

Councilman Daniel Valenzuela opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:07 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the proposed budget. He explained briefly about the budget process and how it is a trial budget because it will change after hearing from the community. Councilman Valenzuela introduced Deputy City Manager Karen Peters.

Ms. Peters explained briefly the hearing and budget process. She thanked residents for coming out and presented both overview videos that explained the budget process and the current budget in depth.

1. Mari Herrera spoke in favor of reallocating \$300,000 for homeless outreach to public safety, the Neighborhood Services Department, and park rangers. She commented the homeless issue is adequately funded this year and resources would be more beneficial in the areas mentioned.
2. Ramon Gonzalez spoke in support of adding more fire stations and 138 more firefighters to help with response times.
3. Father Tom Doyle spoke in favor of providing additional funds to Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) supporting temporary shelter within the City and address mental health issues.
4. Shirley Diekman stated she supports additional funding for homeless and mental health services.
5. Lisa Glow spoke in favor of additional funding for homeless services including temporary shelters, case management and affordable housing.
6. Regina Nixon spoke in favor of maintaining arts and education resources because it improves the quality of life. She stated she would like additional funding for art maintenance and to move towards a \$1 per capita budget for arts education.
7. Suzanne Thraen spoke against additional funding for homeless services as she feels most of the homeless do not want services to improve their situation. She stated she supported services for those seeking assistance. Ms. Thraen added that she would also like to move money from homelessness to neighborhood specialists and public safety that work to improve neighborhoods.
8. Vickie Jaquez submitted a speaker card in favor of increasing funding for Police and Fire, Sober Living licensing, Neighborhood Services Department, Community Bridges, Inc., park safety and the Public Works Department.

Councilman Valenzuela again thanked everyone for attending and concluded the hearing at 6:58 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susannah Pietrzykowsky  
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 7  
ARIZONA SCHOOL FOR THE ARTS  
APRIL 3, 2018**

Deputy City Manager Deana Jonovich opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:03 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance. She presented two videos on the new budget development process and Trial Budget.

Councilman Michael Nowakowski thanked the audience for attending the meeting. He stated attending budget hearings represent the “Team Phoenix” approach, noting the hearing is intended for the Council to hear the needs of the community.

Councilman Nowakowski opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Aaron Ernsberger spoke in favor of increased funding for the Fire Department.
2. Athia Hardt spoke in favor of increased funding for the Library Department.
3. Donna Reiner spoke in favor of increasing funding for public art maintenance by \$16,000, for a total budget of \$100,000.
4. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of increasing funding for more temporary shelters, case management services, and affordable housing for people who are homeless.
5. Kim Osborne spoke in favor of increased funding homeless services including restrooms and cleanup in central city neighborhoods.
6. Hannah Bashaw expressed concerns about homelessness in and around Hance Park. She spoke in favor of increasing funding for security for the Roosevelt neighborhood and for more services to direct people who are homeless to shelters.
7. Stephen Jennings expressed concern about crime in his neighborhood. He spoke in favor of increased funding for more dumpsters in his neighborhood and funding to address homeless issues and graffiti removal.
8. Jessica Bueno spoke in favor of reallocating funding from PHX C.A.R.E.S. to Police, Fire, Neighborhood Services, and Parks and Recreation departments.
9. Patrick Tiersch spoke in favor of increasing funding homeless services including more restrooms and showers at Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) and to keep open the St. Vincent de Paul’s overflow shelter.
10. Dan Klocke spoke in favor of increasing funding to CASS and St. Vincent de Paul for a family reunification program for people who are homeless. He also suggested the City host a conversation with providers and advocates for people who are homeless to discuss how to help people who are a danger to themselves or to others.
11. Lindsey Myers spoke in favor of increased funding for shelters, affordable housing, and case management. He suggested evaluating the effectiveness of services for people who are homeless.

12. Miranda Groux spoke in favor of funding for a non-barrier shelter and more case management services for people who are homeless in light of the closing of the overflow shelter.
13. Wayne Weber spoke in favor of funding to keep open the overflow shelter.
14. Ryan Boyd spoke in favor of increasing funding for services for people who are homeless. He also spoke in support of bike lanes, trees, and shade to make the City more walkable and accessible.
15. Jack Schwimmer spoke in favor of increased funding for arts grants and public art maintenance.
16. Eva Olivas spoke in favor of funding for Police, Park Rangers, Public Works, and Neighborhood Services instead of current homeless services.
17. Drew Maxwell spoke in favor of increased funding for Park Rangers at Hance Park and more police presence around the Arizona School for the Arts to address concerns about people who are homeless.
18. Mark Davis spoke in favor of substantially increased funding to address homeless issues in the Roosevelt neighborhood.
19. Abraham James spoke in favor of increased funding for streets, sustainable neighborhoods, more youth and senior centers, more library hours, and more programs to address homelessness.
20. Felix Moran spoke in favor of restoring funding for YouthBuild and increased funding for youth programs and a youth recreation center in Laveen.
21. Cory Kincaid spoke in favor of funding to help people who are homeless and to continue to create a walkable, dense central city core.
22. Andie Abkarian submitted a card in favor of increased funding for historic preservation and a dedicated site planner position for the Downtown core. She also expressed support for increased funds in the Planning and Development Services Department for the Office of Customer Advocacy and Adaptive Re-use.

Councilman Nowakowski thanked everyone for attending. He invited residents to a town hall on April 4 at 7pm in City Hall to discuss recent crime in the Roosevelt area. He adjourned the meeting at 7:19 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Genevieve K. Siri  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES**  
**VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS**  
**Responded to through April 3, 2018**

1. Enukes2079@gmail.com sent an email in support of increasing pay for police officers.
2. Scott Weinberg sent an email requesting the City fund 3 School Resource Officer positions at Ahwatukee middle schools.
3. Mandy Fellows sent an email in support of increasing staffing at Station 55 to 24 hours.
4. Michelle Ricart sent an email in support of increasing staffing at Station 55 to 24 hours.
5. Stehaney Jones-Wild sent an email in support of increasing staffing at Station 55 to 24 hours.
6. Roger Willis sent an email encouraging additional City funded parks in north Phoenix developments areas.
7. Tanzania Hernandez sent an email in support of opening every library, every day.
8. Lael Beier sent an email in support of additional funding for services for the homeless.
9. Lorena Miss-Ozuna sent an email in support of additional funding/services for Andre House.

Respectfully submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant



City of Phoenix

## General Information Packet

### City Council Report

---

Date: 4/12/2018, Item No. 1

---

#### Community Budget Hearing Minutes

##### Summary

**Attachment A** transmits the minutes of the next four Community Budget Hearings and initial electronic comments received for review.

##### Responsible Department

This item is submitted by City Manager Ed Zuercher and the Budget and Research Department.

---



## City of Phoenix

**To:** Ed Zuercher  
City Manager

**Date:** April 12, 2018

**From:** Jeff Barton  
Budget and Research Department Director

**Subject:** COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from an additional four community budget hearings. These hearings were held between Wednesday, April 4 – 11, 2018, at [Shadow Mountain Senior Center](#), [Sunnyslope Community Center](#), [Steele Indian School Park and Senior Opportunities West Senior Center](#). It also includes revised minutes of the [Paradise Valley Community Center](#) hearing. The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A [summary of the electronic and voice mail comments](#) are also included.

At [phoenix.gov/Budget](http://phoenix.gov/Budget) residents can access:

- The 2018-19 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2018-19 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The community budget hearings will be held through April 17. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes and summary of emails are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3  
SHADOW MOUNTAIN SENIOR CENTER  
APRIL 4, 2018**

Deputy City Manager Karen Peters opened the Community Budget Hearing at 8:03 a.m., welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. She introduced Councilwoman Stark who welcomed those in attendance and asked for feedback on the proposed City Manager's Trial Budget.

Ms. Peters presented two videos which provided information on the City's overall budget process and an overview of the FY2018-19 Trial Budget.

After the presentation, Ms. Peters opened the hearing for public comment.

1. Keith Slatley submitted a comment card expressing concern for Fire Department staffing levels, adding 138 new firefighter positions were needed to address growth in the City.
2. Dana Medlin spoke in support of funding for the Fire Department to address staffing needs. He discussed the critical need to add fire stations in North Phoenix.
3. Franklin Marino expressed his concern for Police Department staffing levels, noting its impact on public safety.
4. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of the increased funding for homeless services including increase funding for the Central Arizona Shelter Services (CASS) program and case management services.
5. Linda Smith expressed a need for increased communication to citizens and better water conservation plans. She also expressed her support for the Phoenix libraries.
6. John Dean spoke in support of increased funding for Police and Fire Department staffing. He commented on the need to increase the number of fire stations in North Phoenix.

Councilwoman Stark thanked everyone for attending and expressed her support for water conservation and the CASS program. The hearing was closed at 8:51 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jesse Benavidez  
Management Assistant II  
Budget & Research Department

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 3 AND 5  
SUNNYSLOPE COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 5, 2018**

Councilwoman Debra Stark opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:03 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. She introduced Councilman Daniel Valenzuela. He summarized the budget process noting the proposed budget will change after hearing from the community. Councilman Valenzuela introduced Assistant City Manager Milton Dohoney.

Mr. Dohoney presented two videos which provided information on the City's overall budget process and an overview of the FY2018-19 Trial Budget.

Following the presentation, Councilwoman Stark opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Cleo Lewis spoke in favor of PHX C.A.R.E.S. to address residents living in the Hatcher corridor.
2. Gloria Paladino submitted a card requesting the Mesquite Library be open on Fridays.
3. Harold Michelson submitted a card in support of all libraries being open every day.
4. Gabriel Maytorena spoke in favor of improvement in preventative and early treatment for individuals diagnosed with mental illness through crisis training programs.
5. John Siefert submitted a comment card in support of more funding for City streets.
6. Ginnie Sumner spoke in support of the Police Department. Ms. Sumner asked the City to build more relationships with non-profits and to be a leader in the addressing the issue of homelessness.
7. Ken Crane spoke in support of more funding for the Police department.
8. Bryan Willingham spoke in support of increased funding for the Fire Department.
9. Tom Caretto suggested the Fire department focus staffing on infill stations due to higher call volumes.
10. Craig Tribken stated he would like to see additional homeless services including increased outreach programs, affordable housing, temporary shelters and case management services.
11. Patrick Tiersch expressed concern about homelessness and the lack of assistance from PHX C.A.R.E.S. He stated he would like to see programmatic changes and additional resources to address homelessness.
12. Nancy Spivey spoke in favor of increasing funding to programs servicing homeless individuals.

13. Casey Whitehead spoke in support of expanded homeless services including funding for more temporary shelters and additional assistance from PHX C.A.R.E.S.
14. Ana Chavez spoke in support of additional homeless and mental health services including funding for outreach, shelters and case management.
15. Lin Ling Lee spoke in support of arts and culture funding.
16. David Gore spoke in support of increased funding for the Fire department and requested the review of staffing levels.
17. Keith Rodgers spoke in support of increased Fire department staffing levels and increased funding for equipment.
18. Jeff Spellman spoke in support of items in the proposed budget to assist neighborhoods, sober living group home licensing and increased park rangers.
19. Gayle Leonard proposed a 25-cent tax on major sporting event tickets to fund new homeless shelters.
20. Franklin Marino stated the Police department is understaffed and described the impact on services.
21. Dorothy Ward spoke in support of increased funding for trees.
22. Carol Poore requested increased funding for public art maintenance.
23. Brian Vance requested additional public safety services in the Sunnyslope area.
24. Heather expressed concern for Fire department staffing levels and the impact on response times.

Councilwoman Stark thanked everyone for attending, noting their comments matter. She closed the hearing at 7:18 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayra Z. Baquera  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 4  
STEELE INDIAN SCHOOL PARK  
APRIL 9, 2018**

Councilwoman Laura Pastor opened the meeting at 6:03 p.m. and thanked those in attendance. She introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher. Mr. Zuercher welcomed everyone and thanked the staff and community for attending the hearing. He presented two videos which provided information on the City's overall budget process and an overview of the FY2018-19 Trial Budget.

After the presentation, Mr. Zuercher opened the hearing for public comment.

1. Ashley Kennedy spoke in support of public arts and culture funding and discussed the impact of arts on the community.
2. Alexandra McWatters spoke in support of public arts and culture funding.
3. Rosemary Holusha stated she supported public safety and clean up services related to homelessness. She also expressed concern at all the apartment developments and their impact on traffic and infrastructure.
4. Alejandro Ranquel spoke in support of increased fire staffing levels and additional stations to reduce response times.
5. Laura Wilte spoke in support of increased funding for arts and culture programs.
6. Diana Wiesenthal spoke in support of every library being open every day.
7. Mike Atanasio spoke in support of increased homeless shelters and would like the City to become more creative in resolving the homelessness issue.
8. Ginnie Ann Summer expressed support for the City to address the homelessness issue. She stated she would like to see programs to assist the homeless not encourage them.
9. John Walker spoke in support of more bike lanes and infrastructure to make streets safer for cyclists, pedestrians, and drivers.
10. Donna Reiner spoke in support of public art maintenance and additional library hours.
11. Craig Tribken spoke in support of increasing efficient case management services for the homeless decreasing the need for shelters.
12. Paul Benjamin expressed concern about traffic on 3<sup>rd</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenues during rush hour, asking for the Police and Streets Departments to address this situation.
13. Casey Whitehead spoke in support of additional shelter and case management services for the homeless. She commented Phoenix C.A.R.E.S. is not provided with sufficient funding to fully address the issue.
14. Mary Ann Cook submitted a card in support of increased funding to address the issue of homelessness.

15. Nicole Rodriguez spoke in support of additional trees for shade and bike infrastructure.
16. Abbey and Derek Tomich spoke in support of more trees for shade and safer streets for cyclists.
17. Brad Brauer expressed concern about traffic on 3<sup>rd</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenues.
18. Mike Ocskow spoke in support of funding for arts and culture programs.
19. Jennifer Glenn submitted a card in support of additional safety measures for bicyclists.
20. Lara Sands spoke in support of better road infrastructure for cyclists and pedestrians.
21. Sam Newman spoke in support of better infrastructure for bicyclists and asked that a programs be created for the bicyclists.
22. Mona Cridebring spoke in support of additional public safety services and services to assist those with mental health issues.
23. Jeff Spellman spoke about homelessness and the impact to neighborhoods. He expressed support of Councilwoman Pastor's proposed suggestions.
24. Maddie Meyer spoke in support of more bike lanes and safer streets.
25. Dianne Barker proposed a monorail system around the City to improve transportation and air quality. Additionally, she spoke in support of services and resources to the homeless.
26. Abraham James spoke in support of library, arts, streets, transit and sustainable neighborhoods. He stated he would also like to see more affordable housing to help the homeless.
27. Jay Minich spoke in support of additional shelters to meet the needs of the homeless.
28. Yvonne Bishara spoke about the increase of street construction and a decrease in tree and shade enhancement.
29. David Tapley spoke in support of additional bicycle infrastructure and safety.
30. Patricia Slatton submitted a card in support of services to the homeless including medical support, mental health services and housing options.

Mr. Zuercher and Councilwoman Pastor thanked everyone for attending, closing the hearing at 8:04 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ann-Marie Branicz  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
COUNCIL DISTRICT 8  
SENIOR OPPORTUNITIES WEST SENIOR CENTER  
APRIL 11, 2018**

Councilwoman Kate Gallego opened the meeting at 8:35 a.m. and thanked those in attendance. She introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher. Mr. Zuercher welcomed everyone and thanked the staff and community for attending the hearing. He presented two videos which provided information on the City's overall budget process and an overview of the FY2018-19 Trial Budget.

After the presentation, Councilwoman Gallego opened the hearing for public comment.

1. Joe Specter spoke in support of art and culture in Phoenix and requested the City increase *its* art and culture investment.
2. Ash Uss spoke of homeless vulnerability and supported increasing funding to reduce homelessness.
3. Christine Dicken spoke in favor of increasing library hours. Ms. Dicken requested that library hours be extended so all libraries could be open every day.
4. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of increased support for homeless case management, a vital component to positive exits, emphasizing that shelter along with case management works.
5. Ken Crane spoke in support for adequate police staffing.
6. Fred Ullrkh spoke in favor of increasing funding for arts grants for community arts enrichment.
7. Kimberley Smith spoke in favor of supporting the Arizona Opera.
8. Bobbie McLeod spoke in support of a senior center in the Laveen area.
9. Jessica Bueno spoke in favor of providing adequate funding to departments to support neighborhoods.
10. Joseph Benesh spoke in support of arts funding.
11. Rick Naimark spoke in favor of funding for arts maintenance and funding for historic property preservation.
12. Aimee Esposito spoke in favor of increasing the number of trees throughout the city and an increase in parks funding.
13. Eva Olivas spoke in favor of additional funding to city departments to address homelessness including neighborhood services, public safety, parks and recreation and public works services.

14. Carlos Avila spoke in favor of providing support to resources dedicated to improving investments in neighborhoods.
15. John Dean spoke in favor of a plan to support future citywide funding needs.

Councilwoman Gallego made closing comments and thanked all for attending. The hearing was closed at 9:30 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mari Tunder  
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 2 AND 3  
PARADISE VALLEY COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 3, 2018**

Councilman Jim Waring opened the meeting by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to the Community Budget Hearing. Councilman Jim Waring then introduced Councilwoman Debra Stark and City Manager Ed Zuercher. City Manager Ed Zuercher also thanked community members and city staff for attending.

City Manager Ed Zuercher presented the video overview of the proposed budget. Following the presentation, Councilwoman Stark opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Wesley Harris asked questions about the public safety pension and adding staff for the proposed Crime Gun Intelligence Center. Mr. Zuercher and staff from the Police Department responded to his questions. Mr. Harris questioned adding 47.4 new staff in 2018-19, noting he supports small government. Mr. Harris stated he felt the proposed Park Ranger positions should be dedicated to patrolling parks.
2. David Gore spoke in support of increased funding for the Fire Department.
3. Bryan Willingham spoke in support of increased funding for the Fire Department.
4. Larisa Balderama spoke in support of licensed and regulated sober living residences.
- \*5. Ginnie Ann Sumner spoke in support of the Police Department. Ms. Sumner also expressed concern that park rangers do not have enough authority. Lastly she asked the City to build more relationships with non-profits and to be a leader in addressing homelessness.
5. Nita Muhlenfeld spoke in support of funding for libraries and extended hours, adding every library branch should be open every day.
6. Ron Peer submitted a comment card in support of funding for library services.
7. John Siefert submitted a comment card in support of more funding for City streets.
8. Cynthia Kerr submitted a comment card in support of sober living licensing, homeless intervention services and additional funding for Police and Fire. Ms. Kerr also commented funding for light rail should be reallocated to City streets and noted the cost of the trees for the streetscape management program are too expensive.

City Manager Ed Zuercher thanked everyone for attending and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 7:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES**  
**VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS**  
**Responded to through April 11, 2018**

1. Daniel Wilson sent an email in support for increased bike infrastructure and pedestrian infrastructure and replacing crosswalks with the flashing yellow lights with HAWK crosswalks
2. Michele Encisco sent an email in support for a no barrier shelter and additional support services through the Phoenix C.A.R.E.S.
3. Bobbi Halverson sent an email in support of increased funding for services to the homeless with pets, partners and belongings
4. Rochaun Smith sent an email for services to address the issue of homelessness and mental health services
5. Tom Chapman called to note his support for a 1% increase in arts funding and for additional park rangers.
6. Vicky Sweeney sent an email in support of additional funding for homeless services.
7. Linda Lipe sent an email in support of additional funding for homeless services.
8. Leslie Pechkurow sent an email in support of additional funding for homeless services.
9. Artie Woo sent an email requesting additional safety measures at the intersection of 23<sup>rd</sup> Avenue and Fairmont as drivers regularly speed through the area and disregard the stop sign. She also stated she would like to see additional low income housing to assist the homeless.
10. Darlene Newsom requested additional funding for UMOM New Day Centers to convert ten transitional beds to emergency shelter beds rather than close units. She stated the cost to maintain services would cost approximately \$200,00 annually.

Respectfully Submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant



City of Phoenix

## General Information Packet

### City Council Report

---

Date: 4/19/2018, Item No. 1

---

#### Community Budget Hearing Minutes

##### Summary

**Attachment A** transmits the minutes of the next three Community Budget Hearings and electronic comments received for review.

##### Responsible Department

This item is submitted by City Manager Ed Zuercher and the Budget and Research Department.

---

ATTACHMENT A



**City of Phoenix**

**To:** Ed Zuercher  
City Manager

**Date:** April 19, 2018

**From:** Jeff Barton  
Budget and Research Department Director

**Subject:** COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the next three community budget hearings. These hearings were held between Wednesday, April 11 – 16, 2018 at [Maryvale Community Center](#), [Pecos Community Center](#), and [Devonshire Community](#). The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A [summary of the electronic and voice mail comments](#) are also included.

At [phoenix.gov/Budget](http://phoenix.gov/Budget) residents can access:

- The 2018-19 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2018-19 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The minutes and summary of emails are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
CITYWIDE BILINGUAL MEETING  
MARYVALE COMMUNITY CENTER  
April 11, 2018**

Councilman Michael Nowakowski opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:05 p.m. and thanked those in attendance. Councilman Nowakowski introduced Councilwoman Laura Pastor, Councilman Daniel Valenzuela and City Manager Ed Zuercher.

Councilwoman Pastor and Councilman Valenzuela welcomed those in attendance. Councilman Valenzuela explained the budget hearing process and commented the hearings were recorded and available on the City's website and on social media outlets. He thanked Mr. Zuercher and City staff for attending the hearings.

Two videos were presented providing information on the City's overall budget process and an overview of the FY2018-19 Trial Budget.

After the presentation, the hearing was opened for public comments.

1. Haley Ritter spoke in support of additional bicycle infrastructure.
2. Craig Tribken spoke in favor of increasing case management funding to provide more support for the homeless population.
3. Tim Baiardi spoke in favor of increased funding for police staff.
4. Jeff Benedict spoke in favor of keeping public libraries open seven days a week.
5. Ron Van Mierlo requested the City add 138 new fire fighter positions to expand service delivery and reduce response times.
6. Ash Uss spoke in favor of increasing homeless services at the André House.
7. Ana Chavez expressed her concern for the homeless situation. She asked for increased funding for the André House to provide additional services for the homeless population.
8. Ramon Gonzalez requested the City add 138 new fire fighters and additional fire stations and trucks to meet service delivery needs.
9. Ramon Aquino spoke in support of additional community programs and increasing funding for education to increase public safety as opposed to adding additional police officers. He also requested a fund be established to support citizens who have been impacted by police violence. Mr. Aquino expressed his support for adding additional community centers.
10. Parris Wallace requested the City shift the proposed \$500,000 in increased police funding to create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by the U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) and to support impacted families by offering counseling and other services. She also requested the City establish a fund for victims of police violence like the Maricopa County Victim Fund.

11. Maria Sanchez requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
12. Mari Herrera expressed support for increasing funding for homeless services, but requested the City shift the proposed new funding for the Phx C.A.R.E.S program to help City departments such as Neighborhood Services or Parks that are impacted by homeless residents. She expressed a concern for increasing funding for a newly created program that was already allotted \$2.5 million dollars.
13. Ron Sereny expressed his concern for civil asset forfeitures and supported reducing civil laws so citizens have less contact with law enforcement thus freeing up police resources to focus on more severe crimes. He suggested utilizing GoFundMe type fund raising efforts to expand community programs.
14. Nia Buckley requested the City shift the proposed increase in police funding to hiring social workers to help citizens deal with the impact of police violence. She recommended police officers receive more cultural diversity training.
15. Jorge Valdez spoke in favor of adding additional funding for the Fire Department.
16. Ruby Silva requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
17. Juan Echavarria requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
18. Yazmin Sagastume requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
19. Ricardo Escobar requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
20. Adrianna Gonzales requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
21. Kate Tutaya expressed her concern for the lack of funding allocated to community programs compared to the amount of funding allocated to the Police Department. Ms. Tutaya stated she was against adding funding for homeless outreach services. She spoke in favor of creating a fund for victims of ICE.
22. Isis Gil requested the City create a compensation fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
23. Joe Garcia expressed his concern for the aging streets and water infrastructure.
24. Angeles Maldonato expressed her concern for racial profiling and the effect it has on the victims.
25. Viridiana Hernandez requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.

26. Alexandra Rodriguez requested the City shift funding from the police department to the community. She requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
27. Ki Cervantes requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
28. Victoria Jaquez expressed her support for the Phoenix Police Department and recommended citizens attend the Citizens Police Academy. She spoke in favor for increasing funding for the Police, Fire and Neighborhood Services Departments. She also supported increasing inspections to enforce code compliance.
29. Hernan Acosta requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
30. Rosa Pastrana expressed her support for the first responders who provide support to the Police Department. She requested a new community center in District 4 around 43<sup>rd</sup> Ave & McDowell.
31. Jennifer Hernandez requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
32. Martin Perez requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
33. Merissa Hamilton expressed her concern for the unfunded pension liability and the salary of the City Manager. She spoke against the light rail expansion due to the negative impact on businesses. Ms. Hamilton stated she supported increasing police training and investing in street repairs. Lastly, she spoke in favor of consolidating the City's election process with the County elections to save money.
34. Marta Felix requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
35. Marco Hernandez requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence. He also expressed concern for additional police training.
36. Juanita Martinez requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence. She requested that the City take into account the opinions expressed at the hearing.
37. Adriana Garcia expressed support for the City's proposed budget but expressed a concern for public safety. She recommended shifting funding from the Police Department to the community.
38. Sandra Lascarez Diaz submitted a card in favor of increasing police training.
39. Laila Kabongi submitted a card against mass incarceration and police brutality. She stated she supports immigration, education and healthcare.

40. Ricardo Pelayo Duenéz submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund.
41. Luella Grodecki submitted a card in support of increasing funding for police and against increasing funding for homeless outreach services.
42. Martha Flores submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
43. Berta Rito submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
44. Juana Rita Ochoa submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
45. Humberto Morales submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
46. Christina Vega submitted a card to address education reform, international affairs and wage inequality.
47. Amedondo submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
48. Angelina Macel Gil submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
49. Rachel Fraizer Johnson submitted a card supporting youth, and arts and culture funding. She requested additional career mentoring and extra-curricular activities for youth.
50. Sarra Tekola submitted a card supporting community funding for the poor.
51. Alejandro Munchara submitted a card supporting more services for youth and increased funding for parks and recreation. He added he opposed additional police funding.
52. Dora Mejia submitted a card supporting funding for parks, streets and schools.
53. Kayla Ormick submitted a card supporting funding for education, health services and more buses. She added she opposed adding additional police officers.
54. Mr. Pablo Julian Zepeda submitted a card in support of higher education for immigrants and more access to resources.
55. Crystal Zaragoza submitted a card in support of education.

56. Lerman Mortoya submitted a card in support of civic courses for immigrants and refugees.
57. Rafael Esquer submitted a card in support of funding for schools, community centers and street improvements. He added he opposed adding funding for police and ICE.
58. Jonathan Beebe Giudice submitted a card in support of reducing police funding and increasing funding for parks, schools and transportation.
59. Sara Helepolli submitted a card in support of community projects that support immigration, LGBT and women's rights.
60. Morales submitted a card in support of increasing jobs.
61. Madeline Bautista submitted a card in support of rights for undocumented workers.
62. Deana Rivero submitted a card in support of more funding for schools and working immigrants.
63. Esther Moncada submitted a card requesting support for the immigrant community affected by police violence.
64. Juana Bonogan submitted a card supporting health and safety.
65. Angelina Macid submitted a card requesting support services for victims of police violence.
66. Urien Nelson submitted a card supporting improved access to higher education for immigrants.
67. Francisco L. submitted a card requesting more funding for community places as opposed to adding funding for police.
68. Rocio Avila submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
69. Crystal Hernandez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
70. Jose Hernandez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
71. Veronica Garcia submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
72. Briana Lagarda submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.

73. Destiny Nerarez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
74. Alexzandra Salazar submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
75. Merveille Badesire submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
76. Janecia Jeffcoat submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
77. Brianna Patrick submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
78. Razareya Williams submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
79. Maximillano Gutierrez submitted a card in support of additional accountability in the Police Department.
80. Angel Ramirez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
81. Jasmin Meza submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
82. Kevin Vi submitted a card requesting funds be diverted from the Police Department to resources for the community.
83. Camila Hernandez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by police violence.
84. Stephanie Michimari submitted a card expressing her concern for ICE and the police.
85. Rosaly Hernandez submitted a card in support of additional funding for more resources for communities affected by police violence.
86. Xavier Hernandez submitted a card concerning the amount of the City's Budget that goes to the Police Department.
87. Ignacio Castro submitted a card in support of shifting funding from the Police Department to resources like counseling, trauma support and therapy for communities impacted by police violence.
88. Victor Gonzalez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
89. Pilar Amezaga submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.

90. Abel Yonez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
91. Karina Cruz submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
92. Keren Arce submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund.
93. Marlina Cueva submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund.
94. Joel Rojas Jr. submitted a card requesting the City create a compensation fund for communities affected by police violence.
95. Sarahi Muñoz Perez submitted a card requesting the City create a compensation fund for communities affected by police violence.
96. Alan Roy submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
97. Emerie Clark submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
98. Liliana Velazquez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
99. Michelle Arias submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
100. Ingrida Betancourt submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund.
101. Thelma Terroa submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
102. Deybeth Ruiz submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
103. Maribel Riz submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE.
104. Dagaberto Bailon submitted a card requesting the City create a compensation fund for victims of police violence.

Councilman Valenzuela thanked those in attendance and encouraged people to send their comments to the City.

Councilwoman Pastor thanked those in attendance. She commented on the importance of focusing on increasing safety through parks and neighborhood services. She also encouraged citizens to learn about and attend the upcoming Council meeting on the proposed Consolidated Elections Initiative.

Councilman Nowakowski thanked those in attendance. He expressed his support for the concerns of the community. Councilman Nowakowski suggested a committee be established to

facilitate better communication between the police and the community and to identify solutions to the problems identified throughout the meeting. He also expressed his support for the Police Department.

Councilman Nowakowski closed the budget hearing at 8:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jesse Benavidez  
Management Assistant II  
Budget & Research Department

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING  
PECOS COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 16, 2018**

Councilman Sal DiCiccio opened the community budget hearing at 8:30 a.m. welcoming those in attendance and introducing City Manager, Ed Zuercher and City Clerk, Cris Meyer.

Mr. Zuercher presented two videos describing the City of Phoenix's budget process and the 2018-19 proposed Trial Budget.

Councilman DiCiccio then opened to public comments from the speakers listed below.

1. Moses Sanchez spoke in support of community infrastructure and public safety.
2. Scott Weinberg spoke of adding school resource officers and requested funds be allocated for school resource officers in Ahwatukee middle schools.
3. Bob Scheldt spoke in support of adding school resource officers in all middle schools.
4. Matt C. spoke in support of public safety, requesting a return to basic public safety coverage and staffing, a new fire station and full-time ambulance service.
5. Toby Sexton spoke in support of public safety.
6. Bill Sheppard spoke in favor of arts maintenance and requested an additional \$16,000.
7. Kevin Heaphy requested funding for increased library hours and that all libraries be open every day.
8. Robert Adair requested the return of the neighborhood circular. Mr. Adair stated he has seen disabled individuals walking two miles for bus service.
9. Aaron Ernsberger spoke in favor of public safety.
10. Miranda Groux spoke in support homelessness and shelters noting that not enough beds and case management is available to support the needs of the community. Ms. Groux requested funding for another shelter and 24/7 bathroom facilities.
11. Nehemias Ponce spoke in support of the Fire Department's plan to hire new firefighters.
12. Geronimo Ramirez submitted a card in support of the Fire Department's plan to increase staffing to meet national standards.
13. Shaun Duncan submitted a card in support of public safety being the highest priority and additional public safety staffing.
14. Steven Arrish spoke to support dark-sky compliance and gun buy-back programs. Mr. Arrish expressed concerns with distracted drivers on Phoenix streets.
15. Laurel Arndt submitted a card in support of the bike lanes on Chandler Blvd be accelerated.

16. Neil Reyes submitted a card in support of the Fire Department's plan to hire new firefighters to improve response times.
17. Lori Allen submitted a card requesting trees be replaced, plants added and grass repaired at Foothills Park. Additionally, she requested speed humps be placed at Marketplace SW.
18. Theresa LC Fogle submitted a card in support of the Trial Budget.

Councilman DiCiccio closed the hearing at 9:30 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mari Tunder  
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
DEVONSHIRE COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 16, 2018**

Councilman Sal DiCiccio opened the Community Budget Hearing at 10:33 a.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He briefly explained of the budget process and introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher.

Mr. Zuercher thanked everyone for coming and presented two videos on the overall budget process and the FY18-19 Trial Budget.

Mr. DiCiccio opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Ken Crane spoke in support of additional police funding and staffing.
2. John Teefy spoke in favor of additional public safety funding and staffing.
3. Chris Murphy spoke in favor of additional fire funding and staffing.
4. Candice Fremouw spoke in support of public safety funding.
5. Mike Brannan spoke in favor of additional fire funding and staffing.
6. Merissa Hamilton asked for additional information on the pension liability and alternative ways for PHX C.A.R.E.S to address the homelessness issues. She also spoke in opposition of funding light rail expansion and acknowledged her support for consolidated elections.
7. Lydia Dutton spoke in favor of tax based incentives for commercial development.
8. Abraham James spoke in favor of libraries open daily and advocated for increased funding for the arts, streets, transportation, sustainable neighborhoods, youth/senior centers, affordable housing and homelessness.
9. Judy Guilds spoke in support of arts and culture programs and requested an additional \$16,000 for arts maintenance.
10. Ginnie Sumner spoke in opposition of additional funding for Community Bridges and spoke in favor of funding for a public service program, new park rules, street inspectors, streets maintenance and additional police officers.
11. Carl Bruning asked about the methodology used in establishing the budget and whether the City was prepared for a potential recession.
12. Darlene Newsom spoke in favor of increasing funding for public safety. She also supported increasing funding for homeless services, including shelter beds through a \$200,000 increase for UMOM.
13. John Walker spoke in favor of more funding for road safety and bicyclist infrastructure.

14. Karen Kurtz spoke in favor of more funding for Phx C.A.R.E.S and homeless outreach teams.
15. Linda Colino expressed support for sober living home licensing and noted opposition of increased funding for the CBI service with Phx C.A.R.E.S.
16. Luke Black spoke in opposition of additional police funding and spoke in support of creating a legal defense fund for immigrants in ICE custody and creating a compensation fund for communities impacted by police violence.
17. Craig Tribken stated he would like to see additional homeless services including increased outreach programs, affordable housing, temporary shelters and case management services.
18. Karen Kruse spoke in favor of additional funding for libraries.
19. Emrys Staton spoke in support of allocating additional police funding to review the impacts of policing and public safety.
20. Dorothy Ward spoke in favor of more funding for public safety services, homeless services and trees.
21. Celeste Castorena spoke in opposition of increased policing but in favor of more funding for projects that will uplift families, light rail extension and libraries open daily.
22. Ann O'Brien spoke in favor of funding for a police and fire protection long-term plan.
23. Terry Ceranski spoke in favor of finding ways to allocate funding on real needs and light rail efficiency.
24. Amy McSheffrey submitted a card in favor of the City's Tree and Shade Master Plan program and requested increasing tree canopies.

Councilman DiCiccio thanked everyone for attending and closed the hearing at 11:59 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Khala Stanfield  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES**  
**VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS**  
**Responded to through April 18, 2018**

1. Rebecca Simms left a voicemail stated she supported increased public safety due to increased crime. She added she opposed the light rail extension.
2. Ginnie Ann Sumner sent an email in opposition of additional funding for Community Bridges and support of ROP officers, new park rules, street inspectors and additional police officers.
3. Jon Samuelson sent an email in support of additional funding for street repair and maintenance.
4. Susie Smith sent an email in support of increasing pay for police officers.
5. Lisa Saper-Bloom sent an email supporting additional funding for homeless resources, police, community/church education, lights, alley gates, park rangers and security/alarm company partnerships.
6. Deborah Cookson sent an email opposing additional funding for Community Bridges under the Phx C.A.R.E.S. program.
7. Enukes2079@gmail.com sent an email in support of increasing pay for police officers.
8. Christie Haggerty sent an email in support of additional funding for public safety in relation to dealing with homelessness.
9. Jim McPherson sent an email in support of creating a team of City employees, residents and community groups to review needs raised during budget process and research grant opportunities.
10. Monica Goddard sent an email in support of increasing hours for all libraries.

Respectfully Submitted,

Khala Stanfield  
Management Assistant



City of Phoenix

## General Information Packet

### City Council Report

---

Date: 4/26/2018, Item No. 1

---

#### Community Budget Hearing Minutes

##### Summary

**Attachment A** transmits the minutes of the final three Community Budget Hearings and electronic comments received for review.

##### Responsible Department

This item is submitted by City Manager Ed Zuercher and the Budget and Research Department.

---

ATTACHMENT A



**City of Phoenix**

**To:** Ed Zuercher  
City Manager

**Date:** April 26, 2018

**From:** Jeff Barton  
Budget and Research Department Director

**Subject:** COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from the final three community budget hearings. These hearings were held between Wednesday, April 11 – 17, 2018 at [Goelet A.C. Beuf Community Center](#), [Metro Tech High School](#) and [Cesar Chavez High School](#). The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A [summary of the electronic and voice mail comments](#) are also included.

At [phoenix.gov/Budget](http://phoenix.gov/Budget) residents can access:

- The 2018-19 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Summary Packet for Community Review of the Proposed 2018-19 Budget in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Detailed Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The minutes and summary of emails are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
GOELET A.C. BEUF COMMUNITY CENTER  
APRIL 17, 2018**

Councilman Jim Waring opened the meeting at 6:03 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and introduced Vice Mayor Thelda Williams and Assistant City Manager Milton Dohoney.

Councilman Waring introduced two videos which provided information on the City's overall budget process and an overview of the FY2018-19 Trial Budget.

Following the presentation, Councilman Waring opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Linda Colino stated she did not support funding for CBI for homeless outreach. Ms. Colino stated very few homeless accept assistance and funding would be better spent on park rangers.
2. Craig Tribken spoke in support of funding for homeless shelters and case management services.
3. Michelle Dew spoke in support of establishing a legal defense fund for immigrants taken in ICE custody rather than increasing funding for the police. Ms. Dew stated she also supports funding for counseling services for victims of police violence.
4. Rawly Duncan spoke in support of establishing a legal defense fund for immigrants taken in ICE custody rather than increasing funding for the police. Mr. Duncan stated he also supports funding for counseling services for victims of police violence.
5. Ron Friesen spoke in support of the Phx C.A.R.E.S. program but not for additional funding for CBI. Mr. Friesen stated many homeless have mental health issues and are in need of housing.
6. Jason Sanders spoke in support of increasing funding for fire stations and fire staffing levels.
7. Doug Sutherland spoke in support of increased funding for new fire stations, police, and new parks.
8. Michael Soto spoke in support of additional funding for investing in the community rather than increased funding for police. Mr. Soto also supports funding for a legal defense fund for immigrants harmed by police or ICE.
9. Luke Black spoke in support of increased funding for the Neighborhood Services Department and establishing a legal defense fund for immigrants taken in ICE custody rather than increasing funding for the police. Mr. Black stated he also supports establishing a compensation fund for victims of police violence.
10. Steve Beuerlein spoke in support of additional funding for public safety and would like more resources and expanded hours for fire station 55.
11. Michelle Ricart submitted a comment card in support of additional funding for full time staffing and rescue services at fire station 55.

12. Chris Crowley spoke in support of an increase in the number of firefighters, fire engines, and fire stations. He additionally supports providing more resources for station 55.
13. Tom Henry submitted a comment card in support of adding 138 firefighters and adding five new fire engines to address response time.
14. Lori Beuerlein submitted a comment card in support of adding supervisory personnel to the fire department alarm room.
15. Cort Asbury submitted a comment card in support of additional funding for the Fire Department. Mr. Asbury wrote the number of responses had increased however there has not been an increase in staffing to accommodate the growth.
16. Regina Nixon spoke in support of additional funding for the arts.
17. Cody Brooks submitted a comment card in support of adding Fire Department personnel and apparatuses to adequately serve the community.
18. Roseanna Bretoi spoke in support of additional funding for police, especially in zip code 85085.
19. Julie Read spoke in support of public safety and additional funding to expand Deer Valley airport.
20. Leanne Murphy spoke in support of establishing a legal defense fund for immigrants taken in ICE custody rather than increasing funding for the police and creating a compensation fund for communities impacted by police violence.
21. Josh Klemm spoke in support for additional funding for the Fire Department.
22. Anthony Adelman spoke in support of additional funding for the fire department to reduce response times.
23. Marshall Zeable spoke in support of additional funding for public safety staffing.
24. Michael Henry submitted a comment card in support of hiring 138 additional firefighters and adding five more fire trucks.
25. Ronald Serery spoke and inquired about the percentage of the budget that includes civil assets forfeitures. Assistant City Manager Milton Dohoney responded staff would follow-up with him.
26. Suzanne Day submitted a comment card in support of implementing the Complete Streets Plan and the Bicycle Master Plan.
27. Emily Spetrino spoke in support of additional funding for parks, arts, and recreation centers rather than additional police funding.
28. Chris Murphy spoke in support of additional funding for public safety.

Vice Mayor Williams and Councilman Waring thanked all the residents for coming, and closed the hearing at 7:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
CITYWIDE YOUTH  
METRO TECH HIGH SCHOOL  
APRIL 17, 2018**

Deputy City Manager Deanna Jonovich opened the hearing at 6:03 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance. She presented two videos which provided information on the City's overall budget process and the FY18-19 Trial Budget.

Councilwoman Laura Pastor and Councilman Daniel Valenzuela thanked the audience for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. Councilman Valenzuela introduced Budget and Research Director Jeff Barton, who opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Jesus Lopez spoke about the importance of youth arts and culture funding.
2. Alexandra McWatters submitted a card in favor of continuing youth arts and culture funding.
3. Darlene Newsom spoke in favor of increasing funding for homeless services, including shelter beds through a \$200,000 increase for UMOM.
4. Matt Lawson expressed the need to hire more firefighters to address the increase in service calls.
5. Kevin Kottmer spoke in support of increasing funding for public safety personnel.
6. Dejah Hernandez submitted a card requesting the City of Phoenix create a legal defense fund for immigrants turned over to ICE.
7. Maria Sanchez requested the City create a compensation fund for the communities impacted by police violence for counseling, trauma support and therapy.
8. Ana Zenea submitted a card demanding a compensation fund for those impacted by police violence.
9. Yvette Teran submitted a card demanding a legal defense fund for immigrants turned over to ICE and a compensation fund for people impacted by police violence.
10. Yazmin Sagastume requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
11. Ignacio Castro submitted a card in support of shifting funding from the Police Department to resources like counseling, trauma support and therapy for communities impacted by police violence.
12. Moises Miranda Hernandez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
13. Adriana Gonzales requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.

14. Maximiliano Gutierrez submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
15. Braenna Boynton requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
16. Parris Wallace requested the City reallocate police funding to community funding for neighborhood specialists for direct community programs.
17. Kiahuitl Kuauhtli requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
18. Kate Tutaya requested the City reallocate police funding to community funding for neighborhood specialists for direct community programs.
19. Ryan Tempest requested the City increase the public art maintenance budget by \$16,000 to bring the total annual budget to \$100,000.
20. Manuel Saldana requested the City reallocate police funding to create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
21. Felix Moran spoke in favor of increasing opportunities for the youth to learn new skills and requested the City extend library hours.
22. Jennifer Hernandez requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
23. Andrea Vidal submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
24. Hayley Shapiro requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
25. Iliana Pacheco requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
26. Karyna Jaramillo requested the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
27. Juan Morales submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
28. Viridiana Hernandez requested the City reallocate police funding to create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
29. Kathy Stillman spoke in favor of increasing public safety funding.

30. Suzanne Thraen spoke in favor of increasing funding for youth services and planting more trees.
31. Ezelia Aros spoke in favor of public services for those returning to the community after being released from jail.
32. Yarely Arellanes submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
33. Milagros Renteria submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
34. Clara Valenzuela submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
35. Treianna Myles submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
36. Victor requested the City reallocate police funding to create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
37. Michael Ingram requested the City allocate resources for in-depth research on police violence and how staffing levels impact crime levels.
38. Ken Chapman submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.
39. Devonte Bouren submitted a card requesting the City create a legal defense fund for immigrants affected by ICE and a fund for families and communities impacted by police violence.

Councilmembers Valenzuela and Pastor thanked everyone for attending, noting their comments matter and closed the hearing at 7:33 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mayra Z. Baquera  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES  
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS  
CESAR CHAVEZ HIGH SCHOOL  
APRIL 17, 2018**

City Manager Ed Zuercher opened the community budget hearing at 6:05 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance. He introduced Councilman Michael Nowakowski and Councilwoman Kate Gallego. Councilwoman Gallego asked attendees for a moment of silence to recognize First Lady Barbara Bush and Police Canine Bane.

Councilman Nowakowski presented the Trial Budget video. He thanked the audience for attending the meeting. Councilman Nowakowski and Councilwoman Gallego presented a powerpoint presentation that covered updates on developments in Laveen.

Councilwoman Gallego opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Jennifer Rouse spoke in favor of restoring funding for South Phoenix's Police Wake Up! Clubs that address youth violence, other youth programs, new neighborhood centers, and public safety.
2. Linda Cannon spoke in favor of funding for the new Laveen Community Center and increasing library hours to reach the goal of having libraries open every day.
3. Mike Bielecki spoke in favor of increased funding for homeless services including increased funding for more shelter beds at Central Arizona Shelter Services.
4. Steve Wagner spoke in favor of increased Fire Department staffing levels and increased funding for equipment and engine maintenance.
5. Wendy Ensminger spoke in favor of increased funding for additional parks, blight reduction, and street maintenance in Laveen. She also expressed support for funding to improve police investigations times, fire staffing and juvenile justice.
6. Jerry Clore spoke in favor of increasing funding for increasing Library hours.
7. Father Tom Doyle spoke in favor of increased funding for homeless services, more shelter beds, and "no barrier" shelters.
8. Ginnie Ann Sumner spoke in favor of increased funding for more police officers, street resurfacing instead of sealing cracks, and restoring the Police Repeat Offender Program (ROP). She also expressed support for reallocating funding for the Phx C.A.R.E.S. program to homeless case management and enforcement programs.
9. Ramon Gonzalez spoke in favor of increasing funding for more firefighter positions, fire stations, and fire trucks.
10. Vance Pierce spoke in favor of additional funding for more frequent street maintenance and repairs.

11. Lisa spoke in favor of increased funding for more enforcement of illegal signs. She also requested installation of soap dispensers in South Phoenix parks.
12. Tony Berastegui spoke in favor of increased recruitment and hiring of police officers, increased enforcement of truancy at and continued maintenance of Cesar Chavez Park, development of the new community center at Cesar Chavez Park, and grass installation at the park south of Cesar Chavez High School.
13. Yvette Madero spoke in favor of street bumps and restrooms at the A-Rod Neighborhood Park.
14. Tony Sample spoke in favor of addressing blight on a vacant parcel of land at 55th Avenue and Samantha Way.
15. Antonio Velasquez spoke in favor of increased funding for police, fire, parks, schools, and supplies for the restrooms at Cesar Chavez Park, especially during youth soccer games.
16. Gilbert Arvizu spoke in favor of an alternative to the proposed Consolidated Elections plan. He expressed concern that independent voters will not receive their ballots and the need for an alternative backup to the City and County elections coordination in case of foreign intrusion during elections.
17. Ana Chavez spoke in favor of increased funding for a “no barrier” and overflow homeless shelter.
18. Jessica Knight spoke in favor of helping people who are homeless. She shared information about a City program, “Success off the Streets (SOS),” a faith- and community-based collaboration that works with businesses and non-profits to develop street-feeding alternatives and sustainable assistance to end homelessness.
19. Elsa Gebreyohanes spoke in favor of increased funding for more street improvements and lighted, pedestrian crosswalks in South Phoenix; a legal defense fund for immigrants; and a reintegration into the community program.
20. Jasmine Lester spoke in favor of increased funding for more street improvements and lighted, pedestrian crosswalks in South Phoenix; a legal defense fund for immigrants; and a reintegration into the community program to reduce prison recidivism. She suggested reallocating Police funding to other community programs.
21. Whitney Walker spoke in favor of funding to help victims and survivors of sexual and domestic violence and to create a full-service rape crisis center.
22. Stephanie Hurd spoke in favor of increased funding for palm trees, public art, and bike and horse paths along the “Dobbins Road Scenic Route” from 21st Street to 65th Avenue. She suggested using impact fees as a funding source.
23. Moses Sanchez submitted a card in favor of funding for more police officers and improved street infrastructure.
24. Shannon Richard submitted a card in favor of increased funding for police, fire and Block Watch programs.

25. Daniel Penton submitted a card in favor of funding to build Cesar Chavez Community Center and finish the development of parks at 55th Avenue and Dobbins, 7th Avenue and Laveen Meadows, and 47th Avenue and Alta Vista Road.
26. Mary Ann G. submitted a card in favor of having an open forum for residents to ask questions.
27. Manuel Burboa submitted a card in favor of prioritizing the road expansion on Southern Avenue between 37th and 41st Avenues from one lane in each direction.

Councilwoman Gallego thanked everyone for attending. Councilman Nowakowski summarized the comments received. He adjourned the meeting at 7:43 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Genevieve K. Siri  
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES**  
**VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS**  
**Responded to through April 26, 2018**

1. Jennifer Strickland sent an email in support of arts and culture programs and asked that the \$2 million in arts funding for the Arizona Commission on the Arts not be used to support the teacher's pay package.
2. Stephanie McDowell sent an email in support of reviewing various budgets to find alternative revenue sources to fund pay increases for teachers and support staff.

Respectfully Submitted,

Julie Flaskerud  
Management Assistant