

City of Phoenix, Arizona

Single Audit Reports

Year Ended June 30, 2018



City of Phoenix, Arizona
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Contents

Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards	1
Notes to the Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards	8
Independent Auditor’s Report on Internal Control Over Financial Reporting and on Compliance and Other Matters Based on an Audit of the Financial Statements Performed in Accordance with <i>Government Auditing Standards</i>	10
Independent Auditor’s Report on Compliance for Each Major Federal Program; Report on Internal Control Over Compliance; and Report on Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards Required by the Uniform Guidance	12
Schedule of Findings and Questioned Costs	16
Status of Prior Audit Findings	20

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Federal Grantor / Pass-Through Grantor / Program or Cluster Title	Federal CFDA Number	Pass-Through Entity Identifying Number	Total Federal Expenditures	Passed Through to Subrecipients
U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA)				
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Health Services				
<i>SNAP Cluster</i>				
Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program	10.551	C-86-13-037-3-04	\$ 30,236	\$ -
<i>Total SNAP Cluster</i>			<u>30,236</u>	<u>-</u>
<i>Child Nutrition Cluster</i>				
Special Milk Program for Children	10.556	ADHS-16-106455	98,252	-
<i>Total Child Nutrition Cluster</i>			<u>98,252</u>	<u>-</u>
Total U.S. Department of Agriculture			<u>128,488</u>	<u>-</u>
Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD)				
Direct Programs:				
<i>CDBG - Entitlement Grants Cluster</i>				
Community Development Block Grants/Entitlement Grants	14.218	N/A	15,348,981	1,257,987
Neighborhood Stabilization Program 1 - HERA	14.218	N/A	15,401	-
<i>Total CDBG - Entitlement Grants Cluster</i>			<u>15,364,382</u>	<u>1,257,987</u>
<i>Section 8 Project -Based Cluster</i>				
Section 8 Housing Assistance Payments Program	14.195	N/A	1,475,525	-
Section 8 Moderate Rehabilitation Single Room Occupancy	14.249	N/A	443,262	-
Lower Income Housing Assistance Program - Section 8 Moderate Rehabilitation	14.856	N/A	38,936	-
<i>Total Section 8 Project-Based Cluster</i>			<u>1,957,723</u>	<u>-</u>
Emergency Solutions Grant Program	14.231	N/A	1,125,763	395,103
Home Investment Partnerships Program	14.239	N/A	6,812,333	300,000
Home Investment Partnerships Program Loan and Loan Guarantees *	14.239	N/A	61,846,404	-
<i>Total Home Investment Partnerships Program</i>			<u>68,658,737</u>	<u>300,000</u>
Housing Opportunities for Persons with AIDS	14.241	N/A	2,318,462	-
Fair Housing Assistance Program State and Local	14.401	N/A	166,035	-
Public and Indian Housing	14.850	N/A	8,726,751	-
<i>Hope VI Cluster</i>				
Demolition and Revitalization of Severely Distressed Public Housing (HOPE VI)	14.866	N/A	1,257,000	-
Hope VI - CSS Endowment Funds *	14.866	N/A	928,102	-
<i>Total Hope VI Cluster</i>			<u>2,185,102</u>	<u>-</u>
Resident Opportunity and Supportive Services - Service Coordinators	14.870	N/A	165,756	-
Public Housing Capital Fund	14.872	N/A	2,654,999	-

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Federal Grantor / Pass-Through Grantor / Program or Cluster Title	Federal CFDA Number	Pass-Through Entity Identifying Number	Total Federal Expenditures	Passed Through to Subrecipients
<i>Housing Voucher Cluster</i>				
Section 8 Housing Choice Vouchers	14.871	N/A	\$ 54,205,140	\$ -
Mainstream Vouchers	14.879	N/A	557,811	-
<i>Total Housing Voucher Cluster</i>			54,762,951	-
Family Unification Program (FUP)	14.880	N/A	1,034,383	-
Choice Neighborhoods Planning Grants	14.892	N/A	324,971	-
Jobs-Plus Pilot Initiative	14.895	N/A	233,691	-
Family Self-Sufficiency Program	14.896	N/A	220,222	-
ROSS Supportive Services Programs	14.898	N/A	166,493	-
Lead-Based Paint Hazard Control in Privately-Owned Housing	14.900	N/A	951,536	55,192
Total Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD)			161,017,957	2,008,282
Department of the Interior				
Direct Program:				
<i>Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act</i>	15.922	N/A	24,951	-
Total Department of the Interior			24,951	-
Department of Justice				
Direct Programs:				
Services for Trafficking Victims	16.320	N/A	128,163	11,231
Missing Children's Assistance	16.543	N/A	339,410	81,298
National Institute of Justice Research, Evaluation, and Development Project Grants	16.560	N/A	11,054	-
Public Safety Partnership and Community Policing Grants	16.710	N/A	1,249,494	-
Special Data Collections and Statistical Studies	16.734	N/A	17,813	-
DNA Backlog Reduction Program	16.741	N/A	389,346	-
Edward Byrne Memorial Competitive Grant Program	16.751	N/A	301,149	90,584
Economic, High-Tech, and Cyber Crime Prevention	16.752	N/A	82,431	5,575
Innovations in Community-Based Crime Reduction	16.817	N/A	134,455	70,987
National Sexual Assault Kit Initiative	16.833	N/A	40,788	-
Equitable Sharing Program	16.922	N/A	1,061,377	-
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Public Safety (A.D.P.S.)				
Crime Victim Assistance	16.575	2014-282	192,814	-
		2015-359	82,528	-
		2015-360	962	-
		2015-361	20,576	-
		2015-VA-GX-0032	89,419	-
		2016-VA-GX-0046	363,371	-
		2018-260	381,397	-
		2018-261	68,407	-
		VOCA-2018-PXFAC-00177	240,513	-
			1,439,987	-

The accompanying notes are an integral part of this Schedule.

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Federal Grantor / Pass-Through Grantor / Program or Cluster Title	Federal CFDA Number	Pass-Through Entity Identifying Number	Total Federal Expenditures	Passed Through to Subrecipients
Passed through from:				
Arizona Criminal Justice Commission (A.C.J.C.) Project Safe Neighborhoods	16.609	PSN-15-001	\$ 89,129	\$ -
Paul Coverdell Forensic Sciences Improvement Grant Program	16.742	CV-16-17-004 CV-17-18-002	30,612 19,484 <u>50,096</u>	- - <u>-</u>
Passed through from:				
Maricopa County Edward Byrne Memorial Justice Assistance Grant Program	16.738	2014-DJ-BX-1197 2015-DJ-BX-0227 2016-DJ-BX-0801	102,250 135,848 22,214 <u>260,312</u>	- - - <u>-</u>
Total Department of Justice			<u>5,595,004</u>	<u>259,675</u>
Department of Labor				
Direct Programs:				
H-1B Job Training Grants	17.268	N/A	506,337	-
YouthBuild	17.274	N/A	370,954	303,829
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Economic Security WIOA Cluster				
WIOA Adult Program	17.258	D116-002127 D116-002127-005	83,053 <u>3,038,897</u> 3,121,950	- <u>264,566</u> 264,566
WIOA Youth Activities	17.259	D116-002127 D116-002127-005	2,574,189 <u>1,289,910</u> 3,864,099	1,531,813 <u>642,622</u> 2,174,435
WIOA Dislocated Worker Formula Grants	17.278	D116-002127 D116-002127-005	3,527,142 <u>1,308,394</u> 4,835,536	- <u>-</u> -
<i>Total WIOA Cluster</i>			<u>11,821,585</u>	<u>2,439,001</u>
Total Department of Labor			<u>12,698,876</u>	<u>2,742,830</u>

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Federal Grantor / Pass-Through Grantor / Program or Cluster Title	Federal CFDA Number	Pass-Through Entity Identifying Number	Total Federal Expenditures	Passed Through to Subrecipients
Department of Transportation				
Direct Program:				
Airport Improvement Program	20.106	N/A	\$ 21,242,209	\$ -
<i>Federal Transit Cluster</i>				
Federal Transit - Capital Investment Grants	20.500	N/A	1,337,697	339,846
Federal Transit - Formula Grants	20.507	N/A	139,921,228	96,917,647
State of Good Repair Grants Program	20.525	N/A	8,548,778	3,298,316
Bus and Bus Facilities Formula Program	20.526	N/A	8,534,866	4,674,245
<i>Total Federal Transit Cluster</i>			<u>158,342,569</u>	<u>105,230,054</u>
<i>Transit Service Programs Cluster</i>				
Enhanced Mobility for Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities	20.513	N/A	2,114,865	1,385,629
<i>Total Transit Services Programs Cluster</i>			<u>2,114,865</u>	<u>1,385,629</u>
Public Transportation Research, Technical Assistance, and Training	20.514	N/A	592,794	592,794
Passed through from:				
<i>Highway Planning and Construction Cluster</i>				
Arizona Department of Transportation				
Highway Planning and Construction	20.205	HSIP PHX-0(301) D	5,295	-
		STP PHX-0(331)D	2,213,473	-
		PHX-0(341)D	215,509	-
		CM-PHX-0(276)	77,510	-
		CMAQ PHX-0(300) D	124,004	-
		CMAQ PHX-0(293) D	1,921,415	-
		TAP PHX-0(328) D	314,697	-
		693JJ31740002	360,599	-
		TAP PHX-0(297) D	1,999,242	-
		STP PHX-0(340)D	7,073	-
		TA PHX-0(302)D	327,620	-
		TAP PHX-D(296) D	85,115	-
		CM PHX-0(285)D	914,247	-
		CM PHX-0(284) D	639,364	-
		HPS-PHX-0(055) A	830,172	-
		STP-0006(185)	237,101	-
		PHX-0(249)A	33,767	-
		STP-PHX-0(248)A	153,992	-
		PHX-0(226)A	21,262	-
		PHX-0(333)D	30,924	-
			<u>10,512,381</u>	<u>-</u>
Maricopa Association of Governments				
Highway Planning and Construction	20.205	None Provided	446,832	-
<i>Total Highway Planning and Construction Cluster</i>			<u>10,959,213</u>	<u>-</u>

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Federal Grantor / Pass-Through Grantor / Program or Cluster Title	Federal CFDA Number	Pass-Through Entity Identifying Number	Total Federal Expenditures	Passed Through to Subrecipients
Passed through from:				
Governor's Office of Highway Safety (G.O.H.S.)				
<i>Highway Safety Cluster</i>				
State and Community Highway Safety	20.600	2018-PTS-047	\$ 27,904	\$ -
		2017-MC-003	11,810	-
		2018-MC-003	8,045	-
		2018-405H-012	16,914	-
		2017-PT-039	43,870	-
		2017-OP-013	10,386	-
		2017-AL-034	41,249	-
		2017-AL-033	8,958	-
		2017-AL-035	752	-
			<u>169,888</u>	<u>-</u>
National Priority Safety Programs	20.616	2018-405D-035	50,000	-
		2017-405D-025	27,546	-
		2017-405h-002	19,460	-
		2018-405h-011	27,547	-
		2018-405b-005	5,536	-
		2018-405d-034	85,500	-
		2018-CIOT-019	11,878	-
			<u>227,467</u>	<u>-</u>
<i>Total Highway Safety Cluster</i>			<u>397,355</u>	<u>-</u>
National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) Discretionary Safety Grants and Cooperative Agreements	20.614	2018-PB-005	8,746	-
Total Department of Transportation			<u>193,657,751</u>	<u>107,208,477</u>
National Endowment for the Arts				
Direct Program:				
Promotion of the Arts Grants to Organizations and Individuals	45.024	N/A	52,375	-
Total National Endowment for the Arts			<u>52,375</u>	<u>-</u>
Environmental Protection Agency				
Direct Program:				
Brownfields Training, Research, and Technical Assistance Grants and Cooperative Agreements	66.814	N/A	102,359	-
Total Environmental Protection Agency			<u>102,359</u>	<u>-</u>
Department of Energy				
Passed through from:				
Governor's Office of Energy Policy				
Weatherization Assistance for Low-Income Persons	81.042	C051-09-06	62,788	-
Total Department of Energy			<u>62,788</u>	<u>-</u>

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Federal Grantor / Pass-Through Grantor / Program or Cluster Title	Federal CFDA Number	Pass-Through Entity Identifying Number	Total Federal Expenditures	Passed Through to Subrecipients
Department of Health and Human Services (HHS)				
Direct Programs:				
Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Projects of Regional and National Significance	93.243	N/A	\$ 157,177	\$ -
Head Start	93.600	N/A	32,976,555	15,271,871
Passed through from:				
Area Agency on Aging (AAA)				
<i>Aging Cluster</i>				
Special Programs for the Aging --Title III, Part C --Nutrition Services	93.045	2016-32-PHX	1,069,020	-
Nutrition Services Incentive Program	93.053	2016-32-PHX	201,410	-
<i>Total Aging Cluster</i>			<u>1,270,430</u>	<u>-</u>
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Health				
PPHF Capacity Building Assistance to Strengthen Public Health Immunization Infrastructure and Performance financed in part by Prevention and Public Health Funds				
	93.539	ADHS13-039133	4,947	-
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Economic Security				
<i>TANF Cluster</i>				
Temporary Assistance for Needy Families	93.558	ADES15-089118	1,007,841	-
<i>Total TANF Cluster</i>			<u>1,007,841</u>	<u>-</u>
Community Services Block Grant	93.569	ADES15-089118	1,638,005	-
Passed through from:				
Arizona Governor's Office of Energy Policy				
Low-Income Home Energy Assistance	93.568	G043-10-06	692,975	-
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Economic Security				
Low-Income Home Energy Assistance	93.568	ADES15-089118	4,933,150	-
<i>Total Low-Income Home Energy Assistance</i>			<u>5,626,125</u>	<u>-</u>
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Economic Security				
Social Services Block Grant	93.667	ADES15-089118	644,892	-
Passed through from:				
Area Agency on Aging (AAA)				
Social Services Block Grant	93.667	2016-32-PHX	278,875	-
<i>Total Social Services Block Grant</i>			<u>923,767</u>	<u>-</u>
Total Department of Health and Human Services			<u>43,604,847</u>	<u>15,271,871</u>
Executive Office of the President				
Direct Program:				
High Intensity Drug Trafficking Areas Program	95.001	N/A	1,553,540	-
Total Executive Office of the President			<u>1,553,540</u>	<u>-</u>

The accompanying notes are an integral part of this Schedule.

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Federal Grantor / Pass-Through Grantor / Program or Cluster Title	Federal CFDA Number	Pass-Through Entity Identifying Number	Total Federal Expenditures	Passed Through to Subrecipients
Department of Homeland Security (DHS)				
Direct Programs:				
National Urban Search and Rescue (US&R) Response System	97.025	N/A	\$ 5,240,769	\$ -
Assistance to Firefighters Grant	97.044	N/A	400,610	-
Staffing for Adequate Fire and Emergency Response (SAFER)	97.083	N/A	5,370,590	-
Preparing for Emerging Threats and Hazards	97.133	N/A	297,875	-
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Emergency Management Disaster Grants - Public Assistance (Presidentially Declared Disasters)	97.036	73027/4203	82,456	-
Homeland Security Grant Program	97.067	170818-01, 170818-02, 170818-03, 170818-04 160819-01, 160819-02, 160819-03, 160819-04 170210-01, 170210-02 160209-01, 160209-02	291,357 262,542 68,270 204,853 <u>827,022</u>	- - - - -
Passed through from:				
Arizona Department of Homeland Security Homeland Security Grant Program	97.067	160818-03 150817-01 170817-05 170817-03 160208-01 160208-03 160208-04 170208-01 170208-02 170208-03 160817-02 160817-03 160817-04 170816-01 170816-02 170816-03 150816-08	1,894 319,515 6,000 5,372 7,195 8,443 2,924 26,024 29,278 64,923 29,298 83,859 208 140,645 15,368 22,590 35,000 <u>798,536</u>	- - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - -
<i>Total Homeland Security Grant Program</i>			<u>1,625,558</u>	-
Total Department of Homeland Security			<u>13,017,858</u>	-
Total Federal Awards Expended			<u>\$ 431,516,794</u>	<u>\$ 127,491,135</u>

* Denotes non-cash awards

City of Phoenix, Arizona

Notes to the Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards

Year Ended June 30, 2018

1. General

The accompanying schedule of expenditures of federal awards (Schedule) includes the federal grant activity of the primary government of the City of Phoenix, Arizona (City). The City's reporting entity is defined in *Note 1* in the City's basic financial statements for the year ended June 30, 2018.

The information in this Schedule is presented in accordance with the requirements of Title 2 U.S. *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 200, *Uniform Administrative Requirements, Cost Principles, and Audit Requirements for Federal Awards* (Uniform Guidance). Because the Schedule presents only a selected portion of the operations of the City, it is not intended to and does not present the financial position, changes in net position/fund balance or cash flows of the City. The Schedule includes federally funded projects received directly from federal agencies and the federal amount of pass-through awards received by the City through the State of Arizona or other non-federal entities.

The City's basic financial statements include the operations of Valley Metro Rail, Inc., a joint use agreement of the City, which received \$74,774,367 in federal awards which are not included in the City's schedule of expenditures of federal awards for the year ended June 30, 2018.

2. Basis of Accounting

Governmental funds and proprietary funds account for the City's federal grant activity. Amounts reported in the Schedule are recognized on the modified accrual basis when they become a demand on current available federal resources and eligibility requirements are met, or on the accrual basis at the time liabilities are incurred and all eligibility requirements are met, depending on the basis of accounting used by the respective fund.

The City's summary of significant accounting policies is presented in *Note 1* to the City's basic financial statements for the year ended June 30, 2018. Such expenditures are recognized following, as applicable, the cost principles in OMB Circular A-87, *Cost Principles for State, Local, and Indian Tribal Governments*, or the cost principles contained in the Uniform Guidance, wherein certain types of expenditures are not allowable or are limited as to reimbursement. Therefore, some amounts presented in the Schedule may differ from amounts presented in, or used in the preparation of, the basic financial statements or reports to federal agencies. Negative amounts, if any, shown on the Schedule represent adjustments or credits made in the normal course of business to amounts reported as expenditures in prior years. The City has elected not to use the 10 percent de minimis indirect cost rate allowed under the Uniform Guidance.

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Notes to the Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards (Continued)
June 30, 2018

3. Federal Loan Programs

The City has certain revolving loan funds, which were originally financed with federal financial assistance through the Community Development Block Grants/Entitlement Grants Cluster (CFDA Number 14.218) and HOME Investment Partnership Program (CFDA Number 14.239). Under these loan agreements, the City has either loaned money to nonprofit corporations for the purpose of establishing and/or improving public housing units or to single families providing affordable housing. Certain loans under this program have no continuing compliance requirements other than continued loan payments, therefore, the outstanding loan balances of such loans have not been included in the Schedule and major program determination. Certain loans are subject to continuing compliance requirements and as such the beginning balance of those loans is included in the Schedule and the major program determination. The Schedule also includes all new loans executed during the year under this program.

The outstanding loan balances as of June 30, 2018, are as follows:

Loans not subject to continuing compliance requirements	\$ 12,277,920
Loans subject to continuing compliance requirements	<u>58,817,769</u>
Total Loans Outstanding	<u><u>\$ 71,095,689</u></u>

**Report on Internal Control Over
Financial Reporting and on Compliance and Other Matters Based on an
Audit of the Financial Statements Performed in Accordance with
Government Auditing Standards**

Independent Auditor's Report

Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council
City of Phoenix, Arizona
Phoenix, Arizona

We have audited, in accordance with the auditing standards generally accepted in the United States of America and the standards applicable to financial audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards*, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States, the financial statements of the governmental activities, the business-type activities, the aggregate discretely presented component units, each major fund, and the aggregate remaining fund information of the City of Phoenix, Arizona (City), as of and for the year ended June 30, 2018, and the related notes to the financial statements, which collectively comprise the City's basic financial statements, and have issued our report thereon dated December 14, 2018, which contained a reference to the reports of other auditors and an emphasis of a matter paragraph regarding a change in accounting principle. Our report includes a reference to other auditors who audited the financial statements of the Phoenix Industrial Development Authority (IDA), a component unit included in the financial statements of the aggregate discretely presented component units, and Multi-City Subregional Operating Group (SROG) and Valley Metro Rail, Inc., joint use agreements of the City, as described in our report on the City's financial statements. This report does not include the results of the other auditor's testing of internal control over financial reporting or compliance and other matters that are reported on separately by those auditors. The financial statements of Regional Wireless Cooperative, a joint use agreement of the City, were not audited in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*.

Internal Control Over Financial Reporting

In planning and performing our audit of the financial statements, we considered the City's internal control over financial reporting (internal control) to determine the audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances for the purpose of expressing our opinions on the financial statements, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the City's internal control. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion on the effectiveness of the City's internal control.

A *deficiency in internal control* exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, misstatements on a timely basis. A *material weakness* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control, such that there is a reasonable possibility that a material misstatement of the entity's financial statements will not be prevented, or detected and corrected, on a timely basis. A *significant deficiency* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control that is less severe than a material weakness, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance.

Our consideration of internal control was for the limited purpose described in the first paragraph of this section and was not designed to identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies. Given these limitations, during our audit we did not identify any deficiencies in internal control that we consider to be material weaknesses. However, material weaknesses may exist that have not been identified.

Compliance and Other Matters

As part of obtaining reasonable assurance about whether the City's financial statements are free from material misstatement, we performed tests of its compliance with certain provisions of laws, regulations, contracts and grant agreements, noncompliance with which could have a direct and material effect on the determination of financial statement amounts. However, providing an opinion on compliance with those provisions was not an objective of our audit, and accordingly, we do not express such an opinion. The results of our tests disclosed no instances of noncompliance or other matters that are required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*.

Purpose of this Report

The purpose of this report is solely to describe the scope of our testing of internal control and compliance and the results of that testing, and not to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the entity's internal control or on compliance. This report is an integral part of an audit performed in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* in considering the entity's internal control and compliance. Accordingly, this communication is not suitable for any other purpose.

BKD, LLP

Dallas, Texas
December 14, 2018

**Report on Compliance for Each Major Federal Program;
Report on Internal Control Over Compliance; and Report on
Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards Required by the Uniform Guidance**

Independent Auditor's Report

Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council
City of Phoenix, Arizona
Phoenix, Arizona

Report on Compliance for Each Major Federal Program

We have audited the City of Phoenix, Arizona's (City) compliance with the types of compliance requirements described in the *OMB Compliance Supplement* that could have a direct and material effect on each of the City's major federal programs for the year ended June 30, 2018. The City's major federal programs are identified in the summary of auditor's results section of the accompanying schedule of findings and questioned costs.

The City's basic financial statements include the operations of Valley Metro Rail, Inc., a joint use agreement of the City, which received \$74,774,367 in federal awards which are not included in the schedule of expenditures of federal awards during the year ended June 30, 2018. Our audit, described below, did not include the operations of Valley Metro Rail, Inc. because they engaged other auditors to perform an audit in accordance with the Uniform Guidance.

Management's Responsibility

Management is responsible for compliance with federal statutes, regulations and the terms and conditions of its federal awards applicable to its federal programs.

Auditor's Responsibility

Our responsibility is to express an opinion on compliance for each of the City's major federal programs based on our audit of the types of compliance requirements referred to above. We conducted our audit of compliance in accordance with auditing standards generally accepted in the United States of America; the standards applicable to financial audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards*, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States; and the audit requirements of Title 2 U.S. *Code of Federal Regulations* Part 200, *Uniform Administrative Requirements, Cost Principles, and Audit Requirements for Federal Awards* (Uniform Guidance). Those standards and the Uniform Guidance require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance about whether noncompliance with the types of compliance requirements referred to above that could have a direct and material effect on a major federal program occurred. An audit includes examining, on a test basis, evidence about the City's compliance with those requirements and performing such other procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances.

We believe that our audit provides a reasonable basis for our opinion on compliance for each major federal program. However, our audit does not provide a legal determination of the City's compliance.

Opinion on Each Major Federal Program

In our opinion, the City complied, in all material respects, with the types of compliance requirements referred to above that could have a direct and material effect on each of its major federal programs for the year ended June 30, 2018.

Other Matters

The results of our auditing procedures disclosed an instance of noncompliance, which is required to be reported in accordance with the Uniform Guidance and which is described in the accompanying schedule of findings and questioned costs as item 2018-001. Our opinion on each major federal program is not modified with respect to this matter.

The City's response to the noncompliance finding identified in our audit is described in the accompanying schedule of findings and questioned costs and/or corrective action plan. The City's response was not subjected to the auditing procedures applied in the audit of compliance, and accordingly, we express no opinion on the response.

Report on Internal Control Over Compliance

Management of the City is responsible for establishing and maintaining effective internal control over compliance with the types of compliance requirements referred to above. In planning and performing our audit of compliance, we considered the City's internal control over compliance with the types of requirements that could have a direct and material effect on each major federal program to determine the auditing procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances for the purpose of expressing an opinion on compliance for each major federal program and to test and report on internal control over compliance in accordance with the Uniform Guidance, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of internal control over compliance. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion on the effectiveness of the City's internal control over compliance.

A deficiency in internal control over compliance exists when the design or operation of a control over compliance does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, noncompliance with a type of compliance requirement of a federal program on a timely basis. *A material weakness in internal control over compliance* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control over compliance, such that there is a reasonable possibility that material noncompliance with a type of compliance requirement of a federal program will not be prevented, or detected and corrected, on a timely basis. *A significant deficiency in internal control over compliance* is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control over compliance with a type of compliance requirement of a federal program that is less severe than a material weakness in internal control over compliance, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance.

Our consideration of internal control over compliance was for the limited purpose described in the first paragraph of this section and was not designed to identify all deficiencies in internal control over compliance that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies, and therefore, material weaknesses or significant deficiencies may exist that have not been identified. We did not identify any deficiencies in internal control over compliance that we consider to be material weaknesses. However, we identified a deficiency in internal control over compliance, as described in the accompanying schedule of findings and questioned costs as item 2018-001 that we consider to be a significant deficiency.

The City's response to the internal control over compliance finding identified in our audit is described in the accompanying schedule of findings and questioned costs and/or corrective action plan. The City's response was not subjected to the auditing procedures applied in the audit of compliance and, accordingly, we express no opinion on the response.

The purpose of this report on internal control over compliance is solely to describe the scope of our testing of internal control over compliance and the results of that testing based on the requirements of the Uniform Guidance. Accordingly, this report is not suitable for any other purpose.

Report on Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards Required by the Uniform Guidance

We have audited the financial statements of the governmental activities, the business-type activities, the aggregate discretely presented component units, each major fund and the aggregate remaining fund information of the City as of and for the year ended June 30, 2018, and the related notes to the financial statements, which collectively comprise the City's basic financial statements. We issued our report thereon dated December 14, 2018, which contained unmodified opinions on those financial statements, a reference to the reports of other auditors and an emphasis of a matter paragraph regarding a change in accounting principle. Our audit was conducted for the purpose of forming opinions on the financial statements that collectively comprise the basic financial statements. The accompanying schedule of expenditures of federal awards is presented for purposes of additional analysis as required by the Uniform Guidance and is not a required part of the basic financial statements. Such information is the responsibility of management and was derived from and relates directly to the underlying accounting and other records used to prepare the basic financial statements. The information has been subjected to the auditing procedures applied in the audit of the basic financial statements and certain additional procedures, including comparing and reconciling such information directly to the underlying accounting and other records used to prepare the basic financial statements or to the basic financial statements themselves, and other additional procedures in accordance with auditing standards generally accepted in the United States of America. In our opinion, the schedule of expenditures of federal awards is fairly stated in all material respects in relation to the basic financial statements as a whole.

BKD, LLP

Dallas, Texas
December 14, 2018

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Findings and Questioned Costs
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Section I - Summary of Auditor's Results

Financial Statements

1. Type of report the auditor issued on whether the financial statements audited were prepared in accordance with accounting principles generally accepted in the United States of America (GAAP) was:

Unmodified Qualified Adverse Disclaimer

2. Internal control over financial reporting:

Material weakness(es) identified? Yes No

Significant deficiency(ies) identified? Yes None reported

3. Noncompliance material to the financial statements noted?

Yes No

Federal Awards

4. Internal control over compliance for major federal programs:

Material weakness(es) identified? Yes No

Significant deficiency(ies) identified? Yes None reported

5. Type of auditor's report issued on compliance for major federal programs:

Unmodified Qualified Adverse Disclaimer

6. Any audit findings disclosed that are required to be reported in accordance with 2 CFR 200.516(a)?

Yes No

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Findings and Questioned Costs (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

7. Identification of major federal programs:

<u>CFDA Number(s)</u>	<u>Name of Federal Program or Cluster</u>
	CDBG - Entitlement Grants Cluster
	WIOA Cluster
	Federal Transit Cluster
93.568	Low-Income Home Energy Assistance
97.025	National Urban Search and Rescue (US&R) Response System

8. Dollar threshold used to distinguish between Type A and Type B programs: \$3,000,000.

9. Auditee qualified as a low-risk auditee?

Yes No

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Findings and Questioned Costs (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Section II – Financial Statement Findings

Reference Number	Finding
-----------------------------	----------------

No matters are reportable.

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Schedule of Findings and Questioned Costs (Continued)
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Section III – Federal Award Findings and Questioned Costs

**Reference
Number**

Finding

2018-001 **Finding:** Subrecipient Monitoring

Federal Transit Cluster

CFDA No. 20.507 - Federal Transit - Formula Grants

Department of Transportation, Award Number AZ-90-X124-00, Award Year 2014

Department of Transportation, Award Number AZ-2016-016, Award Year 2016

Department of Transportation, Award Number AZ-2017-004, Award Year 2017

Criteria: In accordance with 2 CFR Section 200.331(d) the pass-through entity monitoring must include:

- 1) Reviewing financial and programmatic reports required by the pass-through entity.
- 2) Following-up and ensuring that the subrecipient takes timely and appropriate action on all deficiencies pertaining to the Federal award provided to the subrecipient from the pass-through entity detected through audits, on-site reviews, and other means.
- 3) Issuing a management decision for audit findings pertaining to the Federal award provided to the subrecipient from the pass-through entity as required by §200.521 Management decision.

Condition: While we noted the City completed risk assessments and developed a monitoring plan for its subrecipients and performed other monitoring as outlined in section 2 CFR 200.331(d), the City was not able to perform any on-site monitoring reviews for the subrecipients selected for testing during the year ended June 30, 2018.

Questioned Costs: None.

Context: We tested 3 of the 11 subrecipients for the year ended June 30, 2018, and noted based on a risk assessment performed by the City, 8 of the 11 subrecipients were deemed to be higher risk requiring an on-site monitoring review. 2 of the 3 selected for testing required an on-site monitoring review, which did not occur as of June 30, 2018. A non-statistical sampling methodology was used to select the sample

Effect: Failure to conduct timely on-site monitoring reviews and take appropriate corrective action could result in non-compliance by the subrecipient continuing for an inappropriate length of time.

Cause: Controls over subrecipient monitoring were not sufficiently operating during the year primarily due to significant staffing issues and turnover within the Public Transit Department.

Identification as a Repeat Finding: 2017-002

Recommendation: We recommend the City perform the required on-site monitoring for each subrecipient based on the risk assessment performed and monitoring plan established as well as develop a process to track all monitoring performed for each subrecipient.

Views of Responsible Officials: We agree with the finding. See separate report for planned corrective actions.

City of Phoenix, Arizona
Status of Prior Audit Findings
Year Ended June 30, 2018

Reference Number	Summary of Finding	Status
2017-001	<p>Finding: Schedule of Expenditures of Federal Awards Preparation</p> <p>We recommend that the City provide training to all grant managers on Federal guidelines emphasizing the information necessary for SEFA preparation and establish standardized policies and procedures that will help the departments prepare and compile this information. Finally, we recommend the Finance Department analyze and review all reports submitted by the departments to ensure accuracy and completeness of the amounts reported on the SEFA.</p>	<p>Implemented. See separate auditee document for detail of corrective action taken.</p>
2017-002	<p><i>Federal Transit Cluster</i></p> <p>Finding: Subrecipient Monitoring</p> <p>We recommend that the City prepare a risk assessment analysis for each subrecipient to determine the level of risk and the types and frequency of monitoring required. Once the risk assessment analysis has been completed, we recommend the City develop a monitoring plan for each subrecipient as well as develop a process to track all monitoring performed on for each subrecipient.</p>	<p>Partially Implemented. See Finding 2018-001</p>