

1. Call to Order/Roll Call and Announcements:

The meeting of the Environmental Quality and Sustainability Commission (EQSC) was called to order with a roll call at 3:07 p.m. There were 11 members present at roll call. The following commissioner arrived after the initial roll call:

- Kelly Barr

Willa Altman-Kaough, Policy Advisor in the Office of the Mayor, announced that Mayor Kate Gallego will be attending the next EQSC meeting on December 10, 2020 and acknowledged the efforts the EQSC has contributed towards the development of the climate action plan.

2. Review and approval of October 8, 2020 Minutes:

ACTION:

Commissioner Kevin Groman made a motion to approve the October 8, 2020 minutes. Commissioner Timothy Franquist seconded the motion and it carried 11:0.

3. Public Comment – One person spoke:

Chair Colin Tetreault indicated that attendees wishing to offer comments to feel free to do so.

Ryan Boyd understands the importance of thoughtful deliberation, but wants to see action from the Tree and Shade work. Ryan Boyd also saw that the item was removed from today's agenda and said that climate action is needed quickly.

4. Open Meeting Law and Ethics Refresher

Teresa Riza, Open Meeting Law and Council Support Supervisor, City Clerk Department, and Stephen Wetherell, Assistant City Attorney, Law Department, provided an Open Meeting Law and Ethics Refresher to the commissioners. Assistant City Attorney Wetherell began the refresher with the discussion on ethics, including gift policies. Assistant City Attorney Wetherell spoke about the ethics policies that applied to board members, like EQSC commissioners, including conflicts of interest and the procedures taken when a conflict is identified. Assistant City Attorney Wetherell also spoke about the attendance policy where if a board member fails to attend three consecutive regular meetings or more than fifty percent of all meetings of a board during a calendar year, the City Council may declare that seat vacant and appoint a replacement. Assistant City Attorney Wetherell also described the non-discrimination and anti-harassment policy and how to report ethical concerns, which may be done by calling the Integrity Line at (602) 261-8999.

Open Meeting Law and Council Support Supervisor Riza followed up with a discussion on Arizona's Open Meeting Law requirements. The overall purpose is to conduct meetings with transparency. The requirements also apply to digital communications and efforts must be made to make those interactions in an open meeting setting. The requirements of announcing a meeting and posting results after the meeting were described. If a board member is found to be violating Open Meeting Law, penalties include removal from the board, monetary, and rescinding of any actions taken when not following the Law. The board members were also told the difference between attending in a personal capacity and the process to attend officially as a member of the board.

5. Urban Heat Island and Tree and Shade Subcommittee Update

Vice Chair Ginger Torres, Urban Heat Island and Tree and Shade Subcommittee Chair, and Commissioner Dwayne Allen, Urban Heat Island and Tree and Shade Subcommittee Vice Chair, gave an update as to the most recent meeting of the Subcommittee. Vice Chair Torres remarked on the long timeline of approving the tree and shade text amendment. Vice Chair Torres also spoke about the work being done on the tree administrator business case, with Commissioner Allen and other Subcommittee members creating the case. The small group is currently gathering information and interacting with other cities with successful urban forest programs.

The Subcommittee members were invited to view the Phoenix Tree and Shade Prioritization Map graciously presented by Erik Wilson during the last meeting. Unfortunately, members were not able to access the site and more work must be done by IT staff in order to make the link accessible to the public.

<https://phoenix.maps.arcgis.com/apps/webappviewer/index.html?id=2ce7ec39970c45e5861559318c7ee54e>

Commissioner Franquist inquired as to whether the Subcommittee was considering the types of plants to place in regards to the biogenic volatile organic compounds (VOC) that are emitted by plants as recommended by the EQSC. Commissioner Franquist reminded the commission that Maricopa County is in nonattainment for ozone and that a designation of “serious” is possible and that VOCs contribute to the formation of ozone. Commissioner Franquist also described the need for offsets, that are sometimes monetarily valuable depending on region and need, and an idea of planting nitrogen-fixing trees to remove some of the nitrogen oxides that also contribute to the formation of ozone.

Chair Tetreault spoke about the idea of planting the right tree in the right place and that a criteria exists. Chair Tetreault also inquired as to an accounting system of those credits of trees being planted and asked Commissioner Franquist to look into the economics and add this information to the description for the tree administrator role.

The following link leads to an Excel file containing the selection criteria for what tree to plant in Maricopa County, including VOC emissions.

<http://cleanairmakemore.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/Maricopa-County-Urban-Tree-Selection-Criteria-December-22-2017.xlsx>

6. ~~Planning and Development Text Amendment Update~~

This item was struck from the agenda, but Chair Tetreault gave a brief update. Chair Tetreault indicated that Planning and Development Department will present an update at December’s EQSC meeting. Chair Tetreault also asked that the commissioners send out the text amendment to their networks to gain comments and further recommendations from the greater community.

6. Legislative Update

Nancy Allen, Office of Environmental Programs Administrator, provided an Arizona State Legislative Update. Administrator Allen spoke about the last session ending due to the COVID-19 pandemic and how Governor Doug Ducey extended some environmental programs by executive order. The legislative session was due to begin sometime in January or February of 2021. Administrator Allen highlighted surface water quality protection and spoke about the change in definition to the Waters of the U.S. that took protections from about 90% of water bodies in

Arizona. The state is working on creating regulations for a program for Waters of Arizona, but that these regulations cannot be more strict than federal government regulations and that ADEQ would need permission for such a program. Administrator Allen also spoke about the Water Quality Assurance Revolving Fund Community Advisory Board meetings being eliminated, but the City of Phoenix wants to keep them. Administrator Allen spoke about recycling programs and how newsprint is no longer a major component, so recycling requirements will need to be updated. Dr. Matthew Potzler, Environmental Air Quality and Climate Specialist in the Office of Environmental Programs, provided a brief update to the changes being investigated for Clean Burning Gasoline requirements by ADEQ, industry, and others and indicated the real incentive is for the suppliers to be able to provide supply more easily and that no real benefit to air quality would be seen if a change was made to conventional gasoline.

7. Climate Action Plan Update

Nancy Allen, Office of Environmental Programs Administrator, and Dr. Matthew Potzler, Environmental Air Quality and Climate Specialist in the Office of Environmental Programs, gave an update to the efforts towards producing a C40-compliant climate action plan. The commissioners were invited to attend a workshop on December 3, 2020. Commissioner Caroline Lobo asked if there would be issues with a quorum being reached with staff responding that they would keep track of attendance. Chair Tetreault encouraged commissioners to provide support in obtaining more community engagement so that equity and justice were apparent throughout the plan. Commissioner Groman would like to see the net-zero goal adjusted lower to 2030, with interim goals set. Commissioner Franquist and Dr. Potzler entered into a discussion about the driving force behind the requirements being set and if that was due to the decisions of the Arizona Corporation Commission. The discussion included talk about APS's and SRP's net-zero and renewable energy goals. Chief Sustainability Officer Mark Hartman indicated that even achieving net-zero electricity would not be sufficient to get the city to net-zero overall, especially with millions of cars in the region.

8. Announcements and Review of Future Agenda Items

Future possible agenda items include:

- Status of AZ Recycling Industry
- Permitting for Rooftop Solar: City and State
- Batteries / Storage & Fire Codes
- Mayor Kate Gallego
- Rio Reimagined
- EQSC Branding
- Air Quality Update
- Phoenix Water Drought Pipeline Project
- Opioids in Water
- Increase in population of individuals facing homelessness
- Walkability throughout the city

9. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:09 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,
Dr. Matthew Potzler, Environmental Quality Specialist