

**CITY OF PHOENIX  
CITIZENS TRANSIT COMMISSION**

Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes, A.R.S. Section 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the **CITY OF PHOENIX CITIZENS TRANSIT COMMISSION** and to the general public, that the **CITIZENS TRANSIT COMMISSION** will hold a meeting open to the public on **May 7, 2015, at 7:30 a.m. located in the Conference Room, 7th Floor, Public Transit Building, 302 N. 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Phoenix, Arizona.**

One or more commission members may participate via teleconference. Agenda items may be taken out of order.

The agenda for the meeting is as follows:

1.	<b>Call to Order</b>	Chairperson James
2.	<b>Approval of the minutes of the March 5, 2015 meeting</b>  <i>This item is for information, discussion and possible action.</i>	Commission Members
3.	<b>Chairperson's Report &amp; Commissioners' Reports</b> This item provides the Chairperson and Commissioners with an opportunity to provide updates on transit-related issues and other housekeeping items. <i>This item is for information, discussion and possible action.</i>	Chairperson James/ Commission Members
4.	<b>Call to the Public</b> Consideration, discussion, and concerns from the public. Those wishing to address the Subcommittee need not request permission in advance. Action taken as a result of the public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter or rescheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date.	Chairperson James
5.	<b>October Service Changes Public Outreach</b> This report provides an update on October service changes and the public outreach process. <i>This item is an information report only.</i>	Joe Bowar  Info Report Only
6.	<b>Light Rail Projects Update</b> <b>a) West Phoenix/Central Glendale Project Study</b> Provides information and an update on the corridor study along with the next steps. <b>b) Northeast Corridor Feasibility Study</b> Provide information about the implementation of a study to assess the feasibility of high capacity transit in this corridor. <i>This item is for information and discussion.</i>	Albert Santana

7.	<b>Transportation 2050</b> This report provides an overview of the approved Phoenix transportation plan and tax initiative slated for August 25, 2015 election. <i><b>This item is for information and discussion.</b></i>	Maria Hyatt  Presentation only
8.	<b>Public Transit Director's Report</b> This item gives the Public Transit Director an opportunity to discuss issues and accomplishments with the commission. <i><b>This item is for information and discussion.</b></i>	Maria Hyatt  Presentation only
9.	<b>Request for Future Agenda Items</b>	Chairperson James
10.	<b>Adjournment</b>	Chairperson James

For further information, please call Megan Neal, Management Assistant II, Public Transit Department at 602-534-6192.

**Persons paid to lobby on behalf of persons or organizations other than themselves shall register with the City Clerk prior to lobbying or within five business days thereafter, and must register annually to continue lobbying. If you have any questions about registration or whether or not you must register, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 602-262-6811.**

To request reasonable accommodations, call Megan Neal at Voice/602-534-6192 or TTY/7-1-1 as early as possible to coordinate needed arrangements.

April 29, 2015

**CITY OF PHOENIX  
CITIZENS TRANSIT COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES  
March 5, 2015**

Public Transit Department  
302 N. First Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor

<b>Commission Present</b>	<b>Public Present</b>	<b>City Staff Present</b>
James, Abraham – Chair	Chavez, Santos E.	Bowar, Joe
Cannon, Bob		Bresnahan, Jorie
Davis, Pam		Gathers, Kim
Dalager, Rob		Heil, Matthew
Hunter, Yvonne		Howard, Kacie
Miller, Maizie		Hyatt, Maria
Snow, Lou		Kessler, Ken
Wiltshire, Donald		Jankowski, Brian
		Mariscal, Ted
		Munoz, Herb
		Neal, Megan
		Rivera, Alex
		Sapien, Jesus
		Shoop, Jennifer
		Sweinhagen, Melissa
		Venegas, Bernard

<b>Commission Absent</b>
Aylsworth, Aaron
MacDonald, Shelley
Tallarico, Fred

- Call to Order  
Chairperson Abraham James called the meeting to order at 7:30 a.m. The Chair advised that a quorum was present.

Commissioner Bob Cannon arrived to the meeting at 7:34a.m.  
Commissioner Yvonne Hunter arrived to the meeting at 7:53a.m.
- Approval of Minutes of the February 5, 2015 Meeting  
Commissioner Donald Wiltshire made a motion to approve the minutes, and the motion was seconded by Commissioner Pam Davis. The motion passed unanimously.

3. Chairperson's Report & Commissioners' Reports

No items reported.

4. Call to the Public

No items reported.

5. Bus Stop Shade Study

Deputy Public Transit Director Jesus Sapien introduced Jorie Bresnahan and Joe Bowar.

Ms. Jorie Bresnahan informed the Commission that the shade study started with the Complete Streets plan, and the need for a statement to be included about shade structures for all bus stops. The shade study was needed to address common complaints, document conditions at unsheltered stops, assess the magnitude of the problem, and prioritize/schedule shade improvements.

The findings of the study are:

Of the **4,059** bus stops in Phoenix, **1,507** currently have no City-constructed transit shade shelter. Of the stops with no transit shade structure:

- **548** had trees, buildings, or other features, which provide shade during some periods of the day in the same manner a City-provided transit shelter would.
- **323** have significant ROW or infrastructure constraints, whereby improving these bus stops would require the purchase of additional ROW.
- **636** bus stops have no physical constraints that would preclude the installation of a standard transit shade structure. As a result of this study, these stops will be placed on a prioritization schedule for future enhancements.

**Number of Bus Stops and Boardings (Jul-Oct 2014):  
Shaded Bus Stops vs. Non-Shaded Bus Stops**

Bus Stops			Average Weekday Boardings	
Category	Number	Percent of Total	Number	Percent of Total
Shade Structure Present	2,552	63%	110,443	87%
Other Shade Present	548	13%	7,178	6%
No Shade - ROW & Infrastructure adequate to install a structure	636	16%	6,567	5%
No Shade - ROW & Infrastructure <b>inadequate</b> to install a structure	323	8%	2,801	2%
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>4,059</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>126,989</b>	<b>100%</b>

Ms. Bresnahan showed the Commissioners photos of different bus stops around the valley that show the different challenges that would be faced in trying to install shade structures at every stop.

The next steps are to rank all of the non-shaded bus stops by ridership to create a priority listing. Using the priority list, staff will be able to install 30 additional shade structures per year using capital improvement program funds.

Commissioner Snow asked for clarification as to what dictates if a shelter will be built. Ms. Bresnahan explained that the ridership priority list will dictate when a shelter will be built; staff will go down the line and install 30 shade structures per year.

Chairperson James asked staff if they have looked at different shade structure designs that would provide better shade than the current structures being used. Ms. Bresnahan said that staff is looking for effective shade that would provide improved shade during all times of the day. Mr. Herb Munoz, Public Transit Project Manager, mentioned that there are vertical panels that are being looked at that can be oriented to the direction of the sun.

Commissioner Snow asked what the policy was to provide trash containers at bus stops. Mr. Munoz explained that whenever furniture is placed at a stop, a trash receptacle is also placed. In some existing stops, there is not currently room due to lack of right-of-way. Commissioner Snow asked if there was a specific request, if staff would place a trash receptacle at a stop, and Mr. Munoz explained that is not the current policy.

Chairperson James asked staff about possible solar panels as well as Wi-Fi would be possible on shade structures and at bus stops. Mr. Munoz explained that the majority of new structures have solar panels and LED lighting, but that they are having a problem with theft of the batteries and are working to mitigate the problem. Mr. Munoz also explained that adding solar to all structures may not be possible due to existing shade from trees, etc.

#### 6. Desert Sky Transit Center Update

Deputy Public Transit Director Jesus Sapien introduced Mr. Herb Munoz provided an update on the Desert Sky Transit Center.

Mr. Munoz presented some of the background of the Desert Sky Transit Center, which is currently located in a lease area of the mall parking lot. The transit center is heavily used, and is the busiest around 68,000 monthly boardings. The new transit center and park-and-ride site will be at 79<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Thomas Road on 4 acres of land. The design elements of the new site will be:

- Bus loading and staging spaces
- Covered parking spaces
- Drop off area
- Pedestrian connections to adjacent properties

- Security
- CCTV
- Bike racks and bike lockers
- Solar
- Ticket Vending
- Public art

The current status of the project is:

- Land acquisition finalized
- Design completed
- Plans and permits approved for construction
- Construction contract awarded to Haydon Building Corp
- Protected burrowing owls relocated
- Site secured with temporary fencing
- Site clearing and grubbing completed
- Initial site grading in progress
- Project completion is scheduled for November 2015

Chairperson James asked if staff has looked at using sustainable design elements. Mr. Munoz explained that low-water plants will be used, solar power, low-e glass, shade structures, and LED lighting.

Commissioner Snow asked what increase in ridership percentage staff expected due to the new facility. Mr. Munoz stated that the current transit center is the busiest of all centers, and with the improved amenities, covered parking, and improved safety features staff expects to see an increase in ridership, but that no study has been performed. Director Hyatt also mentioned that new routes have been added to the area, so an increase in ridership is likely, although it takes a while for new routes to build up to full ridership.

#### 7. Comprehensive Phoenix Transit Plan

Director Hyatt informed the Commission that the Comprehensive Phoenix Transit Plan was presented to the City Council at the March 3, 2015 meeting. Citizen Committee on the Future of Phoenix Transportation members Marty Schultz and Andy Federhar presented to the Council, along with Director Hyatt and Deputy City Manager Rick Naimark. Director Hyatt also mentioned that many other committee members were present and at least 30 citizens from the community spoke to the Council. City Council passed the plan with certain modifications.

The Council approved:

- Sales tax reduced from Subcommittee approval of .73 to .70
- Northeast Extension reduced by 1/3 of the miles
- Camelback Rd Phase 2 eliminated
- Additional reductions per staff analysis of public outreach
- Reductions cannot come from street improvements budget or new bus routes to 'complete the grid' in Phoenix

- The Public Transit Department will be made a Special Revenue fund department and \$16 million annually of the General fund will be reallocated to fund other city needs
- A new light rail station will be constructed at 48th St/Washington
- Phoenix will be responsible for utility costs associated with rail construction
- A transit and streets committee will be formed
- The tax will commence on January 1, 2016 - December 31, 2050

Director Hyatt explained how transformative this plan will be for the valley, and will provide quality service for citizens. Director Hyatt went on to explain that the current street replacement cycle is 62 years, and this plan will help ensure a shorter cycle. Also mentioned was the financial return on investment that is seen currently, and that with the new light rail miles could potentially reach \$40 billion.

Commissioner Wiltshire asked staff to make sure that the commissioners receive an electronic copy of the presentation.

Commissioner Hunter asked for clarification on the 62 year street replacement cycle, and if money would be freed up to also repair smaller streets on a shorter cycle or if they would stay at the 62 year replacement cycle. Director Hyatt stated that she believed that the cycle would be reduced down to 30 years from 62 years since funding for streets would be doubled, the Streets Department would then be able to re-prioritize existing funding.

Commissioner Hunter also asked if the circulator hours will also increase to match bus and light rail hours. Director Hyatt said that staff was anticipating making all service hours match.

Commissioner Dalager asked if there was currently a streets committee in place, and Director Hyatt explained that there is not a current committee.

Commissioner Hunter asked if the proposed new street and transit committee would have fiscal oversight, be looking for new funding, and making sure that projects are in the purview of the plan. Director Hyatt agreed that was the intent of creating the group; fiscal oversight, additional funding options, and policy review.

Commissioner Hunter asked about the \$16 million that would be given back to the General Fund if the tax passes and how under Prop 400, and if any of the \$16 million are Prop 400 Funds and how that reconciles if returned. Director Hyatt said that the general fund participation was in the ballot language for Transit 2000, not Prop 400.

Commissioner Wiltshire asked if it is anticipated that tax revenue and participation bonds be utilized. Director Hyatt stated that it is easier on the bus side than on the light rail side. The light rail depends on having the cash flow to build the projects, making it hard to do all at once. The projects are stretched out through 2034 and the oversight committee will look at additional funding that could speed up the timeline. Director Hyatt

mentioned TIFIA loans and Public-Private Partnerships may also be funding options that will need to be looked into.

Commissioner Hunter mentioned that there needs to be a push to evidence of new projects rolled out to the public so they can see progress, but understands it is difficult because a significant amount of the money from the tax needs to go to operations and maintenance, and that a dedicated funding source should be set aside to keep the existing system maintained.

Commissioner Davis asked if the public vote for the plan will be on the August 2015 ballot. Director Hyatt explained that the next step for the plan is to go to the City Council formal meeting on March 18<sup>th</sup> and will have the language which Council will then vote to have on the August 2015 ballot. Commissioner Davis asked what we are doing to get information out to the voters. Director Hyatt informed the commission that the Mayor's Office and Council will put together a campaign committee since City staff cannot participate in the campaign; staff will be available to assist the campaign committee with any information they need and provide public outreach.

Chairperson James stated that he supports the plan, but has a concern that light rail will be going through older areas of the city, and he hopes that this is taken into consideration when plans are created which will look to preserve these diverse areas. Director Hyatt explained that there are existing models in other cities that the City will reference as plans are created. Currently, the South Central light rail plans are already changing to deal with the uniqueness of the area. Commissioner Hunter also stated that there are older neighborhoods which would benefit transit that would assist people coming in and out of the area, such as care givers, etc. Commissioner Hunter mentioned the Friends of Transit conference where there was a presentation by '8-80 programs' that many cities have adopted where infrastructure is in place so that people from the age of 8 to 80 can get around. The website is [www.8-80.org](http://www.8-80.org). This idea should be used in the future to accommodate the local residents and their quality of life.

8. Public Transit Director's Report

Director Hyatt informed the Commission that 80 new buses have been ordered from Gillig, and buses should be received in about one year. These new buses will help in the 5 year replacement plan of the current buses. Director Hyatt also asked Deputy Public Transit Director Melissa Sweinhagen to mention the upcoming small business event. Ms. Sweinhagen informed the group that the Phoenix Business Experience is on March 10<sup>th</sup> at the Phoenix Convention Center to encourage small businesses to do business with the City of Phoenix. Information will be sent out to the Commissioners.

9. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chairperson Wiltshire asked staff to update the Commission on the development plans for Central Station; Director Hyatt agreed to provide an update at the next meeting.

10. Adjournment

Chairperson James asked for a motion to adjourn. Commissioner Cannon set the motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Hunter. The meeting was adjourned at 8:33 a.m.

**CITIZENS TRANSIT COMMISSION REPORT**

---

TO: Maria Hyatt  
Public Transit Director

FROM: Jesus Sapien  
Deputy Public Transit Director

SUBJECT: OCTOBER 2015 PROPOSED BUS SERVICE CHANGES – PUBLIC  
OUTREACH

---

---

This report provides information to the Citizens Transit Commission on proposed bus service changes for October 2015 and the associated public outreach process.

THE ISSUE

The Public Transit Department is focused on improving the efficiency of Phoenix's transit services to best serve passengers' needs. The Department regularly receives passenger input and reviews routes semi-annually to determine if improvements can be made while at the same time offsetting the costs of enhancing transit services. The proposed October 2015 bus service changes are funded through Transit 2000, the dedicated Phoenix transit tax, and Proposition 400, the regional transportation tax. A public outreach process for the proposed changes will be conducted as is customarily done with all service changes.

OTHER INFORMATION

The proposed October 2015 bus service changes and public outreach process are as follows:

Route 19C (19<sup>th</sup> Avenue Connector), Route 19 (19<sup>th</sup> Avenue), and Route 60 (Bethany Home Road)

In January 2013, the 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue Connector (19C) service was implemented to provide a connection between Christown Spectrum and Metrocenter malls along during light rail's Northwest Extension construction project. The service runs from the 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Montebello Transit Center, along 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue to Dunlap Avenue, and continues to the Metrocenter Mall Transit Center. At the same time, Route 19 has been detoured in the light rail construction corridor using 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue between Bethany Home Road and Dunlap Road. Route 60 is detoured from its regular route to avoid the construction

corridor and still provide service to the 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Montebello Avenue Transit Center. During previous public outreach processes, these changes were conveyed as being temporary during light rail construction to continue providing transit connections.

Light rail construction has progressed to the stage where regular bus service can soon return to the Northwest Extension corridor. It is proposed to eliminate the Route 19C and restore Routes 19 and 60 to their original routes.

#### New Desert Sky Transit Center

The construction of the new Desert Sky Transit Center is on schedule and will be located at the southeast corner of 79<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Thomas Road, at the northwest corner of Desert Sky Mall. With the construction completion scheduled for October 2015, Routes 29, 75, 83, MARY, I-10West RAPID, and the Ajo/Gila Bend Rural Connector may see minor schedule adjustments to reflect the new location for the transit center. Relocating these routes to the new facility provides for improved connectivity, larger passenger waiting areas, and utilization of the new center's amenities including public restrooms, bicycle lockers/racks, and covered parking areas.

#### Route 50 (Camelback Road)

At the request of the City of Scottsdale, staff is working on terminating Route 50 at Scottsdale Road and Camelback Road as a result of Scottsdale's plan to implement a trolley to provide service from Scottsdale Road to Scottsdale Community College along Camelback Road. As part of Scottsdale's request, they are proposing to increase and fund the frequency of bus service from 44<sup>th</sup> Street to Scottsdale Road. There will be no cost increase for the City of Phoenix related to the Scottsdale request. The City of Scottsdale and Valley Metro will be conducting public outreach related to this change.

#### Schedule Adjustments and Additional Trips to Numerous Routes

Staff will be making schedule adjustments and adding select trips during the peak service times and at the end of the day to facilitate more effective service. The routes identified for potential adjustments include routes 3, 7, 8, 17, 19, 27, 29, 35, 41, 50, 60, 106, and Grand Avenue Limited.

The Public Transit Department will use the locally adopted public outreach process for the proposed October 2015 bus service changes. In May, staff will solicit public comment on service changes through several public outreach events located near the proposed service change areas in coordination with other regional proposed service changes. Outreach will include on-board bus announcements and multiple opportunities for passengers to provide their feedback on the proposed changes, as well as in-person discussions with passengers at affected areas and notices on the Valley Metro website. In addition, a formal public hearing will be scheduled to collect public input and feedback on the proposed service changes. Advertisements for the public meetings will be placed in local newspapers, information will be posted to the department and regional transit websites, and staff will send media releases and contact local reporters.

After the conclusion of the public outreach process for these proposed service changes, the Public Transit Department will return to the Citizens Transit Commission with a formal recommendation on these proposed bus service changes.

### RECOMMENDATION

This report is provided for information only.

---

## CITIZENS TRANSIT COMMISSION REPORT

---

TO: Maria Hyatt  
Public Transit Director

FROM: Albert Santana  
Light Rail Project Administrator

SUBJECT: WEST PHOENIX/CENTRAL GLENDALE TRANSIT CORRIDOR STUDY  
AND NORTHEAST CORRIDOR FEASIBILITY STUDY

---

---

This report provides the Citizens Transit Commission with an update on the West Phoenix/Central Glendale Transit Corridor Study and the Northeast Corridor Feasibility Study. This report is provided for information and discussion only.

### **WEST PHOENIX/CENTRAL GLENDALE TRANSIT CORRIDOR STUDY**

#### **THE ISSUE**

The Regional Transportation Plan identifies an approximately five-mile east/west high capacity transit corridor between 19th Avenue and downtown Glendale. In March 2013, Valley Metro initiated a study for this corridor to work with the City of Phoenix, the City of Glendale and the community to determine what route and type of transit is best for the corridor.

The current study area is bounded by 19th Avenue to the east, 67th Avenue on the west, Northern Avenue on the north, and Camelback Road on the south. The study area is broad to encompass key transportation corridors and activity centers, such as Grand Canyon University and downtown Glendale.

There are three levels of study analysis. Levels 1 and 2 have been completed, and Level 3 is currently in progress. Each level studies different criteria, looking at fewer route options and transit modes in more detail over time.

The first two levels of analysis identified six route alternatives for evaluation and considered three types of transit: light rail, bus rapid transit and streetcar. After completing the first two levels, several route alternatives were removed from further consideration: Northern Avenue, Bethany Home, and the full Grand Avenue routes (see map A). This determination was based on public input, lower potential for economic development and community impacts. The remaining alternatives would serve higher densities of population, employment, and activity centers. The analysis identified light rail and bus rapid transit as the best options for continued study, while the streetcar transit option has been removed from further consideration.

Level 3 analysis will evaluate the remaining routes (see map A):

- Glendale Avenue

- Camelback Road/43rd Avenue
- Camelback Road/Grand Avenue/51st Avenue

And the remaining types of transit:

- Light rail
- Bus rapid transit

This final stage of analysis includes evaluating ridership potential, detailed right-of-way and traffic impacts and detailed cost estimates. More focused analysis of the Downtown Glendale Analysis Area (see map A) will be included in the Level 3 evaluation.

Community outreach has been conducted throughout the study to collect public input on the proposed routes and types of transit, including 69 different stakeholder outreach activities, as well as ongoing opportunities to provide written input.

### NEXT STEPS

The Level 3 analysis is underway and community input will continue throughout the process with the next round of public meetings beginning this summer. At the conclusion of the study, staff will seek City Council approval of a preferred alternative to proceed into the design and environmental analysis phase.

Operation for this corridor is scheduled for 2026.

## **NORTHEAST CORRIDOR FEASIBILITY STUDY**

### THE ISSUE

The Regional Transportation Plan identifies a Northeast high-capacity transit corridor, connecting the existing light rail system to the Paradise Valley Mall area (see map B). Under the current corridor planning schedule, the Northeast high-capacity transit corridor would open in 2034.

### NEXT STEPS

The planning study will further refine the high-capacity transit options by assessing route alternatives and types of transit to best connect the existing light rail system with the Paradise Valley Mall area.

The study will begin summer 2015.

## Map A – West Phoenix/Central Glendale Level 3 Route Alternatives and Alternatives Removed from Consideration



## Map B – Northeast Transit Corridor Study Area

