

**CITY OF PHOENIX
CITIZENS TRANSIT COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
MARCH 30, 2017**

Public Transit Department
302 N. First Avenue, 7th Floor

Commission Present	Public Present	City Staff Present
Ed Pastor	Steven Wilcox	Ray Dovalina
Patrick Brennan (phone and in person)	David Rutkowski	Maria Hyatt
Sue Glawe	Mark Wavering	Mario Paniagua
Gail Knight	Patrizia Gonella	Joe Bowar
Jennifer Mellor (phone)	Greg Haggerty	Kini Knudson
Roy Miller	Jake Speck	Albert Santana
Rick Naimark	Carrie Cote	Dan Brown
William "Sparky" Smith	Natalie Carrick	Jesus Sapien
		Herb Muñoz
		Victoria Kayiwa
		Megan Neal
		Brenda Yanez
		Jorie Bresnahan
		Carla Khan
		Eileen Yazzie
		Ted Mariscal
		Justin Feek
		Ken Kessler
		Angel Borrego

Commission Absent
David Adame
Bret Aldieri
David Martin
Phil Pangrazio
Mario Trejo Romero
Quinn Whissen

1. Call to Order
Chairperson Pastor called the meeting to order at 5:06 pm. with a quorum present.

2. Approval of the minutes of the Feb. 23, 2017 meeting
Chairperson Pastor asked for a motion to approve the minutes.

Commissioner Miller asked when the five-year plan would be presented to the commission. Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua stated it would be presented after the commission's summer break.

Vice Chair Naimark moved to approve the minutes, seconded by Commissioner Knight. The minutes were approved unanimously.

3. T2050 Financial Update
Chairperson Pastor informed the commission this agenda item was a report only, and opened for questions.

There were no comments.

4. Upcoming T2050 Related Public Meetings
Chairperson Pastor informed the commission this agenda item provides information regarding future public meetings and events related to Transportation Plan 2050 (T2050); and opened for any comments.

Vice Chair Naimark inquired about the April 28 pub crawl. Public Transit Director Maria Hyatt explained the details and noted that the event is a more accurately called a restaurant crawl and was designed to commemorate the new April service changes.

Commissioner Miller expressed concern that the commission may not be receiving notices about meetings pertaining to T2050.

Chairperson Pastor stated the reason for this agenda item is to provide the commission with upcoming public meetings and events. He asked staff if there had been any public meetings since the last commission meeting. Deputy City Manager Paniagua stated there have not been any public meetings regarding T2050.

Commissioner Miller asked if there have been any non-public meetings. Deputy City Manager Paniagua confirmed that there have been, but that the notification is to inform the Commission of public meetings involving T2050.

Quorum was temporarily lost at 5:16 pm and reestablished at 5:18 pm via phone connection with Commissioner Mellor.

5. Project Management Consultant (PMC) Update
Chairperson Pastor informed the commission this agenda item was a report only, and opened for any comments.

There was discussion of the PMC's plan element to include a downtown circulator as an important piece of downtown business and the DASH is in need of improvements. The PMC is working on current needs and staff will request re-evaluating the DASH, downtown circulator.

Commissioner Miller inquired as to the amount that has been spent out of the 5-million-dollar budget for the PMC. Deputy City Manager Paniagua stated about \$250,000 dollars.

6. Public Outreach for October 2017 Service Changes

Chairperson Pastor informed the commission this agenda item was a report only, and opened for any comments.

Vice Chair Naimark expressed his contentment to the new service changes to Happy Valley Road in providing a direct connection to the Happy Valley Town Center.

There was discussion regarding the increase of buses and frequency to Thomas Road. Commission Miller expressed his thoughts that the service changes will not improve congestion on Thomas Road.

7. Shaded Bus Stops

Deputy City Manager Paniagua introduced Public Transit Deputy Director Joe Bowar to present on this item. Mr. Bowar provided a brief review of what was presented at January's CTC meeting on this subject. He mentioned the proposed bus stop shade improvements plan is a key element of "Moving Phoenix Forward" provided through T2050. Mr. Bowar provided additional cost information regarding the bus shade contract for fiscal year FY17/18 of \$1.8 million dollars. He explained the funding breakdown, which includes new bus stops, refurbishment, maintenance, repair, and bus pads. Mr. Bowar went on to explain progress with the ASU partnership.

Commissioner Glawe mentioned there is transient traffic and homesteading at bus stops along 19th Ave. Mr. Bowar explained police has increased patrols and coordination with the Desert Horizon precinct.

There was discussion regarding the new bus stop enhancements contract that has been delayed due to a procurement process protest and appeal and an outcome is forthcoming. The new contract will proceed with the installation of 80 new shelters of the current design from FY 17/18. It is expected to move forward with a new design early in 2018. When asked by Chairperson Pastor what the new shelter cost parameters were, Mr. Bowar indicated they would be within \$9,000 to \$11,000 dollars.

Chairperson Pastor inquired about cost effectiveness of new shelters and noted there are bus stops lacking shelters in the Encanto area. He noted a specific stop on 19th Ave. and Virginia Ave. Transit Superintendent Herb Muñoz stated the location will be reviewed for vertical panels. He mentioned the narrow right-of-way in the Encanto area creates impediments when providing shade structures at bus stops.

Commissioner Brennan requested a matrix prioritizing safety of bus stops adjacent to intersections or high traffic areas. He asked the distance of bus stops for an intersection. Mr. Bowar stated 120 feet.

Commissioner Smith asked to be included in the process with ASU. Mr. Bowar responded affirmatively.

Quorum was temporarily lost at 5:33 pm, as Commissioner Brennan left the call. Quorum was reestablished as Commissioner Brennan then arrived in person to the meeting at 5:37 pm.

8. T2050 Mobility Program Prioritization

Special Projects Administrator Eileen Yazzie presented on the item and recapped recommendations previously presented at February's meeting. The first recommendation was for approval to conduct additional project assessments for major street sidewalk improvements funded by T2050 and also brought forth to the Transportation and Infrastructure (T&I) Subcommittee. She stated the item being presented is the second half of the recommendation for the approval of locations for area mobility assessments focused on pedestrian and bicycle facilities improvements. She noted that the recommendation included three factors requested by the commission to be added to the current eight factors. Ms. Yazzie stated there was little change to the top ten locations discussed at February's meeting. She mentioned the change is to include the top 11 locations versus ten; and recommended moving the 20th ranked location to 11. Ms. Yazzie stated a mobility and accessibility HUD grant opportunity was obtained for the 20th ranked area (boundaries east of I-10 to 9th Street, and the north boundary of I-10 to Jackson Street).

There was discussion regarding cost and the five-year plan of the program. Yazzie stated the cost for each mobility study is estimated to be between \$60,000 to \$125,000 dollars based on the size of the mobility area. The program is included in Street Transportation Capital Improvement Plan (CIP). Staff noted the five-year T2050 implementation plan was provided at a previous meeting and the dollar allocation for the mobility program totals \$23 million dollars (line item number 16).

Commissioner Smith inquired about the cost of the assessment. Ms. Yazzie explained the assessment entailed research, data analysis, work already completed, and an inventory of gaps.

Vice Chair Naimark inquired about a request brought forth by Commissioner Aldieri at February's meeting regarding numbers 21 and 22 on the list. Ms. Yazzie responded that Commissioner Aldieri received his information after the meeting from Assistant Street Transportation Director Kini Knudson.

Vice Chair Naimark motioned the Citizens Transportation Commission recommend Transportation and Infrastructure (T&I) Subcommittee approve the top scoring locations for area mobility assessments focused on pedestrian and

bicycle facilities improvements; seconded by Commissioner Brennan. The motion carried approved unanimously.

9. Call to the Public

Chairperson Pastor called for public comment.

There were no comments.

10. Request for Future Agenda Items

Next agenda items agreed upon by the commission included:

1. Bike lanes in low income areas (April/May)
2. October Services Changes (May)
3. 5-year T2050 plan review (Aug/Sept)
4. Chair/Vice Chair elections (Aug)

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua stated the April meeting could be postponed to May with only one item on the agenda.

Commissioner Milled requested more clarification of the five-year plan and what would be presented. Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua stated a strategic plan is forthcoming, including updates on improvements for the past year and a half, revenues and expenditures, projections, and costs. He mentioned there will be an opportunity to review any possible changes.

Commission Miller mentioned he would like to address the lack of officers with police. He requested an agenda item regarding transferring funds to aid police. Chairperson Pastor informed Commissioner Miller that the Transit Enforcement Unit (TEU) with the Police Department presented at the March meeting. He mentioned TEU would be returning in the future.

Commissioner Miller requested a future vote to transfer funds to aid police. Chairperson Pastor stated the commission will have to wait for the item to be put on the agenda as an action item to vote on.

Commissioner Mellor expressed interest in providing additional assistance to Police and mentioned researching technology that could better aid Police.

11. Adjournment

Chairperson Pastor asked for motion to adjourned the meeting.

Commissioner Smith motioned to adjourn the meeting at 6:31 pm; seconded by Commissioner Glawe.

Mar. 30, 2017