

**CITY OF PHOENIX  
ELECTRIC VEHICLE AD HOC COMMITTEE:  
EDUCATION, OUTREACH AND EQUITY SUBCOMMITTEE**



**Summary Minutes from Friday, January 14, 2022**

Virtual Meeting – Via WebEx

**Ad Hoc Committee Members (Present)**

Councilwoman Ansari  
Clark Miller  
Lisa Perez  
Omar Gonzales  
Vianey Olivarria

**City Staff Present**

Karen Apple, Sustainability  
Mark Hartman, Sustainability  
Michelle Litwin, City Manager's Office  
Karl Kaseoru, ITS  
Aaron Kane, Council District 7 Office  
Albert Crespo, Transit  
Gabriel Navarez, Aviation  
David Benton, City Attorney's Office

Jesus Sapien, Transit  
Joe Bowar, Transit  
Joe Giudice, Public Works  
Karen Peters, City Manager's Office  
Kimberly Brown, Aviation  
Sarah Demory, Aviation  
Scott Coughlin, Parks  
Willa Kaough, Office of the Mayor  
Sandra Hoffman, Planning and Dev.

**1. Call to Order/Roll Call**

Councilwoman Ansari called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. and Karen Apple, the City's EV Program Manager, performed the roll call. Councilwoman Ansari reported that this is the fifth meeting for this subcommittee.

**2. Approval of Minutes – Dec. 10, 2021 Electric Vehicle Ad Hoc Education, Outreach and Equity Subcommittee Meeting**

Councilwoman Ansari requested a motion to adopt the minutes, Committee Member Gonzales called for a first motion and Committee Member Perez called for a second, unanimous pass, motion carried.

**3. News and Announcements**

Councilwoman Ansari introduced Karen Apple to discuss recent news in the EV world.

Ms. Apple reported on recent EV news. The presentation included information on Chrysler concept car called the Airflow, the Federal Fleet Purchase directive from President Biden to be zero emission vehicles by 2035, and a conversion about a Shell London gas station to an EV charging hub.

Committee Member Miller commented that it would be useful to have a session where members brainstorm scenarios about widespread charging of vehicles and what Phoenix might look like in 2050. The conversation would include big differences in how that could look, and big implications for policy and the future of homes and parking garages. Furthermore, Committee Member Miller suggested that it might be worth exploring other aspects of what those scenarios might look like. Likewise, there might be a lot of places currently operating as gas stations that could be converted to EV charging hubs.

Ms. Apple continued to report that 50 utilities formed a group to Coordinate EV Infrastructure efforts.

Mark Hartman, Chief Sustainability Officer, commented that there could be different needs for the long-term—where do we want charging infrastructure versus short term needs. Furthermore, Mr. Hartman commented on the future implications of charging infrastructure and asked how we implement this now in a way that would cause the least disruption to infrastructure transition.

Ms. Apple continued to report that Sony has developed two concept EVs and presented them at the recent Consumer Electronics Show.

Committee Member Miller offered three suggestions for the vehicle evolution: the electrical infrastructure and rise of software; technology and electronic companies view of an EV world; and lastly, the opportunities as cars become more autonomous—based on the time people will spend in their cars and the ability to capture that time in advertising, entertainment and other revenue streams.

Ms. Apple concluded to report that GM is expanding their technology platforms beyond their core portfolio and automotive applications.

#### **4. Deliverables Update & Draft Recommendations for February 2022**

Councilwoman Ansari commented that she spoke with Mayor Gallego this week and wanted to give the EV Ad Hoc Committee more of a profile on work that is being done. Furthermore, Councilwoman Ansari suggested a written update in the general packet as well as a policy meeting, and to have a discussion around the EV Roadmap in March. Councilwoman Ansari suggested having the final roadmap ready for a vote by council in June 2022.

Committee Member Perez agreed that it would be good to have it in the general packet to have a more robust conversation. Committee Member Perez asked who receives the general packet information. Furthermore, there should be an effort to get the information out to a broader audience, perhaps social avenues to make sure more eyes are on it before the policy meeting.

Deputy City Manager Peters commented, in addition to the packet, that when there is a policy item, there is an additional memo that goes into that packet. Additionally, in the February report there will be a progress report, and the March policy item will be more focused on recommendations.

Councilwoman Ansari introduced Mark Hartman, Chief Sustainability Officer, to discuss the deliverables for this subcommittee.

Mr. Hartman provided an interim update from the EV Ad Hoc Committee items, including the summary of activity, approach, and preliminary recommendations for items needing action and potential funding starting next fiscal year.

Mr. Hartman stated that a lot of departments are asking how free EV charging for employees would work, what the infrastructure and policy would look like, and asked for thoughts.

Committee Member Perez provided support for employee charging infrastructure, lead by example, employees should have access to charging, and it is an added benefit.

Committee Member Miller added that this is an equity-oriented policy. Furthermore, as electrification proceeds, a higher number of employees will have EVs. Benefits will skew towards lower paid staff and will help create access to charging. Likewise, it is a good option for those who don't have access to at home charging and stated that there are equity benefits.

Mr. Hartman stated that the cost of electricity is relatively nominal, but it would be good to have a ballpark estimate for the annual cost.

Committee Member Miller commented that it would be worth monitoring and encouraging people to charge their daily commutes.

Mr. Hartman agreed that workplace charging should encourage daytime charging to use the spare capacity on the grid.

Mr. Hartman asked about Justice40 goals and ARPA funding: are they something we want to bring before council in the early days as one of the principles of this Ad Hoc or wait for the full EV Roadmap.

Committee Member Gonzales strongly supported the content being upfront and providing it to council as early as possible to highlight the value.

Councilwoman Ansari added support for updating language to be stronger. She suggested that there needs to be more background context and should make sure to mention this.

Mr. Hartman provided some clarification around language.

Conversation and edits around language continued.

Mr. Hartman asked about funding prioritization and asked for feedback.

Committee Member Perez stated that this will come down to staffing and ability to do this proactively.

Committee Member Olivarria suggested putting the money where it makes sense and on what is needed.

Conversation around language and edits continued.

Mr. Hartman asked about the edits around an EV program manager, potentially a staff, and how to partner with the new City Equity Office. Mr. Hartman asked if the Committee wanted to bring this forward now due to its budget implications.

Councilwoman Ansari commented on adding it to the written general packet for February.

Mr. Hartman stated that he was not sure if it will be in the trial budget, and if the Ad Hoc Committee wanted to include this.

Deputy City Manager Peters stated that the general info packet should be more broad and high level versus getting into details of each recommendation. Furthermore, this one should be discussed in the March presentation as proposed ideas.

Councilwoman Ansari stated that the Committee should be proposing for more than one position, that the work might be too much for one person. Additionally, Councilwoman Ansari suggested asking for more support, highlighting what the

subcommittees are trying to achieve, what it will take to get that done, and what capacity it looks like on the city side.

Committee Member Olivarria supported the idea of a whole team.

Committee Member Perez suggested that there might be teams and that other departments could assist, but not sure if that information is available.

Councilwoman Ansari supported the idea to explore a hybrid opportunity/model, where staff members split their time. Furthermore, supported working with different departments to break down silos.

Deputy City Manager Peters supported the idea, highlighting Public Works responsibility to secure vehicles citywide, there are opportunities for this and might be the most effective and efficient. Deputy City Manager Peters stated there could be a working group that is led by the Office of Sustainability and EV Manager but have employees from other departments contributing.

Councilwoman Ansari suggested housing EV employees in other departments.

Deputy City Manager Peters stated that city staff need to identify who is doing what to see if there are already individuals working in/on this.

Councilwoman Ansari suggested that there may be a transit focused equity and inclusion person that is also on the EV team (hypothetical idea).

Mr. Hartman asked if there should be a base amount of funding to meet minimum EV needs.

Committee Member Miller suggested an experiment—to explore how much it would cost to add level one chargers to see whether the cost is more inclusive. Committee Member Miller stated at ASU there are many more EVs than EV charging spots, and maybe low-cost charging infrastructure could add value for now.

Edits were made to language around base funding.

Committee Member Gonzales suggested edits that were made to the deliverables document.

Mr. Hartman asked about the consultant study and asked for input.

Committee Member Perez added when identifying infrastructure for public fleet and EV charging at facilities, why not use internal assets to identify.

Committee Member Perez suggested highlighting the lack of capacity for city staff and the need for an outside consultation.

Committee Member Miler asked if this could be done by the EV team that is in the recommendation.

Mr. Hartman stated that the city has some engineers that understand the elements, however they might not be the expert on EV infrastructure. Furthermore, this does need external guidance that can be provided to city employees working in this field.

Deputy City Manager Peters suggested language edits.

Mr. Hartman discussed the recommendation for consumer research/surveys/workshops as a prerequisite to education and awareness campaigns.

Committee Member Perez commented this is important, the committee needs to hear from people, and get the consumer a part of this. Furthermore, this is not going to be one size fits all; we need to hear directly from the community not us making assumptions about it.

Councilwoman Ansari and Committee Member Miller suggested edits to language.

Committee Member Miller commented it would be good to have insights from experts as to what the long term looks like.

Mr. Hartman asked about the request for a robust education and outreach campaign and is this needed.

Committee Member Perez stated this is critically important; the average person has no idea about this content.

Committee Member Miller stated it is important to get out there with good information and suggested language edits. Likewise, a conversation with communities and businesses to get a feel for what they are thinking and collaboratively thinking what would benefit Phoenix.

Mr. Hartman asked if there were any other recommendations that should be added to the document for the early recommendations to council and welcomed the members to send additional items to him and Ms. Apple.

Committee Member Perez suggested clarification on the education and outreach.

Discussion of the document occurred, and clarification of the process was made.

Committee Member Perez reminded the subcommittee that EV charging is being viewed as an amenity not as required infrastructure, and it will cost a lot to update infrastructure later. Furthermore, this should be required from planners/developers from the moment they submit their applications.

Discussion around the document and its content occurred, edits were made to the document.

Councilwoman Ansari stated that the February general packet is higher level information. Suggesting that the information should include the top line priorities from each subcommittee, this document might be better for the March draft roadmap.

Committee Member Perez suggested that there is written out words and descriptions since a lot of people don't know a lot of these terms.

Councilwoman Ansari suggested a glossary of terms and clarified that the draft EV Roadmap in April/March will include discussion about the roadmap at policy meeting with the final EV Roadmap due June 2022.

## **5. EV Needs Assessment Survey, Outreach and Community Input Program Development**

Mr. Hartman asked for suggestions on conducting community outreach, including, who should be included, key items recommended for workshops, who should we partner with, key things the subcommittee wants to do within the outreach and outline how we might bring in as many people as possible to provide input.

Suggestions were included to the document. Suggestions included ones from Councilwoman Ansari to set metrics on how much public input is needed and if there will be a set number. Committee Member Perez included recommendations to include webinars and ride and drive event, as well as including information from the Climate Action Plan. Committee Member Miller suggested small focus groups in coordination with other organizations like CHISPA and the Hispanic Chamber.

Mr. Hartman asked are there any new ideas how to engage disadvantaged communities as this has often been difficult.

Councilwoman Ansari suggested that council offices provide opportunities for district specific listening sessions.

**6. Public Comment**

Councilwoman Ansari asked for public comment. No public comment.

**7. Future Agenda Items**

Councilwoman Ansari asked for future Agenda items. No items suggested.

**8. Adjournment**

Councilwoman Ansari adjourned the meeting at 11:40am. Next meeting is scheduled for Friday February 11, 2022 at 10:00am.