

**CITY OF PHOENIX
ELECTRIC VEHICLE AD HOC COMMITTEE:
EDUCATION, OUTREACH AND EQUITY SUBCOMMITTEE**



Summary Minutes from Friday, November 12, 2021

Virtual Meeting – Via WebEx

Ad Hoc Committee Members (Present)

Councilwoman Ansari
Clark Miller
Lisa Perez
Vianey Olivarria

Committee Members (Absent)

Omar Gonzales

City Staff Present

Karen Apple, Sustainability
Mark Hartman, Sustainability
Karen Peters, City Manager's Office
Michelle Litwin, City Manager's Office

Aaron Kane, Council District 7 Office
Karl Kaseoru, ITS
David Benton, City Attorney Office

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Councilwoman Ansari called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. and Karen Apple, EV Program Manger performed the roll call. Councilwoman Ansari reported that this is the third meeting for this subcommittee. The agenda included working on deliverables, identifying a schedule and priorities to be presented to City Council in January 2022 and a presentation by City and County of Denver.

2. Approval of Minutes – Sept. 10, 2021 Electric Vehicle Ad Hoc – Education, Outreach and Equity Subcommittee Meeting

Councilwoman Ansari requested a motion, Committee Member Perez called for a first motion with changes, and Committee Member Miller called for a second, unanimous pass, motion carried.

3. News and Announcements

Councilwoman Ansari introduced Ms. Apple to present on news and events in the EV world.

Ms. Apple reported that the US House passed infrastructure package and would be voting on \$1.75-trillion Build Back Better Act. Additionally, the US Department of Energy, Office of Electricity has expanded its Energy Zones Mapping tool to include and equity component. B2U Storage Solutions has converted approximately 160 used Leaf battery packs into energy storage, Toyota revealed its first all battery electric vehicle (BEV), Ford demonstrated applications for its first electric crate motor, National Automobile Dealers Association (NADA) formed a partnership with Chargeway to deploy EV beacons, announced that the EV Ad Hoc SharePoint page has moved and is now located at www.phoenix.gov/sustainability/electric-

[vehicles/ad-hoc-committee](#), and provided information on the SRP Rebate EV charger ribbon cutting event.

Committee Member Miller commented that there are 100M internal combustion engine vehicles around the country with 4-5M in the valley and recommended thinking about the business opportunity where businesses can convert these to EV. Committee Member Miller stated that with the flow of vehicles into Phoenix and back out to the country that there is an opportunity to create bottom-up opportunities for small businesses forming in Phoenix working on converting vehicles which will be cheaper, and asked how do we incubate that?

Councilwoman Ansari reported on some notable experiences from COP26 and commented on City of Phoenix having a large source of emissions compared to worldwide numbers and to ensure that EVs are affordable and assessable as possible and look at the equity lenses. Additionally, Councilwoman Ansari recommended requesting a presentation on Justice40, perhaps from someone in the Federal government to better understand the framework and find ways to incorporate it.

4. Overview of Environmental Justice and Equity Screenings Tools

Mark Hartman, Chief Sustainability Officer highlighted BlueLA which is a carshare service in LA, which may be a viable solution in vulnerable communities, providing an affordable option in these communities. Mr. Hartman stated that this is a societal change/shift in thinking about how we use vehicles.

Ms. Apple presented on the EPA – EJScreen Tool which included information on the tool. The tool includes information on but not limited to demographics, energy burden, and population income. Additionally, Ms. Apple presented on Department of Energy's (DOE) – Energy Zones Mapping Tool, which included information on but not limited to density of existing EVSE stations, percent minority, population density, and energy burden.

5. Deliverables – Example Template Overview

Mr. Hartman led the discussion on the deliverables template and introduced Committee Member Miller to present on the template.

Committee Member Miller presented on the Education and Outreach deliverables template, which included questions and metrics that needed updating. Committee Member Miller recommended prioritizing the questions as a framework, to make it easier to understand and how to programs and initiatives can tie into it. Additionally, Committee Member Miller discussed efforts to enhance equity in EV programs including outcomes, empowerment, transition management, and agreement on core principles.

Committee Member Miller presented on distributional outcomes, inclusive process, and recognition.

Mr. Hartman asked about Greenlining where you prioritize previously redlined communities.

Committee Member Miller stated that there are programs that address old infrastructure that destroyed communities. Additionally, the Subcommittee needed to be thinking about what the money needs to be spent on and how to maximize impact while addressing past issues.

Committee Member Miller recommended listening to the community to identify historical legacies that matter most to those communities then create metrics that are appropriate. Additionally, he suggested to invest in ways that enhance mobility in those communities.

Committee Member Miller presented on the size and scale on existing programs, incentives, and rebates. The presentation included information on acknowledging potential problems getting incentives to low-income areas, thinking creatively on how to address that area, and what it means to match the size and scale of the program to the need and benefits Phoenix will receive. Additionally, Committee Member Miller addressed assessment of co-benefits, reduction, and to develop strategies. Furthermore, he commented on the affordability for each group in terms of total mobility cost/burden, how to make EV more affordable, and how to make EV equitable for these groups.

Mr. Hartman asked if the subcommittee should prioritize actions in communities where car ownership is more difficult by highlighting other mobility options for those who do not have disposable income.

Committee Member Miller recommended car sharing or other options that address those issues. Additionally, he recommended enabling low-cost car ownership opportunities while also recommending other motility options.

Committee Member Miller continued by discussing how the city can ensure low-income workers have comparable opportunities to benefit from EVs as well as working with employers to identify strategies to enhance mobility for those employees. He suggested there could be an equity enhancing opportunity to create opportunities where business offer car share options/opportunities. Committee Member Miller asked for recommendations from what the city currently offers as incentives.

Committee Member Miller provided December and January actions which included the framework, programs for individuals, programs for business partners, and program size and scale.

Mr. Hartman stated that this is new and asked what does this program look like. Additionally, Mr. Hartman asked what will be done in year one and two and how to

ramp up, how to plan for a couple years? What can be done now? What should be a priority?

Committee Member Perez stated that employers could offer charging and what does that mean? Ms. Perez inquired as to how the city could make this possible. She commented that communities and the city need to agree on these actions. Recommended an EV 101 to create more awareness. Additionally, she requested finding out where the highest number of EVs are registered within the city? She offered to partner with other subcommittee members to create actionable outputs.

Committee Member Miller stated that he would be working to create clarity in the framework and to drill it down to current action items and future action items. Additionally, he stated that the most ambitious goal being 100% EV car sales by 2035.

Mr. Hartman said that it is about creating practical items and timelines for those action items. What are the items that set the stage for now but lead way to the future.

Committee Member Miller stated that the big news is HERTZ buying 100,000 Tesla's. He suggested that the committee talk to HERTZ and see where those vehicles will go when those come off contract? He also suggested to review if there is an opportunity to partner with them and grow the used EV market and what would that partnership look like? He commented about what the subcommittee is going to want to achieve in 5+ years and who can we work with now to get ahead of the game?

Mr. Hartman agreed it would be good to create that timeline of what can be done now and what steps to get to year 5+ goals.

Committee Member Olivarria stated that decision making power should be shared with the community. Additionally, she suggested to include the public transportation aspect into the framework, and that this would be visible in systemic change.

Mr. Hartman provided an example of how the last mile is primarily EV bikes or other forms of transportation that are cost effective and assessable and the possibility of providing those to neighborhoods. Mr. Hartman highlighted the Choice Neighborhoods 1\$ opportunity with grid bike, and stated that the committee should encourage access to mass transit.

Committee Member Miller commented on a suggestion to deploy small-scale autonomous shuttles like Tempe shuttle providing small circulators between neighborhoods and public transit, especially with the automated vehicle market is being explored in Phoenix.

Mr. Harman recommended more incubation time to think about the framework and create the practical action items and timeline and what information is needed to complete that.

Committee Member Miller stated that the DOE EV Program is struggling to understand what equity means for them and Justice40. Committee Member Miller suggested asking them if there is an opportunity to invest in the city and the cities exploration into EV equity and would it create more capacity.

6. City and County of Denver – EV, Equity, Education and Awareness Programs Overview

Mr. Hartman introduced Mike Salisbury, Transportation Energy Lead for the City and County of Denver.

Mr. Salisbury provided an overview of EV Programs at Denver, highlighting education, outreach, and equity. The presentation included information on the Climate Action Fund and how that impacts their programs and work.

Mr. Hartman asked what the vote passed by for the resident-led and City Council-supported ballot initiative for climate action protection.

Mr. Salisbury stated that it was 65% for the ballot.

Mr. Salisbury presented on Pass Gas, a drive electric campaign.

Mr. Hartman asked if they conducted a focus group and how they came up with the name Pass Gas.

Mr. Salisbury stated that they worked with small groups and completed surveys. The focus group wanted something new and different than the status quo.

Mr. Salisbury presented on electrifying carshare in under resources neighborhoods which included information on the \$300,000 funded by CARES Act, EV charging stations, outreach, discounts, and projects. Additionally, he discussed the Never Equity Index which provided a foundation for where they would prioritize their work and to ensure they provided services to those most in need.

Mr. Salisbury presented on neighborhood carshare event; however, a lot of community members did not know what a carshare program included or how to use it. They completed outreach and got the word out and created partnerships with community-based organizations to disseminate the information on carshare. Additionally, Mr. Salisbury presented on other community events that were focused on underserved communities especially those affected by the lack of transportation opportunities during Covid-19. Stated that they connected with those trusted community organizations to make the program successful and to obtain appropriate information.

Mr. Salisbury provided information on a neighborhood-based approach to equitable E-Mobility, including talking to neighborhood leaders and members to understand what the problems were and what solutions they could provide as a city to address those mobility issues. The city started an RFP process to encourage community-based organizations to assist with EV options. Additionally, the City recently launched an electrified micro-transit which is on-call and free to get people to larger transportation hubs which provided access to public transportation to create access to jobs, schools, and business.

Councilwoman Ansari thanked Mr. Salisbury for the presentation and asked for questions.

Committee Member Perez asked if they started out with an education template.

Mr. Salisbury stated that they went to the communities and local organizations to learn from them where the need is. He stated that purchasing EVs was not on their radar because they are not even considering purchasing a vehicle at all. He recommended being flexible since there is not a one size fits all template.

Councilwoman Ansari stated that this task is vast and how frequently they updated the roadmap, and did they have a plan in place?

Mr. Salisbury said that updating the plan has unfortunately not been a priority. However, he stated that they used public feedback to understand what the community thinks should be prioritized.

Councilwoman Ansari asked what capacity did they have on the city staff side to implement?

Mr. Salisbury stated that they had an office of about 20 people working on various components.

Councilwoman Ansari asked if the climate action protection fund grew that office?

Mr. Salisbury said that they've grown a lot and are still creating positions.

Ms. Apple asked how do we ensure the incentives get to the right people and how has Denver ensured that?

Mr. Salisbury commented that they are working on developing an incentive for electric bikes where residents will receive a purchase rebate. He suggested they are currently considering creating a tiered incentive; however, they want to complete a large, targeted outreach. He stated that they are starting to complete outreach to local organizations who they can support with funding to do the local outreach and (e-bike libraries) how to create recourses before the provide the incentive.

Ms. Apple asked how the established the Equity Map and what criteria was used.

Mr. Salisbury commented that they had over 15 criteria to develop the map including, income levels, where is there great provision of transit and biking infrastructure, where are there already EV options, where is traffic safety a problems. Additionally, they reviewed what areas have difficulty accessing schools and businesses.

Committee Member Miller was excited to see the diversified electrification strategies and the different kind of tools used to ensure equitability. He commented that it will be helpful to establish the committee's framework and plan. Committee Member Miller stated that Philadelphia had to set up Philadelphia Energy Authority to hold long-term solar contracts and staffed it with sustainability people who got creative and are now working on a public – private opportunities to create upgrades for low-income residents' transition to EV. Additionally, Committee Member Miller asked if Denver has thought about creating a separate entity that could act in innovative ways to support the effort?

Mr. Salisbury stated that the Climate Protect Fund allowed Denver to create those innovative opportunities and provided the flexibility to fund a \$25M contract for community solar.

Committee Member Olivarria asked what the timeline was, how long is community outreach versus activating the programs, and what was the decision-making process?

Mr. Salisbury stated that it took approximately eight months to complete community outreach. They used that experience to learn and readjust their plan moving forward.

7. Public Comment

Councilwoman Ansari asked for public comment. No public comment.

8. Future Agenda Items

Committee Member Miller asked for a brief overview of city business partnership strategies what are some of the rules and practices that the city uses effectively for encouraging business to take actions. Asked what the committee is attempting to get business to do and for examples on requests the city has made to business to align their goals.

Mr. Hartman provided an example of a small business program for sustainable businesses which offers free energy audits and showcase their business. Mr. Hartman provided next steps, including conversations with each subcommittee discussing how to divide up actions and what are the short- and long-term goals. Mr. Hartman recommended having subcommittee members reach out individually, and state if they need a partner. Additionally, he suggested pulling things from each

subcommittee for the December meeting to have a more cohesive plan and next steps.

9. Adjournment

Councilwoman Ansari adjourned the meeting at Meeting adjourned at 11:52am. Next meeting is Friday December 10, 2021.