

**CITY OF PHOENIX
ELECTRIC VEHICLE AD HOC COMMITTEE:
EDUCATION, OUTREACH AND EQUITY SUBCOMMITTEE**



Summary Minutes from Friday, December 10, 2021

Virtual Meeting – Via WebEx

Ad Hoc Committee Members (Present)

Councilwoman Ansari
Clark Miller
Lisa Perez
Omar Gonzales
Tim Sprague

Committee Members (Absent)

Vianey Olivarria

City Staff Present

Karen Apple, Sustainability
Mark Hartman, Sustainability
Michelle Litwin, City Manager's Office
Albert Crespo, Transit
David Uriarte, ITS
Jesus Sapien, Transit
Joe Bower, Transit

John Chan, PCC
Keith Carbajal, PWD
Kimberly Brown, Aviation
Sandra Hoffman, Planning and Dev.
Scott Coughlin, PRD
David Benton, City Attorney's
Aaron Kane, Council District 7 Office

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Councilwoman Ansari called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. and Karen Apple, the City's EV Program Manager performed the roll call. Councilwoman Ansari reported that this is the fourth meeting for this subcommittee.

2. Approval of Minutes – Nov. 12, 2021 Electric Vehicle Ad Hoc – Education, Outreach and Equity Subcommittee Meeting

Councilwoman Ansari requested a motion to adopt the minutes, Committee Member Gonzales called for a first motion and Committee Member Miller called for a second, unanimous pass, motion carried.

3. News and Announcements

Councilwoman Ansari introduced Karen Apple, EV Program Manager, to discuss recent news in the EV world.

Ms. Apple reported on recent EV news, the presentation included information on the new Tesla Cyberquad and the government of Spain issued a proposal of EVSE installation order.

Ms. Apple asked for comments

Committee Member Miller asked if this is something that would be available early in the transition. Additionally, stated that this could mean fewer gas stations, with less economic ability to handle regulations. Committee Member Miller suggested making this transition happen early. Likewise, why would you install these at gas stations unless they are along highways for people making long distance trips.

Committee Member Perez mentioned that there is a rest stop in Ohio along the highways that had a large charging area.

Aaron Kane, Director of Outreach and Engagement, Council District 7 Office, commented that this might be a part of the statewide plan.

Committee Member Perez commented that the phasing out of gas/older vehicles is going to be slower than people think.

Mark Hartman, Chief Sustainability Officer, stated that while highways are outside of our mandate, Electrify America is looking to implement an EV Fast Charge (EVFC) or charging facilities every 50 miles along the federal highway network. Mr. Hartman continued and asked what we need internally, leaving state and federal agencies to work on highways.

Committee Member Gonzales asked if the government of Spain was providing subsidy to the gas stations, and who would be responsible for installation and paying for it.

Ms. Apple stated that it was not in the article, just that it was a proposal. However, Ms. Apple commented that she would assume they will provide incentives.

Committee Member Gonzales commented that owners would not be able to justify this in the beginning, that it would futureproof their business. However, it would be convenient to see chargers at these locations since people already know where their local gas stations are.

Ms. Apple continued to present on the Liquid Phase Change, Cooled Cable Development, this could up the charging speeds at our locations. Additionally, there was a global average battery price decrease by 6% between 2020-2021, this has a huge impact on the purchase price of the vehicles. Ms. Apple reported that Volkswagen is rumored to be building an E-Convertible.

Councilwoman Ansari asked if there was a date for the convertible.

Ms. Apple stated that there was no date at this time, just rumored to be in building process.

Ms. Apple announced that the Salt River Project is putting on an Electrification Activator Webinar and provided information on the date and time, as well as where to find the information on the EV Ad Hoc page and offered to send the link as well.

Mr. Kane stated that there was a national polling in support of EV, and the American Lung Association AZ showed support for public fleet at 67%, support for investment at 66%, and support for consumer incentives for purchasing at 66%. Additionally, he stated that there was equal support across Democratic, Republican, and Independent parties.

4. Timeline Overview

Councilwoman Ansari discussed the Ad Hoc Committee timeline, including the recommendation for a draft roadmap by February allowing time for Spanish translation, public input, draft budget items that could be pushed in the upcoming budget cycle, with the goal of a delivering a roadmap to city council by June 2022. Councilwoman Ansari also highlighted the variety of stakeholder groups and opportunities, commenting that her office had a meeting with the Homebuilders and intend on having follow-up meetings. Furthermore, Councilwoman Ansari announced that they held a roundtable earlier in the week with Valley Partnership members, including a variety of commercial and industrial property owners. Councilwoman Ansari reported that she will continue to engage these groups and asked the committee for additional pieces. Furthermore, her office will tentatively follow up with the Homebuilders group late January, as well as follow up the commercial and industrial groups. Councilwoman Ansari is aiming to meet with a stakeholder group of valley employers in February, and potential public workshops. Councilwoman Ansari commented that she aims to hold as many listening sessions as possible.

Committee Member Perez asked who is attending the stakeholder and roundtable meetings and asked if committee members can attend. Committee Member Perez reported on information gained from participating as a member of the Village Planning Committee (VPCs) and planning commission that builders are amenable to EV installation but are including it as an amenity not infrastructure. Committee Member Perez asked what conversations are happening at Valley Partnership to keep necessary groups in sync.

Councilwoman Ansari and Mark Hartman clarified that committee members can attend.

Councilwoman Ansari commented that it is important for members to attend and there should be a series of workshops with VPCs. Councilwoman Ansari asked if this should be a public input session or stakeholder meeting.

Committee Member Perez asked if builders choose not to include EV charging will the city mandate this requirement at a later date?

Committee Member Miller stated that there is a middle ground between installing chargers now and doing nothing, and that is putting in conduit for the chargers now so that it is an easy upgrade later rather than making it something that is difficult. Additionally, Committee Member Miller stated that it will less costly than putting in chargers immediately when they might not be needed but will make properties ready for chargers when the time comes. Committee Member Miller stated that this is something builders should be thinking about and stated that if the city is successful in making this transition it will only make this area more competitive. Furthermore, Committee Member Miller stated that ASU students have

expressed excitement in EV and recommended holding a public workshop at ASU campuses. Likewise, there should be conversations in January/February with the lower income parts of the city to ensure appropriate input on equity questions. For example, asking these communities what would be valuable to them.

Committee Member Gonzales suggested that different workshops spread out geographically to ensure we are capturing the various communities and stakeholders within those regions.

Committee Member Perez stated that while the VPCs are great, they do not have big attendance numbers. This topic needs to be a proper public event/meeting and cannot be dumped on a VPC meeting.

Councilwoman Ansari agreed that there should be a regional approach and will flush out more opportunities for public meetings and outreach.

5. Deliverables – Update

Councilwoman Ansari introduced Mark Hartman, Chief Sustainability Officer to provide an overview of the deliverables thus far.

Mr. Hartman stated that as we research EV equity that there is a lot of rhetoric but not a lot of practical actions are presented on equity solutions. Mr. Hartman asked, are low-income electric scooter subsidies an equity solution?

Committee Member Miller asked if this would include subsidies for purchase.

Mr. Hartman said that the city would need to understand the demographics of scooter riders, and if they would be beneficial to disadvantaged communities.

Committee Member Miller commented that it would be hard to know without talking to people. Furthermore, stated that he assumed that the demographics would most likely be younger. It would be hard to do grocery shopping and other tasks with this mode of transportation. Might be able to address last mile problems though. Committee Member Miller stated that there is a range of technology available in this space to address the last mile issues, but is worried that Phoenix is not geographically set up to support non vehicular modes of transportation.

Committee Member Gonzales asked for an example of a scooter program, if there was any data on who is using scooters and in what communities.

Mr. Hartman stated that there has been research and data around this, but there is not scooter information on the Greater Phoenix area.

Committee Member Gonzales recommended using micro mobility ecosystem, wherein operators geofence areas to prevent certain types of riding. Additionally, placing scooters

across the city equitably. Committee Member Gonzales highlighted that other cities tie subsidies to SNAP benefits or utility bills, aligning with state and federal programs.

Mr. Hartman asked the question, what would make a low-income electric car share program equitable.

Committee Member Miller stated that the placement of the cars would have to be targeted to make it equitable. However, insurance companies might redline where you can or cannot put them. There needs to be data to support placement.

Committee Member Perez suggested that this is a multipronged approach, that one size does not fit all. Furthermore, safety issues will be a large issue in various areas and will need to address seamless transportation as a part of the equation.

Mr. Hartman stated that e-mobility solutions may be the avenue to creating connectivity. Furthermore, discussion with Valley Metro and transit to understand how to add value to the transportation system would be good.

Mr. Hartman concluded with the question, if you had \$5M what would an EV Equity program look like?

Committee Member Perez suggested creating a pass that would work for everything. A universal pass that would include all the various types of public transportation.

Councilwoman Ansari asked if it would be a good idea to take \$5M and focus on one area like Maryvale and completely help that one area that has been historically left behind and include all these components, versus spreading that money across the entire city.

Committee Member Gonzales recommended point of purchase incentives, like putting cash on the hood. Furthermore, he recommended guaranteed universal basic income to provide communities with incentives to transition their vehicle to EV. Committee Member Gonzales likewise suggested that the committee create community grant programs where the community wants to see this money spent.

Conversation around an EV subsidy pilot was discussed.

Councilwoman Ansari mentioned the January 11, 2022 work study around ARPA and suggested that it is a good opportunity for this group to address where the funds would be spent and asked for ideas.

Committee Member Miller asked if there was any thought about assisting schools with purchasing EV school buses that could potentially be used off hours for small neighborhood circular routes.

Mr. Harman stated that there would be federal dollars for EV school busses in the

infrastructure bill and that there may be partnership opportunities.

Mr. Hartman introduced Committee Member Perez to present information on the Education and Outreach deliverables and asked for input from members on what they would like to see added or are they on the right track.

Committee Member Perez covered an overview of the deliverables. Committee Member Perez stated that this is a lot of work to implement this program, and that there is a lack of awareness in this area. She restated that we have to address this as infrastructure not as an amenity, additionally recommended thinking outside the box to address equity components. Committee Member Perez continued to report on the deliverables and recommended adding information in Spanish and English.

Furthermore, Committee Member Perez stated that the city has a responsibility to market to their constituents and ask if the committee members can get information on where the sales of EVs have been? Additionally, she asked if there is there a way to get that data from ADOT?

Mr. Hartman stated that there have been requests made for that data, but that the dealers have been hesitant to share it.

Committee Member Perez continued to report on the strategies and commented that she was concerned with the sunset date and leaving this to staff. Committee Member Perez asked how many staff will be involved and suggested that real time data is needed to make decisions to build strategies. She continued to state that data on time charging is important and asked if the city should provide free charging to employees. Committee Member Perez suggested that assessments need to happen early to drive actions.

Councilwoman Ansari supported the idea of a committee EV full time employee (FTE) and small team and suggested that people show their support for staff at public budget hearings.

Councilwoman Ansari recommended that more time be spent considering the plan for the committee and its sunset date. Additionally, she asked if there will be annual reviews that will be updated to ensure that goals are being tracked and met.

Mr. Hartman stated that by June 2022, the subcommittees have proposed recommendations for future public input as committee or other means.

Committee Member Miller suggested tailoring initiatives, education and outreach depending on the area.

Mr. Hartman asked how we want to gather views and what are the opportunities to do that and what are all the sectors. For example, small business, disadvantaged communities, and shift workers and how do we understand their needs and perspectives. Additionally, Mr. Hartman suggested that there needs to be platforms for lateral thinking conversations to open the dialog to everyone to better understand what the appropriate solutions are. Mr. Hartman asked what are things that need to be done early in 2022.

Committee Member Perez asked when this will be sent to council and what are the next steps.

Councilwoman Ansari suggested that the draft EV Roadmap and a few recommendations that we should push forward this year in the budget. Furthermore, the roadmap and recommendations do not need to be complete at this point. Councilwoman Ansari highlighted that there are other buckets of funding that might be available for use. By June 2022, City Council will vote on the final roadmap. Councilwoman Ansari highlighted the podcast Outrage and Optimism and an episode that highlighted a partnership between the state and a city in Brazil that optimized transportation passes and created one universal option thus increasing ridership.

Mr. Hartman suggested getting data from the Transit Department's Last Mile program with Lyft.

Committee Member Miller stated that he would be in support of funding for an FTE to complete education and outreach. Furthermore, suggested that this person would talk to other cities to find out what they have don to tackle low-income transportation issues. Furthermore, this FTE could solicit information to have a catalog of ideas to explore and would hopefully build trust in these communities and address the equity component.

Mr. Hartman stated that there is an equity office being created within the City of Phoenix and stated that there should be potential support.

Councilwoman Ansari said that there should be close collaboration between these offices.

Mr. Hartman asked for some ideas for the goals in the equity deliverables.

Committee Members discussed various topics around goals. Committee Member Miller suggested leveraging electric options to improve disadvantaged communities. Furthermore, he suggested setting a larger goal for the EV roadmap of doing things that provide ancillary solutions for these communities.

Committee Member Gonzales suggested focusing on medium (MD) and heavy-duty (HD) vehicles, and pilots that target commercial corridors.

Mr. Kane commented that at the roundtable with Valley Partnership industrial stakeholders foresee some of the heavy-duty delivery trucks converting faster than personal vehicles

because it is easier for companies than individuals. Mr. Kane asked if Omar and other industry people are seeing this as well.

Committee Member Gonzales stated that the industry for personal EVs is far ahead in terms of manufacturing those vehicles thanks to federal support. Regarding MD and HD and large fleets like Amazon and Walmart have the resources to do so and want to reach their sustainability goals. There is interest from larger companies the issue is infrastructure, and they will want charging to be private.

Committee Member Perez asked how you have conversations with the large trucking companies to see when or where they are going with their sustainability goals and how it impacts the community.

Committee Member Gonzales suggested that they need a nudge and commented on the Southern California rule where warehouses are responsible for the trucks in and out of their facilities to make investments into zero emission to reach those sustainability goals. This example highlights the options incentivize or mandates.

Conversation continues to include topics on air quality and partnership opportunities.

6. Public Comment

Councilwoman Ansari asked for public comment. No public comment.

7. Future Agenda Items

Councilwoman Ansari asked for future agenda items. No additions at this time.

8. Adjournment

Councilwoman Ansari adjourned the meeting at Meeting adjourned at 11:55am. Next meeting is January 14, 2021.