

TABLE OF CONTENTS
FOR CITY COUNCIL PACKET

APRIL 22, 2014

The April 23, 2014 Formal Meeting is Cancelled.

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

1. Council Information and Follow-up Requests/Consent Agenda/Call for an Executive Session/Reports and Budget Updates by the City Manager
2. Employee Service Recognition Announcements (NO REPORT)
3. [Water Resources Update](#)
- *4. [Golf Fund Update](#)
- *5. [Arizona State Land Bio Medical Corridor](#)

NOTE - This item will not be heard by the City Council on April 22, 2014, and will be scheduled for a future agenda.

GENERAL INFORMATION

- [Liquor License Applications Received for the Period of April 7, 2014 through April 11, 2014](#)
- [Follow-up: April 15, 2014 Policy Meeting](#)
- [Follow-up: April 16, 2014 Formal Meeting](#)
- [Community Budget Hearings](#)

RESPONSE TO REQUEST FROM CITIZENS

[Dianne Barker](#)

Ms. Barker suggested that minutes from the formal Council meetings be available to the public before the next meeting, and proposed that the meeting minutes include remarks made by residents at the Citizen Comments sessions.

Packet Date: April 17, 2014



**CITY OF PHOENIX
CITY COUNCIL POLICY SESSION
TUESDAY, APRIL 22, 2014 - 2:30 P.M.
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
200 WEST JEFFERSON**

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38.431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that the City Council will hold a meeting open to the public on Tuesday, April 22, 2014, at 2:30 P.M. located in the City Council Chambers, 200 West Jefferson, Phoenix, Arizona.

1:00 P.M. - AN EXECUTIVE SESSION WAS CALLED
FOR THIS TIME AT THE POLICY SESSION
OF APRIL 8, 2014.

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED. ITEMS MAY BE
DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT SEQUENCE.**

ESTIMATED COUNCIL INFORMATION AND
1. 2:30 P.M.- FOLLOW-UP REQUESTS.

This item is scheduled to give City Council members an opportunity to publicly request information or follow-up on issues of interest to the community. If the information is available, staff will immediately provide it to the City Council member. No decisions will be made or action taken.

CONSENT AGENDA.

This item is scheduled to allow the City Council to act on the Mayor's recommendations on the Consent Agenda. The Consent Agenda has been publicly posted.

CALL FOR AN EXECUTIVE SESSION.

A vote to call an Executive Session may be held.

REPORTS AND BUDGET UPDATES BY THE CITY MANAGER.

This item is scheduled to allow the City Manager to report on changes in the City Council Agenda and provide brief informational reports on urgent issues. The City Council may discuss these reports but no action will be taken.

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED.
ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT
SEQUENCE.**

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

-2-

TUESDAY, APRIL 22, 2014

ESTIMATED

2. 3:00 P.M.-

EMPLOYEE SERVICE
RECOGNITION
ANNOUNCEMENTS (NO
REPORT)

Staff: Zuercher
(Presentation: 5 min.)

This item is for information only. No City Council action is required.

ESTIMATED

3. 3:05 P.M.-

WATER RESOURCES
UPDATE

Staff: Naimark, Sorensen
(Presentation: 10 min.,
Estimated. Total Time:
30 min.)

This report provides the City Council with a summary of the drought conditions in the region, the City's water planning activities, and current water supply portfolio. This report also requests approval for staff to work on several activities to protect and enhance the City's water resources.

This item is for information, discussion, and possible action.

Backup included in Council packet/City Clerk's Office.

ESTIMATED

*4. 3:35 P.M.-

GOLF FUND UPDATE

Staff: Takata, Burke
(Presentation: 10 min.,
Estimated Total Time:
30 min.)

This report provides an update on the 2013 Golf Fund Balancing Plan approved by the City Council on March 6, 2013.

This item is for information, discussion, and possible action.

Backup included in Council packet/City Clerk's Office.

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED.
ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT
SEQUENCE.**

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

-3-

TUESDAY, APRIL 22, 2014

ESTIMATED

*5. 4:05 P.M.-

UPDATE ON THE CITY'S
BIOMEDICAL EFFORTS

Staff: Blue, Marshall
(Presentation: 10 min.,
Estimated Total Time:
25 min.)

NOTE - This item will not be heard by the City Council on April 22, 2014, and will be scheduled for a future agenda.

This report provides an update to the Mayor and City Council on the City's efforts to continue to promote investment in the biomedical industry in Phoenix on both the downtown Phoenix campus and in the Arizona Biomedical Corridor in north Phoenix.

This report is for information and discussion only.

Backup included in Council packet/City Clerk's Office.

*4:05 P.M. – ADJOURNMENT

For further information, please call the Management Intern, City Manager's Office, at 602-262-4449.

For reasonable accommodations, call the Management Intern at Voice/602-262-4449 or TTY/602-534-5500 as early as possible to coordinate needed arrangements.

Si necesita traducción en español, por favor llame a la oficina del gerente de la Ciudad de Phoenix, 602-262-4449 tres días antes de la fecha de la junta.

PHOENIX CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS

Councilman DiCiccio
Councilwoman Gallego
Councilman Gates
Councilman Nowakowski
Councilwoman Pastor
Councilman Valenzuela
Vice Mayor Waring
Councilwoman Williams
Mayor Stanton

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

POLICY AGENDA

TO: Rick Naimark
Deputy City Manager

AGENDA DATE: April 22, 2014

FROM: Kathryn Sorensen
Water Services Director

ITEM: 3

SUBJECT: WATER RESOURCES UPDATE

This report provides the City Council with a summary of the drought conditions in the region, the City's water planning activities, and current water supply portfolio. This report also requests approval for staff to work on several activities to protect and enhance the City's water resources.

THE ISSUE

In the Southwest, lengthy and worsening drought conditions have resulted in ever-increasing media coverage warning of imminent water shortages. Fortunately, the City of Phoenix employs a desert-centric view of water resources planning that prepares the City to withstand extended droughts. Through methodical, long-range water resource planning and prudent investment in critical infrastructure, Phoenix is well-positioned to meet all of its customers' water demands for decades to come, even during extended droughts like the current one.

While the City of Phoenix has secured a diverse portfolio of water supplies that provides a high level of redundancy during drought, the City is not completely insulated from the impacts of a long-term drought. Due to the volume and high priority of the City's water rights, shortages on the Colorado and Salt/Verde Rivers will not affect Phoenix for many years. However, shortages would impact other municipalities, farmers, and businesses across central Arizona. No matter how well Phoenix has planned to avoid a water shortage, the regional economy may suffer if reliable water supplies for the region are threatened. Looking decades into the future, the City's analyses show that continued growth coupled with the possible effects of climate change on the region will increase the chance of a shortage that would directly impact Phoenix. Therefore, the City must continue to look ahead, plan, and innovate like the generations before us so we can always provide reliable water supplies to our customers.

OTHER INFORMATION

City of Phoenix Water Planning Activities

The City of Phoenix has a century-old history of effective water planning. Phoenix has maintained a long-range Water Resources Plan since 1985 that is reviewed and updated approximately every five years. The Water Resources Plan was last updated in 2011 and is currently in the process of being updated. The Water Services Department also prepares water infrastructure master plans every five years, with

annual updates that assist in the preparation of the annual capital improvement program update. In 2008, the City completed its first Groundwater Management Plan that provides a roadmap for the maintenance and continued development of the groundwater infrastructure system. Finally, the City developed its first comprehensive Water Conservation Plan in 1986 that is also periodically reviewed and updated. As a result of these planning efforts, the City has:

- Secured a diverse and robust portfolio of water supplies sufficient to meet demands of our growing community for decades into the future;
- Developed and maintained water treatment and delivery infrastructure that minimizes losses while providing a high level of redundancy and reliability;
- Informed, educated and provided services to our customers, enhancing their adaptation to life in the desert and significantly improving water-use efficiency. Despite a 27 percent increase in population, total annual water consumption by Phoenix customers has decreased by 2 percent since 1996.

City of Phoenix Water Supply Portfolio

Brief descriptions of the various supplies in the City's water portfolio are provided below.

Salt River Project (SRP) - About half of the water delivered by the City comes from the Salt River Project (SRP) system, which is comprised of a series of dams and reservoirs that capture Salt and Verde River water, groundwater wells, and canals that transport water for delivery to the metropolitan Phoenix area. Total storage capacity in SRP reservoirs is about 2.3 million acre-feet (AF), and its maximum groundwater pumping capacity is about 340,000 AF per year. As of January 1, 2014, the SRP reservoir system was approximately 55 percent full.

The City's right to SRP water is based on land referred to as "member land" within the City that was pledged in the early 1900's as collateral to finance the construction of Roosevelt Dam and the associated SRP water delivery facilities. SRP's normal annual allocation to member lands is 3 AF per acre. The SRP Board may reduce the yearly allocation under low reservoir conditions, which has only happened four times in SRP's history of record (1939-40, 1947-48, 1950-51, and 2003-04 - in each case the allocation was never reduced below 2 AF per acre).

For 2014, SRP has approved the full 3 AF per acre allocation comprised of 1.8 AF surface water and 1.2 AF groundwater. Should the drought persist, SRP may increase groundwater pumping to its maximum capacity of 340,000 AF per year and/or reduce the allocation to something below 3 AF per acre. Fortunately, Phoenix is currently using about two-thirds of its full allocation, or 1.8 AF per acre, so even a reduction to 2 AF per acre in the SRP allocation would not impact the City's current ability to meet its on-project demands.

In addition, certain City of Phoenix SRP member lands enjoy very high priority rights to Normal Flow water, which is allocated based on the flow of the SRP river system at various points. This water is available in addition to the normal allocation of 3 AF per acre, and provides additional drought protection.

Central Arizona Project (CAP) - The other major source of surface water for the City is the Colorado River, which is delivered through the CAP. The City holds rights to Colorado River water totaling more than 186,000 AF but currently uses approximately 130,000 AF. This makes up about 47% of the City's total water deliveries. CAP supplies are available to the City through permanent water service subcontracts (122,000 AF/year) and 99-year leases (64,000 AF/year). More than 97 percent of this water is considered "high priority" within the CAP's priority system.

In August 2013, the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation (USBR) announced that 2014 releases from Lake Powell on the Colorado River would be reduced by 9 percent as compared to 2013 releases (7.48 million acre-feet (MAF) versus 8.23 MAF). The reduction in releases from Lake Powell in 2014 is not a declared shortage on the Colorado River. However, the USBR announcement also indicated that studies show a significant chance that a shortage requiring a reduction in deliveries to the lower Colorado River basin (including CAP) could be declared as early as 2016 if drought conditions persist.

While the USBR announcement is reason for continued close monitoring, it does not mean Phoenix's CAP water supplies are in imminent danger of being reduced. In fact, a shortage declaration in 2016 would have no impact on the City's CAP supplies due to their high priority. A shortage declaration in 2016 would reduce CAP Excess Water supplies, which are used for the Central Arizona Groundwater Replenishment District, agriculture, and recharge. There would be no reduction in municipal and industrial (M&I) water deliveries. The first chance that Phoenix's CAP supplies could possibly be reduced due to shortage is not projected to occur before 2020; even then, the reduction would only be a small percentage of the total CAP entitlement. Fortunately, the Arizona Water Banking Authority has stored more than 1.9 MAF of excess CAP water underground over the past 17 years to offset M&I reductions.

Groundwater - In 1986 the City was heavily reliant on groundwater, using almost 72,000 AF to meet 27 percent of customer water demands. Today, less than 3 percent of customer demands (8,100 AF in 2013) are met with groundwater. This reduction in reliance on groundwater has allowed this resource to be preserved for future times when the City may need to increase pumping to offset shortage of CAP or SRP supplies. The City currently maintains twenty-four active groundwater wells which can produce up to 16,250 AF per year. The Groundwater Management Plan identifies additional groundwater pumping infrastructure the City could develop to increase pumping capacity and further reduce the impact to customers in the event of future shortages in surface water supplies. The City is in the process of implementing a program to develop aquifer storage and recovery (AS&R) wells to sustain groundwater levels in aquifers. This AS&R program allows the City to store excess water underground so it will be available for recovery during future times of shortage or drought. Under initial pilot operations over the last three years, the City has stored 1,800 AF using these types of wells.

Reclaimed Water - Reclaimed water is an important component of the City's water resource portfolio. Approximately 40 percent of potable water delivered to the City's customers is returned to the City as wastewater. All of this wastewater is collected, treated and delivered for various non-potable uses such as energy production, crops,

turf irrigation, wetlands, and groundwater recharge. For example, the City, in partnership with four other cities in the Sub-Regional Operating Group, delivers up to 80,000 AF of reclaimed water from the 91st Avenue Wastewater Treatment Plant to the Palo Verde Nuclear Generating Station for cooling purposes. Another example is an innovative program that was executed as part of an Indian water rights settlement in 1996 under which the City delivers a portion of its reclaimed water from the 23rd Avenue Wastewater Treatment Plant to the Roosevelt Irrigation District in exchange for potable water that is delivered to the City through the SRP system. Supplying reclaimed water for these purposes helps to offset the need (and competition) for additional potable water supplies in the region.

Other Sources - While the multiple water sources described above provide considerable security and flexibility for the City, staff has taken additional steps over the years to ensure sufficient water is available to meet customers' needs even under extraordinary drought conditions. Such steps include:

- Partnering with SRP and other cities to construct the CAP-SRP Interconnection Facility (CSIF) which allows CAP water to be introduced into the SRP delivery system;
- Developing, or partnering in the development of, recharge projects that have allowed the City to store more than 182,000 AF of excess CAP water and reclaimed effluent underground for future recovery;
- Paying for the installation of gates at Horseshoe Dam on the Verde River to increase storage capacity at Horseshoe Reservoir. The City currently has nearly 58,000 AF of Gatewater in storage;
- Paying a portion of the costs to raise Roosevelt Dam, thereby securing capacity in the New Conservation Storage (NCS) space created by raising the dam. The City currently has more than 108,000 AF of NCS water in storage.

Water Supply Summary - Phoenix's robust portfolio of water supplies and redundant water delivery system provides a high level of water management resiliency and makes Phoenix much less vulnerable to water supply problems that other cities may face. It is possible that long-term temperature increases in source watersheds could reduce precipitation. Of great concern is the possibility of reduced snow pack in the mountains, which would mean reductions in the amount of water that flows into, and is gradually released from, Salt River Project and Colorado River reservoirs to users downstream. A related concern is how these drought conditions might affect the cost of water. For example, CAP's fixed operation and maintenance (O&M) costs are relatively constant regardless of how much water it delivers. Therefore, reductions in CAP water availability during a declared shortage on the Colorado River would cause the fixed O&M costs to be spread over a smaller amount of water, thus increasing CAP water rates. The potential impacts of drought on the costs of the City's various water sources continue to be evaluated and will need to be reflected in future water rate-setting processes.

Looking Ahead

The City of Phoenix's multiple water sources, use of reclaimed water, effective infrastructure management, culture of wise water use, and continued comprehensive planning and monitoring of drought and climate issues positions the City well to meet the water demands of customers for decades to come. However, the City must

continue to work to ensure that the water supplies we have secured are used as efficiently as possible. The City must continue efforts to support and educate the community in the efficient use of water. Finally, the City must also protect and enhance water supplies for the distant future. To that end, staff recommends the City actively engage in the following activities:

Mitigation of Colorado River Shortages

Due to the extended drought in the region, water levels in Lakes Powell and Mead on the Colorado River have been steadily dropping. Over the past nine months, representatives from the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation and the seven Colorado River Basin States (Arizona, California, Nevada, Colorado, New Mexico, Utah and Wyoming) have been meeting to identify and discuss strategies to mitigate the risk of continued declines in the Lake levels due to the ongoing drought. One strategy that is emerging from these meetings is the establishment of a Colorado River System Conservation Program to reduce demands on the Colorado River. Under the program, entities entitled to use Colorado River water would be compensated for voluntary reductions in water use, which would create conserved water that would benefit the system through increased reservoir levels. These increased reservoir levels then would forestall or mitigate future shortage declarations. Staff understands that five of the parties involved in the discussions (Central Arizona Project, Metropolitan Water District of Southern California, Southern Nevada Water Authority, Denver Water and the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation) have developed a proposed agreement for a two-year pilot program with an overall budget of \$11 million. As the largest municipal user of CAP water, the City of Phoenix has a significant stake in the condition of the Colorado River system. A successful program of this nature carried into the future would significantly improve the long-term reliability of Colorado River water supplies. Therefore, staff proposes that the City make an effort to increase its participation in the ongoing discussions among the Basin States and explore the possibility and benefits of participating in the Colorado River System Conservation program.

Inter-AMA Firming

In 2013, representatives from the Southern Arizona Water Users Association (SAWUA) and the Arizona Municipal Water Users Association (AMWUA) began discussing the concept of a partnership among CAP subcontractors in the Phoenix and Tucson Active Management Areas (AMAs). Under this partnership, CAP subcontractors in the Phoenix AMA who are not using all of their CAP entitlements, such as the City of Phoenix, would store some of their excess CAP supplies in recharge facilities in the Tucson AMA. In exchange, during future shortage, the participating Tucson area subcontractors such as the City of Tucson would recover the stored water and direct a like amount of their surface water (CAP) for delivery to Phoenix AMA water treatment plants. In the short term this would prop up groundwater levels in the Tucson area, which is primarily dependent on wells. In the long term, during drought it would provide dedicated surface water deliveries to the City of Phoenix, which relies heavily on surface water treatment plants. The concept provides significant benefits for both regions. Because staff does not project a need to use all of the City's CAP water directly for at least another fifteen years, staff proposes that the City work to develop an Inter-AMA Firming agreement with the City of Tucson and other entities in the Tucson AMA.

Protection of Groundwater Supplies

The City of Phoenix has done an excellent job of transitioning away from the use of groundwater and instead using primarily surface water from the CAP and SRP to meet customer demands. In doing so, the groundwater remains in place for use when the surface water supplies are not available due to shortage. Of primary concern, then, is the long-term security, and availability of, of those groundwater supplies. In addition, the City has stored more than 182,000 AF of CAP water and reclaimed effluent underground, and staff wants to ensure availability of those credits to pump when needed in the future. As a result of the analyses done by ADWR in the Assured Water Supply Designation process in 2010, along with more recent modeling runs by ADWR, it is clear that current rules, policies and laws regarding recharge, recovery, and replenishment do not fully protect the physical availability of groundwater and long-term storage credits.

Of further concern is the fact that, under the existing regulatory structure, a significant amount of growth in the Phoenix AMA will be based on these rules, policies and laws. Therefore, it is important that the policies, rules, and regulations regarding groundwater use be thoroughly reviewed and revised where necessary to protect these resources for the future and to ensure sustainable growth in our region.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends City Council approval to:

- Aggressively engage in discussions with state and federal officials, as well as representatives from the Colorado River Basin states, to mitigate the impacts of Colorado River shortages;
- Work with one or more CAP subcontractors in the Tucson AMA, in coordination with ADWR and CAP, on the development of an Inter-AMA Firming program; and
- Encourage and participate in the review of rules, regulations, policies and laws that govern recharge, recovery, and replenishment in our region for the purpose of protecting groundwater supplies and ensuring sustainable growth.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT - REVISED

POLICY AGENDA

TO: Lisa Takata
Deputy City Manager

AGENDA DATE: April 22, 2014

FROM: James P. Burke
Acting Parks And Recreation
Director

ITEM: 4

SUBJECT: GOLF FUND BALANCING PLAN UPDATE

This report provides an update on the 2013 Golf Fund Balancing Plan approved by the City Council on March 6, 2013.

The Golf Fund is beginning to show signs of improvement with implementation of the City Council approved Golf Fund Balancing Plan approved by the City Council in March 2013. Revenues are up and the projected operating deficit subsidy from the General Fund has been reduced from \$1.1 million to \$600,000 for Fiscal Year 2014-15. In the current fiscal year, staff successfully identified and implemented alternative solutions to reduce the annual deficit, including the sale of golf equipment and leased golf carts, amounting to \$351,000. This will keep the Golf Fund within the budget allocation for Fiscal Year 2013-14.

THE ISSUE

Until this fiscal year, Phoenix Municipal Golf Courses had been included in the City's Enterprise Fund. All golf course fees and other revenues collected were kept separate from all general funds and were to be used for operational, administrative, capital and debt costs associated with operating the seven Parks and Recreation Department Municipal Golf Courses. The Golf Enterprise Fund began running a deficit in Fiscal Year 1998-99. Initially brought on by the debt associated with the purchase of Palo Verde Golf Course, and the construction of Aguila Golf Course, and exacerbated by economic conditions, the Golf Enterprise Fund continued to generate annual operating deficits.

In 2012, the City Manager's Office requested the Budget and Research Department conduct a study of the City's Golf Program to identify options available to improve the financial condition of the Golf Enterprise Fund. This study was presented to the Parks and Recreation Board on May 24, 2012 and to the Parks, Arts, Families, and Seniors Subcommittee on June 20, 2012. At the Parks and Recreation Board meeting, the Board voted to establish a Citizen's Golf Ad-Hoc Committee. The Committee sought extensive public input and recommended an action plan in December 2012 that focused on retiring existing debt, reducing annual operating deficits and funding any future annual operating deficits.

Based on input from the Ad Hoc Golf Committee, the Parks and Recreation Board, and the City Council, in March 2013 staff obtained City Council approval of the 2013 Golf Fund Balancing Plan.

OTHER INFORMATION

Since March 2013, staff has made significant progress to implement the recommendations of the Golf Fund Balancing Plan. The Plan's action steps and accomplishments to date include:

1. Keep all City golf courses open.
 - ✓ All existing golf courses remain open to the public.
2. Retire existing debt.
 - ✓ Phoenix Parks and Preserve (3PI) funds were identified to pay down a \$17.1 million portion of the debt over three years.
 - ✓ Better than expected performance of golf operations resulted in a \$900,000 reduction in the money needed from 3PI this fiscal year. This fiscal year, 2013-14, \$4.8 million is needed to pay down the annual golf debt.
3. Reduce the Golf Fund's annual operating deficit.
 - Issue an RFP to outsource golf course maintenance.
 - ✓ In October 2013 the City Council approved a contract with OB Sports to maintain five municipal golf properties, saving an estimated \$1 million annually. OB Sports took over maintenance of Aguila and Maryvale Golf Courses in January 2014 and Encanto, Cave Creek and Palo Verde in February.
 - Solicit recommendations from development firms to provide development opportunities at Phoenix Golf Courses.
 - ✓ In response to the desire for a golf summit, staff has met with several prominent development groups with significant knowledge of the Phoenix market, to solicit strategic advice on potential development opportunities at City golf courses. Staff will return to the Parks and Recreation Board and the City Council with the findings.
 - Hire a golf operations and financial consulting firm to develop a five-year business plan, five-year capital plan, assist with RFP development and identify efficiencies to increase revenue and reduce operating expenses.
 - ✓ Touchstone Golf, LLC was hired in October 2013 to provide golf course operating and financial consulting services. Touchstone presented its findings to the Parks and Recreation Board and the Parks, Arts, Transparency, and Ethics Subcommittee on March 26, 2014. Touchstone's report included a detailed market analysis of each course, five-year business and capital expenditure plans for each course, strategies and recommendations to increase revenue and efficiencies.
 - ✓ Touchstone recommended right sizing the Phoenix Golf organization by eliminating a centralized golf marketing position and reclassifying existing positions to provide course-based marketing and tournament bookings. These actions would save the golf operation \$35,000 annually and provide better on-course service to customers.

- ✓ Touchstone will return in May to help roll out, execute the five-year business plans, and assist in development of the food and beverage RFP.
 - ✓ Touchstone Golf recommended further exploration of alternate uses for Palo Verde Golf Course.
 - Issue an RFP to replace current food and beverage providers with a single provider.
 - ✓ Staff will work with Touchstone Golf to develop and issue an RFP for food and beverage at golf courses. An RFP will be issued this summer in anticipation of current contracts expiring in spring 2015.
4. Develop a plan to fund future operating deficits.
 - ✓ Effective July 2013 the Golf Fund no longer operates as an Enterprise Fund.
 - ✓ The Fiscal Year 2013-14 Operating Budget included up to \$1.1 million of General Funds to offset any golf operating deficit. The fund is within the budgeted amount for this year and the projected annual deficit for next year has been reduced to \$600,000, which is built into the City Manager's Trial Budget.
 - ✓ Phoenix Golf Revenues continue to trend upward. Revenues increased one and one-half percent from Fiscal Year 2011-12 to Fiscal Year 2012-13 and are up three percent for the first nine months of this fiscal year over last. The Fiscal Year 2013-14 revenue estimate is \$6,395,656. Staff achieved six months of maintenance outsourced savings, including \$294,000 in revenue from the sale of some maintenance equipment, as well as \$57,000 from the trade in of leased golf carts.
 5. Develop golf course deed restrictions.
 - ✓ The Finance and Planning and Development departments have provided an analysis of each golf property including its General Plan use designation and zoning; current deed restrictions; prevalent land uses; recent zoning activity in the area; and the nearest golf courses.
 6. Issue an RFP for management and operation of Papago Golf Course.
 - ✓ In June 2013 the Parks and Recreation Board recommended staff to negotiate an Intergovernmental agreement with ASU to operate the Papago Golf Course. Staff anticipates requesting final approval from City Council in May 2014 for a July 1, 2014 takeover by ASU prior to the start of the peak golf season.
 7. Provide an annual report to City Council on the financial and operational status of this plan.
 - ✓ This report summarizes accomplishments since March 2013.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff requests City Council approval to proceed with the right sizing staffing changes recommended by Touchstone Golf, by eliminating a centralized golf marketing position and reclassifying existing positions to provide course based marketing and tournament bookings. These actions will save the golf operation \$35,000 annually and provide better on course service to customers.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

POLICY AGENDA

TO: Paul Blue
Deputy City Manager

AGENDA DATE: April 22, 2014

FROM: Hank Marshall
Acting Community and Economic
Development Director

ITEM: 5

SUBJECT: UPDATE ON THE CITY'S BIOMEDICAL EFFORTS

This report provides an update to the Mayor and City Council on the City's efforts to continue to promote investment in the biomedical industry in Phoenix on both the downtown Phoenix campus and in the Arizona Biomedical Corridor in north Phoenix.

THE ISSUE

The City of Phoenix is committed to promoting investment in biomedical facilities Citywide, with a focus in two primary areas in Phoenix: on the Phoenix Biomedical Campus (PBC), which is home to the University of Arizona College of Medicine campus in downtown Phoenix; and in the Arizona Biomedical Corridor (ABC), extending from State Route 101 to the Central Arizona Project Canal, between State Route 51 and 64th Street.

More information on current projects will be presented to the Mayor and City Council at the April 22, 2014 City Council Policy meeting.

OTHER INFORMATION

Phoenix Biomedical Campus

The City-owned Phoenix Biomedical Campus (PBC) is a 28-acre urban medical and bioscience campus planned for more than six million square feet of biomedical-related research, academic and clinical facilities.

PBC is expected to contain the highest concentration of research scientists and complementary research professionals in the region providing firms with unprecedented opportunities for growth and collaborative efforts with many research and educational partners. The PBC provides an exceptional location for firms to recruit the most talented doctors and researchers. Present tenants of the site include:

- Translational Genomics Research Institute
- National Institute of Diabetes and Digestive and Kidney Disorders
- University of Arizona College of Medicine – Phoenix

- Northern Arizona University's College of Health and Human Services
- University of Arizona College of Pharmacy - Phoenix
- St. Joseph's Hospital and Medical Center
- Arizona Biomedical Collaborative I
- Phoenix Union Bioscience High School

Arizona Biomedical Corridor (ABC)

The Arizona Biomedical Corridor (ABC) site is approximately 600 acres, extending from State Route 101 to the Central Arizona Project Canal, between State Route 51 and 64th Street. A majority of the land within this area is controlled by the Arizona State Land Department (ASLD), as part of the State Land Trust.

On April 3, 2012, the City Council approved a MOU with ASU and Mayo to jointly plan for the ABC. The City Council authorized staff to extend the MOU at the April 2, 2014 Formal City Council meeting.

Under the MOU, the City, ASU and Mayo agreed to focus on the development of the corridor to create jobs and educational opportunities in northeast Phoenix, which will serve as an international destination for renowned medical care at Desert Ridge.

In July 2013, private developer KUD International, a subsidiary of one of the world's largest development, design and construction companies, submitted an application to acquire 225 acres from the Arizona State Land Department within the proposed ABC. KUD plans to establish a biomedical and advanced technology research and development campus adjacent to the Mayo Clinic. ASLD has accepted and advanced KUD's application, and anticipates holding an auction in 2014.

RECOMMENDATION

This report is for information and discussion only.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

GENERAL INFORMATION

TO: Lisa Takata
Deputy City Manager

PACKET DATE: April 17, 2014

FROM: Cris Meyer
City Clerk

SUBJECT: LIQUOR LICENSE APPLICATIONS RECEIVED FOR THE PERIOD OF
APRIL 7, 2014 THROUGH APRIL 11, 2014.

This report provides advance notice of liquor license applications that were received by the City Clerk during the period of Monday, April 7, 2014 through Friday, April 11, 2014.

INFORMATION

The liquor license application process includes the posting of a public notice of the application at the proposed location and online for twenty days, and the distribution of an application copy or a copy of this report to the following departments for their review: Finance, Planning and Development, Police, Fire, and Street Transportation.

Additional information on the items listed below is generally not available until the twenty-day posting/review period has expired.

LIQUOR LICENSE APPLICATIONS

<u>Application Type Legend</u>					
<u>O-</u> Ownership	<u>L-</u> Location	<u>N-</u> New	<u>OL-</u> Ownership & Location	<u>AOC-</u> Acquisition of Control	<u>SE-</u> Special Event
<u>Liquor License Series Definitions</u>					
1	In State Producer	*7	On sale-beer & wine	11	Hotel/Motel-all liquor on premises
3	Microbrewery	8	Conveyance license-sale of all liquor on board planes & trains	12	Restaurant-all liquor on premises
4	Wholesaler	9	Off sale-all liquor	14	Clubs-all liquor on premises
5	Government	9S	Sampling Privileges	15	Special Event
*6	On sale-all liquor	10	Off sale-beer & wine		
		10S	Sampling Privileges		

*On-sale retailer means any person operating an establishment where spirituous liquors are sold in the original container for consumption on or off the premises and in individual portions for consumption on the premises.

Dist	App. Type	Agent/Owner Name Business Name/Address Phone	Lic. Type	Approx. Protest End Date	Within 2,000 Feet of Light Rail	Proposed Agenda Date
1	N	Robert Fertig, Agent Bold Barley Brewing 2737 West Thunderbird Road, Suite 102 630-674-0004	3	5/2/14	No	5/28/14
4	N	Gilbert Enriquez Kaspers Smoke Kastle 1718 North 16th Street 602-770-4191	10	5/2/14	No	5/28/14
4	N	Octavio Rubio, Agent Mariscos Ensenada 2019 North 16th Street 602-717-1948	12	5/2/14	No	5/28/14
5	SE	Vanessa Ramirez Ballet Folklorico Quetzalli-AZ, Inc. (5/10-5/11/14) 2209 North 99th Avenue 480-326-2722	15	N/A	N/A	*5/10/14
5	SE	Elizabeth Guzzo Casa de la Cultura Colombiana (7/19/14) 4344 West Indian School Road, Suite 100 480-332-3985	15	N/A	N/A	5/28/14
6	SE	Suzanne Sabbagh The Cedar Club of Arizona (5/9/14) 1702 East Northern Avenue 602-614-5011	15	N/A	N/A	*5/9/14
6	SE	Anne Gill Ahwatukee Foothills Chamber of Commerce (7/3/14) 12432 South 48th Street 480-753-7676	15	N/A	N/A	5/28/14

Dist	App. Type	Agent/Owner Name Business Name/Address Phone	Lic. Type	Approx. Protest End Date	Within 2,000 Feet of Light Rail	Proposed Agenda Date
7	AOC	Mayte Juarez, Agent Taquitos and Beer 7710 West Lower Buckeye Road, #107 623-266-9005	12	5/2/14	No	5/28/14
7	SE	Daniel Ortega Cesar Chavez Foundation (5/3-5/4/14) 7611 West Thomas Road 602-697-7287	15	N/A	N/A	*5/3/14
7	N	Rosa Gamez, Agent Carniceria Mi Ranchito #2 5032 West Southern Avenue, #110 623-203-2292	10	5/2/14	No	5/28/14
8	SE	Katia Howard Free Arts for Abused Children of Arizona (5/15/14) 803 North 7th Street 602-705-4383	15	N/A	N/A	*5/15/14

*Event Date – Application not received in time for Council review.

For further information regarding any of the above applications, please contact the City Clerk Department, License Services Section, at 602-262-6018.

RECOMMENDATION

This report is provided for information only. No Council action is required.

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

TO: Mayor And Council

PACKET DATE: April 17, 2014

FROM: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

SUBJECT: FOLLOW-UP: APRIL 15, 2014 POLICY SESSION

Attached are the April 15, 2014 Policy Session Minutes and Council Information and Follow-Up Requests.

City Council Requests for Information and Announcements
City Council Policy Session
April 15, 2014

Councilwoman Williams

Councilwoman Williams thanked everyone who attended the District 1 Budget Hearing on Thursday, April 10th, at the Beuf Community Center. Councilwoman Williams announced the next District 1 Community Breakfast would be held on Friday, April 25th, at 7:30 a.m. at the Deer Valley Airport with guest speaker City Manager Ed Zuercher. Councilwoman Williams noted the pool at Cortez Park would be open at the beginning of swim season. Councilwoman Williams also reported an Easter event would be held at Metrocenter Mall on Saturday, April 19th, from 9:30 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. that included breakfast and an Easter egg hunt.

Councilwoman Gallego

Councilwoman Gallego announced the District 8 Bicycle Safety Day would be held on Saturday, April 19th, and would include events at the Arizona Science Center, Esteban Park, and Betty Fairfax School. Councilwoman Gallego recognized Tony Valdovinos, and thanked him for his contribution to the District 8 Office.

Councilman DiCiccio

Councilman DiCiccio asked staff how the elimination of \$19 million in employee pay raises, the removal of all vacant positions, and the selling of vacant city-owned property would affect the budget deficit.

Councilman DiCiccio asked staff if salary savings in the proposed budget referred to an employee's salary or total compensation package.

Councilman DiCiccio recognized Mike Ritchie, and thanked him for his contribution to the District 6 Office.

Councilman Nowakowski

Councilman Nowakowski thanked everyone who attended the Movie in the Park on Friday, April 11th. Councilman Nowakowski announced the next Budget Hearing for District 7 and District 4 would be held on Wednesday, April 16th, at 6:00 p.m. at the Phoenix Art Museum. Councilman Nowakowski noted he visited the Mexican State of Sonora with several mayors from Arizona to discuss regional economic development partnerships. Councilman Nowakowski recognized several children who recently made significant financial contributions to organizations that assisted the families of fallen public safety officers.

Councilman Gates

Councilman Gates thanked everyone who attended the joint District 3 and District 5 Budget Hearing held at the Sunnyslope Senior Center on Tuesday, April 15th, at 7:30 a.m. Councilman Gates acknowledged Matrix Absence Management for relocating its corporate headquarters from California to District 3. Councilman Gates thanked

everyone working to repair the Greenway Bridge, and noted the Volunteer Service Awards Ceremony would be held on Tuesday, April 15th, at Steele Indian Park. Councilman Gates also recognized Carmella Aja and thanked her for her contributions to the District 3 Office.

Councilman Valenzuela

Councilman Valenzuela thanked Grand Canyon University for volunteering to subsidize Car 99 for a year, and for contributing funds to the City's anti-graffiti program. Councilman Valenzuela acknowledged everyone who participated in the clean-ups in Maryvale; the United Neighborhood Association Volunteer Event; and the joint District 5 and District 3 Budget Hearing at Sunnyslope Senior Center.

Vice Mayor Waring

Vice Mayor Waring thanked everyone who attended the joint District 2 and District 3 Budget Hearing held at the Paradise Valley Community Center on Wednesday, April 2nd. Vice Mayor Waring announced Acting Chief Kara Kalkbrenner would be the guest speaker at the District 2 Community Meeting on Tuesday, April 29th at the Paradise Valley Community Center.

Councilwoman Pastor

Councilwoman Pastor invited everyone to participate in the Budget Hearing for District 4 and District 7 at the Phoenix Art Museum on Wednesday, April 16th, at 6:00 p.m. Councilwoman Pastor announced the Westwood Village Estates Neighborhood Association and the Simpson Block Watch planned activities to celebrate National Volunteer Month throughout April. Councilwoman Pastor thanked everyone who attended the reading of "Jeremy the Jackrabbit Catches the Sun" at the Arizona Science Center on Saturday, April 12th.

Mayor Stanton

Mayor Stanton announced that the annual Ahwatukee Easter Parade would be held on Saturday, April 19th, at 10:00 a.m. Mayor Stanton noted the Native American Basketball Invitational, a three-on-three tournament, would be held this weekend in Downtown Phoenix from Saturday, April 19th to Sunday, April 20th. Mayor Stanton acknowledged the death of Chuck Walheim, one of the founders of the East Valley Partnership, and an advocate for regionalism throughout the State.

CITY COUNCIL AND CITIZEN REQUESTS
April 15, 2014

CITY COUNCIL INFORMATION REQUESTS

INFORMATION REQUESTS	DATE AND COUNCIL PERSON	DUE DATE	ASSIGNED TO	STATUS
<p>Councilman DiCiccio requested that staff prepare five-year and ten-year projections for the secondary property tax fund before Council is asked to vote on policies that would use resources designated for investments in critical infrastructure to pay for operational expenses. Councilman DiCiccio also asked how much money has been taken out of the secondary property tax fund since 2009.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">April 8, 2014 Councilman DiCiccio</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">04/22/14</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Zuercher Paniagua Young</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Pending</p>
<p>Councilman DiCiccio requested that staff investigate the legality of pension spiking.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">April 8, 2014 Councilman DiCiccio</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">04/22/14</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Zuercher, Brown</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Pending</p>
<p>Councilman DiCiccio asked staff how the elimination of \$19 million in employee pay raises, the removal of all vacant positions, and the selling of vacant city-owned property would affect the budget deficit.</p> <p>Councilman DiCiccio asked staff if salary savings in the proposed budget referred to an employee's salary or total compensation package.</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">April 15, 2014 Councilman DiCiccio</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">05/06/14</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Zuercher, Paniagua</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">New</p>



**CITY OF PHOENIX
CITY COUNCIL POLICY SESSION
TUESDAY, APRIL 15, 2014 - 2:30 P.M.
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
200 WEST JEFFERSON**

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38.431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that the City Council will hold a meeting open to the public on Tuesday, April 15, 2014, at 2:30 P.M. located in the City Council Chambers, 200 West Jefferson, Phoenix, Arizona.

1:00 P.M. - AN EXECUTIVE SESSION WAS CALLED FOR THIS TIME AT THE POLICY SESSION OF APRIL 8, 2014.

THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED. ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT SEQUENCE.

Mayor Stanton called the meeting to order at 2:44 P.M. with Councilmembers Laura Pastor, Thelda Williams, Vice Mayor Jim Waring, Michael Nowakowski, Daniel Valenzuela, Kate Gallego, Sal DiCiccio and Bill Gates present.

ESTIMATED COUNCIL INFORMATION AND
1. 2:30 P.M.- FOLLOW-UP REQUESTS.

This item is scheduled to give City Council members an opportunity to publicly request information or follow-up on issues of interest to the community. If the information is available, staff will immediately provide it to the City Council member. No decisions will be made or action taken.

Action Taken:

Councilman DiCiccio asked staff how the elimination of \$19 million in employee pay raises, the removal of all vacant positions, and the selling of vacant city-owned property would affect the budget deficit. Councilman DiCiccio asked staff if salary savings in the proposed budget referred to an employee's salary or total compensation package.

Councilmembers made general comments.

CONSENT AGENDA.

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED.
ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT
SEQUENCE.**

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

-2-

TUESDAY, APRIL 15, 2014

This item is scheduled to allow the City Council to act on the Mayor's recommendations on the Consent Agenda. The Consent Agenda has been publicly posted.

Action Taken:

Councilwoman Williams moved to approve the Consent Agenda. Councilman Gates seconded the motion, which passed 9-0.

CALL FOR AN EXECUTIVE SESSION.

A vote to call an Executive Session may be held.

Action Taken:

A call for an Executive Session was not made.

REPORTS AND BUDGET UPDATES BY THE CITY MANAGER.

This item is scheduled to allow the City Manager to report on changes in the City Council Agenda and provide brief informational reports on urgent issues. The City Council may discuss these reports but no action will be taken.

ESTIMATED

2. 3:00 P.M.-

EMPLOYEE SERVICE
RECOGNITION
ANNOUNCEMENTS
(NO REPORT)

Staff: Zuercher
(Presentation: 5 min.)

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED.
ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT
SEQUENCE.**

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

-3-

TUESDAY, APRIL 15, 2014

This item is for information only. No City Council action is required.

Action Taken:

Ed Zuercher, City Manager, thanked Councilmembers and City staff for their participation in Community Budget Hearings during the month of April. Mr. Zuercher acknowledged the hard work and dedication of the Budget and Research Department throughout the process. Mr. Zuercher announced Acting Assistant City Manager Danny Murphy would be returning to his role as Director of the Aviation Department. Mr. Zuercher thanked Mr. Murphy for the leadership he provided during the past six months as the Acting Assistant City Manager.

Councilwoman Williams recognized Anthony Montano for 35 years of service to the City of Phoenix. Councilwoman Williams stated Mr. Montano began his career as a junior in high school through the CETA program, and advanced from a semi-skilled worker, to a tradeshelper, to his current position of certified welder. Councilwoman Williams noted Mr. Montano has worked in the Aviation Department his entire career, and enjoyed spending time with his family in his spare time. Councilwoman Williams thanked Mr. Montano for his hard work and dedication.

ESTIMATED

3. 3:05 P.M.-

STATE LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

Staff: Takata, Remes
(Presentation: 15 min.,
Estimated. Total Time:
25 min.)

This report seeks approval, guidance, and direction from the Mayor and Council on state legislation of interest to the City.

This item is for information, discussion, and possible action.

Backup included in Council packet/City Clerk's Office.

Action Taken:

Tom Remes, Director of the Government Relation Department, introduced the item and John Gonzales, Government Relations Management Assistant.

Mr. Gonzales reviewed HB 2693: PSPRS; Employer Liability; Death Benefits and SB 1478: Water Protection Fund; Mesquite; Tamarisk. Councilman Gates moved to support HB 2693 and SB 1478. Councilwoman Williams seconded the motion, which passed 8-1; Councilman DiCiccio opposed.

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED.
ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT
SEQUENCE.**

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

-4-

TUESDAY, APRIL 15, 2014

Mr. Remes explained HB 2389: Transaction Privilege Tax Changes and SB 1397: Liquor Omnibus. Vice Mayor Waring asked if the information for all bills presented was current. Mr. Gonzales confirmed that the bills were current. Vice Mayor Waring suggested that reports reflect the actual date of the report.

Councilman Gates moved to monitor HB 2389 and SB 1397. Councilwoman Williams seconded the motion, which passed 8-1; Councilman DiCiccio opposed.

Mr. Gonzales reviewed SB 1063: Misconduct Involving Weapons; Firearm Storage, HB 2339: Firearms; Permit Holders; Public Places, HB 2517: Firearms, State Preemption; Penalties, and HB 2448: Just Compensation; Tax Credits.

Vice Mayor Waring exited the meeting at 3:30 p.m.

Councilwoman Williams moved to oppose the SB 1063, HB 2339, HB 2517, and HB 2448. Councilwoman Pastor seconded the motion, which passed 7-1; Councilman DiCiccio opposed.

ESTIMATED

4. 3:30 P.M.-

PRELIMINARY 5-YEAR
CAPITAL IMPORVEMENT
PROGRAM

Staff: Zuercher, Paniagua
(Presentation: 15 min.,
Estimated Total Time:
45 min.)

This report transmits the Preliminary 2014-19 Capital Improvement Program (CIP). The City Charter requires the City Manager to submit the Preliminary CIP in advance of the Council's adoption of the final budget. The \$748.8 million total program (see attached schedules) for 2014-15 represents significant investment by the City in infrastructure.

This item is for information and discussion. No Council action is required.

Backup included in Council packet/City Clerk's Office.

Action Taken:

Mr. Zuercher introduced the item and Mario Paniagua, Director of Budget and Research. Mr. Zuercher provided an overview of the goals of the 2014-2019 Capital Improvement Program (CIP).

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED.
ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT
SEQUENCE.**

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

-5-

TUESDAY, APRIL 15, 2014

Mr. Paniagua highlighted a number of the projects in the 2014-2019 CIP, such as the expansion of Terminal 4 in the Aviation Department, mountain preserve improvements in the Parks and Recreation Department, bicycle infrastructure in the Street Transportation Department, and the construction of new reservoirs in the Water Department. Mr. Paniagua identified the next steps in the CIP process including the adoption of the CIP Resolution and the Tentative Capital Budget Ordinance on June 4th.

ESTIMATED

5. 4:15 P.M.-

PROPERTY TAX UPDATE

Staff: Zuercher, Paniagua,
Young
(Presentation: 15 min.,
Estimated Total Time:
45 min.)

This report provides an update on City of Phoenix property taxes and detail regarding the General Obligation (G.O.) Bond Program and requests Mayor and City Council action to reaffirm the City's Property Tax Policy first approved by Council action on May 10, 2010.

This item is for information, discussion, and possible action.

Backup included in Council packet/City Clerk's Office.

Action Taken:

Mr. Zuercher introduced the item and Neal Young, Chief Financial Officer. Mr. Young identified some of the factors responsible for the decrease of Assessed Value (AV) in the City of Phoenix such as the decision not to increase the combined tax rate in FY 2009-2010, and voters' approval of Proposition 117 in 2012. Mr. Young outlined the principal differences between the primary and secondary property taxes, and reviewed the property tax policy Council adopted in 2010, including the use of secondary funds to cover debt service and to delay bond projects.

Mr. Young displayed a number of graphs that demonstrated Phoenix was one of the few cities in the Valley that did not increase property taxes in the past five years, and that the amount of property taxes the City collected significantly decreased. Mr. Young noted the current balance of the secondary property tax reserve fund, and explained that rising interest rates for municipal bonds could cause the secondary reserve fund to drop below the minimum target level in FY 2016-2017. Mr. Young proposed increasing the secondary property tax rate, decreasing the primary property tax rate, or using other general fund resources to cover G.O. bond debt service if the secondary property tax reserve fund was insufficient.

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED.
ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT
SEQUENCE.**

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

-6-

TUESDAY, APRIL 15, 2014

Dianne Barker stated the City needed to focus on the important task of creating new revenue sources, which could help alleviate some of its financial challenges. Ms. Barker suggested establishing partnerships with the private sector to encourage growth and stability.

Scott Mussi stated any plan that proposed to significantly increase property taxes should be thoroughly vetted before it was approved. Mr. Mussi commented that infrastructure projects should not be balanced on the backs of taxpayers.

Greta Rogers stated the property tax rate in Phoenix was relatively low in the State and country when compared with other municipalities. Ms. Rogers commented the City would not be able to continue to progress if revenue was not raised to finance infrastructure and other projects.

Councilwoman Williams suggested re-examining the CIP project list due to the fact it was developed ten years ago and may not be reflective of the City's current needs.

Councilman Waring returned to the meeting at 4:00 p.m.

Councilman DiCiccio asked what other strategies existed besides raising taxes, which had a greater impact on the people with fixed or lower incomes.

Vice Mayor Waring stated Phoenix should be proud to not have raised taxes in the last five years.

5:00 P.M. – ADJOURNMENT

Mayor Stanton adjourned the meeting at 4:22 p.m.

For further information, please call the Management Intern, City Manager's Office, at 602-262-4449.

For reasonable accommodations, call the Management Intern at Voice/602-262-4449 or TTY/602-534-5500 as early as possible to coordinate needed arrangements.

Si necesita traducción en español, por favor llame a la oficina del gerente de la Ciudad de Phoenix, 602-262-4449 tres días antes de la fecha de la junta.

**THE TIMES LISTED FOR AGENDA ITEMS ARE ESTIMATED.
ITEMS MAY BE DISCUSSED EARLIER OR IN A DIFFERENT
SEQUENCE.**

POLICY SESSION AGENDA

-7-

TUESDAY, APRIL 15, 2014

PHOENIX CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS

Councilman DiCiccio
Councilwoman Gallego
Councilman Gates
Councilman Nowakowski
Councilwoman Pastor
Councilman Valenzuela
Vice Mayor Waring
Councilwoman Williams
Mayor Stanton

**CITIZEN REQUESTS/COMMENTS
CITY COUNCIL FORMAL SESSION
April 16, 2014**

Pat Vint

Mr. Vint proposed moving the Citizen Requests segment of the Formal Council Session to the middle of the meeting to ensure more Councilmembers would be present to hear residents' questions and concerns. Mr. Vint expressed his regret that residents could only comment on a maximum number of five agenda items per Formal Session.

Follow up: None

Richard Zuckerman

Mr. Zuckerman expressed his regret more Councilmembers were not present during the Citizen Requests segment of the Formal Council Session. Mr. Zuckerman spoke in support of the removal of fluoride from the City's drinking water, and the primary use of natural and organic treatments to combat illness and disease.

Follow up: None

John Rusinek

Mr. Rusinek stated he attended the April 3rd Budget Hearing at the Devonshire Senior Center. Mr. Rusinek invited Councilmembers and City staff to examine the condition of his neighbor's driveway in reference to regulations in the Zoning Ordinance regarding dust-proofed surfaces.

Follow up: None

Carolyn Harrison

Ms. Harrison reported residents of Phoenix Manor established a Block Watch program, and would host a Coffee-with-a-Cop on Wednesday, April 23rd, at 8:30 a.m.

Ms. Harrison asked what volunteer opportunities existed for seniors to help the City prepare for the Super Bowl.

Follow up: Jonovich, Gallegos

Dianne Barker

Ms. Barker asked staff to include the Citizen Requests segment of Formal Council Sessions in the minutes that are approved as the meeting's official record.

Ms. Barker expressed her hope the City would use the opportunity to participate in the Super Bowl to attract the next wave of residents and businesses to Phoenix.

Follow up: None

Leonard Clark

Mr. Clark stated he was grateful for all of the assistance Grand Canyon University (GCU) provided to the homeless and low-income residents of Phoenix. Mr. Clark remarked he was uncertain GCU's recent financial contribution to the City to subsidize Car 99 and the anti-graffiti program would not cause elected officials or staff to treat GCU in a preferential manner, thereby violating the principle of separation of church and state.

Follow up: Zuercher, Brown

CITY COUNCIL AND CITIZEN REQUESTS
April 15, 2014

CITY COUNCIL INFORMATION REQUESTS

INFORMATION REQUESTS	DATE AND COUNCIL PERSON	DUE DATE	ASSIGNED TO	STATUS
<p>Councilman DiCiccio requested that staff prepare five-year and ten-year projections for the secondary property tax fund before Council is asked to vote on policies that would use resources designated for investments in critical infrastructure to pay for operational expenses. Councilman DiCiccio also asked how much money has been taken out of the secondary property tax fund since 2009.</p>	<p>April 8, 2014 Councilman DiCiccio</p>	<p>04/22/14</p>	<p>Zuercher Paniagua Young</p>	<p>Pending</p>
<p>Councilman DiCiccio requested that staff investigate the legality of pension spiking.</p>	<p>April 8, 2014 Councilman DiCiccio</p>	<p>04/22/14</p>	<p>Zuercher, Brown</p>	<p>Pending</p>
<p>Councilman DiCiccio asked staff how the elimination of \$19 million in employee pay raises, the removal of all vacant positions, and the selling of vacant city-owned property would affect the budget deficit.</p> <p>Councilman DiCiccio asked staff if salary savings in the proposed budget referred to an employee's salary or total compensation package.</p>	<p>April 15, 2014 Councilman DiCiccio</p>	<p>05/06/14</p>	<p>Zuercher, Paniagua</p>	<p>New</p>

CITIZEN REQUESTS

REQUEST	REQUEST DATE AND NAME OF CITIZEN	DUE DATE	ASSIGNED TO	STATUS
<p>Ms. Barker suggested the minutes from Formal Council Sessions were available to the public before the next Session occurred, and proposed including the Citizen Comment segment of the meeting in the minutes.</p>	<p align="center">April 2, 2014 Ms. Barker</p>	<p align="center">04/16/14</p>	<p align="center">Takata, Meyer</p>	<p align="center">Completed</p>
<p>Ms. Harrison asked what volunteer opportunities existed for seniors to help the City prepare for the Super Bowl.</p>	<p align="center">April 16, 2014 Ms. Harrison</p>	<p align="center">04/30/2014</p>	<p align="center">Blue</p>	<p align="center">New</p>
<p>Mr. Clark stated he was grateful for all of the assistance Grand Canyon University (GCU) provided homeless and low-income residents of Phoenix. Mr. Clark remarked he was uncertain GCU's recent financial contribution to the City would not cause elected officials or staff to treat GCU in a preferential manner, thereby violating the principle of separation of church and state.</p>	<p align="center">April 16, 2014 Mr. Clark</p>	<p align="center">04/30/2014</p>	<p align="center">Zuercher, Brown</p>	<p align="center">New</p>

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

GENERAL INFORMATION

TO: Ed Zuercher
City Manager

PACKET DATE: April 17, 2014

FROM: Mario Paniagua
Budget and Research Director

SUBJECT: COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS

This report transmits minutes from nine community budget hearings held between Wednesday, April 8 and Tuesday, April 15, 2014.

At phoenix.gov/Budget residents can access:

- The 2014-15 City Manager's Trial Budget
- Community Budget Hearing Schedule
- The Proposed 2014-15 Budget for Community Review tabloid in English and Spanish
- The Budget Hearing presentation video
- Videos of all completed budget hearings
- Budget Information Packet and Citywide Inventory of Programs

The Budget and Research Department also maintains an e-mail address and a voice mailbox for residents to provide comments on the budget. A summary of the electronic and voice mail comments are included through April 7, 2014.

The community budget hearings will be held through April 22. Staff will continue to transmit minutes and comments received about the budget proposal each week.

The minutes from the nine additional community budget hearings and electronic comments are provided below.

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARING
COUNCIL DISTRICT 2
TRAMANTO FIRE STATION
APRIL 8, 2014**

Deputy City Manager, Lisa Takata, opened the meeting at 6:01 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to the community budget hearing and introduced Vice Mayor Jim Waring. Vice Mayor Waring also thanked those in attendance for participating.

Vice Mayor Waring gave a brief summary of the proposed 2014-15 budget and presented the overview, describing the process in more detail. Following the presentation, he opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Ron Christensen spoke against the City Manager's salary. Mr. Christensen was concerned about over optimistic projected revenue and also stated that Police and Fire could maybe take cuts as it would not be fair to regular employees.
2. Melyna Fang spoke and submitted a comment card against stopping band-aid cuts. She supports renewing the sales tax on food or possible a luxury tax to hire more police officers. She also supported corporate sponsorships for Police Department needs.
3. Kelly Pignato did not wish to speak but submitted a card supporting reinstating the sales tax on food as Phoenix is one of two cities that does not have this tax. Ms. Pignato stated better revenue projections are needed. She also recommended raising community center fees.

Afterward, Vice Mayor Waring thanked everyone for attending and closed the budget hearing at 6:51 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Susan Robustelli
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
CITYWIDE ENGLISH/SPANISH
MARYVALE COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 8, 2014**

Councilman Daniel Valenzuela opened the Community Budget Hearing at 6:12 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. He introduced Councilman Michael Nowakowski and Councilwoman Laura Pastor.

Councilman Nowakowski commented he welcomed comments on residents' needs and wants.

Councilwoman Pastor commented several Councilmembers wanted to look at innovative ways to bundle services and new ways to generate revenue.

City Manager Ed Zuercher gave a brief summary of the proposed 2014-15 budget and asked staff to present the overview video describing the process in more detail.

Following the presentation, Mr. Zuercher introduced Mayor Greg Stanton who welcomed residents to the hearing and stated that important changes occurred in the proposed budget every year based on the input received by residents.

Mr. Zuercher then opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Dwight Amery asked that no cuts be made to police and that residents need the services provided at the youth and senior centers.
2. Ramon Aquino spoke in favor of funding for youth programs to help low income families.
3. Doc Dawkins spoke to maintain community centers which provided important services to residents.
4. Esther Aguila Dawkins spoke to maintain community centers because they provide services for the youth in the community.
5. Frank Brandenburg stated the street infrastructure around the neighborhood was in desperate need of repair. He provided pictures of the street conditions at 49th Avenue and Indian School and Garfield/McKinley at 35th Avenue.
6. Barb Heller stated she did not support any cuts to public safety or the Graffiti Busters program. She also asked the City to look into ways to increase user fees and taxes.

7. Al DePascal asked the city maintain community centers and to put a freeze on merit raises of employees.
8. Joe Garcia spoke to maintain community centers, pools, senior centers, because these are the types of services expected when residents pay taxes.
9. Marge Neiman from the Desert West Center asked the city to keep the center open because of the services it provides to the community.
10. Ruby Hill from the Desert West Center asked the city to keep the center open because of the services it provides to the community.
11. Juan Juarez spoke in favor of funding for Phoenix Channel 11 because it reaches out to the community with quality programs.
12. Miguel Angel Lopez spoke in favor of funding for the Maryvale Community Center because of the important youth services it provides.
13. Liz Ricario spoke in support for public safety programs in the community and funding for the community centers which keep kids out of trouble.
14. Maria Myers spoke in favor of bike program funding and asked the City to keep senior centers open.
15. Tyler Olsen recommended that the City provide a more participatory budgeting process for citizens that other cities around the country are starting.
16. Luis Schmidt stated that the city and residents should work together to find creative solutions to the budget deficit, including increasing revenues and keeping important services.
17. Barbara Keene spoke in support of maintaining community centers and asked the city to keep funding for the Graffiti Busters program.
18. Linda Alonzo from the Desert West Center asked the city to keep the center open because of the services it provides to the community.
19. Carol Hobbs asked to maintain community centers and asked the city to look into increasing revenues rather than eliminating services.
20. Dorothy Gentry spoke in support of keeping senior centers open because volunteers provide important services to seniors.
21. Shirley Adair submitted a card questioned the need for more taxes were needed for ongoing expenditures.

22. Silvana Salcido spoke in favor of continued funding for the Arts Programs and the Graffiti Buster program.
23. Rex Gulbranson stated he appreciated the funding for the Arts and Culture programs because they provide important events for tourists and brings in additional revenue to the City.
24. Dion Abril spoke to support maintaining the Fire Prevention program because of the important building codes that save lives.
25. Victoria Jaquez spoke against any reductions to public safety, Graffiti Busters program, and community services. She also asked the city to implement new methods of generating revenue.
26. Andrea McCoy spoke in favor of increasing revenue to restore services to the community. She also asked the city to not cut public safety.
27. Norma Ramirez spoke against any reduced funding for public safety programs because those are the services needed most in the community.
28. Marshall Pimentel spoke in favor of generating more revenue through user fee for the Light Rail and asked the City to not reduce funding for the Graffiti Busters program.
29. Brenden Robert spoke to maintain community centers because kids need libraries for reading/education. He also asked the City to increase the biking program funding.
30. Adriana Garcia spoke against any cuts to public safety and any reduction in hours at community centers.
31. Rosario Guzman spoke against closing the Desert West Center because of the services provided to the elderly residents in the area. She also spoke against any cuts to public safety programs.
32. Liz Hourican asked the city to find creative ways to increase revenues and not eliminate services.
33. Phil Hourican submitted a card that asked the city to find new revenue sources instead of eliminating services.
34. David Solano spoke against closing community centers because of the youth programs they provide. He also spoke against the level of the City Manager's pay.
35. Jessica Rubio stated that dog parks should close before any of the community centers.

36. Rosa Pastrana asked the city to not close community centers and, in fact, more centers are needed for the Maryvale area. She also asked the city to increase revenue rather than eliminating services.
37. Adelaida Garcia spoke in favor of keeping funding for community centers, pools, and youth services.
38. Aldo Gonzalez spoke against closing any of the community centers and asked the City to find additional revenue sources to provide these important services.
39. Bill Scheel from the Historic Preservation Commission spoke in favor of continued funding for historic preservation programs, including a study for the Maryvale area.

Afterward, Councilman Nowakowski summarized the comments received and clarified that the City Manager received a pay increase as a result of being promoted from the Assistant City Manager position. He thanked everyone for attending and sharing their stories.

Councilwoman Pastor thanked residents and city staff for attending this meeting. She said there are multigenerational cuts across the board. She added she believes cutting the community centers and senior centers is not acceptable. She has asked staff for additional information related to community center usage and which centers are planned to be affected.

Councilman Valenzuela thanked everyone for their comments and reiterated the hard work put into the transparency of this trial budget and that everyone's comments will be incorporated into the final version of the budget.

Mayor Stanton thanked everyone for attending and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 8:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

David R. Mays
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 5
VILLA DE LA PAZ ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
APRIL 10, 2014**

Councilman Daniel Valenzuela opened the community budget hearing at 6:07 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the proposed budget. He remarked on last year's budget compared to this year and stated it is now time to determine where the money will be coming from and the need to prioritize. Mr. Valenzuela handed the platform over to Deputy City Manager Rick Naimark.

Mr. Naimark explained the importance of budget hearings and mentioned that this is the first stage in adopting a budget. He also acknowledged city staff by raise of hands and stated they are here to help answer questions. He presented the overview video that spoke of the current budget in depth.

1. Walt Gray spoke in favor of supporting city programs and employee compensations and that pay agreements should only go through management and the unions. He supports a sales tax increase by raising it by an increment of 0.15% to cover the deficit.
2. Jesus Rodriguez supports street repairs and also feels it assists public safety by ensuring they reach their destination safely. He is against any cuts to Streets employees.
3. Thomas Jones spoke in favor of Historic Preservation. He stated that adaptive reuse of public buildings will save the city money.
4. Suzanne Thraen spoke in favor of Fire Crisis Response teams. She also is against any cuts that will affect the protection of children, seniors, and quality of life. She also favors an increase to the sales tax by an increment of 0.15% and also suggested holding raffles.
5. Victoria Jaquez asked to maintain Central Booking and against the proposed cuts to NSD. She is in favor of other revenue sources.
6. Paul Loomans spoke in favor of cycling and increased bike infrastructure. He also stated that cyclists tend to spend money in local shops more so than car riders.
7. Annie Eldon spoke in favor of bike infrastructure and transit. She noted a Baltimore, MD study that showed more jobs were created from bike infrastructure than car infrastructure. She supports continued funding for cyclists.

8. Jimmy Arbizu spoke against cuts to employees and programs for children and seniors. He also does not support contracting out services and believes it uses more money in the long run.
9. Martha Dieckman commented on the City Manager's salary. She is in favor of making cuts to top executive pay but not to remaining employees. She is in favor of reinstating the sales tax on food.

Councilman Valenzuela clarified some points made and gave his closing comments. He thanked everyone for attending and concluded the hearing at 7:29.

Respectfully submitted,

Susannah Pietrzykowsky
Budget Analyst II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 8
BROADWAY HERITAGE CENTER
APRIL 9, 2014**

Councilwoman Kate Gallego opened the community budget hearing at 6:10 p.m. by thanking everyone for attending the meeting, and inviting them to share their thoughts regarding the Trial Budget. Councilwoman Gallego acknowledged City staff and community leaders in attendance, and introduced Ed Zuercher, City Manager.

Mr. Zuercher thanked everyone for their participation, and provided a brief overview of the budget video. Councilwoman Gallego opened the hearing to public comment after the video presentation.

1. Jennifer Longdon spoke to maintain of Pioneer Pool because it was the only public barrier-free pool in the City that served disabled persons. Ms. Longdon also opposed eliminating closed-captioning for Channel 11 programs.
2. Albert Blanco asked to maintain the Fire Prevention Inspectors because they protected the public safety officers. Mr. Blanco spoke in favor of the reinstating the sales tax on food, or implementing a plastic bag tax.
3. Greta Rogers asked to maintain recreational and senior centers, and reducing employees' wages. Ms. Rogers spoke in support of raising revenue through the implementation of taxes and fees, and reducing proposed expenses in next year's budget.
4. Carmen Arias asked to maintain recreation centers. Ms. Arias spoke in favor of constructing a community center at Lindo Park.
5. Gene Holmerud spoke in favor of developing programs to teach cyclists and motorists how to share the road to promote public safety.
6. Anthony Musa asked to maintain senior and recreational facilities and reducing the number of positions in Fire Prevention and Central Booking.
7. Shanna Dumas asked if operational efficiencies could be identified in programs and facilities that benefit the youth. Ms. Dumas suggested the City charge a fee when staff removes graffiti from private property.
8. Michael Johnson asked to maintain recreational centers and reducing civilian positions in Central Booking because they placed more responsibility on Police Officers. Mr. Johnson spoke in favor or reinstating the sales tax on food,

developing a summer jobs program, and utilizing resources in the Contingency Fund.

9. Muriel Smith asked to maintain recreation centers because it might lead to increased gang activity. Ms. Smith spoke in support of raising the cost of program fees provide more revenue for community centers.
10. Paul Barnes spoke in opposition to proposed budget cuts regarding service or wage reductions. Mr. Barnes spoke in favor of increasing revenue.
11. Darlene Anaya submitted a comment card in support of keeping the community center in Lindo Park open.
12. Carole Henry asked to maintain recreation and senior centers. Ms. Henry stated residents in some neighborhoods had not recovered from the reductions in service that occurred in 2008. Ms. Henry suggested rotating programs through different facilities throughout the City instead of eliminating them altogether.
13. Jerry Clore stated all of the stakeholders in the community should face the City's budget problems together.
14. Major Lucious submitted a comment card that opposed reducing services that were critical to the residents' welfare.
15. Roy Hamilton submitted a comment card that opposed closing senior centers.
16. Anna Richardson submitted a comment card that opposed the closing of senior centers.
17. Mr. Haddad spoke in support of increasing revenue through reinstating the sales tax on food.
18. Nora Hamilton submitted a comment card asking to maintain senior centers.
19. Emilie Vazquez spoke in support of creating more dog parks and instituting a plastic bag tax.
20. Henry Barnwell submitted a comment card to maintain services that benefitted the youth, seniors, and other vulnerable populations throughout the City.
21. Michael Pops spoke in support of establishing partnerships with organizations in the private sector to develop infrastructure and programs that promote public safety. Mr. Pops suggested building a grocery store in South Phoenix.

22. Wannetta Davis stated the negative effects of the trial budget would have a larger impact on the residents of South Phoenix.
23. Libby Comer spoke in support of making larger investments in bicycle infrastructure.
24. Lisa Parks stated greater investments in bicycle infrastructure would activate streets, increase revenue, and make the streets safer for cyclists.
25. Vince Nicholes asked if Phoenix was the type of City that turned its back on its most vulnerable populations when it confronted a crisis.
26. Nellie Daniels submitted a comment card to maintain senior and recreational centers, and reducing aid to food assistance programs.
27. Michael Kelly encouraged all stakeholders in the City to participate in the budget process.
28. Mary Lou Mesa asked to maintain senior centers.
29. Jesus Rivera submitted a comment card in support of dog parks.
30. Frankie McMurry spoke in opposition to closing parks, pools, and recreation and senior centers for the youth and the elderly.
31. Bobbie McLeod spoke in support of keeping the Senior Opportunity West Senior Center open because it provided nutrition, social interaction, health and fitness education, and case management for its members.
32. Crystal Houston asked to maintain funding for the Arts. Ms. Houston stated minimizing the budget would drastically limit programs and restrict access to opportunities to enjoy or participate in the arts.
33. John Romero spoke in support of investing in bicycle infrastructure.
34. Gary Brauer spoke in support of developing ideas to increase revenue. Mr. Brauer spoke to maintain services at community centers, and reducing assistance to local food banks.
35. Jessica Beresford spoke in support of implementing methods to improve the quality of management of community centers. Ms. Beresford spoke in favor of establishing partnerships with the private and non-profit sectors to increase the caliber and number of programs available at recreational centers, and raising the cost of user fees.

36. Louis Acosta spoke in support of creating more efficient operational and reporting processes for the Graffiti Busters program. Mr. Acosta spoke in favor of aggressively exploring right-sourcing opportunities.
37. Kurt Mangum spoke in support of researching what other cities across the country were doing to increase revenue. Mr. Mangum stated it was difficult to attract new residents and businesses to an area if children were not safe or had nothing to do. Mr. Mangum spoke in favor of reducing expenses through pension reform.
38. Amaris Plascencia submitted a comment card in favor of establishing more dog parks in the City.
39. Mario Leyva submitted a comment card in support of dog parks.
40. Gilona Galeno submitted a comment card in support of dog parks.
41. Betty Ware spoke in favor of reinstating the sales tax on food to raise revenue. Ms. Ware stated the proposed budget cuts would have the negatively impact the lives of the youth and seniors.
42. Felix Trejo asked to maintain services at senior centers.

Mr. Zuercher thanked everyone in attendance. Councilwoman Gallego thanked the residents of District 8 for their dedication and passion, and for sharing their ideas and budget priorities. Councilwoman Gallego closed the budget hearing at 8:15 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Thaddis Jackson
Management Intern

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
CENTRAL CITY SOUTH
EMMETT McLOUGHLIN COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 10, 2014**

Deputy City Manager Deanna Jonovich opened the meeting at 5:39 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance, thanking them for coming to the community budget hearing and presented the video overview of the proposed budget.

Following the presentation, Ms. Jonovich stated that the Mayor and City Council look forward to hearing from residents and opened the meeting to public comments.

1. Mary Rose Wilcox spoke in favor of continuing funding for the senior centers in the community because of the resources they provide low income families.
2. Shannon Dubasik asked to maintain University Park because of the important services it provides to the community.
3. Mary Alvarez asked to maintain services at Marcos de Niza Senior Center and Harmon Park because of the important services they provide to low income families.
4. Job Salinas Hernandez spoke in support of services at Marcos de Niza Senior Center and Harmon Park because of the important services they provide to low income families.
5. Calistro Rosales spoke in support of services at Marcos de Niza Senior Center and Harmon Park because of the important services they provide to low income families.
6. Grace Arroyo Salinas asked the city to use new taxes to help fund youth services at community centers.
7. Raul Daniels spoke in favor of funding for youth services to keep kids off the street and out of trouble.
8. Ginger Baron asked to continue services at Marcos de Niza senior center, pools, and any year round recreation activities. She also stated that dog parks should close before any community center.
9. Arthur Murillo asked that the youth services provided by the city get its fair share of financial support and that more input from low income families was need as part of the budget process since they rely on these services so much.

10. David Galavis expressed concern over reductions in youth programs that help children stay out of trouble and asked the city to not fund any part of the costs to host next year's Super Bowl.
11. Eva O. Olivas spoke about how the community and the city should work together to resolve the budget deficit and stated that the current budget is unacceptable and hoped the city could develop a budget that did not affect so many community services.
12. Selena Salazar asked to maintain services at community centers because they keep the communities safer. The youth programs help kids with activities that keep them off the street. She asked the city to keep services equal throughout the city and do not concentrate on low income areas.
13. Peter Martin spoke about how important community togetherness was and that the city needed to work with its partners to resolve the budget deficit and keep the important services that are identified as possible cuts.
14. Maria Herren stated opposition to the closing of any parks, libraries, or pools during the summer because these locations are safe for kids to visit.
15. Stanley Johns asked the city to keep the parks open.
16. Gloria Gonzalez asked to maintain services at community or youth centers especially in low income areas where the services are needed the most. She asked that the city be equitable in reducing services in all communities.
17. Michael Stevens asked to maintain services at senior or youth centers.
18. Mary Chou-Thompson submitted a card asking that the city not eliminate any youth programs because they are important to the city.

Afterward, Ms. Jonovich thanked everyone for attending and providing their important input into the city's budget process and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 6:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

David R. Mays
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 1
GOELET A. BEUF COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 10, 2014**

Councilwoman Williams opened the community budget hearing at 6:06 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget. She introduced Deputy City Manager Rick Naimark and indicated the presentation would provide valuable information about the proposed budget.

Mr. Naimark gave a brief summary of the proposed 2014-15 budget and asked staff to present the overview video describing the process in more detail. Following the presentation, Councilwoman Williams opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Karen Young spoke in support to maintain services at community centers and stated both seniors and children would be negatively impacted if the center was closed. She stated it would also increase the crime rate if the centers were closed.
2. Jack Davis spoke in favor of leaving the Beuf Community Center open and bike safety. He supported reinstating the sales tax on food to help resolve the budget deficit.
3. Ronald Vaught spoke against the proposed spending cuts and stated he thought more revenue ideas would help resolve the budget problem.
4. Geri Bowers asked that services be maintained at community centers for seniors.
5. Betty VerMeer spoke in favor of keeping the Deer Valley Community Center opened.
6. Linda Fleur requested services continue at community centers.
7. Rosalie Hurd spoke in support of services at community centers and stated how important the fitness programs are for the children.
8. Rosa Pecaro stated seniors have contributed to the community and closing the Deer Valley Community Center would be a hardship for seniors and children.
9. Charles Bube spoke in support of maintaining community centers and supported finding better ways to spend city resources. He stated he is against the dog parks.

10. Alvin McCarty spoke in support of maintaining services at Beuf Community Center and stated persons with disabilities benefit from the centers. He asked if the City Council offices are also cutting their budgets and stated many children and seniors eat at the centers.
11. Miranda Cain from the Greater Phoenix Chamber of Commerce supported the proposed spending cuts and is opposed to any tax increases. She supported efforts to expand the business community.
12. Dawn Titles stated he had concerns about the budget and wanted to know how the city went from being structurally balanced to now showing a deficit.
13. Barb Heller spoke against the proposed budget and suggested increasing fees to help keep community centers opened.
14. Al Lauwers asked to maintain services at senior centers and stated he does not support the dog parks.
15. Judi Haenel spoke in support of increasing revenues to help solve the budget deficit. She stated she supports reinstating the sales tax on food and charging businesses fees. Additionally, Ms. Haenel stated she did not agree with raising the City Manager's salary.
16. Charles Fortner spoke in favor of reducing the number of managers.
17. Richard Eon spoke against the proposed budget cuts and stated spending is too high.
18. Barbara Eon spoke in favor of maintaining community centers and purchasing golf courses. She also spoke against the dog parks and proposed enhancements to Margaret T. Hance Park.
19. James Main spoke against spending by the City Council offices and the proposed budget cuts.
20. Ralph Battaglin asked to maintain services at the Beuf Community Center and the proposed budget.
21. Becky White spoke in favor of increasing revenues to keep senior centers open. She also spoke in favor of police officers and is against closing central booking.
22. Carol Blundall spoke in favor of keeping the senior centers open and reserve a ride. Mr. Naimark stated he would have staff follow up with Ms. Blundall regarding transportation.
23. Kent Snider spoke in favor or restoring the sales tax on food and other revenue increases to help resolve the budget shortfall.

24. Carol Trevilian spoke in favor of maintaining the Beuf Community Center.
25. Art True spoke in support of the community and senior centers.
26. Jay Caruthers spoke in support of the community centers and stated the center provides valuable services to seniors and children. He stated he is concerned about property values declining if the centers are closed.
27. Barbara Gonzales spoke in support of the community centers and fee increases but supports reinstating the sales tax on food. She also spoke against closing central booking and reductions to fire prevention services.
28. Robert Suich spoke in support of the community centers and suggested reducing salaries of top managers to help resolve the budget deficit.
29. Ron (no last name provided) spoke against taxes and in favor of keeping the community centers opened for seniors.
30. Rupesh Ratkaran spoke in favor of Beuf Community Center and the children and fitness programs offered at the center.
31. Friar Henry Wasielweski spoke in favor of keeping the Deer Valley Community Center open. He spoke against the proposed cuts and supports reinstating the sales tax on food.
32. Suzanne Day spoke in favor of bike infrastructure and public transit services. She stated she supports reinstating the sales tax on food and is also against closing community centers.
33. Mike Ornosky stated he is a City employee and provided several ideas to help resolve the budget deficit including a possible tariff or fees to contractors doing business with the city. He recommended advertising opportunities as another way to generate revenue.
34. Walt Gray spoke in favor of increasing the retail sales tax rate to help resolve the budget deficit and supported restoring previous budget cuts. He spoke against reinstating the sales tax on food. He also spoke in support of workforce development to create jobs.
35. Lisa Parks spoke in favor of bike infrastructure.
36. Libby Coyner spoke in favor of bike infrastructure, community centers and reinstating the sales tax on food.
37. Regina Nixon spoke in favor of the arts and music programs offered at the community centers. She also spoke in favor of police and fire services, keeping the pools opened and reinstating the sales tax on food.

38. Roxanne Allen, a retired City of Phoenix employee, spoke in favor of the sales tax on food and evaluating Council budgets for possible reductions. She supports community centers, summer programs, diving teams and the pools.
39. Logan and Bethany Sterne spoke in favor of keeping the Beuf community center opened and the children's programs, specifically the swim teams.
40. Steve Gesler spoke in favor of the Beuf Community Center, homeless programs and reinstating the sales tax on food. He also supports other revenue ideas including a potential tax on spring training facilities and optimizing the website.
41. Luis Acosta, a retired City of Phoenix employee, spoke against over spending by the city. He spoke in favor of more transparency with the budget and recommended increasing fines for graffiti offenders.
42. Jeanne Bowling asked to maintain city pools and supports the swimming teams.
43. Lou Snow thanked Councilwoman Williams for her work in the community, specifically revitalization efforts.
44. Vicky Phetteplace spoke in support of the community centers, mainly Beuf and Deer Valley, and closure of public pools. She also supports reinstating the sales tax on food.
45. Julia Kerytkowski submitted a card wanting to know how much money was used in other areas that could be allotted to parks and recreation. She indicated she is in favor of keeping pools opened and the community centers opened.
46. Cindy Jones submitted a card supporting increasing fees to keep the community centers opened and reinstating the sales tax on food. She indicated keeping the centers opened will keep kids off the streets and will help to prevent crime.
47. Laverne McArthur submitted a card supporting increasing fees to keep community centers opened, reinstating the sales tax on food and slot machines at the race track.
48. Tom and Rita Kleykamp submitted a card in support of the Deer Valley Community Center.
49. Khue Do submitted a card opposing reductions to human services volunteer programs such as the COMFORT program and crisis intervention programs that help domestic violence victims.
50. Cheryl Colin submitted a card spoke in support of the community centers and indicated it would be detrimental to the children's summer programs.

51. Stacey Arvanaghi submitted a card in favor of charging fees for classes to help keep the Beuf Community Center opened. She indicated it would be a disaster to the community if the center was closed.
52. Travis Andrews submitted a card in favor of the recreation center for children.
53. Travis Brown submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center.
54. Charles Hoover submitted a card in support of community center services.
55. Stefanie Taylor submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center, specifically the sports programs and fitness classes.
56. Christina Taylor submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center, specifically the sports and exercise programs.
57. Yuntao Zhu submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center.
58. Jason Stokes submitted a card opposing the proposed budget cuts and supporting reinstating the sales tax on food and seeking other potential revenue sources.
59. Brenda Morgan submitted a card supporting reinstating the sales tax on food to help keep the following programs and services: police central booking, neighborhood inspector positions, graffiti busters, community prosecutors, funding for street repairs and senior centers.
60. Mary E. Kitchen submitted a card to maintain services to the police department, activities at Rose Mofford Park, street repairs, senior centers, graffiti busters and blight inspectors. She supports reinstating the sales tax on food.
61. Bernard Columby submitted a card supporting increased funding to help seniors.
62. Don Schilling submitted a card in support of the senior centers.
63. Thomas Marshall Olsen submitted a card supporting the continuation of the senior lunch program and ballroom dancing classes.
64. Jacob DuMers submitted a card in support of the gym at the Beuf Community Center.
65. Lorik Muslin submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated he and his friends frequent the center often to play basketball.
66. Nick Wafford submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated it is the only place where he can play basketball.

67. Cheryl Norman submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center. She indicated the center provides classes to children which keep them active and if the center is closed crime would increase.
68. Andrew Cordoza submitted a card in favor of charging residents a \$50 annual fee for residents and a \$70 annual fee for non-residents to help keep the Beuf Community Center open.
69. J.A. Hill submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated it would negatively impact seniors and children specifically during school breaks.
70. Dauntel Dukes submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center.
71. Patti Kramer submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated it would cause a serious hardship to seniors and community members.
72. Darryl Fulmer submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated the center helps to keep kids out of trouble and gives seniors companionship.
73. Rosa Violeta Wegrón submitted a card in support of the Beuf Community Center and indicated the center helps seniors and children.
74. Mark Lawrence Harris submitted a card in support of parks and recreation and senior centers.
75. Reace Lambert submitted a card to maintain recreation centers and indicated the centers help to keep kids out of trouble.

Councilwoman Williams thanked everyone for attending the meeting and providing feedback about the proposed budget. She closed the meeting at 8:56 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Amber Williamson
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICTS 4 & 8
PHOENIX CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL
April 10, 2014**

Councilwoman Laura Pastor opened the community budget hearing at 6:05 p.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City's proposed budget.

Acting Assistant City Manager Danny Murphy introduced city staff. He gave a brief overview of the budget and then presented the video describing the proposed budget in detail.

Afterward, Councilwoman Kate Gallego expressed that she does not support this trial budget. She added she promotes bike safety and infrastructure as well as personal ID cards. She opened the hearing to public comment.

1. Seneca Boulanger spoke to maintain services at her local park on 67th and Encanto. She and her family utilize the park to play sports and spend time.
2. Paul Barnes spoke against the proposed service cuts and does not support balancing the budget by reducing employee wages, which he feels would decrease morale. He proposes to increase revenue and advocates for the food tax.
3. John Walker spoke in favor of increased bike infrastructure and safer cycling. He would like bicycle funding to continue. Mr. Walker noted a study showing that bicyclists bring in local revenue by remaining in the area to eat and shop.
4. G.G. George spoke against the proposed budget but supports increased revenue options such as reinstating the sales tax on food. She also supports parks programs and its amenities stating it is a vital component to the City.
5. Mary Moore does not support closing her local pool and advocates for the Neighborhood Services attorneys in order to preserve local neighborhoods. She also supports bringing back the sales tax on food and finding other revenue streams.
6. Derek Horn supports Historic Preservation as he feels it retains stability in neighborhoods.
7. Richard Siever submitted a card in favor of continuing or increasing park services.

8. Luis Schmidt spoke against the proposed services cuts explaining that many residents rely on those services. He spoke in favor of the community centers and Ironwood pool. He is against making cuts to employee wages.
9. Joseph Benesh spoke in favor of the Arts programs as it is vital to investing in the children. He also supports a bag tax and bringing back the food tax.
10. Sandra L. Lilley submitted a card for her support of the community centers. She explained they are essential to keeping the youth occupied and off the streets. In addition, she is against any cuts to fire and police and is requesting more.
11. Lori Gonzalez spoke in favor of restoring the 1% on sales tax on food and extending it past its sunset date. She expressed concerns regarding the closure of senior centers, particularly in District 8.
12. Emelie Vazquez spoke of her support of a plastic bag tax as well as her support of a dog park in the district.
13. Gustavo Vasquez spoke of his support for a dog park in the area.
14. Clarissa Felix spoke in favor of a plastic bag tax and a dog park in the area.
15. Charlene Tarver spoke in favor parks and recreation programs as well as Arts. She favors additional revenue resources in order retain services for children's health, safety, and welfare.
16. Abraham James supports the arts programs, library, transit, senior and youth centers, neighborhood services, public works, fire, and police. They are essential in order to retain the status as a world-class city.
17. Julie Witenstein and her daughter spoke in favor of the arts, especially for the Teen Art Guild explaining it provides youth an outlet to keep busy and increase their confidence.
18. Joe Murphy supports a plastic bag tax and does not support employee cuts.
19. Bill Cusimano supports charging for parking at popular parks and reinstate charging for metered parking after hours and weekends. He does not support cutting essential employee positions, Fire Response teams and maintenance workers. He supports additional revenue sources.
20. Anthony Leach supports cutting executive salaries in order to retain recreation centers and other services for his children. He also spoke in favor of increasing funding for police.

21. Giona Galeno spoke in favor of recreation centers, a dog park, and promoting a plastic bag tax. She stated recreation centers allow people to bond and relieve stress.
22. Juana Mendoza submitted a card wishing to support dog parks and a tax on plastic bags.
23. Dan Carroll spoke in favor of alternative revenue such as the sales tax on food, a cellular public safety fee, mountain parks parking fee, a tax on graffiti supplies, and a plastic bag fee. He is not in favor of the proposed budget and does not favor balancing budget on the rank and file men and women.
24. Jennifer Boucek spoke in favor of personnel that support historic preservation as well as other employees. She supports reinstating the 1% on sales tax on food and extending it. She also expressed her hope in ensuring the budget is secure for the future instead of just temporarily.
25. AJ Marsden spoke in favor of the sales tax on food. She also expressed her concern with user fees as a revenue source since it could potentially hurt the ones that can't afford them. She opposes the elimination of Central Booking.
26. Tanya Callaway expressed her disappointment that Phoenix is not committed to a live/work/play mentality. She explained her perspective while searching possible relocation areas for herself and her small business.
27. Monique Lange spoke against closing the Long View Recreation Center or any other recreation center with an after-school program. She supports increasing fees up to \$150/semester if they could remain open. She also requested more activities be offered. She also supports a dog park.

Councilwoman Pastor thanked everyone for participating in the hearing and expressed her support for senior centers, fire, police, and historic preservation in her closing comments.

Councilwoman Gallego thanked everyone for their suggestions and she concluded the hearing at 7:27.

Respectfully submitted,

Susannah Pietrzykowsky
Budget Analyst II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 6
MADISON SCHOOL DISTRICT, DISTRICT OFFICE
April 10, 2014**

Councilman Sal DiCiccio opened the meeting by welcoming those in attendance and thanking them for coming to comment on the City budget.

Councilman Stanton introduced City Manager Mr. Ed Zuercher who explained that the City was looking for input from residents on the budget. A video of the budget was presented. Following the presentation, Mr. DiCiccio opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Scott Sefranka spoke to maintain services at senior centers, pools, Central Booking, and the Police Air Support Unit. Mr. Sefranka suggested increasing revenue by selling vacant properties.
2. Ginnie Ann Sumner spoke in support of cross training staff to complete right-of-way and sign enforcement inspections.
3. Nathan Mabley spoke in support of reducing the Police Air Support Unit due to noise nuisances he routinely experiences at his home.
4. Robert Topolosek, Fire Inspector, spoke against reductions to the fire inspection program.
5. Charles Wilfong spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food. Mr. Wilfong asked to maintain services at pools and funding for the Melrose Archway and Margaret T. Hance Park restoration projects.
6. Richard Rea spoke in support of restoring the sales tax on food and partnering together to fix the budget. Mr. Rea noted the City Manager was promoted which was the reason for the salary increase.
7. Sarah Kriehn, Phoenix Arts Commission, spoke in of funding for the Office of Arts and Culture budget. Ms. Kriehn spoke against the \$123,000 reduction to arts grants funding.
8. Per Klype spoke in favor of raising prices to ride public transit, moving city employees to the Affordable Care Act insurance in lieu of city provided insurance, and privatizing city services. Mr. Klype spoke against pension spiking.
9. Gladys Butt spoke in support of the City Manager and senior centers.

10. Nicole Rodriguez spoke in favor of fire prevention services, field officers for Neighborhood Services Department, zero tolerance for hostility in the work place, and increasing health care costs to employees to offset the increase in employee insurance coverage rates. Ms. Rodriguez questioned the Safer Grant to fund fire fighters and the closure of recreational centers.
11. Janet Traylor spoke in favor of funding for the Office of Arts and Culture budget.
12. Neal Haddad, Citizens for Phoenix, spoke in favor of restoring the sales tax on food to fiscal year 2012 funding levels.
13. Eddie Jones spoke in favor of funding for the Office of Arts and Culture budget.
14. Matt Marcus did not speak but asked about the process for obtaining funding for capital improvement projects.
15. Amina Krick spoke in support of facilities supporting the disabled. Ms. Krick spoke against the closure of Pioneer Park as there is no close substitute to this facility for the disabled who are not capable of driving to another location for the same uses. Ms. Krick asked about the feasibility study for the ABIL Center in Phoenix.
16. Susan Loga spoke in favor of increasing the fees for parks and recreation and senior programming to achieve cost recovery.
17. Nick Ramirez spoke in favor of restoring the sales tax on food, funding for the Office of Arts and Culture, emergency responders, and street repairs.
18. Gary Brewer spoke against all the budget cuts. Mr. Brewer spoke in favor of restoring the sales tax on food.
19. Ed Blunden provided information about the City's pension system.
20. Jane Conway did not speak but submitted a card in favor of reducing the cost of building lower income apartments and reducing pension costs to taxpayers. Ms. Conway stated she did not support the City Manager's pay or water-rate raises.

Afterward, Councilman DiCiccio thanked everyone for attending, and closed the Community Budget Hearing at 7:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Laura A. Madson Brown
Management Assistant II

**SUMMARY MINUTES
COMMUNITY BUDGET HEARINGS
COUNCIL DISTRICT 3 and 5
SUNNYSLOPE COMMUNITY CENTER
APRIL 15, 2014**

Councilman Bill Gates opened the Community Budget Hearing at 7:32 a.m. by welcoming those in attendance and thanking staff and residents for attending. He informed everyone that Councilman Daniel Valenzuela would be there shortly. He then introduced City Manager Ed Zuercher who introduced a budget overview video which described the budget process in more detail.

Following the presentation, Councilman Gates introduced Mayor Greg Stanton and thanked him for attending the hearing. Mayor Stanton thanked everyone for coming and emphasized the importance the citizens' comments have on the final adopted budget due to our hyper-public budget process. Councilman Gates then opened the hearing to public comments.

1. Winifred Green spoke about her confusion of why we now need cuts after being the top run city only 5 years ago.

Mayor Stanton thanked her for all she's done for Sunnyslope. He said that although we aren't the same as we were five years ago, Councilman Gates has helped us find efficiencies in our city over the past five years. Despite the cuts over the years, we received the highest customer service ratings from the public.

2. Auria and Herlinda Cerbas spoke in support of keeping the senior centers and community centers open. They suggested the increase in the City Manager's salary could have been used to support cuts.
3. Tee Lambert asked how the budget cuts are determined by the City. She supports and encourages creative revenue ideas.
4. Judy Guilds spoke in support of new revenue and does not want to see budget cuts in the arts programs.
5. Patsy Bauer spoke in support of keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center.
6. Craig Tribken supports more funding for the homeless shelters and services.
7. Harold Brazer spoke in support of keeping the community centers and senior centers open.
8. Linda Smith spoke in support of our libraries and was happy to find out library funding is earmarked from property taxes.
9. Sherry Rampy spoke in support of the Historic Preservation Commission.

10. June Gibson asked to maintain services at senior centers.
11. Elizabeth Hourican offered a suggestion of the City putting PV solar panels on every building in Phoenix to generate revenue and reduce costs.

Councilman Gates responded that both he and the Mayor support solar programs.

12. Carol Norris spoke in support of the senior and community centers. She suggested leasing vehicles instead of buying them, comparing salaries to other neighboring organizations and capping them, and contracting for more services to save on personal services costs.
13. Robert Andrews spoke in support of the community centers.
14. Mark Greenberg spoke in support of senior and community centers. He suggested a 1% tax on food in restaurants and bars and earmark this revenue for the community centers.

At 8:25 a.m., Councilman Valenzuela joined the meeting.

15. Paul Loomans spoke in support of more bicycle infrastructure for both safety and to promote economic development.
16. Michelle Goings spoke in support of arts and culture to attract more people into Phoenix which would lead to increased tax revenue.
17. Roger Peck spoke in support of keeping the senior and community centers, swimming centers and parks open. He would like to see more of the park rangers restored from the prior year cuts.

Councilman Gates responded that although we have not restored all of the previously cut park rangers, we did restore some of them last budget year.
18. Gene Derie believes we have cut too much over the years and we must keep the centers open. He supports increasing taxes.
19. Walt Gray is opposed to the proposed cuts. He supports employee raises and suggests adding an increment of 0.15% to the general sales tax, but not the sales tax on food.
20. David Bickford spoke in support of senior centers and community centers as well as more funding for bicycle infrastructure. He would also like to see improvements on the frequency of the bus and light rail transportation system.
21. Michael Spano supports keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center and senior centers open.
22. Betsy Durkin spoke in support of keeping the community centers open.

23. Leslie Spencer-Snyder spoke to oppose any more cuts to our parks. She supports keeping the sales tax on food and finding new revenue sources.
24. Bob Boelke spoke in support of keeping the senior centers and libraries open.
25. Janet Valder and Claudia Cardenos spoke in support of keeping the after school programs, community centers, swimming pool hours and children programs.
26. James Natziger spoke in support of the Sunnyslope Senior Center as well as the youth and outdoor recreation programs.
27. Lillian Barker spoke in support of homeless centers, youth services and senior centers because they keep people healthy which in turn saves us money. She does not support lowering employee's wages and would support increased fees and taxes other than the sales tax on food.
28. S. Elaine spoke in support of keeping the senior centers open. She stated the economically depressed areas are harder hit by the loss of services.
29. Laura Gonzales spoke in support of all the community centers.
30. Barbara Shaw Snyder spoke in support of ensuring the cuts are not disproportionately affecting specific individuals or specific districts. She also supports funding for street infrastructure.
31. Greta Rogers spoke in support of raising sales tax by an increment of 0.1% and reinstating the sales tax on food permanently. She opposes cuts to the senior centers, parks and the police civil services.

Councilman Gates clarified that the need for cuts was not entirely due to cutting the sales tax on food. The sales tax on food cut amounted to \$14 million while the total deficit was \$38 million.

32. Jack Charters spoke in support of the Sunnyslope Community Center.
33. Colby Jeffers spoke in favor of keeping the community centers open for our youth and teens.

At 9:15 a.m., Councilman Gates thanked everyone for attending and left the meeting.

34. Suzanne Day spoke in support of keeping the community centers open. She supports keeping the sales tax on food as well as creating a plastic bag and bottle tax. She also supports bicycle infrastructure and public transportation improvements.
35. Mike Stewart spoke in support of keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center open.

36. Carey Mavin spoke in support of keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center open.
37. Benjamin Spano spoke in favor of keeping the Sunnyslope Community Center open.

The following individuals did not speak, but attended the meeting and submitted comments:

38. Craig Dean suggested reducing bulk trash pickups to twice a year instead of four times per year.
39. Hal Mokbiz is in support of keeping the community centers open.
40. Ellen Judd is in support of children and seniors – quality of life is so important.
41. Gerda Sullivan is concerned that the budget cuts always affect the most vulnerable people in society.
42. Kay Schnizlein is in support of keeping all community centers and senior centers open. She also supports adding solar to all public buildings and is in favor of a plastic bag tax.
43. Pam Fitzgerald is in favor of increasing revenues, cutting the City Manager's salary, eliminating pension spiking and no police cuts.

Mayor Stanton went over the budget calendar and reminded the audience that council will make budget decisions in mid-May. He then introduced Councilman Valenzuela.

Councilman Valenzuela spoke about how wonderful and diverse Sunnyslope is and thanked all the senior citizens who attended today and reminded them that their comments really will make a difference.

The community budget hearing closed at 9:26 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary Scrivens
Budget Analyst III

**SUMMARY MINUTES
VOICEMAIL, ELECTRONIC, AND WRITTEN BUDGET COMMENTS
Through April 6, 2014**

1. DeeAnn Chan sent an email in support of maintaining community centers and pools.
2. Karen Recker sent an email to maintain funding for community centers.
3. Lily Henson sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Beuf Community Center.
4. Kristel Jonkosky sent an email to maintain community pools.
5. Kristina Troost sent an email in support of maintaining summer recreational swim and dive teams.
6. Nilesh Joshi sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Beuf Community Center.
7. Julie Elefante sent an email in support of funding parks and recreation services.
8. Choi Lee sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Mountain View Community Center including their senior ping pong program.
9. Jennifer Fryer sent an email to please reconsider the closure of city pools and recreation centers for the summer.
10. Ron and Ruth Brown sent an email stating a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow the City to solve the deficit problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
11. Debi and Dan wall sent an email in support of maintaining services at Mountain View Community Center. They suggested staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues to balance the budget.
12. Collen Connolly sent an email to maintain parks and recreation programs.
13. Rosemary Holusha sent an email to maintain City pools and swim and dive teams. She also questioned hiring an Assist City Manager.
14. MoniQue Simpson sent an email to maintain funding for Pecos Community Center.

15. Brent Grove sent an email suggesting the City needs a new City Manager. He commented he supported reducing the City Manager's salary.
16. Debi Huss sent an email to requesting to not cut recreation centers.
17. Micheal Espinoza sent an email recommending the Municipal Court create a night court to sentence criminals, thus avoiding pay the jail fee for those released until their court date.
18. Brandi Flores sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Mountain View Community Center.
19. Hua Mo sent an email to maintain services at the Pecos Community Center.
20. Teresa Lueken sent an email to maintain services at community centers and pools.
21. Jennifer Mawyer sent an email in support of summer recreation programs, community centers and City pools.
22. Timna Guerchon sent an email stating many parents rely on programs at the community services. She asked the City to please reconsider these cuts.
23. Roy Miller sent an email about the importance of maintenance at Encanto Park.
24. An anonymous person called to ask that community center programs and hours be maintained.
25. Meghan Masterson sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
26. Leah Harris sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
27. Jamie Trammell sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
28. Kristen Johnson sent an email to maintain programs and City pools.
29. Janelle Rastad sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
30. LaDonna Harvey sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Deer Valley Community Center. She asked the City to clean up their finances and find waste to support reducing the budget deficit.
31. Leah Derewicz sent an email in support of services at Pecos Community Center and pool.

32. Staci Lesueur sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
33. Lisa Warren sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
34. Mary Jo Santistevan sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Community Center.
35. Brian Stash sent an email in support of funding community centers.
36. Kimberly Micheau sent an email to keep City pools open in the community.
37. Emily Sandhu sent an email in support of swim and dive programs.
38. Katie Libby sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Beuf Community Center.
39. Jordyn DeFriez sent an email in support of maintaining parks and recreation funding.
40. Breck Labrecque sent an email in support of maintaining services at the Sunnyslope Community Center.
41. Tamii Kujawa sent an email in support of maintaining services at Pecos Pool.
42. Diane Russo sent an email in support of services at community centers and pools.
43. Shar Zapp sent an email in support of maintaining swim and dive programs.
44. Ronda S. Reed sent an email to maintain services at Paradise Valley Community Center.
45. Jean Pratt sent an email in support of services at community centers.
46. Tory Kirkpatrick sent an email to maintain services at the Paradise Valley Community Center.
47. Ralph & Carolyn Chilelli sent an email stating a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
48. John Norris also sent an email to propose a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
49. George Young sent an email to reconsider closing any recreation centers, pools, or adult centers

50. Kathryn Halsey sent an email to say revenues, not cuts, will move us forward. She added she feel it was short-sighted to drop the sales tax on food and feel Arizona needs to learn how to tax itself responsibly.
51. Loretta Frawley sent an email in support of maintaining services at Mountain View Community Center.
52. Robert Kostewa sent an email stating a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
53. Ruth Brown sent an email stating a balanced approach of staff-proposed efficiencies, limited cuts and increased revenues will allow us to solve this problem without relying on deep, deep cuts or employee concessions.
54. Richard Sparber sent an email to retain programs for seniors, arts and low income participants.
55. Loretta Frawley sent an email in support of maintaining services at Mountain View Community Center.
56. Carol Kropf sent an email to maintain services at Beuf Community Center.
57. Christine Grumeretz sent an email about the importance of the Paradise Valley Community Center to her family.
58. Susan Crookston sent an email in support of maintaining programs at the Paradise Valley Community Center.
59. Heidi Combs sent an email in support of maintaining community centers.
60. Judy Bernstein sent an email to maintain services at community centers. She recommended increasing recreation fees to offset costs.
61. Daranna L. Johnson sent an email to maintain services at community centers. She recommended increasing recreation fees to offset costs.
62. April Pak sent an email to reconsider maintaining swim programs.
63. Candace Jones-Pehlic sent an email to support services at community centers. She suggested charging organizations for use of meeting rooms.
64. Brenna Schear sent an email to maintain services at Beuf Community Center.
65. Mayra Lerdahl called to ask to please reconsider closing community centers and pools.

66. Arnold Jurn sent an email supporting the City cutting the Neighborhood Services Department.
67. Janis and Daniel Myers sent an email to maintain swim and dive programs.
68. Thomas Reeder sent an email to maintain services at the Deer Valley Community Center and suggested employee concessions to address the budget.
69. West Side Town Hall Steering Committee sent an email supporting an added increment of 0.15% to the general sales tax for workforce development (\$500,000), full restoration of library hours, full restoration of PAC programs, more police, and more Community & Economic Development staff for the city's new economic development plan.
70. Mary called to say that the dog parks are unnecessary and funding should be used for swim programs instead.
71. Victoria Jaquez sent an email in support of maintaining community centers and programs.
72. Megan Wahl sent an email to maintain swim and dive programs.
73. Kara Barron sent an email to maintain services at the Deer Valley Community Center.
74. Lachell Merrell sent an email to maintain community centers.
75. Cynthia Grunert sent an email to support services at the Beuf Community Center.
76. Jim Fox sent an email in support of maintaining programs at community centers.
77. George Holusha sent an email requesting to balance the budget through employee concessions and not reduce any services. He added he supported eliminating bonuses, reducing middle manager and executive pay and eliminating vacation and sick leave buy outs.
78. Heather Paulk sent an email to maintain swimming programs and pools.
79. Kitty and Brandon sent an email in support of preserving programs at community centers.
80. Gilbert Gonzales asked to consider freezing pay increases rather than having employee furlough days.
81. Joel Anderson sent an email asking to at a minimum maintain current pay levels for employees. He also suggested paying employees for benefits and let them manage them instead.
82. Kathleen Hoffman sent an email suggesting bus pass perk be eliminated.

83. Nancy K. Williams sent an email to maintain services at the community centers.
84. Erin Rodriguez sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
85. Peggy Espinoza sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
86. Kelly Figliola sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
87. Jackie Y. sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
88. Casey Smith sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.
89. Marion Upper sent an email to request maintaining services at community centers.
90. Nylin Lightford sent an email in support of maintaining programs at Desert West Community Center.

Respectfully Submitted

Julie Flaskerud
Management Assistant

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

CITIZEN REQUEST

TO: Lisa Takata
Deputy City Manager

PACKET DATE: April 17, 2014

FROM: Cris Meyer
City Clerk

SUBJECT: RESPONSE TO CITIZEN REQUEST FROM APRIL 2, 2014 - DIANNE
BARKER

THE ISSUE

This report provides the City Council with information in response to Dianne Barker's comments at the April 2, 2014 Citizen Comment session regarding minutes of formal City Council meetings. Ms. Barker suggested that minutes from the formal Council meetings be available to the public before the next meeting, and proposed that the meeting minutes include remarks made by residents at the Citizen Comments sessions.

OTHER INFORMATION

The minutes of the formal meetings are the permanent historical record of the proceedings and must be accurate. The minutes are prepared as expeditiously as possible with available resources. Following their preparation, the minutes are reviewed and approved by the City Council at a formal meeting. The approved minutes are then posted to phoenix.gov and are also available in the City's public records database.

Individuals have access to information about what occurred at a formal Council meeting before the final minutes are approved. A summary of the results of every formal meeting is posted on phoenix.gov immediately, on the day of the meeting. The public may subscribe to an e-mail list serve to receive a notification as soon as the results are available online. On the day after each formal meeting, videos of the meeting are available on phoenix.gov and YouTube. In addition, a copy of the closed-captioning transcript of the meeting is available upon request.

In regard to Ms. Barker's request that the minutes of the formal meeting include public comments, the Arizona Open Meeting Law limits discussion at the meeting to items on the posted meeting agenda. Comments made by the public related to posted agenda items are included in the meeting minutes. Comments made during the citizen comment sessions before and after the meeting are not included in the meeting minutes. However, summaries of the requests made during citizen comment sessions are distributed to the City Council and are available to the public in the Council packet posted on phoenix.gov each week.

RECOMMENDATION

This item is for information only.