

# PHOENIX ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY and SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION MINUTES

**November 10, 2022**

Phoenix City Hall  
Online Using Webex

<b>Commission Members Present</b>	<b>City Staff Present</b>
Bill Sandweg, via phone	Tricia Balluff, Office of Environmental Programs (OEP)
Caroline Lobo, via phone	Mark Hartman, Office of Sustainability
Colin Tetreault, via phone	Felipe Moreno, Public Works (PW)
Darren Chapman, via phone	Amanda Jordan, PW
Ginger Torres	Mikaela Castle, PW
Kathy Knoop, via phone	Lora Martens, Office of Heat Response and Mitigation
Kelly Barr, via phone	Julie Riemenschneider, OEP
Penny Allee Taylor, via phone	Joshua Uebelherr, OEP
Sarah Porter, via phone	Anita Ponce, OEP
Timothy Franquist, via phone	Katrina Gerster, OEP
	Matthew Potzler, OEP
<b>Commission Members Not Present</b>	<b>Community Members Present</b>
Andrea Odegard-Begay	Anna Bettis
Eric Gorseger	Wayne Warrington
Kevin Groman	
Kim Sax	

1. **Call to Order/Roll Call and Announcements:**  
The meeting of the Environmental Quality and Sustainability Commission (EQSC) was called to order with a roll call at 3:03 p.m. There were 9 members present at roll call. The following commissioners arrived after roll call:
  - Sarah Porter at 3:08 p.m.
2. **Review and approval of October 13, 2022, Minutes**  
This item was not discussed.
3. **Public Comments**  
No one spoke.
4. **Urban Heat Island and Tree and Shade Subcommittee (UHITS) Update**  
This item was taken after item 6.

Vice Chair Ginger Torres, Chair of the Subcommittee, reported that the UHITS meeting was not held on November 8, 2022 due to lack of quorum and reminded the commissioners that the final meeting would be held next month in December 2022 as UHITS is sunsetting at that time. Vice Chair Ginger Torres then spoke about the expected ad hoc committee the Office of Heat Response and Mitigation is working with the Mayor's Office to set up related to items focused on by UHITS. A key goal of the ad hoc committee will be to help update the city's Tree and Shade Master Plan.

5. **Zero Waste**  
Felipe Moreno, Assistant Director of the Public Works Department (PW), and Amanda Jordan, Project Manager, spoke about PW's plans to get Phoenix to zero waste. Zero waste is defined as diverting a minimum of 90% of waste from the landfill. Assistant Director Felipe Moreno spoke about the history of waste diversion efforts in the City of Phoenix, waste diversion goals within the 2021 Phoenix Climate Action Plan, the circular economy, community engagement opportunities (including installation of an educational tour at 27<sup>th</sup> Ave Materials Recovery Facility to increase accessibility to all communities), and what the pathway to reach the 2030 and 2050 diversion goals will look like. Among the waste diversion activities, there is also action being taken to capture landfill gas of already in-place waste. Improvements to the customer experience are encouraging participation in the circular economy. These include curbside pickup of hazardous waste and scheduling to pick up waste, recyclables, and organic waste, when operationally feasible, on the same day.

Commissioner Penny Allee Taylor asked about the efficiencies involved with the waste being picked up on the same day with Assistant Director Felipe Moreno offering that this has provided operational savings and increased the convenience for the customers. Vice Chair Ginger Torres asked how the EQSC could be of assistance with engaging the public on this effort. Assistant Director Felipe Moreno indicated that there would be public engagement beginning in early 2023 regarding the zero waste plan and that the commissioners could engage their respective contacts to increase engagement with various stakeholders. Chair Caroline Lobo asked that the commissioners send list of stakeholders that they believe would be interested in participating in this process to be sent to staff via email to [oeinfo@phoenix.gov](mailto:oeinfo@phoenix.gov). Chair Caroline Lobo then asked if there are milestones in between the 50% by 2030 and 90%+ by 2050, with Assistant Director Felipe Moreno replying that interim key performance indicators were being evaluated internally that would be included in staff annual progress reports. Chair Caroline

Lobo and Assistant Director Felipe Moreno then entered into a discussion about the capital overlay and various funding sources available to meet these goals. Project Manager Amanda Jordan added to the conversation by speaking about the project with C40 Cities that will bring funding to the Resource Innovation Center (RIC) with the City of Phoenix primarily offering land. This would also include offering waste diversion testing services, basic infrastructure and office space. Commissioner Colin Tetreault offered his congratulations to the team for their great work and glad to see the RIC grow. Commissioner Darren Chapman asked how the growing circular economy benefit members of different socioeconomic levels and lower-income communities. Project Manager Amanda Jordan spoke about a microfacility being developed with Arizona State University involving plastic waste and how it was being staffed by Hustle PHX, a Black, Indigenous and People of Color non-profit organization. Finally, a discussion about policy level advocacy at the state level was entered into with a possible agenda item in the future to further discuss.

## **6. Proposition 400 and Air Quality**

Commissioner Tim Franquist, Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) Environmental Director, spoke about the impacts of ozone nonattainment and Proposition 400E (Prop 400), which is a tax approved by voters in 2004 to fund transportation projects in Maricopa County that is due to expire by 2025. Ozone concentrations in the nonattainment area range from 75-80 ppb, with 75 ppb being used for planning purposes. Ozone concentrations in the region have been decreasing, but recent increases are being observed that are not completely attributable to wildfires. In addition, the background concentration (from sources outside of the region) of ozone comprises more than 60% of ozone concentration. Commissioner Tim Franquist then spoke about upcoming attainment deadlines and how new controls would need to be implemented (including implementation outside of the nonattainment region), along with the permitting implications. The lack of emission offsets in the region was then discussed and how this is already limiting economic opportunities for businesses interested in expanding or coming to the region. The estimated costs of ozone nonattainment were also discussed and were in the range of \$100 million per year.

Commissioner Tim Franquist then spoke about the MAG Momentum 2050 transportation plan and how the planned investments would be affected if there is not an extension of the Prop 400 tax, which would also affect public transit funding and further negatively impact air quality.

Commissioner Colin Tetreault asked about the risk to economic activity in the region and health implications if we move to a serious nonattainment of ozone. Commissioner Tim Franquist highlighted the importance of this public health issue and how the businesses could possibly be sited outside of the nonattainment area. Commissioner Kathy Knoop and Commissioner Tim Franquist then spoke about the transition to electric vehicles and how replacing over 3.5 million vehicles would result in 7 ppb ozone decrease. Commissioner Tim Franquist spoke about the 93 ozone measures and how even such a transition to electric vehicles is not a “silver bullet” to the issue. There was then discussion about the reduced travel observed during the pandemic and that air quality did not improve as expected, and how climate change will not significantly contribute to ozone concentrations in the region. Chair Caroline Lobo asked about the path to getting Prop 400 extended. Commissioners entered into a discussion about the effect on the economic growth of the region, engaging further with Chamber of Commerce, Greater Phoenix Economic Council (GPEC) and businesses, with Commissioner Kelly Barr

emphasizing the impacts to business and need for greater engagement with the economic development community. Commissioner Penny Allee Taylor also spoke about working with health organizations, like hospitals, since this is a public health issue, as well. Commissioner Colin Tetreault spoke about a case study by CDP that spoke about Arizona's interest in sustainability, including comments by Mayor Kate Gallego, and representatives from APS and GPEC, that can be found here <https://www.cdp.net/en/articles/cities/case-study-in-arizona-sustainability-is-bringing-in-big-business> and how informing the public may help. Commissioner Tim Franquist spoke about publicizing actions that individuals could take that would contribute to improving the air quality.

**7. Announcements and Review of Future Agenda Items**

Vice Chair Ginger Torres, GO Bond Environment and Sustainability Subcommittee Chair, announced that there would be the final GO Bond Executive Meeting on November 14, 2022, and encouraged commissioners to provide support to the items related to environmental quality and sustainability.

**8. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:48 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,  
Matthew Potzler, Environmental Quality Specialist