

**PHOENIX ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY and SUSTAINABILITY
COMMISSION MINUTES**

August 8, 2019

Phoenix City Hall
Room 12 Central
200 West Washington St
Phoenix, AZ 85003

Commission Members Present	City Staff Present
Allee Taylor, Penny	Jeremy Legg, Convention Center
Allen, Dwayne	Cynthia Campbell, Water Services Department
Barr, Kelly via phone	Elizabeth Planas, Office of Sustainability
Bendor, Josh,	Nancy Allen, Phoenix Office of Environmental Programs (OEP)
Howell, Park	Joseph Gibbs, OEP
Lobo, Caroline via phone	Cindy Salazar, OEP
Forst Michalegko, Lesley via phone	Julie Riemenschneider, OEP
Porter, Sarah	Richard Adkins, Phoenix Parks and Recreation Department
Sandweg, Bill	Willa Altman-Kaough, Mayor's Office
Tetreault, Colin	Shereen Warrayat, Council District 1 Office
Torres, Ginger	
Commission Members Not Present	Community Members Present
Adams, Talonya	Wendy Barrett, Trees Matter
Guidas, Elyse	Aimee Esposito, Trees Matter
Nelson, John	Jackson Schiefelbein, Intern, City Manager's Office
Ruht, Kimberly	Lindsey Enyart
	Claire Nickell
	C.J. Hager, Vitalyst
	Monica Greenman, via phone Tree and Shade Subcommittee member

I. Call to Order and Announcements:

The meeting was called to order with a roll call at 3:02 p.m. There were 8 members present at roll call. The following Commissioners arrived at the times stated below:

- Penny Allee Taylor at 3:08 p.m.
- Josh Bendor at 3:10 p.m.
- Caroline Lobo at 3:23 p.m.

Commission member Bill Sandweg announced that his Copper Star Coffee shop has been certified as GOLD in the Green Business Leader Certification program by City of Phoenix for its efforts in composting food and recycling.

II. Review and approval of July 11, 2019 Minutes:

ACTION:

Commissioner Bill Sandweg made a motion to approve the July 11, 2019 minutes. Commissioner Kelly Barr seconded the motion and it carried 10:0.

III. Public Comment – Six people spoke:

Commission Chair Colin Tetreault indicated that attendees wishing to offer comments on the Draft Tree and Shade Recommendations from the Urban Heat Island / Tree and Shade Subcommittee are requested to fill out a speaker card and limit their comment to five minutes.

Lindsey Enyart, a resident living near Piestewa Peak spoke of a neighbor who was notified by the city to clean up the abandoned alley behind her property and allegedly also cut down 6 Palo Verde trees there that were shading Ms.Enyart's back wall and yard. Removal of the trees caused the block wall temperature to rise as high as 168 degrees without shade. Partial shade was 113 degrees; but with former trees – 98 degrees. Because Ms. Enyart doesn't have room to plant trees in her back yard she wanted to replace the trees on other side in alley. She is requesting help to find a city contact that could give her a definitive answer about planning trees in the abandoned alley.

Jim McPherson, Downtown Voices Coalition

Mr. McPherson expressed strong support for the Subcommittee recommendations.

Stacey Champion, thanked the Subcommittee for their work and urged the Commission to focus on the need to serve marginalized communities who desperately need trees and shade, especially in transit corridors. She also suggested bolstering the language around health because shade and coolness should be a public health issue. It's been 9 years since the Tree and Shade Master Plan was approved and each year, more and more heat deaths are being experienced.

Claire Nickel, from the Coronado neighborhood, lived in Phoenix 20 years and came across the Tree & Shade Master Plan a few years ago. Trees are amazing and important for cooling and quality of life. She is raising her voice for trees and asks what is in the plan to engage the community and to help underserved communities?

Aimee Esposito, Trees Matter, Tree & Shade Subcommittee member - The Environmental Quality and Sustainability Commission (EQSC) is important. My

organization, Trees Matter, receives a lot of granular questions. The establishment of a standing Tree and Shade Commission (Part 2 of the Recommendations document) would continuously address the Tree & Shade issue and complement a Tree & Shade Administrator. Venues for the Tree and Shade Commission meetings should be easily accessible, preferably in the evening, and at an accessible location, such as Burton Barr Library, etc.

Nicole Rodriguez - The Commission should recognize and defer to the work and research that the Subcommittee has accomplished. As a member of the Tree and Shade Subcommittee, we started doing grassroots level review of best management practices and did our due diligence, spending time at home and doing research. We took careful consideration of city staff and other experts, to help us clarify issues. Planning and Development Department (PDD) had the opportunity at meetings to provide input. I ask that you hold the City's feet to fire on this issue. It is a health issue; trees are necessary urban infrastructure and have human health aspects to them. While I am an arborist, I am not an expert on everything, we should consider having more experts at the table.

IV. Review of Urban Heat Island / Tree and Shade Subcommittee Recommendations

Sarah Porter, Chair of the Tree and Shade Subcommittee thanked the Subcommittee for their work. This work was focused on trees and recognition that the city developed the Tree & Shade (T&S) Master Plan with a goal for 30% coverage by 2030. There initially was a Citizen Ad Hoc committee, where Dwayne Allen, our Subcommittee Vice Chair, participated and pushed City Council to form a more formal body, as a Tree and Shade Subcommittee to the Environmental Quality and Sustainability Commission. The Subcommittee's approach was to take recommendations to council with a document that says how we will get to the Master Plan goals without getting too detailed and keeping it higher level. Later, the document could be updated for those granular details.

In Sarah's opinion the most important recommendation is to establish a Tree and Shade Administrator that is responsible for tree and shade implementation. She discussed her experience of residents wanting to complete tree projects, yet there wasn't a Tree & Shade Administrator to handle these issues, or tree issues with utilities, or applying for grants, or leveraging opportunities for more trees and shade.

Next in importance is to establish a Standing Tree and Shade Committee that would also ensure progress toward meeting the Tree and Shade Master Plan goals. The Commission would work with the Tree & Shade Administrator to create more detailed guidelines for planting and maintenance. Another important recommendation is to provide enough annual funding to ensure that we achieve our canopy goal and that would also account for the necessary increase in planting, replacements and continuous maintenance.

The remaining recommendations are mandates that apply only to multifamily and commercial uses, not single-family residential. For example, if you have required tree stipulations in site plans, then you are responsible to execute that plan. If you want a change, you must receive permit/approval from PDD. There are some differences between the Subcommittee recommendations and the PDD draft text amendment. This is area that needs most consideration. Not everyone is going to be happy with mandates. Is it carrots and/or sticks?

Subcommittee Vice Chair Dwayne Allen added that the draft recommendations are a general framework and the Subcommittee intentionally steered away from details that could be better addressed through the proposed Administrator and/or Tree and Shade standing committee. The Administrator could take all the current good works that many departments are doing now and better coordinate them.

Joshua Bednarek discussed written comments of the Planning and Development Department(PDD) on the draft recommendations. While there is alignment between the Subcommittee recommendations and PDD's draft text amendment to its Landscaping Code, there are some nuances between the two that would be advantageous to have more time to work through. The text amendment aligns with Part 3 of the draft recommendation, although some PDD provisions go further, and some do not. PDD would like to continue working with the EQSC and get language to line up and provide a resource for EQSC. Public hearings for the draft PDD text amendment are to be scheduled later in Fall, and then in early 2020 the draft would go before City Council.

After Mr. Bednarek spoke, Subcommittee Chair Sarah Porter suggested that Parts 1 and 2 of the draft recommendations become separated (bifurcated) from Part 3, the section which addresses issues pertinent to PDD's text amendment. The intent was that Parts 1 & 2 could proceed on a different time track from Part 3 as PDD and the Commission address alignment of the two draft documents. It was noted that the draft recommendations endorsed the text amendment.

Ginger Torres asked when the draft recommendations would go to Council. Chair Colin Tetreault indicated that the Commission would work with staff to determine timeframes. Subcommittee Vice Chair added that detailed questions regarding the appropriate trees to plant and locations would be addressed by a future standing Tree and Shade Committee. Also, the Subcommittee felt that palm trees should not be recommended.

Discussion then went back to address alignment with PDD and its text amendment process with some indicating that the Subcommittee Recommendations are the work product of citizens and the text amendment the work of the PDD city staff. Perhaps they need not be so aligned. Others supported bifurcating Parts 1 & 2 from Part 3 to better align Part 3 with PDD's text amendment. Subcommittee Vice Chair added that if the complete recommendations document were brought before Council, Council itself could separate out Part 3 to better align with the Text Amendment provisions and schedule, so let's send up the full document and have Council make the decision.

Chair Tetreault then directed the Commission that he wants to table a vote on approval of the draft recommendations until next month. He wants Commissioners and staff to solicit feedback from individuals from the Community by Close of Business, September 5, and then have staff compile comments and send back to Commissioners on September 6. Staff could continue to receive any feedback from others and bring those in September 12. The Chair directed the Commission to review compiled public comments and send a "track changes" (if possible) revised document to staff by September 10. The next September 12 Commission meeting will be a "redlining" session to hammer out a Final Recommendations document for an approval vote.

V. Presentation: Camp Colley

Richard Berg, Camp Colley Executive Director, reported that hundreds of Phoenix kids spend time at Camp Colley. The Camp has been providing disadvantaged, underserved Phoenix youth with an invaluable nature experience since 2001. The Camp is located on City of Phoenix property and named after James Colley who formerly served as a Parks & Recreation Department director. The mission of the Camp is to create a place for disadvantaged kids in Phoenix to get out of city, spend time outdoors and develop an appreciation for nature and the outdoors.

The Camp is located near Happy Jack, Arizona, and is off the grid using solar panels and battery packs to power the facility. The Camp Colley Foundation provides funding for scholarships, to applicants aged 8-14 at Parks and Recreation Department recreation centers, e.g. Maryvale and Sunnyslope, who are kids who wouldn't otherwise receive an outdoor camp experience.

Camp programs include archery, canoeing, horseback riding and environmental learning, which are accredited by the American Camp Association. The Camp wants to become a fully-accredited camp and is measuring a variety of outcomes for success.

There are several opportunities for involvement: growing the Camp Colley Foundation network for funds and volunteers. Volunteers are needed to help with outreach and marketing. Approximately 300 campers are or have been to camp this year with a capacity for 400. People interested in helping are requested to attend a meeting at the Winship House every 3rd Thursday of the month from 5 to 6 p.m. There will also be a mixer "S'mores & Scholarships", hosted by Phoenix Mayor Kate Gallego, Tuesday, Oct 29, 6 to 8 p.m. at monOrchid, 214 E. Roosevelt St., Phoenix, AZ 85004.

Caroline Lobo left a 5:02 p.m.

VI. Update: Talking Stick Arena Renovations

Jeremy Legg of the Phoenix Convention Center presented an update to a previous presentation he gave on the \$230 million renovation for the Talking Stick Arena. Since the previous presentation, HOK Architects has been placed under contract for the design; Okland for the construction and PC Sports, as the City's owner's representative.

The renovation will include plumbing, mechanical, roof, electrical, air circulation technology, accessibility (ADA), and nearly 1,000 solar panels of up to 378 kWh per year. Energy and water efficiency improvements include low-flow plumbing, advanced air handlers and controls, LED lighting, and insulation improvements to yield an overall potential 20% energy reduction. Construction is expected to begin May 2020.

Operations Waste Reduction – 4.5 tons of materials recycled monthly: glass, plastic and cardboard. There are discussions with the concessionaire on future opportunities with food service, etc. Outside walkability improvements will address the plaza and a more attractive and engaging apron along the south side at Jackson.

The Arena annually hosts 200 community events and creates 1,140 local jobs. Next steps will see a hard closure of the Arena beginning in November through Fall of 2021.

Quorum lost at 5:17 p.m.

VII. Announcements and Review of Future Agenda Item

Future possible agenda items include:

September Dedicated to Completion of Tree and Shade Recommendations

October Green Finance
Working Together: Trees and Green

TBD: Mayor Kate Gallego
Rio Reimagine

VIII. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:19 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,
Joseph Gibbs, Environmental Quality Specialist