

**CITY OF PHOENIX
ELECTRIC VEHICLE AD HOC COMMITTEE**
Summary Minutes from Monday, Oct. 1, 2021



Virtual Meeting – Via WebEx

Ad Hoc Committee Member Present

Councilwoman Ansari
Autumn Johnson
Caryn Potter
Catherine O'Brien
Clark Miller
Court Rich
Delbert Hawk
Kathy Knoop
Lisa Perez
Omar Gonzalez
Tim Sprague
Vianey Olivarria
Jason Smith
Columba Sainz

Ad Hoc Committee Members Absent

Katherine Stainken

City Staff Present

Karen Apple
Mark Hartman
Karen Peters
John Chan
Lawrence Polk
David Benton
Joe Giudice
Keith Carbajal
Kimberly Brown
Tim Sprague
Larry Smallwood
Alice Bimrose

Felissa Washington Smith
Stephen Dudley
Karl Kaseoru
Alan Stephenson
Sandra Hoffman
Willa Kaough
Katie Dickinson
Mario Barajas
Albert Crespo

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Councilwoman Ansari called the meeting to order at 10:08 a.m. and Deputy City Manager Karen Peters performed the roll call. Councilwoman Ansari reported that all three subcommittees have had a chance to meet and discuss the proposed deliverables that are being considered for recommendation. Councilwoman Ansari introduced Mayor Gallego.

2. Comments from Mayor Gallego

Mayor Gallego provided welcome comments and an overview of and acknowledged staff involvement. Mayor Gallego stated that EVs are key to reducing emissions, and the City is committed to succeeding and having a diverse group on job creation, and equity opportunities. Mayor Gallego commented on the Valley being known as Electric Valley and innovation hub and moving forward. Mayor Gallego stated that Phoenix has to overperform on the 1.1M EVs goal on the road in 2030. Mayor Gallego stated that the Climate Action Plan is on the City Council agenda for Oct 12 for approval. Mayor Gallego stated the city has a goal of 50% new car sales being EV by 2030.

3. Approval of Minutes – Aug. 9, 2021 Electric Vehicle Ad Hoc Committee Meeting

Councilwoman Ansari requested a motion, Committee Member Hawk called for a first motion and Committee Member Knoop called for a second, unanimous pass, motion carried.

4. Welcome and Introduction of New Ad Hoc Committee Member

Councilwoman Ansari introduced new member Jason Smith, with APS.

Committee Member Smith provided an introduction. Committee Member Smith works for APS in the Customer Grid Solutions team in the project strategies and solutions group, supporting EV, solar, battery technologies.

5. News and Announcements

Mark Hartman, Chief Sustainability Officer, provided an overview of several news items including a \$14 billion dollar plant for the Ford F150 Lightning, creation of new Ford battery factories, Lucid Motors started EV production in Casa Grande, Atlys Motor Vehicles prototype EV pickup truck, and GM BrightDrop. Mr. Hartman stated that there are marketing opportunities in highlighting the new EV technological advances, including power outlets, USB ports, and on-board air compressors.

6. EV Market Strategy/OEM Targets/Federal Funding Overview

Councilwoman Ansari stated that there is potential for significant funding opportunities under the Federal Infrastructure bill.

Mr. Hartman provided an overview of the OEM EV timeline plans, where 40% of all models will be EV by 2030. Sixteen automakers committed to 100% EV by 2030 included Audi, GM, and Volvo to name a few. Mr. Hartman provided an infrastructure bill overview that included \$2.5 B for EV Charging and Refueling Grant, \$5B EV charging Formula program, and \$11B for bus transportation infrastructure.

Committee Member Gonzales announced that next week is Fuel Cell Day and provided information about fueling initiatives being undertaken at Nikola. In addition, Nikola announced an MOU with Opal Fuels to discuss infrastructure in renewable fuels to create a nationwide network.

7. Discussion of Subcommittee Deliverables Recommendations

Councilwoman Ansari introduced the need to prioritize the deliverables in determining the strategies by Spring of 2022.

Committee Member Perez presented on equity principals and stated that equity should be included across all program areas. She requested a staff presentation on comparable city's programming regarding feedback, program details. She suggested reviewing how these cities implemented community outreach and various other policies.

Committee Member Olivarria presented on the education and outreach deliverables and stated that trust should be built with the community members and to conduct listening sessions with community members. She also emphasized the need to produce content for a *needs assessment* study.

Councilwoman Ansari asked for additional feedback from other committee members and stressed these are clear actions.

Committee Member Miller stated that he agrees with the Mayor's opening challenge to "overperform" and asked how that might look for Equity, Education and Outreach and help lead the committee to concrete recommendations.

Councilwoman Ansari pointed towards the Justice40 initiatives to use as a framework for what it means to overperform. She emphasized the need to conduct cross education/collaboration between the committees to include equity principals.

Committee Member Potter stated the need to better understand areas with energy burdens to start outreach, she introduced the *NREL Solar for All* tool to examine census blocks at areas that have increased energy burdens. The use of the tool could assist in determining which areas could be targeted first.

Committee Member O'Brien advocated for a *needs assessment* study for each individual community, as each community may have different needs. She emphasized the use of different tools to establish priorities and to use equity-based assessments for each community.

Councilwoman Ansari recommended using listening sessions to better understand the needs of the individual communities.

Committee Members Potter and Johnson stated that the "one million vehicles" goal from the *APS State Transportation Electrification Plan (STEP)* is based on the medium adoption scenario. It is not ambitious enough and should focus on the high adoption scenario to meet climate goals and overperform. Committee Members Potter and Johnson discussed the Nevada goal of 40% investments for underserved communities' statewide goal of 40% infrastructure to disadvantaged communities.

Committee Members Potter and Johnson recommended that the Committee review how it can be broken down and proportionalized. Committee Member Potter suggested reviewing the Transportation Equity Network (Chicago, IL) to use as with the local community knowledge and stakeholders to make decisions of embedding justice with equity programs and driving investment. Committee Members Potter stated the information will be uploaded to the SharePoint site.

Councilwoman Ansari highlighted the need for prioritization of deliverables which members could help identify—leveraging information that already exists to assist in guiding the committee on the deliverables.

Committee Member Potter requested that having discussions with Valley Metro on route data that could be used to assist the Committee in understanding appropriate areas to develop programs. She stated that data access is important to understand energy burden and residents more likely to use transit.

Committee Member Miller discussed energy and transportation burdens should be included in comparison to internal combustion engine vehicles when considering equity. Committee Member Miller stipulated there will need to be measurements in place to examine how costs affect different groups. He mentioned new programs in WA and OR that developed accountability mechanisms that equity gets built into energy system planning. He suggested that equity evaluation processes be reviewed for energy and transportation transition processes.

Committee Member Johnson provided an overview of the deliverables and requested staff presentations for public charging infrastructure. She provided an overview of needs including: EV siting, how to fund to charging stations and installation, equity, incorporating information from other cities, coordinating with utilities. She also stated the need for understanding EV charging station business models, as well as examining case studies.

Committee Member Rich provided an overview of the deliverables for workplace and business charging to include: EV Ready building codes, zoning ordinances and incentives, streamlining city permitting processes, recommendations for provisions to be included requirements for new development. He also stated the need for assisting with EV charger installs for business and coordinating/communicating with utilities.

Committee Member Potter provided an overview of home charging deliverables and noted overlap with other EVSE install categories with public charging installations. She stated that zoning ordinances and EV Ready building codes are the foundations for the EV ready provisions. She recommending streamlining permitting process, retrofitting and upgrades to buildings, focus on opportunities for incentives. Committee Member Potter suggested education and outreach programs that highlight city enabled direct incentives for residents for existing buildings and

identifying content for clearinghouse/central data/information sourcing for financing EVs.

Councilwoman Ansari has started discussions with multi-family and builders to co-create solutions. She also stated that a meeting including commercial and industrial developers should be explored.

Committee Member Smith agreed with incentives for off peak and other incentives currently being used at APS to learn what is working.

Councilwoman Ansari requested APS be at the table to discuss current incentive plans and to identify future options.

Committee Member Rich suggested that some sort of level “mandate” of parking spaces for new builds that could identify a certain percentage, in addition to incentives for new builds be reviewed

Committee Member Miller requested that options be explored for bus, talent requirement and hiring. He stated that strategies on how to reach out to and engage youth and how they use programs to help employees purchase and charge EVs as a perk. He also requested to review larger employers with GHG programs, and that employee transportation has to fall within a company scope and how to include in sustainability planning as a strategy. He stated, incentives are a huge equity challenge, take public/rate payer money to early adopters, often at the wealthier end of spectrum, doesn't work for low income, increases disparity and adaption rates. He suggested developing strategies for other equitable approaches; alternatives to incentives, targeted for low-income communities.

Committee Member Potter stated that some incentives have not worked to help communities that they were intended. She stated that the level of the incentives should be balanced.

Planning and Development Director, Alan Stephenson, highlighted the long timeline needed for outreach for a building code updates that includes a public hearing process before adoption by City Council.

Committee Member Knoop provided an overview of the City fleet and charging deliverables that included, transit to clean transportation, city purchase of EVs, city EV charging infrastructure and employee EV charging needs and discussed OEM need to coordinate for replacement vehicles. She stated the need for Public Works fleet presentation and training for staff drivers, mechanics. She also requested that the Committee consider how/when/where these vehicles will be charged to be ready for use the next day/duty cycles. She also recommended that a review be undertaken of vehicles that are take home and across the state, how to use public charging and reimbursements for home electricity use. She stated that employee charging is key to EV advancements and be equitable and fair and establish, survey,

when and where and what is home charging situation. She requested a presentation from the Phoenix Convention Center staff on the City's EV parking incentive program.

Committee Member Miller stated that there is an opportunity for the City to lead on how beneficial workplace charging can be and leverage use of 110v outlets for employees for lower cost.

Committee Member Knoop stated that leveraging existing construction opportunities by the City when lots are under improvement to install conduit.

Committee Member O'Brien stated from a utility's perspective, the load could utilize renewables during the day and offset peak loads when employees go home. High renewable generative times, increasing fleet and workplace charging helps to offset peak demand usage.

Committee Member Knoop stated that no networking fees are required for the use of Level 1 chargers and don't have to recover the cost of networking fees. She suggested that Level 2 chargers are most likely what employees would require to accommodate charging needs.

Councilwoman Ansari asked for any other additional comments.

8. Public Comment

Councilwoman Ansari opened the discussion to members of the public. No members of the public commented.

9. Future Agenda Items

Councilwoman Ansari requested input for future meeting topics for next full committee meeting in Nov.

Committee Member Johnson asked for CAP clarification on the updated plans availability.

Deputy City Manager, Karen Peters, stated that the CAP was included on the October 12 City Council agenda and that the meeting started at 2:30pm and agenda will be out in advance. She stated that the Final CAP version will also be posted on the OEP Climate Action Plan website, week before and can review final CAP.

Committee Member Johnson asked if the final CAP could be emailed to the Committee?

Ms. Peters stated that a link could be provided by staff.

Council Aid, Aaron Kane asked to clarify the CAP process.

Ms. Peters clarified the City Council CAP process and options for approval or provide additional revisions. She stated based on decisions from the City Council, approval could be obtained on October 12 or on October 27.

Committee Member Potter asked how Committee input could be included in the CAP and City Council input process and implementation process.

Mr. Hartman stated that City Council will be approving the initial version of the CAP and next year will update the CAP. Recommendations from this committee would fit well into next year's CAP. The updated GHG emission inventory is currently in progress.

Ms. Peters commented that opportunity is provided to the Committee to dive into specifics and provided more specific direction to accomplish CAP goals. The Final Draft CAP was posted on the OEP website on October 7th.

10. Adjournment

Councilwoman Ansari adjourned the meeting at 11:30am, next meeting is Nov 5 at 10:00am.