

**CITY OF PHOENIX  
ELECTRIC VEHICLE AD HOC COMMITTEE**



**Summary Minutes from Friday, May 13, 2022**

Virtual Meeting – Via WebEx

**Ad Hoc Committee Members (Present)**

Councilwoman Ansari  
Autumn Johnson  
Caryn Potter  
Catherine O'Brien  
Clark Miller  
Court Rich  
Delbert Hawk  
Lisa Perez  
Omar Gonzales  
Tim Sprague

**Ad Hoc Committee Members (Absent)**

Katherine Stainken  
Vianey Olivarria  
Columba Sainz  
Delbert Hawk  
Jason Smith  
Kathy Knoop

**City Staff Present**

Karen Peters, CMO  
Mark Hartman, Office of Sustainability  
Karen Apple, Office of Sustainability  
Karl Kaseoru, ITS  
Aaron Kane, Office of The Council  
Albert Crespo, Transit  
Alan Stephenson, Planning and Dev.  
Chad Makovsky, Aviation  
Darice Ellis, Office of Sustainability  
Gabriel Navarez, Aviation  
Jesus Sapien, Transit  
Joe Bowar, Transit

John Chan, PCC  
Kini Knudson, Streets  
Sandra Hoffman, Planning and Dev.  
Stephanie Bracken, Office of The Council  
Stephen Dudley, Planning and Dev.  
Willa Kaough, Office of the Mayor  
David Benton, City Attorney's Office  
Gary Jacobsen, Aviation  
Joe Giudice, PWD

**1. Call to Order/Roll Call**

Councilwoman Ansari called the meeting to order at 10:15 a.m. and Karen Apple, the City's EV Program Manager performed the roll call. Councilwoman Ansari reported that this is the ninth meeting of the full EV Ad Hoc Committee and the second to last Full EV Ad Hoc meeting.

**2. Approval of Minutes – March 4, 2022, Electric Vehicle Ad Hoc Committee Meeting**

Councilwoman Ansari requested a motion to adopt the minutes, Committee Member Perez called for a first motion and Committee Member O'Brien called for a second, unanimous pass, motion carried.

### **3. Arizona State University – Edison Eastlake Community – EV Equity Survey and Study Overview**

Councilwoman Ansari turned the meeting over to Ms. Apple to introduce Arizona State University Master of Sustainability students to present an EV equity study and survey recommendations.

Ms. Apple introduced the students to provide their project overview.

The EV Changers team presented on Transportation Electrification Options for Underserved Communities in Phoenix. The presentation included information on project context, mission, value, project overview, cost analysis, comparative city analysis, survey distribution and results, and recommendations.

Councilwoman Ansari asked for questions.

Committee Member O'Brien asked about the cost, and if that was the average cost throughout the industry or something specific to Arizona.

Mr. Keller stated that the costs were average industry costs. Additionally, the group highlighted that the more successful programs were in Baltimore and D.C. and were the only EV equity community programs that were deeply analyzed.

Councilwoman Ansari thanked and congratulated students for the students for their presentation.

### **4. Working Session – Draft EV Roadmap Outreach Status, Comment Review, and Schedule**

Councilwoman Ansari introduced Mark Hartman, Chief Sustainability Officer, to review the Draft EV Roadmap and discuss next steps.

Mr. Hartman highlighted the ongoing outreach on social media, in the community, Village Planning Committee (VPC) meetings, various commissions and employee groups.

Mr. Hartman provided a Roadmap Outreach – April Summary which included information on the number of outreach events, community partners, employee groups, outreach attendees, survey responses, and social media posts.

Mr. Hartman continued to present on the Roadmap Outreach feedback that was received, including information on general responses, costs, incentives, equity, infrastructure, and education and outreach.

Mr. Harman provided results of the survey questions.

Committee Member Miller stated EV model availability corresponded to purchasing cycles and drives adoption.

Mr. Hartman continued with survey results.

Committee Member Miller stated that some VPC meeting feedback suggested that things like sustainability scoring metrics may incentivize developers to favor installation of EV infrastructure to increase EV adoption.

Mr. Hartman stated that commissions and VPCs can make stipulation requests of developers. The Planning and Development Department staff has agreed to explore the drafting of new stipulation language for VPCs to use in regards to EV charger installs.

Committee Member Potter asked what education can be done about levels and what those levels of requirements entail.

Mr. Hartman continued the presentation.

Committee Member Miller asked a question regarding an EV survey result. He asked how 80% of respondents own a single-family home corresponds with city demographics, and how do to get more surveys completed by renters or those from that category.

Mr. Hartman highlighted that these are the results from the English version, however, the Spanish survey and social media results are still ongoing. Mr. Hartman asked for any suggestions on how to better connect with Spanish speaking groups to increase feedback.

Committee Member Potter recommended putting together a list of Homeowner Associations (HOA) for townhome and condo communities. She also suggested, sending the survey to other organizations connected to this work.

Mr. Hartman stated that results should increase in the upcoming weeks of the survey.

Committee Member Sprague recommended talking to the Arizona Multifamily Association) and looking at companies that manage condo and HOA's.

Mr. Hartman continued the presentation.

Committee Member Miller suggested that younger populations may be underrepresented but may represent the group more likely to purchase EVs.

Mr. Hartman continued the presentation and reminded that these results are just from the English-speaking survey.

Mr. Hartman presented information on the Draft EV Roadmap and comment discussion. Items included equity, workforce development, and EV charging and range anxiety.

Committee Member O'Brien stated that there are EV maps available that gives you range information and savings calculations. Committee Member O'Brien offered to connect the City of Phoenix to developers who could create a similar product for the city.

Committee Member Potter asked if there is a place that committee members can see additional comments from public meetings in one place.

Mr. Hartman said that the city team will sort, organize, and send them out to committee members.

Mr. Hartman continued to present on the Draft EV Roadmap comments, included information on focusing on all types of EVs not just cars, costs, developers, and power grid and availability of electricity.

Committee Member O'Brien stated that when it comes to reliability and according to the current adoption numbers, SRP is not seeing any issues to the system. Furthermore, SRP is taking information on load profiles and what that would look like for residents and what load profiles look like for public chargers. SRP is completing analysis of the system to see what that looks like as EV adoption grows and how that would affect the operations and reliability of the system. Right now, there is no effect on it. Furthermore, the scenario in California is very different than what is happening in Arizona. SRP and APS are forecasting ahead of time to accommodate the additional loads.

Mr. Hartman provided an overview of the timeline from April to June.

Committee Member Potter asked how the city has been thinking about continuing to connect with the people who have completed the survey and is it possible to see what should be included in the draft. Furthermore, would it make sense to continue to connect with those people who have completed the surveys.

Mr. Hartman stated that typically comments are included but do not go back and ask additional information past what was in the survey. However, there were approximately 400 people who selected the option to stay informed on the process.

Committee Member Potter suggested it might be worth creating the updated draft to those people to show where their feedback has been incorporated. To highlight transparency in the process.

Mr. Hartman suggested preparing a webinar of the content that is being added and allow an opportunity to ask questions and provide an update around June 25<sup>th</sup>.

Committee Member Potter liked the idea and suggested sharing the information on the EV website.

Committee Member Miller stated that after conversations with City Council and VPCs, that equity is an issue that they are all talking about. Furthermore, the Committee might want to add a few things in the report. One would be a long-term EV equity strategy; the second recommendation is articulating how the committee sees equity fitting into each of the roadmap recommendations.

Committee Member Potter suggested highlighting what the staff and committee has come up with in terms of the method for evaluating success, specifically around equity.

Committee Member Perez stated that it is important to reach out to each council office and identify the areas they believe are underserved in their community. Furthermore, this will help people understand what that means and where those communities are. Committee Member Perez also recommended that the committee provide an example of what other cities equity programs look like, stating that while we may not know what the cost will be in Phoenix, but providing an example of cost could possibly be based on those other comparable cities programs.

Councilwoman Ansari highlighted some potential presentation and celebration dates and locations. Additionally, she supported changing the title to be more about transportation electrification, if that is something the rest of the committee agrees with.

#### **5. Public Comment**

Councilwoman Ansari asked if any members of the public had registered to speak. No members of the public registered to speak for public comment.

#### **6. Future Agenda Items**

Councilwoman Ansari asked if anyone had items they'd like to add to future meetings.

Councilwoman Ansari suggested that it would be helpful to have a full meeting with this committee before the Committee sunsets to highlight next steps and priorities. Likewise, what future involvement looks like if members want to continue to be involved with the work.

No other items were added.

#### **7. Adjournment**

Councilwoman Ansari adjourned the meeting at 11:33am. Next meeting is Friday, June 3, 2022.